

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page No.

<b><u>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</u></b> .....	<b>III</b>
<b><u>1. INTRODUCTION</u></b> .....	<b>1</b>
1.1 <u>Study Background</u> .....	1
1.2 <u>Objectives</u> .....	2
1.3 <u>Scope of Work</u> .....	3
1.4 <u>Organization of This Report</u> .....	3
<b><u>2. HUMAN HEALTH AND ECOLOGICAL RISK ASSESSMENT APPROACH</u></b> .....	<b>5</b>
<b><u>3. BACKGROUND ON BIOSOLIDS PELLETS AND REGULATORY FRAMEWORK</u></b> .....	<b>8</b>
3.1 <u>Literature Review</u> .....	8
3.1.1 <u>Review of Government Documents</u> .....	8
3.1.2 <u>Review of Scientific Literature</u> .....	9
3.1.3 <u>Review of Grey Literature</u> .....	9
3.1.4 <u>Summary</u> .....	9
3.2 <u>Study Background on City of Toronto Pellets</u> .....	10
3.2.1 <u>Ashbridges Bay Waste Water Treatment Plant</u> .....	10
3.2.2 <u>Pelletizer Operations</u> .....	11
3.2.3 <u>Potential Uses for Pellets in the City of Toronto</u> .....	13
3.2.4 <u>Regulatory Framework</u> .....	15
3.2.4.1 <u>Pellets: Biosolid or Fertilizer?</u> .....	16
3.2.5 <u>Ontario Framework</u> .....	16
3.2.5.1 <u>Guidelines for the Utilization of Biosolids and Other Wastes on                     Agricultural Land (March 1996)</u> .....	16
3.2.5.2 <u>Ontario Nutrient Management Act and Regulation 267/03</u> .....	18
3.2.6 <u>Federal Fertilizers Act and Regulations</u> .....	19
3.2.6.1 <u>T-4-93 Standards for metals in fertilizers and supplements</u> .....	20
3.2.6.2 <u>T-4-106 Organic Fertilizers under the Fertilizers Act</u> .....	21
3.2.6.3 <u>T-4-112 Information Required for the Assessment of By-Products and                     Other “Waste” Materials Sold as Fertilizers or Supplements</u> .....	21
3.2.6.4 <u>T-4-113 Guidelines to Safety Assessments of Fertilizers and Supplements                     and to Information to be Submitted in Demonstrating Product Safety</u> .....	22
3.2.7 <u>Other Jurisdictions</u> .....	22
3.2.7.1 <u>Canadian Provinces</u> .....	25
3.2.7.2 <u>United States Environmental Protection Agency</u> .....	26
3.2.7.3 <u>European Union</u> .....	27
3.2.7.4 <u>Western Australia</u> .....	28
3.2.7.5 <u>Summary</u> .....	29
<b><u>4. PELLET QUALITY DATA</u></b> .....	<b>30</b>
4.1 <u>City of Toronto’s Monitoring Program</u> .....	30
4.2 <u>Risk Assessment Data Set</u> .....	30
4.3 <u>Evaluation of Pellet Integrity</u> .....	34



<b>5.</b>	<b><u>HUMAN HEALTH RISK FROM CHEMICAL EXPOSURE</u></b>	<b>36</b>
5.1	<u>Hazard Identification</u>	36
5.1.1	<u>Selection of Entities of Potential Concern</u>	36
5.2	<u>Dose-Response Assessment</u>	38
5.2.1	<u>Toxicity Reference Values</u>	39
5.2.1.1	<u>Non-carcinogenic EoPC TRVs</u>	39
5.2.1.2	40	
5.2.1.3	<u>Carcinogenic EoPC TRVs</u>	41
5.2.2	<u>Bioavailability</u>	41
5.2.3	<u>Dermal Toxicity</u>	42
5.3	<u>Exposure Assessment</u>	43
5.3.1	<u>Exposure Pathways</u>	43
5.3.2	<u>Receptor Identification and Characteristics</u>	43
5.3.2.1	<u>Potential Exposure Mechanisms</u>	45
5.3.3	<u>City Worker Scenarios</u>	45
5.3.3.1	<u>City Parks Worker</u>	46
5.3.3.2	<u>City Landfill Worker</u>	49
5.3.4	<u>Recreational Use Scenario</u>	51
5.3.4.1	<u>Toddler and Composite Receptors</u>	51
5.3.4.2	<u>Adult Golfer</u>	54
5.3.5	<u>Home Use Scenario</u>	57
5.3.5.1	<u>Residential Toddler</u>	57
5.3.5.2	<u>Residential Adult</u>	60
5.3.6	<u>Summary of Exposure Assessment</u>	64
5.3.7	<u>Concentrations of EoPCs</u>	65
5.3.7.1	<u>Concentration in Amended Soils</u>	65
5.3.7.2	<u>Concentration of EoPCs in Garden Vegetables</u>	70
5.3.7.3	<u>Concentrations of EoPCs in Air</u>	74
5.3.8	<u>Chronic Daily Intake and Lifetime Averaged Daily Intake of EoPCs</u>	75
5.3.8.1	<u>City Parks Worker Pellet Application Daily Intakes of EoPCs</u>	75
5.3.8.2	<u>Recreational Daily Intakes of EoPCs</u>	77
5.3.8.3	<u>Residential Daily Intakes of EoPCs</u>	79
5.4	<u>Risk Characterization</u>	81
5.4.1	<u>Non-carcinogenic Risk Assessment Approach and Methodology</u>	82
5.4.2	<u>Carcinogenic Risk Assessment Approach and Methodology</u>	83
5.4.3	<u>Risk Characterization Results for City Parks Worker</u>	84
5.4.4	<u>Risk Assessment Results for Recreational Exposure</u>	86
5.4.5	<u>Risk Assessment Results for Home Use</u>	88
5.4.6	<u>Summary of the Risk Characterization of the Non-Carcinogens</u>	90
5.4.7	<u>Discussion on Potential Carcinogenic Risk from Exposure to Arsenic from Pellets</u>	91
5.5	<u>Uncertainty Analysis</u>	92
5.5.1	<u>Uncertainties in Hazard Assessment Assumptions</u>	93
5.5.2	<u>Uncertainties in Toxicological Information</u>	96
5.5.3	<u>Uncertainties in Exposure Parameters</u>	97
5.5.3.1	<u>Body Surface Area</u>	97
5.5.3.2	<u>Arsenic Concentration without Background</u>	98
5.5.3.3	<u>Mixing Depth of Surface Soil</u>	99
5.5.4	<u>Modelling Assumptions</u>	100



<b>6.</b>	<b><u>HUMAN HEALTH RISK FROM EXPOSURE TO BIOLOGICAL AGENTS</u></b>	<b>108</b>
6.1	<u>Limitations of the Study</u>	108
6.2	<u>Vegetative Bacteria and Enveloped Viruses</u>	109
6.3	<u>Bacterial Spores</u>	110
6.4	<u>Human Enteric Viruses</u>	110
6.5	<u>Protozoan Parasites</u>	111
6.6	<u>Helminths</u>	111
6.7	<u>Prions</u>	111
6.8	<u>Summary of Biological Issues</u>	112
<b>7.</b>	<b><u>ECOLOGICAL RISK ASSESSMENT</u></b>	<b>115</b>
7.1	<u>Preliminary Qualitative Assessment of Plant Toxicity</u>	117
7.2	<u>Receptor Characterization</u>	117
7.3	<u>Exposure Assessment</u>	121
7.4	<u>Hazard Assessment</u>	128
7.5	<u>Risk Characterization</u>	132
	7.5.1 <u>Approach</u>	133
	7.5.2 <u>Results</u>	133
7.6	<u>Uncertainty Analysis</u>	136
<b>8.</b>	<b><u>EMERGING ISSUES</u></b>	<b>139</b>
8.1	<u>Odour</u>	139
8.2	<u>Polybrominated Diphenyl Ethers</u>	141
8.3	<u>Phthalates</u>	142
8.4	<u>Alkylphenol Ethoxylates</u>	143
	8.4.1 <u>Nonylphenol</u>	144
	8.4.2 <u>Ethoxylates</u>	144
8.5	<u>Endocrine Disruptors</u>	144
8.6	<u>Linear Alkylbenzene Sulphonates</u>	145
8.7	<u>Pharmaceuticals</u>	145
8.8	<u>Radionuclides</u>	146
<b>9.</b>	<b><u>CONCLUSIONS</u></b>	<b>148</b>
9.1	<u>Study Overview</u>	148
9.2	<u>Summary of Findings</u>	148
	9.2.1 <u>Human Health Risks from Non-Carcinogenic Effects</u>	148
	9.2.2 <u>Human Health Risks from Carcinogenic Effects</u>	149
	9.2.3 <u>Biological Agents</u>	149
9.3	<u>Ecological Risks</u>	150
<b>10.</b>	<b><u>STATEMENT OF LIMITATIONS</u></b>	<b>153</b>
<b>11.</b>	<b><u>REFERENCES</u></b>	<b>155</b>



## LIST OF APPENDICES

<b>APPENDIX A – DOSE-RESPONSE PROFILES .....</b>	<b>A-1</b>
1. Introduction .....	A-6
2. Arsenic .....	A-10
3. Cadmium .....	A-20
4. Chromium III.....	A-28
5. Cobalt .....	A-34
6. Copper .....	A-42
7. Lead A-50	
8. Mercury – Elemental.....	A-57
9. Molybdenum .....	A-63
10. Nickel .....	A-68
11. Phosphorus.....	A-74
12. Selenium .....	A-75
13. Zinc A-80	
14. Polychlorinated Biphenyls (PCBs) .....	A-85
15. Polychlorinated Dibenzo-para-Dioxins and polychlorinated dibenzofurans .....	A-95
<b>APPENDIX B – HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT EQUATIONS .....</b>	<b>B-1</b>
1. Amended Soils Scenarios .....	B-3
<b>APPENDIX C – HUMAN RECEPTOR CHARACTERISTICS .....</b>	<b>C-1</b>
1. Receptor Characteristics by Age Groups .....	C-2
2. Body Surface Area.....	C-9
3. Gardening Time.....	C-9
4. References .....	C-9
<b>APPENDIX D - ECOLOGICAL RECEPTOR CHARCTERISTICS.....</b>	<b>D-1</b>
<b>APPENDIX E - ANALYTICAL DATA .....</b>	<b>E-1</b>
1. Cake Data .....	E-2
2. Pellet Data .....	E-11
3. Calculations.....	E-13
4. Exposure Assessment and Risk Evaluation Calculations.....	E-22



**APPENDIX F - USE OF BIOSOLID CAKE DATA VS. PELLET DATA..... F-1**

**APPENDIX G - THE BIOLOGICAL ISSUES RELATED TO USE OF A PELLETIZER FOR  
THE DECONTAMINATION OF BIOSOLIDS IN TORONTO ..... G-1**

**APPENDIX H – PEER REVIEW COMMENTS ..... H-1**

**APPENDIX I – RESPONSE TO PEER REVIEW COMMENTS ..... I-1**

- 1. Specific Comments ..... I-5**
- 2. Copy Edits ..... I-31**



## LIST OF FIGURES

	<u>Page No.</u>
Figure 2-1: Human Health and Ecological Risk Assessment Framework .....	6
Figure 3-1: Segher Keppel's HARDpelletiser Process .....	12
Figure 3-2: City of Toronto Approved Label for ABTP Produced Biosolids Pellets .....	17
Figure 4-1: Pellets Spread on Felt .....	34
Figure 4-2: Dry and Humid Pellet Sizes .....	35
Figure 5-1: Conceptual Model for City Parks Worker Scenario .....	48
Figure 5-2: Conceptual Model for City Landfill Worker Scenario .....	51
Figure 5-3: Conceptual Model for Toddler for Recreational Use Scenario .....	54
Figure 5-4: Conceptual Model for Adult - Recreational Use Scenario .....	57
Figure 5-5: Conceptual Model for Toddler - Home Use Scenario .....	61
Figure 5-6: Conceptual Model for Adult - Home Use Scenario .....	64
Figure 5-7: Percent Contribution of Each Ingestion/Dermal Exposure Pathway to Residential Composite Receptor Cancer Risk.....	91

## LIST OF TABLES

	<u>Page No.</u>
<a href="#"><u>Table 3-1: Fifteen Nutrients Considered Essential for Plant Growth</u></a> .....	13
<a href="#"><u>Table 3-2: T-4-93 Standards for Cumulative Metal Addition to Soil</u></a> .....	20
<a href="#"><u>Table 3-3: Biosolids Regulations and Standards From Various Jurisdictions</u></a> .....	23
<a href="#"><u>Table 3-4: Western Australia's Classification and End Uses of Biosolids</u></a> .....	29
<a href="#"><u>Table 4-1: Analytical Data for Trace Organics in Biosolids Cake from 1996 to 2003, Used as the Pellet Concentration</u></a> .....	32
<a href="#"><u>Table 4-2: Analytical Data for Inorganic Chemicals in Biosolids Cake<sup>a</sup> from 1996 to 2003, Used as the Pellet Concentration</u></a> .....	33
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-1: Toxicity Reference Values for Non-Carcinogenic Substances</u></a> .....	39
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-2: Toxicity Values for Carcinogenic Substances</u></a> .....	41
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-3: Selected Relative Bioavailability Factors</u></a> .....	42
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-4: Human Receptors considered in the Biosolids Pellet Study</u></a> .....	44
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-5: Exposure Definitions</u></a> .....	45
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-6: Potential Exposure Scenarios - City Parks Worker</u></a> .....	46
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-7: City Parks Worker Characteristics</u></a> .....	47
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-8: Potential Exposure Scenarios - City Landfill Worker</u></a> .....	49
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-9: City Landfill Worker Characteristics</u></a> .....	50
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-10: Potential Exposure Routes for Recreational Use Scenario - Toddler and Composite Receptors</u></a> .....	52
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-11: Toddler and Composite Receptor Characteristics</u></a> .....	53
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-12: Potential Exposures for Adult Golfer - Recreational Use Scenario</u></a> .....	55
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-13: Adult Golfer Characteristics</u></a> .....	56
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-14: Potential Toddler Exposure - Home Use Scenario</u></a> .....	58
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-15: Residential Toddler and Composite Receptor Characteristics</u></a> .....	59
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-16: Potential Adult Exposure - Home Use Scenario</u></a> .....	62
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-17: Residential Adult Characteristics</u></a> .....	63
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-18: Summary of Receptors and Exposure Pathways</u></a> .....	65
<a href="#"><u>Table 5-19: Assumed Landfill Topdressing Components</u></a> .....	67



<a href="#">Table 5-20:</a>	<a href="#">Exposure Point Concentrations of EoPCs in Amended Soil Over 25 years Based on a 5.4 t/ha annual application rate</a> .....	69
<a href="#">Table 5-21:</a>	<a href="#">Summary of Physical-Chemical Parameters</a> .....	71
<a href="#">Table 5-22:</a>	<a href="#">Bioconcentration Factors from Soil to Food Type</a> .....	72
<a href="#">Table 5-23:</a>	<a href="#">Summary of Estimated Soil and Plant Concentrations</a> .....	74
<a href="#">Table 5-24:</a>	<a href="#">Summary of Estimated Air Concentrations</a> .....	75
<a href="#">Table 5-25:</a>	<a href="#">City Parks Worker Chronic Daily Intake and Lifetime Averaged Daily Intake</a> .....	76
<a href="#">Table 5-26:</a>	<a href="#">City Landfill Worker Chronic Daily Intake and Lifetime Averaged Daily Intake</a> .....	77
<a href="#">Table 5-27:</a>	<a href="#">Recreational Toddler Chronic Daily Intake and Composite Receptor Average Daily Intake</a> .....	78
<a href="#">Table 5-28:</a>	<a href="#">Golfer Chronic Daily Intake and Lifetime Averaged Daily Intake</a> .....	79
<a href="#">Table 5-29:</a>	<a href="#">Residential Toddler Chronic Daily Intake and Lifetime Averaged Daily Intake</a> .....	80
<a href="#">Table 5-30:</a>	<a href="#">Residential Adult Chronic Daily Intake</a> .....	81
<a href="#">Table 5-31:</a>	<a href="#">Risk Characterization for City Parks Worker Scenario</a> .....	85
<a href="#">Table 5-32:</a>	<a href="#">Risk Characterization for City Landfill Worker Scenario</a> .....	86
<a href="#">Table 5-33:</a>	<a href="#">Risk Characterization for Toddler and Composite Receptor - Recreational Use Scenario</a> .....	87
<a href="#">Table 5-34:</a>	<a href="#">Risk Characterization for Golfer - Recreational Use Scenario</a> .....	88
<a href="#">Table 5-35:</a>	<a href="#">Risk Characterization for Toddler and Composite Receptor - Home Use Scenario</a> .....	89
<a href="#">Table 5-36:</a>	<a href="#">Risk Characterization for Adult - Home Use Scenario</a> .....	90
<a href="#">Table 5-37:</a>	<a href="#">Estimated Chromium VI Concentrations</a> .....	93
<a href="#">Table 5-38:</a>	<a href="#">Selected Toxicity Reference Values for Chromium VI</a> .....	94
<a href="#">Table 5-39:</a>	<a href="#">Selected Relative Bioavailabilities for Chromium VI</a> .....	94
<a href="#">Table 5-40:</a>	<a href="#">Chromium VI Uncertainty Assessment</a> .....	94
<a href="#">Table 5-41:</a>	<a href="#">Comparison of Arsenic Concentrations With and Without Background</a> .....	98
<a href="#">Table 5-42:</a>	<a href="#">Arsenic Exposure Ratio Comparison</a> .....	98
<a href="#">Table 5-43:</a>	<a href="#">EoPC Concentrations Assuming 2 cm Mixing Depth</a> .....	99
<a href="#">Table 5-44:</a>	<a href="#">Surface Soil Mixing Depth Uncertainty Analysis</a> .....	100
<a href="#">Table 5-45:</a>	<a href="#">Evaluation of Assumptions in the Risk Analysis</a> .....	101
<a href="#">Table 7-1:</a>	<a href="#">Ecotoxicity of Soil Based on Plants or Invertebrates</a> .....	118
<a href="#">Table 7-2:</a>	<a href="#">Summary of VECs Selected</a> .....	121
<a href="#">Table 7-3:</a>	<a href="#">Uptake Factors from Soil to Food Type (UF) (kg/kg fw)</a> .....	124
<a href="#">Table 7-4:</a>	<a href="#">Summary of Physical-Chemical Parameters</a> .....	127
<a href="#">Table 7-5:</a>	<a href="#">Summary of Selected TRVs for Ecological Receptors</a> .....	129
<a href="#">Table 7-6:</a>	<a href="#">Summary of Factors for Body Weight Scaling of TRVs</a> .....	131
<a href="#">Table 7-7:</a>	<a href="#">Summary of Ecological HQs for Home or Recreational Use Scenario</a> .....	134
<a href="#">Table 7-8:</a>	<a href="#">Summary of Ecological HQs for Landfill Use Scenario</a> .....	135
<a href="#">Table 7-9:</a>	<a href="#">Evaluation of Assumptions in Ecological Risk Analysis</a> .....	137
<a href="#">Table 8-1:</a>	<a href="#">Heat Dried Pellets with 33% Moisture Added and Soil Inoculation Odour Description</a> .....	140

