


**Decision Document**


---

## Board of Health

<b>Meeting No.</b>	24	<b>Contact</b>	Candy Davidovits, Committee Administrator
<b>Meeting Date</b>	Monday, June 15, 2009	<b>Phone</b>	416-392-8032
<b>Start Time</b>	1:00 PM	<b>E-mail</b>	boh@toronto.ca
<b>Location</b>	Committee Room 1, City Hall	<b>Chair</b>	Councillor John Filion

---

*The Decision Document is for preliminary reference purposes only. Please refer to the Board of Health's Report to City Council or to the Minutes for the official record.*

**How to Read the Decision Document:**

- *Recommendations of the Board of Health to City Council appear after the item heading.*
- *Other action taken by the Board on its own authority, which does not require Council's approval, is listed in the decision document under the heading "Decision Advice and Other Information".*
- *Declarations of Interest, if any, appear at the end of an item.*

*Minutes Confirmed – May 19, 2009*

HL24.4	ACTION	Amended		Ward: All
--------	--------	---------	--	-----------

### **Air Quality Impact Assessment - Metrolinx Georgetown South Service Expansion and Union-Pearson Rail Link**

#### **Decision Advice and Other Information**

The Board of Health:

1. requested Metrolinx to do the following as part of its assessment of the proposed Georgetown South Service Expansion and Union-Pearson Rail Link:
  - a. make the following additions to the consultants' risk assessment studies:
    - i. estimate particulate deposition to soil, and evaluate skin contact and ingestion exposures to these particulates;
    - ii. evaluate diesel exhaust both as a whole and as a mixture of individual components;

- iii. undertake an ultrafine particulate matter (PM0.1) monitoring program to characterize baseline concentrations and concentration gradients in collaboration with the Environmental Protection Office of Toronto Public Health and provide the assessment to the Medical Officer of Health that allows the public sufficient time to comment before Metrolinx finalizes its Environmental Project Report;
    - b. conduct a health impact assessment (HIA) study, in consultation with the Medical Officer of Health, to examine the distribution in the community of risks and benefits from the proposed Georgetown South Service Expansion and Union-Pearson Rail Link;
    - c. estimate the contribution of each train line operating on the Georgetown South Corridor to total, annual diesel exhaust emissions, and thereby predict the emissions reductions achievable through electrification of GO Georgetown services and the Union-Pearson Rail Link; and
    - d. make the above information available in a way that allows the public sufficient time to review and comment before Metrolinx finalizes its Environmental Project Report;
2. requested the Medical Officer of Health to review the risk assessment reports, air quality impact mitigation strategy and health impact assessment when they are released by Metrolinx, and provide input to Metrolinx and the public through the Environmental Bill of Rights Registry;
3. requested Metrolinx to:
  - a. electrify the Georgetown South Service Expansion and the Union-Pearson Rail Link prior to implementing expanded service;
  - b. apply the following good practices for the protection of public health to the Georgetown South Service Expansion and the Union-Pearson Rail Link until such time as electrification is in place:
    - i. select hybrid locomotives with on-board rechargeable energy storage systems and regenerative braking;
    - ii. select new locomotives and remanufacture systems of the best available technology, which may be more advanced than that required by the current US EPA emissions standards for line-haul locomotives;
    - iii. use ultra low-sulphur diesel (ULSD, 15 ppm);
    - iv. ensure that idle control systems are in place, and develop and implement idling reduction policies;
    - v. regularly assess and maintain tracks and locomotives to maintain emissions performance at or above the relevant emissions standards; and

- vi. develop a detailed mitigation strategy to manage the residual human health risks;
    - c. collaborate with Toronto Public Health, City Planning, and Transportation Services to ensure that the stations on the Georgetown South Corridor are developed into connected “mobility hubs” where residents can live, shop, eat, work, play, and connect to active transportation and public transit;
    - d. to apply the good practices for the protection of public health requested above to all non-electrified GO transit rail services that pass through residential neighbourhoods in the City of Toronto;
4. recommended to Metrolinx that the Georgetown South Service Expansion and the Union-Pearson Rail Link not proceed until recommendations from the Board of Health have been addressed;
5. requested Metrolinx to immediately release its consultants’ report on electrification of the Georgetown South Service Expansion and that upon the release of the consultants’ report, the Medical Officer of Health review it and provide input to Metrolinx and the public through the Environmental Bill of Rights Registry and the Environmental Project Review (EPR);
6. forwarded this report to Canadian National Railway, Canadian Pacific Railway and Via Rail Canada, and requested that they apply the good practices for the protection of public health requested above to their services that pass through residential neighbourhoods in the City of Toronto;
7. forwarded this report to:
  - a. the Clean Train Coalition, Environmental Health Association of Ontario, Mount Dennis Community Association and Weston Community Coalition;
  - b. the Toronto District Catholic School Board and Toronto District School Board;
  - c. the Medical Officers of Health for Halton and Peel Regions;
  - d. the Ontario Minister of the Environment;
  - e. the Federal Ministers of the Environment and Transportation;
  - f. all local Members of Parliament and Members of Provincial Parliament; and
  - g. the Premier of Ontario;
8. forwarded a copy of this report to the Chief Medical Officer of Health for Ontario for review and with the request that she advise the Minister of the Environment on all adverse health impacts of the current Metrolinx proposal; and

9. forwarded this report and the Board of Health's decision to the Parks and Environment Committee for its June 16, 2009, meeting.

## **Origin**

(June 3, 2009) Report from the Medical Officer of Health

## **Summary**

In response to requests from the Board of Health and the Parks and Environment Committee, Toronto Public Health (TPH) undertook a review of the health-related studies under preparation by Metrolinx' consultants for the proposed Georgetown South Service Expansion and Union-Pearson Rail Link. The scope of this review was dependent on the availability of data from Metrolinx.

The Medical Officer of Health (MOH) and City Council support enhancements to public transit such as those proposed by Metrolinx. However, the potential health impacts associated with diesel exhaust from increased train traffic are cause for concern. Diesel exhaust and many of its component pollutants are associated with significant health impacts. In addition, certain residential neighbourhoods through which the trains will pass have lower socioeconomic status than the average for the City and, therefore, are particularly vulnerable to any health impacts that may occur.

This report recommends improvements to Metrolinx' assessment of its proposed project, including a health impact assessment and changes in scope to better estimate exposure and health effects. Electrification of the Georgetown GO Line and Union-Pearson Rail Link should be undertaken as soon as possible, and several health-protective practices should be implemented in the interim.

## **Background Information**

HL24.4 - Air Quality Impact Assessment - Metrolinx Georgetown South Service Expansion and Union-Pearson Rail Link - Staff Report  
(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-21895.pdf>)

## **Communications**

- (June 7, 2009) letter from Lin Grist, Health Team Leader, Clean Train Coalition (HL.New.HL24.4.1)
- (June 6, 2009) letter from Professor Elizabeth Littlejohn, Sheridan Institute of Technology and Advanced Learning and University of Toronto (HL.New.HL24.4.2)
- (June 8, 2009) letter from Suri Weinberg-Linsky (HL.New.HL24.4.3)
- (June 8, 2009) e-mail from Leya Matalas (HL.New.HL24.4.4)
- (June 8, 2009) e-mail from Kevin Milburn (HL.New.HL24.4.5)
- (June 8, 2009) letter from Mary Louise Ashbourne (HL.New.HL24.4.6)
- (June 8, 2009) letter from Debbie Adams (HL.New.HL24.4.7)
- (June 8, 2009) letter from Lisa Mann, Link York (HL.New.HL24.4.8)
- (June 8, 2009) letter from Cherri Hurst (HL.New.HL24.4.9)
- (June 15, 2009) letter from James O'Mara, Executive Lead, Environment Policy and Planning, Metrolinx (HL.New.HL24.4.10)
- (June 15, 2009) submission from Elizabeth Littlejohn, Sheridan Institute of Technology and

Advanced Learning and University of Toronto (HL.New.HL24.4.11)  
(June 15, 2009) submission from Sue Patrick Breit (HL.New.HL24.4.12)  
(June 15, 2009) submission from Scott Dobson (HL.New.HL24.4.13)  
(June 15, 2009) letter from Michael Armstrong (HL.New.HL24.4.14)  
(June 15, 2009) letter from Laura Albanese, MPP, York South-Weston (HL.New.HL24.4.15)  
(June 15, 2009) letter from Peter Frampton, Executive Director, Learning Enrichment  
Foundation (HL.New.HL24.4.16)  
(June 15, 2009) letter from Alan Tonks, M.P. York South-Weston (HL.New.HL24.4.17)  
(June 15, 2009) submission from Rick Ciccarelli, Mount Dennis Weston  
Network (HL.New.HL24.4.18)  
(June 15, 2009) submission from Lin Grist, Clean Train Coalition (HL.New.HL24.2.19)  
(June 15, 2009) submission from Alanna Morgan (HL.New.HL24.4.20)