
BRIEFING NOTE: 2006 Budget Public Consultation Results

Background:

On January 13, 2006, City Manager Shirley Hoy received Budget Advisory Committee (BAC) approval of a public consultation plan for the 2006 Operating Budget.

The purpose of the consultation was to assist BAC and Policy and Finance (P&F) Committees in their final budget deliberations, to supplement the traditional deputation process. The program was to be composed with the following features:

- One meeting per Community Council district
- To be held at a time convenient to the public (ie evenings and/or weekends)
- Meetings to be held before the February 16 joint BAC/P&F meeting
- Hosted by the BAC and P&F committees
- All Councillors to be invited to attend and participate
- Meetings to be advertised in local papers and on the City's website
- All Councillors to be provided with a standard release and/flyer for distribution to constituents
- The results of the meeting to be tabulated and submitted to the joint BAC/P&F meeting

Consultation Overview:

In February 2006, Mayor David Miller and Budget Advisory Committee Chair Councillor David Soknacki invited Torontonians to talk about the City's 2006 Operating Budget at four public meetings.

In total, 140 people participated in the 2006 public consultations on Toronto's 2006 Operating Budget. The consultations took place at:

- North York Civic Centre, Saturday, February 4, 9:30 – 12:00 noon
- Etobicoke Collegiate Institute, Saturday, February 4, 2:00 - 4:30 p.m.
- East York Civic Centre, Wednesday, February 8, 7 - 9:30 p.m.
- Scarborough Civic Centre, Thursday, February 9, 7 - 9:30 p.m.

Communications

This consultation opportunity was communicated with advertisements in Eye Weekly and in NOW magazine on January 26, 2006; and in Metroland's eight community newspapers on January 27 (Scarborough, Etobicoke, North York, Beaches, Bloor West/Annex, York and City Centre Moment).

A news release was issued through Corporate Communications to Canada News Wire on January 26, 2006 and a reminder release was issued on February 7, 2006. Media coverage included City TV, Toronto Star, Guardian/Mirror, CTV, Toronto Observer and Fairchild TV.

The consultations were also communicated on the City's website at <http://www.toronto.ca/budget2006>. This final report and the participants' responses will also be posted on this page.

All Councillors were provided with promotional information for their use when communicating with their constituents. They were given written text that could be used in a newsletter, on their website or as an email message. They were also provided with promotional flyers, both generic and customized to each Community Council district, which allowed Councillors to add their own contact information and photograph.

Consultation Process

At each session, participants heard an update on the City's operating budget and shared ideas with their neighbours, the Mayor and City Councillors. Facilitators assisted the conversations at tables of up to 10 people, and recorded everyone's ideas. In addition, resource staff from the Financial Planning Division were available to answer participants' questions.

Participants were provided with a workbook to assist their conversation. It included a list of Council's nine priorities, a brief explanation of property taxes and how they are used to pay for City services, details on the 2006 operating budget pressures, proposed budget balancing strategies and a profile of the services the City provides.

Participant Feedback:

The participants were engaged in two conversations at their tables:

Conversation 1: What concerns, advice and ideas do you have about how to manage City expenses?

Conversation 2: What concerns, advice and ideas do you have about how to increase City revenues?

In a plenary, the entire group discussed:

Conversation 3: How should Council balance the budget?

The overall themes expressed by participants were about the need for the City to find innovative ways to deliver services, look for creative ways to raise revenues, balance the budget, and ensure that citizens are receiving value for their tax dollars.

A transcript of participants' comments is attached. This report provides an overview of the major ideas from all four sessions. The main themes on revenues and expenditures were:

Revenue Sources

- Participants felt strongly that the City cannot rely on property taxes to balance the budget but should have sustainable, long-term sources of revenues that grow with the economy.
- Many felt that the City should negotiate with other levels of government for a share of hotel and income taxes.
- Many participants felt that people who did not reside in the city, but commuted to Toronto for work should contribute to the City's revenues. Many suggested tolls as one possible means of achieving this. A few felt that the introduction of tolls would be problematic and create more bureaucracy.
- Several people suggested that the City should introduce a Toronto lottery as a possible revenue sources.
- People felt that additional revenues could be generated from increasing user fees for parking, swimming programs, and filming and building permit fees.
- Some participants expressed concern that increasing user fees would create difficulties for people who cannot afford to pay and that user fee increases should only be in selected services and not charged across the board.
- Participants were concerned that the City continues to maintain under-utilized assets, rather than selling or renting such assets. However, other participants said it was counter-productive to sell the City's assets.
- Participants were concerned about rising property taxes and suggested that there should be a more uniform property tax assessment system across the City.
- Many participants felt that the tax ratio between residential and commercial is a contributing factor for businesses relocating elsewhere.

Expenditures

- Many participants suggested that the City could realize financial benefits by paying closer attention to environmental management. Suggestions included public education on waste management, exploring new energy and waste technologies, user fees for garbage over a set limit, and applying energy saving strategies in municipal buildings.
- Participants felt that the City could realize cost-savings and reduce expenditures by evaluating programs for cost-effectiveness, more closely scrutinizing city contracts and reducing administration costs by combining departments with similar functions.

Other general areas of discussion included:

Intergovernmental Relations

- People wanted to know that each level of government has clear responsibilities for the right services and that these services are funded adequately.
- Participants felt very strongly that the Province should honour its commitment and remove the cap on cost-shared programs.
- Participants indicated that the City needs to build strong, direct relationships not only with the Provincial government but also with the Federal government as they have a role and responsibility for many areas affecting the City's budget such as immigration, transit, and housing.

- Because of the unique role of the City of Toronto regionally, provincially and federally, the City should explore funding relationships that might include tax rebates and exemptions, forgivable loans, and shared revenue sources such as income tax.

City Services, City Council

- Participants want the City to pay attention to efficiencies, safety, and the role of community partners to enhance the delivery of parks and recreation services.
- Participants indicated that City services should not be reduced if cuts would affect safety, social services, and public health.
- Several participants mentioned a need for the City to maintain and enhance services and programs for youth, including job strategies, after-school programs and community partnerships. Many felt these investments would be cost-saving efforts in the long-term.
- Some participants felt that the City relied too much on the work of outside consultants.
- Several participants indicated a need to review, and in some cases reduce the number and salaries of City Councillors and staff.

Monitoring and Transparency

- People felt that there should be more transparency and improved information on the City's operations and budget to provide the public with an understanding of how programs are run and money is spent.
- Participants expressed the need for improved accountability to ensure fiscally responsible, efficient and cost-effective service delivery.
- The City should budget on a longer-term basis and should be continuously working to balance the budget and maintain service levels.
- Participants felt that the City should look at core versus non-core services to find efficiencies and reductions.
- Participants were of the view that the City should use existing facilities more efficiently rather than build new ones, and that facilities such as basketball courts, community centres and meeting rooms should be better allocated across the City.
- Some participants felt that private initiatives could be used to provide some services, while others felt that it would be more costly to privatize.

Transportation

- People are interested in the City making investment in the TTC with a focus on efficiency, maintenance and integrated service planning.
- Participants said the City should look at creative solutions to increase ridership, provide fare options, and reduce fraud.

Crime and Safety

- People want to know that they are getting good value for money and that the cost of policing correlates to community needs and the crime rate.
- Participants suggested that the City should invest additional resources in community policing and violence reduction programs.

- Other suggestions included benchmarking costs and performance, increased efficiency in the delivery of services and more monitoring of operating costs to justify the level of expenditure.

Conclusion:

Participants expressed appreciation that they were given an opportunity to be heard by elected officials and staff. Many suggested that the city should hold these meetings more than once each year and suggested that participation would increase if the sessions were more widely publicized. Participants at each session said they would like the City to explore creative ways for communities to participate in future sessions perhaps through televised broadcasts, interactive and web-based broadcasts and electronic bulletin boards and blogs.

Prepared for: Budget Advisory Committee and Policy and Finance Committee
For Information: Josie Lavita, Director, Financial Planning Division
Date: March 21, 2006

Conversation 1

Concerns, advice and ideas about managing expenses

North York Civic Centre

1. Reduce expenditures
2. Don't reduce expenditures
3. Modify behaviours
4. Be responsible in spending
5. Examine how police/EMS staff time is spent
6. Look to examples of other cities around the world
7. Think long term – make investments now for future savings
8. Maximize use of voluntary sector
9. Plan on a human scale
10. Incentives for energy efficient buildings to leverage support from senior levels of government
11. Reduce # of councillors/smaller council
12. Reduce size/pay scale for police
13. No pay increase for councillors
14. Efficiency consultations for city services
15. Replace some police constables with cadets
16. No eating/drinking on TTC to reduce cleaning costs
17. Downloading
18. If city is paying for services should we have control?
19. Correlation between police and community services
20. Reduction in social services - increase in violence
21. Can 3 year/long-term solve problem?
22. Think longer than 3 years
23. Safety should not come at expense of social program - balance safety and social
24. Three priorities
25. Cyclists and safe cycling
26. Traffic tickets and revenue generation
27. Enforcing sidewalk shoveling by-law – revenue generation
28. Province and City operate on-line gambling
29. Welcome policy review
30. Re-educate public on police budget
31. Reduction in police budget
32. Redeploy police resources
33. Re-active vs proactive spending (ie. Parks and Recreation, housing)
34. Don't really see what the whole deficit is
35. Cut technology spending – 311, computer spending
36. Eliminate smart cards – direct money in another direction
37. More transparency between operating and capital budgets
38. Concern with breakdown of large police budget
39. Encourage funding from Province for transit service, social services. Costs should not be locally funded
40. Concern with what portion of budget is salary based
41. Reduce police salaries
42. Why does Toronto continue to utilize streetcars?
43. No balance between police budget and crime level
44. Other taxes – hotel taxes; waive sales taxes that we pay on city services such as TTC
45. More money for city infrastructure – TTC
46. Concern that all people that work in the city but live elsewhere are not having to pay for expenses. – Toronto is servicing more than just Torontonians – explore services fees i.e. toll roads

47. Concern over social services/welfare being abused – should be better policed
48. Wheel-trans service levels are declining
49. Don't cut TTC services in some areas, but in other areas buses are running empty
50. Educating and monitoring of solid waste management services
51. Better policing of Parks facilities during evening hours

Etobicoke Collegiate Institute

52. Stop spending money we don't have
53. Island bridge – too expensive to stop it
54. Look at contracting out services – garbage collection
55. Zero-based budgets
56. Give incentives to departments under-budget
57. City must lead by example – garbage collection on holidays
58. City should spend \$ efficiently
59. Plan ahead
60. Province and Federal government should spend more on cities
61. Concern about cutting services for students/at risk youth – invest more in prevention than dealing with problem afterward
62. More accountability in police services board – across the board for all spending across City
63. Want more of a police presence
64. Hiring freeze and promotional freeze at City Hall
65. Be cautious about debt charges
66. Continuation of after-school programs for at risk youth
67. Upload to Province
68. Money mindset change at City Hall – \$ coming from hard working tax payers
69. Should be follow-up with grants given out
70. Keep open mind on issue of private garbage collection (maintain it as measuring stick)
71. Don't lose it's soul – culture, environment, nature/animals
72. Politicians should take the leadership in cutting administration costs (cut councillors expenses)
73. Consultants being over hired – managers not managing
74. Cut 8% off administration costs (or up to 80% with no changes in services)
75. Reduce the number of councillors (22?) – but difficult to get answers now
76. Purchase hybrid buses lower costs of fuel
77. Photo radar for police budget
78. Use/rent space from religious social groups who have structures/buildings – use existing private facilities for city social and recreation programs
79. Use existing facilities for programs vs new facilities – e.g. police
80. Cut/review in the most expensive services
81. Increase efficiency of services – e.g. police – more monitoring
82. Security of safety is an issue and a priority
83. Upload cost of community services to Federal
84. Look at non-core expenses and look at efficiencies and reduction
85. Reduce expenses by looking at new waste management and technologies
86. Encourage partnerships for social service delivery in places of worship
87. City voluntarily took on down-loading i.e. pesticides
88. Youth programs within city eventually decrease need for policing
89. Use of \$ in departments – follow through i.e. consultants
90. More investment actually needed
91. \$ coming out of income tax

92. Efficient use of schools for programs in neighbourhoods – school board lost rights to tax
 93. Use schools and municipal space available at reasonable cost for residents to decrease other costs
 94. Multi-use (pools, tech shops)
 95. Police time in court
 96. Waterfront – who is responsible – two competing bodies – who has been paying?
 97. Concern is island airport expansion
 98. Benchmarking performance to justify costs? i.e. crime rate = police costs
 99. Clean and beautiful city – reduction in service can be counterproductive
 100. Wages – students paid too high
 101. Build power station (include garbage incineration + sludge) – power station as well
 102. Relocation of station
 103. Focus on Police, Fire and TTC
 104. Breakdown of #s (one-time?)
 105. Better prepared Councillors – read reports – pay increase, computers
 106. Look for more opportunities and contract out i.e. security guards instead of police
 107. Less police, deploy police better – use more cameras, look at other cities i.e. pay and display
 108. Use more green hornets
 109. More accountability for police – use cameras rather than building new force
 110. Treat our own garbage locally – use to heat home
 111. Eliminate ‘rework’ – make service more efficient
 112. Get it right this first time
 113. Stop duplication of services
 114. Better use of technology
 115. Better trained City employees i.e. management
 116. Run a city like a company
 117. Produce our own policy
 118. Break down property tax bill
 119. City bears the brunt of Provincial problems – more than other cities
 120. Find balance between accountability and responsibility
 121. Better use of equipment i.e. empty buses – use smaller buses in the pm
 122. Better allocation of community services i.e. basketball courts, meeting rooms
 123. Library board accounting needs to be more clearer and direct involvement of community when setting budget
 124. The library accounting system needs to be more transparent
 125. Info coming from the City needs to be clearer and reach the community better
 126. Need better ways of hearing from residents
 127. Advertising in major newspapers not government local papers
 128. Councillors should have similar meetings for their own wards
- East York Civic Centre**
129. Identify expenses that the Province can take back
 130. Cut unneeded expenses, i.e. relocating traffic lights
 131. Provincial government should honour commitment to provide more police (\$)
 132. Closer examination of TTC, Fire and Police budgets; look at management level and closer auditing of performance
 133. Provide rent subsidies rather than shelters to reduce homelessness – less expensive
 134. Federal government should help pay for services required to deal with homelessness, immigration, unemployment and under-employment that are unique to large City

135. Carefully review collective agreements and keep salary increases in line with cost of living
136. Greater Councillor scrutiny of police performance
137. Special budget review process (more thorough) for police and TTC and other top 5 expenditure categories
138. Reduce garbage to US with conservation culture
139. Contract out services i.e. garbage
140. Increase accountability so that money is not wasted
141. Why no loan forgiveness for the City?
142. Capping health benefits and pensions – people working in government get more
143. Employment – youth employment strategies
144. Arts in community
145. Publicizing Arts Not Action
146. Citizen involvement in programs
147. Ownership
148. Improving neighbourhoods
149. Privatize LCBO
150. Court system – concern about costs
151. Police visibility
152. Need proactive \$ for crime – after school programs – youth
153. Increasing officers only short-term effect
154. Instead increase social programs
155. Under-employed
156. Limit on social housing
157. Under-utilization of library spaces – facilities are there to use, i.e. after school programs
158. Literacy contributing to crime
159. Half of property tax goes to Queen’s Park
160. City should better manage funds for works projects – large projects not enough checks and balances on spending – yearly Council checks on spending
161. Others are concerned that this could increase costs
162. Better internal audits
163. More accountability
164. Cut staffing or staff hours
165. Examine union negotiations to look for cost savings
166. Benchmarking – cost comparisons with private sector to ensure they are in line
167. Look at community run parks; community members undertake maintenance activities; partnerships with neighbours; do this instead of hiring more people; community engagement; incorporate into union negotiations
168. Continue negotiations with the provincial and federal governments
169. Synergy among departments programs to decrease expenditures
170. Snow removal fees are exorbitant – reduce this fee
171. Reduce signage at Civic Centres
172. Stop speed hump installation
173. Reducing sidewalk and street cleaning – perform service more efficiently
174. Reduce technology spending
175. Smart cards for TTC
176. Don’t install 311 service
177. Cut IT budget in half
178. Do not re-design Nathan Phillips Square
179. Cancel Front St. Extension
180. Cancel St. Clair Right Of Way
181. True deficit is \$700 million – operating and capital
182. More meetings in East York – Many seniors in East York can’t get downtown
183. Sell Metro Hall
184. Cut City Staff fleet
185. More responsible management
186. Enforcement of counterfeit TTC tickets
187. Collect back-taxes and debts more effectively
188. Freeze Councillors pay – be straightforward about increases

189. Need good people, so must pay
190. Harmonize all waste services
191. De-Amalgamate
192. Stop maintenance of certain parks
193. Have fewer parks with better maintenance
194. Public consultation on staff and Council wages
195. Keep OMERS costs down – can City do anything?
196. Remove remote TTC routes at late hours that have low ridership, inefficient, particularly in wealthy neighbourhoods
197. More Council control over TTC management

Scarborough Civic Centre

198. Using volunteers to cut costs and improve service
199. Reduce labour force with retirement incentives
200. Concern with any excessive property tax increase
201. Citizen forums (ongoing) to help Council/Mayor – offer ideas, review budget expenditures and give advice on new revenue ideas (tap into community expertise)
202. Does the City have too many managers
203. Ask employees for good ideas (confidential – not given to supervisors)
204. Concern that TTC fare increase is too much
205. Concern that City may decrease social services, which will hurt people
206. Increase lobbying with Province to pay it's share
207. Just because a service is provincially mandated, the City is not right to think the Province should pay for all of it
208. Point out to Provincial government there is no difference between Mr. Harris telling City to pay for service and Mr. McGuinty telling them same thing
209. Mayor should consult with Toronto MPP's about what city needs
210. City is hiring too many police officers
211. Cut down on TTC drivers over time
212. More creative service planning (e.g.. reducing bus service on off-peak hours – too many empty buses
213. Invest in counselling to reduce violence and reduce need for police services
214. Province should bear expenses it wants City to cover
215. Combine departments to reduce employees and cut costs (at administration level)
216. Closer evaluation of programs to review costs
217. Partner with other organizations to cover some expenses (i.e. businesses, non-profits) – must also partner with Province and Feds
218. Do not privatize – more expensive – keep public service
219. Use and refine efficiency measures to improve services
220. Ask province and feds to share revenues (PST, GST, Income tax) generated by film industry in Toronto
221. City of Toronto lottery
222. Raise property taxes
223. Raise user fees
224. Fee for driving into City (e.g. London, England)
225. Do not raise user fees
226. Develop tourism strategy (Zoo, environment) for Scarborough and get Federal and Provincial governments to commit to giving City a portion of the new tax income it will generate
227. Issue a “Scarborough Bond”, specifically to improve transit (subway on RT, Sheppard)

- 228. Increase business taxes at the same rate as residential
- 229. Try to bring more businesses in, especially into Scarborough i.e. on Sheppard
- 230. Introduce a City of Toronto income tax
- 231. Massive sale of excess assets, i.e. land
- 232. Concern about pension costs
- 233. Cutting snow collecting costs
- 234. Finding efficiencies in snow removal services
- 235. Uploading to Province – TCHC
- 236. Affordable housing must be in City budget
- 237. Uploading with all municipalities to Federal Government
- 238. Increase Wheeltrans service – Province and Federal governments need to help fund
- 239. Uploading group home costs needed
- 240. Waste collection costs are justified
- 241. Put waste signs up to stop littering
- 242. Public education to reduce waste
- 243. Debt charges – why?
- 244. Waste levy for extra bags
- 245. Make solid waste separate body
- 250. Tax on excessive packaging to reduce garbage
- 251. Congestion tax or toll for downtown drivers
- 252. Community partnership program for youth and early retirees
- 253. Spend wisely
- 254. Ask for share of income tax
- 255. Instead of GST cut, request Fed government transfer the 1% to cities
- 256. Province fund TTC
- 257. Increase parking costs
- 258. Don't increase user fees on community services
- 259. Hotel tax
- 260. Charge parking fees in all parks
- 261. Require individuals charged with vandalism or littering to pick-up garbage
- 262. Reduce signs/flyers posted in public spaces to require those who post them to cleanup
- 263. Negotiate purchase agreements between TTC and major institutions (e.g. levies, bulk purchases)
- 264. Residential = 3% commercial 1% does it make sense? City should look at balance
- 265. Progressive tax – sales tax, provincial tax, corporate tax increase moves company to suburbs
- 266. Selling off works to get market value i.e. Skydome
- 267. Increase tourism \$ into tourism – spend \$ to make \$, package deals for tourism
- 268. Manage it properly – ie Toronto unlimited, go to other major centres to promote, bands, high \$ rate – negotiate with centres for package, TTC passes – taxing powers over tourism
- 269. High admission rates to tourist spots
- 270. Policy changes needed with Province and Federal level
- 271. Social programs – Province takes responsibility

Conversation 2

Concerns, advice and ideas about increasing City revenue

North York Civic Centre

- 246. Demand senior levels of government pay their share
- 247. Increase property taxes
- 248. Tax system for business whereby businesses pay based on profits with tax deductions for donations to specific services
- 249. Provide incentives for businesses that actively recruit youth and new graduates

272. Target large items to senior governments – i.e. housing, disability
273. Leverage with Province – national transfer – education, welfare, healthcare, social housing
274. More \$ from higher levels of government
275. Training so in few years can contribute with income tax
276. Increase social programs
277. Partner with corporations for training in exchange for keeping lower tax rates (stay with 1%)
278. User fees stay at minimal hiked – minimal cuts to social programs
279. Inflation rate, get it down
280. TTC and police encourage them to find efficiencies
281. Taxing garbage
282. Condos being taxed as commercial
283. Renting and selling of City lands
284. Luxury residential tax (houses over \$1million) – pay when selling, land transfer tax, different rates for housing costs, unified
285. City of Toronto lottery
286. Implementation of municipal bonds
287. Introduce tolls for people coming into core of City
288. Can the City put a royalty on natural gas (ie gas tax)
289. \$ to put back into City infrastructure
290. Citizens cannot afford additional tax increases
291. Up-loading should be to the Federal level not Provincial
292. Necessary for Torontonians to be more involved = education
293. Although the \$ may move to Province Torontonians still member of Province of Ontario. There problem will still exist with uploading
294. Ask cities to become provinces
295. Come up with more uniform tax system across the board
296. Education property tax bill should come directly from the Province – what would be the cost of doing this?
297. Should have a sustainable form of income each year so that we don't have to continue to address this budget problem
298. User fees for those visiting/working in City – e.g. toll roads, parks and recreation facilities and services
299. Invest in programs that won't increase our debt
300. Look at what other cities are doing
301. Use user fees to change behaviour in solid waste management. But ensure that education is a part of program
302. Energy conservation in City facilities and public – shouldn't be a disconnection between what City does and what public is asked to do. – lights out at night
303. Cheaper ways to manage solid waste
304. Very concerned that property taxes keep going up, but household income isn't necessarily increasing.

Etobicoke Collegiate Institute

305. Look at selling assets (ie metro hall)
306. Contracting out services/privatization – garbage, look at all services city provides to see if contracting out makes sense
307. Concern about rising business taxes – companies will start moving into 905 region – losing jobs
308. Look at increasing user fees on some services – swimming programs - cannot be across the board because not everyone can afford it – subsidize based on income – can't penalize youth who can't afford the user fees – jobs for youth

309. Looking at a “made in Toronto Ontario” solution for solid waste (ie incineration)
310. Should look at wages and if they are appropriate
311. Look internal for savings – City should lead by example – energy conservation at city hall and offices
312. Don’t think the city has successfully looked for savings
313. Increasing parking tickets
314. Following up on unpaid taxes and parking tickets
315. City is already too expensive to live – increasing taxes will make that worse - People will move out of city
316. City relies too much on consultants – too expensive
317. Concern about the users coming into city to work, but don’t pay for anything
318. No toll roads because it would be too expensive for Torontonians
319. Find ways to tax those that work in City but live elsewhere
320. More to draw tourists to City – will spend money here
321. Get Province to take on social housing, TTC and welfare cost reduction (1/2) in education tax did not balance, city was “short charges”
322. Council have ability to set share of a sales tax – hold a referendum
323. Auditor general to assess value of services rendered (independent)
324. Better enforcing by-laws – fines increase
325. Continue to collect gas tax and city decide on allocation
326. More transit fee to full-cost recovery from users
327. Penalize drivers in downtown Toronto alleviates tragic congestions
328. Rent/sell out existing under-used facilities (e.g. civic centres)
329. Increase taxes vs fines and fining
330. User fees not taxes
331. Increase revenue from tourism by fining for littering etc.
332. Increasing powers to the city seen as positive
333. Strategy – look at reducing expenses and not raising tax use user fees instead
334. Sell metro hall and lease back space
335. Tackle salaries and benefits
336. User Fees i.e. swimming lifeguard 2 hour pay for 1 hour work
337. Create more opportunities for use to increase people of people using facilities
338. Make conditions more favourable to increase use
339. Uploading to Province – what role
340. Housing – apply pressure
341. One-time deals not best way to balance budget
342. Gas tax - no new takes
343. More parking charges – increase areas of pay parking
344. Tax GO train tickets out of city
345. Tolls coming into city – problematic – more bureaucracy – economy downtown
346. Industry going to 905 or elsewhere vs. incoming
347. Well educated workforce, increase income
348. Create energy off bio-degradable waste
349. Garbage tags
350. Contract out services i.e. garbage – decrease wages just or fair
351. Need more building inspectors / enforcement for renovations
352. Tolls for vehicles in the City of Toronto - may have impact on others
353. \$ to beautify City
354. Call a bus service (bus in a weak link)
355. TTC should be 24 hours
356. Leave room in GST so that revenue can share with City
357. Demand more \$\$ back from Province

358. Need more consistent – long term \$
359. Need not only more inspectors but they need to be available during the summer
360. Better allocate GST / PST with City
361. Increase dumping fines
362. Fines for residents who don't maintain property
363. Condo units should be metered instead of part of fees
364. Use solar energy during construction (municipal buildings)
365. Find places where there is stronger wind - wind power i.e. downtown buildings (Bay St.)
366. Deep Lake water cooling – use more
367. Increase laneway development (downtown)
368. Any new building over 3 storeys should have options for a homeless person
369. More civic engagement – have these meetings more often
370. Careful in selling off assets
371. Slow down with privatization
372. Should not have given away 407
373. Put casinos on Toronto Island and build budget
374. We should vote on any expenditure
375. Legalize prostitution – have them pay taxes
376. Get Federal government involved in the budget process – not just Province
377. Proportional vote
378. New formula for sharing lottery earnings
- East York Civic Centre**
379. Don't sell assets – counterproductive
380. City of Toronto lottery, modeled on hospital fundraiser
381. Use a hotel tax
382. Federal government has \$8.23 (projected) surplus – go after some of these \$'s for transit etc.
383. Encourage businesses to be good corporate citizens and donate \$ for things that benefit them
384. Increase fines, especially for litter, graffiti etc.
385. Provide revenue generating services such as pet care
386. Promote more tourism to Toronto
387. Start screaming at the province
388. Province shares gains: for example, do study on how much Province gains from tourism to Toronto – share with the City
389. Charge cabs from airport
390. Go after full gas tax amount to fund infrastructure deficit
391. Look at increasing user fees (including TTC)
392. Banks should give the City more \$ to beautify Toronto and improve services, reduce fees
393. Don't make Metro pass transferable
394. City of Toronto Act – what tax will be increased?
395. Toronto partnering with other countries for tourism
396. TTC lottery – public lottery
397. Buying metro-pass" for people driving into city who could use TTC – pay to come into city – road toll for private autos would also increase ridership
398. Commuter Metro-pass (Mon-Fr only) – reduce pollution
399. Will make a need for increasing service levels, already at capacity
400. Increase capital for TTC to create ridership
401. Limit the timeline for Gas Tax and increase the amount we get (20c/\$1 but for short-term) to increase service levels
402. Cost saving in limiting pollution, decreasing hospital time
403. Keep the GST tax same in Toronto – would drive people to 905

404. Increase Winter tourism (but may not draw people) – promote the Path system
405. Toronto Lottery Corporation
406. Using more efficient energy i.e. air conditioning
407. License plate tax
408. Increasing parking fees/tickets
409. Net loss \$11 billion to Ottawa
410. Claw back transfers to Province and Feds in equalization payments (keep 25%)
411. Have a session with MPPs and MPs with citizens like this
412. Go to Queen’s Park re federal \$
413. Cutting costs – operating costs
414. Benefits – cap
415. Tender contracts – more frequent
416. Employment – less people on social assistance
417. Eliminate councillors’ ability to set salary
418. Where would cuts be made – why does library need \$ - that would undermine youth
419. Don’t understand need for more police; put more desk staff on street; two neighbourhoods in need – do they require that many more officers?
420. Keep property tax increases to 3%/year
421. Dissolving Port Authority
422. Look at increasing fines allowed through the City of Toronto Act
423. Waste management: use financial incentive to get people to recycle more because recycling programs are industry funded – educate people that this area is funded by outside sources
424. User fees to try to change behaviours – waste management
425. Concerns about increased user fees on Parks & Recreation programs
426. Put \$ into programs that will enhance City
427. More parking fees for larger vehicles – revenue could be used for TTC
428. Parking downtown should be prohibitively expensive
429. Look at way to tax those that come into city to work, but live in 905 region
430. Go Transit should be funded by Province, i.e. road tolls at borders
431. Concern that we are encouraging businesses to leave Toronto because it’s too expensive here – losing jobs and tax base – build up commercial tax base
432. Property taxes should not be based on value of house – assess size of property and level of services
433. Property assessments are rising at too high a rate – not even across system
434. Upload Gardiner Expressway costs to the Province
435. User fees on garbage extra bags – concern about illegal dumping
436. Police radars – increase speed ticketing – contract out the radars
437. Lobby the provincial and Feds – focus on Feds
438. Developing under-utilized land – property taxes
439. Speculator tax – to limit property tax increases on seniors when old houses knocked down by speculators
440. How can City implement Speculator tax?
441. 3% property tax is the limit
442. Don’t cut services
443. Certain areas (under-used valuable land) should be taxed higher
444. Cut projects not services, eg. Nathan Phillips Square
445. Increase radar ticketing
446. Re-negotiate with Province to collect radar \$\$
447. Enforcement of by-laws – anti-littering and idling
448. Collecting back taxes
449. Increase building permit fees, process fees more quickly – need more staff

- 450. Fine illegal building – extension of homes – collect “real” cost of properties that are illegally converted – staffing challenge of enforcement
- 451. Need more by-law officers for littering
- 452. Animal services by-law fee is unfair and shortsighted – will cause increase of homeless pets
- 453. Fine irresponsible pet owners
- 454. Advertising on city garbage trucks
- 455. Advertise on bins
- 456. Harmonizing ticketing costs of TTC based on distance
- 457. Reducing user fees (fares) will mean more people using service and increased revenue
- 458. Consider increasing property taxes above current commitment by Council
- 459. Examine collecting tolls on roads at certain times (e.g. special events)
- 460. Collect surcharge on event tickets 0 (easier to collect than tolls)
- 461. Tax planes taking off/landing at Island Airport
- 462. Increase parking meter fee (at levels of private parking lots and garages)
- 463. A campaign for ideas to increase revenues
- 464. Creative fundraising like hospitals do (selling shirts, lotteries)
- 465. Create a fundraising department at City of Toronto Special events and promotions to attract people to Toronto
- 466. Looking at cutting wages and overtime
- 467. Cutting exp. More tendering and competitive bidding on City purchases and contracts – hard to find on internet
- 468. Cap staff overtime expenses
- 469. Transfer cost of EMS staff waiting time to hospital
- 470. Limit staff/councillors wage increases
- 471. Limit staff severance packages
- 472. Limit borrowing \$ for operating costs
- 473. Prevent fraudulent TTC tickets
- 474. Better scrutiny of City contracts – increased transparency in spending
- 475. Province exempt licensing fees for City vehicles
- 476. Improve collection of outstanding parking fees, arrears in property taxes
- 477. City tax on the sale of homes
- 478. Congestion toll for people driving downtown during peak hours (e.g. as in London)
- 479. City tax on downtown parking fees
- 480. User fees to finance certain specific services/facilities (e.g. soccer stadium) – excluding recreation services and school facilities
- 481. More self-management of food concessions in public spaces
- 482. Increase fees for filming in the City
- 483. Garbage tax after certain # of bags (eg.1,4)

Plenary Session

How should Council balance the budget

North York Civic Centre

- 484. Small amounts to improve City in areas
- 485. Budget problems are not going to be resolved – unless we upload back to the Province – and that the uploading needs to be done over a period of several years
- 486. Separating capital from operating worked out badly – because you don’t notice the impact one has on the other – should re-open the capital particularly re the technical budget
- 487. Thinking long-term in how we make decisions about spending – spending more money in areas like public transportation and cleaner air – in the long term you save on public health – we spend so that we see

- immediate results – but we should think about the long-term
488. Let's not do a clean and beautiful city until we clean up the streets by getting rid of the cars
489. Element of self-responsibility emphasized – graffiti is on public property – those who make the mess – should be forced to clean it up
490. Responsibility of Council going to the public for more engagement – the public needs to be aware of the allocation of resources – particularly the police budget – political hot-potato but we really need to cap it.
491. Re clean and beautiful – social housing costs – we would be a more clean and beautiful City with a Federal housing strategy, social program investment as well – clean and beautiful expands past transportation to strong neighbourhoods and social programs
492. 22 ridings in city – 22 Mps, 22 MPPs – need to have only 22 Councillors
493. But may not save too much, hard to get representative
494. Replacing missing sidewalks on arterial roads and not on widening road = clean and beautiful – health
495. Police budget is 98% salaries – where can cuts be made?
496. City lottery – casino – gambling increases crime, and not the cities job – will be in competition with NGO's – just moving the money around and the NGO will need to go to City for grant money. Should be put to the public on a ballot. Lottery yes – casino no
497. Enforce City snow by-law fine collection to increase revenue
498. Municipal savings bonds can we have them....?
499. Value of property to set variable rate
500. Why upload to the Province when we should upload to the feds – the Province is only going to tell us that they don't have the money – the money is with the feds...
- Etobicoke Collegiate Institute**
501. Increase youth programs – will see benefits in other areas
502. Follow through on plans that were approved by Citizens and Council – do not let the minority determine what is funded.
503. Social services are used by people living outside Toronto
504. Efficient use of school resources for community recreation – put pressure on Province to fund
505. Use current facilities more efficiently rather than build new ones
506. Multiple use of building facilities
507. Police time spent in courts increasing – deploy them to the streets. Let Province pay; for police time spent in court.
508. Competing city agencies – duplication of services
509. Shut down the Toronto Port Authority
510. Benchmarks to understand police budget.- who sets the standards. Benchmark performance to justify costs
511. Cutting services will impact Council Priority # 1 – Clean and Beautiful City
512. Why pay above minimum wage to pick up garbage?
513. Use less consultants – staff can do the job
514. Use power plants to burn garbage and generate energy
515. Energy conservation measures –incentives to citizens to be efficient
516. User fees should be reasonable
517. Citizens only allowed swimming for 1 hour, but lifeguards have to be paid for a minimum of 2 hours

- 518. Increase the number of people using recreation facilities by creating favourable conditions
- 519. Upload social programs to Province
- 520. Direct funding relationship between the Federal government and the City.
- 521. Gas tax should continue to come to cities
- 522. City of Toronto Act – new revenue sources
- 523. Tolls on expressways
- 524. Hotel tax
- 525. Parking meters on more streets
- 526. Well-educated workforce to attract businesses
- 527. Alternative ways of generating energy
- 528. Contract out garbage services
- 529. Enforce by-laws for idle vehicles and littering
- 530. City levies consumption tax directly – long term revenue source

East York Civic Centre

- 531. Privatize Zoo if not a profit maker for the City
- 532. Can we afford program “enhancements” – safety measures should be seen as priorities (little investment, big payback), ie. Cycling safety, education programs
- 533. Higher than 3% property taxes OK
- 534. Use other than property taxes to operate revenues – hotel tax, etc.
- 535. Double cost of water to user
- 536. User fees for garbage to cover cost of waste management – like water
- 537. Put cost of waste back on the source of garbage – packaging
- 538. Amalgamation costs/loan \$20 million should be forgiven by province
- 539. Encourage businesses to locate in Toronto

- 540. Negotiate for a percentage of corporate income tax from upper levels of government
- 541. Tax rebates should be given to cities not individuals/companies
- 542. Sell municipal bonds
- 543. EMS needs to be rationalized to be cost effective
- 544. Connect provincial property tax credit to incomes so low income earners can afford increased property taxes
- 545. Tax holiday for new business so more businesses locate here (cautions raised)
- 546. Negotiate with province a rebate for positive impact of Public Health initiatives
- 547. Review where health related initiatives are in the budget put in Public Health budget – gets provincial funding
- 548. Expand user fees
- 549. Increase parking fines
- 550. Put a surcharge on downtown parking lot fees for parking that goes to City
- 551. Tolls
- 552. Decentralize services so they are locally available

Scarborough Civic Centre

- 553. Review costs for effectiveness – cut waste
- 554. Promote tourism
- 555. We focus on old revenues – we need to create new ones
- 556. Have federal government to fund more police services (use experienced soldiers to work with police) instead of hiring more City police – 500 soldiers would save \$250 million
- 557. If no jobs for new immigrants, federal government should support people needing support instead of the City
- 558. Cut top heavy administration costs

559. Encourage more new businesses – make taxes easier to pay
560. More private initiatives to provide services
561. Get province to act responsibly – upload or pay up
562. Don't just rely on property taxes
563. Find new sources!!
564. Partnerships are good
565. Council is too large
566. Budget on a longer term
567. User fees unfair to poor – waive fees for poor
568. User fees for those who can afford recreation services
569. Road tolls? Don Valley? No
570. City of Toronto Act
571. Hotel tax should be used
572. Does capacity exist to expand ridership on TTC? NO
573. Carpooling services should connect with TTC to increase ridership,
574. Reduce car use – save \$\$ on road repairs
575. No fare increases for TTC
576. Tax on new large homes – 2 car garages, multiple washrooms
577. Graduated tax
578. Environmental tax
579. Get \$ from license plate registration
580. Toll tax – by license plate
581. Education vs. punishment – by-law officers
582. Advertising on shelters, bins OK
583. Hotel tax
584. Private partnerships for cultural festivals
585. Property tax insufficient
586. User fees (with exemption for poor) as opposed to property tax hikes
587. Sell inefficient assets only
588. What is the future of City's commitment to affordable housing given present budget shortfalls?
589. Cut debt servicing costs – prioritize urgent capital projects and stall less important projects. Do not put up buildings that are costly to maintain
590. More transparency in City so that citizens can know where money is being spent – must be more open if we want citizens participation.
591. Hire more counsellors and less police officers
592. Police assume people will do wrong – people are arrested on suspicion – this ties up the court system
593. City should use more standard accounting procedures rather than reporting on a gross and net basis – City's actual debt not very clear.
594. Every year at this time there is a sense of urgency – is there ongoing work on how to keep services and balance the budget?