

Human Resources and Cost Implications of the Recommendations of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity and Clarification of the Term "Employment Equity"

(City Council on December 14, 15 and 16, 1999, amended this Clause by adding thereto the following:

"It is further recommended that the joint report dated December 14, 1999, from the Chair, Task Force on Community Access and Equity, and the Chief Administrative Officer, embodying the following recommendations, be adopted:

'It is recommended that:

- (1) Recommendation No. (1) of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity be replaced with the following recommendation:*
 - “(a) in addition to an Aboriginal Affairs Committee, City Council establish four city-wide access, equity and human rights community advisory committees as follows:*
 - Disability Issues Committee;*
 - Status of Women Committee;*
 - Race and Ethnic Relations Committee; and*
 - Committee on Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgendered Issues; and*
 - (b) the community advisory committees on access, equity and human rights consider rotating the location of their meetings across the City;”;*
- (2) Council adopt Task Force Recommendations Nos. (2) through (5) and (8);*
- (3) in view of Council’s adoption, on April 13, 14 and 15, 1999, of a policy for citizen appointments (Clause No. 2 of Report No. 3 of The Special Committee to Review the Final Report of the Toronto Transition Team), Task Force Recommendation No. (6) be replaced with the following:*
 - “(a) the members of the city-wide access, equity and human rights community advisory committees be recommended for appointment by the Nominating Committee using the existing Council Policy for Citizen Appointments and, for the initial appointments, the Nominating Committee conduct the interview process using community persons nominated by the Task Force on Community Access and Equity;*

- (b) *the guidelines developed by the Task Force for appointments to these advisory committees be considered in making these appointments; and*
- (c) *the term for the initial appointments to these advisory committees continue until the end of the next term of Council;”;*
- (4) *Council amend Task Force Recommendation No. (7) to provide for “at least one Member of Council” to serve on each of the city-wide access, equity and human rights community advisory committees;*
- (5) *Task Force Recommendation No. (76) be implemented as outlined in Clause No. 2 of Report No. 10 of The Strategic Policies and Priorities Committee, adopted by Council on June 9, 10 and 11, 1999, which provides for an annual community consultation on access, equity and human rights to provide input to planning, policy and program development;*
- (6) *the Chief Administrative Officer work with the Aboriginal Affairs and Disability Issues Committees towards the establishment of an Aboriginal Affairs Office and an Office on Disability Issues;*
- (7) *the Chief Administrative Officer report to Council on the effectiveness of the city-wide access, equity and human rights community advisory committees mid-way through the next term of Council;*
- (8) (a) *a reference group be established to advise the City Auditor in carrying out his responsibility to oversee an internal audit of the performance of the Corporation in achieving its access, equity and human rights goals once in each term of Council; and*
- (b) *the membership of the reference group include members of the community advisory committees and be chaired by a member of Council;*
- (9) *Council thank the members of the various municipal advisory committees on access, equity and human rights and the members of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity for their work over the past two years and their important contribution to City policy; and*
- (10) *the appropriate City Officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.’ ”)*

The Policy and Finance Committee recommends the adoption of the report (December 1, 1999) from the Chief Administrative Officer subject to amending Recommendation No. (2) by adding thereto the following:

“(2) (ii) the consolidated employment equity policy reiterate and reaffirm the fundamental principles of fairness and equal opportunity for each and every citizen of Toronto; and the policy explicitly reject the concept of “demographic mirrors” and “racial set-asides” – i.e., “demographic mirrors” being the concept that the percentage or proportion of “designated” groups in the general community as defined in the repealed Employment Equity Act of Ontario should be reflected or “mirrored” precisely in the bureaucracy of the new City of Toronto; and “racial set-asides” being the concept that a certain proportion of the City contracts should be set aside for businesses either owned and/or employing certain racial groups;”,

so that Recommendation No. (2) now reads as follows:

“(2)(i) as part of her forthcoming report on the consolidated employment equity policy for the City of Toronto, the Acting Commissioner of Corporate Services report to Council, through the Administration Committee, on the implementation of the Human Rights Office and on how the expertise and skills of the employment equity and human rights consultants are being used to enhance the activities of the human resources business units; and

(2)(ii) the consolidated employment equity policy reiterate and reaffirm the fundamental principles of fairness and equal opportunity for each and every citizen of Toronto; and the policy explicitly reject the concept of “demographic mirrors” and “racial set-asides” – i.e., “demographic mirrors” being the concept that the percentage or proportion of “designated” groups in the general community as defined in the repealed Employment Equity Act of Ontario should be reflected or “mirrored” precisely in the bureaucracy of the new City of Toronto; and “racial set-asides” being the concept that a certain proportion of the City contracts should be set aside for businesses either owned and/or employing certain racial groups;”.

The Policy and Finance Committee submits the following report (December 1, 1999) from the Chief Administrative Officer:

Purpose:

This report analyzes the resource implications of the recommendations contained in the final report of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity. It recommends further discussion with the Chair and members of the Task Force on some aspects of the Task Force Report to ensure that the intent of the Task Force's action plan can be achieved within the City's financial

constraints. The report also responds to Council's request for a clarification of the term "employment equity".

Financial Implications and Impact Statement:

The recommendations in this report are intended to ensure that the intent of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity's action plan and recommendations, as amended, may be implemented within the existing resources of the City. Rather than requiring new, additional resources, the Task Force's recommendations will provide some of the context for establishing priorities within the City's ongoing programs and activities.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that:

- (1) Council adopt the final recommendations of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity subject to:
 - (a) referring recommendations (1) through (8) and (76) to the Task Force and the Chief Administrative Officer for a joint report on options for the establishment of various advisory committees, except for the Aboriginal Affairs Committee;
 - (b) Council establish an Aboriginal Affairs Committee;
 - (c) referring Task Force recommendation (70) to the Commissioner of Community and Neighbourhood Services for consideration in her forthcoming report on the former City of Toronto's day care grants program;
 - (d) consistent with Council's adoption of SPPC Report No. 10 (2) on June 9, 10 and 11, 1999, striking out Task Force recommendation 85 and assigning to the City Auditor responsibility to oversee, once in each term of Council, an internal audit of the performance by the corporation as whole in achieving its access, equity and human rights goals;
 - (e) referring Task Force recommendation (15) to the Toronto Transit Commission and the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services for consideration during the preparation of their respective business plans and capital spending priorities;
 - (f) referring Task Force recommendation (16) to the Commissioner of Corporate Services for consideration during preparation of the Corporate Services Department's business plan; and
 - (g) referring Task Force recommendation (34) to the Commissioner of Corporate Services for a report on its implications;

- (2) as part of her forthcoming report on the consolidated employment equity policy for the City of Toronto, the Acting Commissioner of Corporate Services report to Council, through the Administration Committee, on the implementation of the Human Rights Office and on how the expertise and skills of the employment equity and human rights consultants are being used to enhance the activities of the human resources business units; and
- (3) the appropriate City Officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

Background:

On January 2, 6, 8 and 9, 1998 City Council adopted Report No. 1 of the Striking Committee, which established a Task Force on Community Access and Equity and appointed Councillor Joe Mihevc as its chair.

The chair of the Task Force submitted a draft final report to the former Strategic Policies and Priorities Committee on January 26, 1999. The committee referred the report to the Chief Administrative Officer for a report back to the committee on the financial implications of the Task Force's draft report. In response, the Chief Administrative Officer prepared a report which:

- (a) summarized the resource implications of the recommendations contained in the draft final report of the Task Force; and
- (b) presented an approach to the organization of administrative structures for access and equity functions in the City that accommodate the aspirations of the Task force within the financial constraints of the corporation.

The Chief Administrative Officer's report and the Task Force's Action Plan and Final Recommendations were submitted to Council on June 9, 10 and 11, 1999 as Strategic Policies and Priorities Committee Report 10 (2), entitled "Resources for Access and Equity Functions and Final Recommendations of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity." Council adopted the recommendations in the Chief Administrative Officer's report. Council received a separate report from the Chief Administrative Officer, which the Strategic Policies and Priorities Committee had requested be submitted directly to Council, and which recommended that Council adopt the Task Force's recommendations for the establishment of Offices for Aboriginal Affairs and Disabilities Issues respectively.

Council struck out the Strategic Policies and Priorities Committee's recommendation to adopt the Task Force's Action Plan and Final Recommendations and requested the Chief Administrative Officer to:

- (a) submit a report to the Policy and Finance Committee on the human resource and financial cost implications of the recommendations of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity; and

- (b) provide clarification of the term “employment equity”.

This report responds to Council’s request.

Comments:

(A) Resource Implications of the Task Force’s Final Recommendations:

A detailed analysis of the resource implications of each of the Task Force’s 89 recommendations is provided in Attachment #1 at the end of this report. Overall, the Task Force’s recommendations are targeted towards:

- (a) establishing structures and processes through which the City can plan and manage its access and equity programs;
- (b) reinforcing or reviewing the continuation of existing City policies and directions;
- (c) acting on the implementation of existing policies and previous decisions; and
- (d) establishing accountability mechanisms for the measurement and evaluation of the City’s progress towards access and equity objectives.

Many of the recommendations serve to reinforce Council’s commitment to existing policies and programs or suggest a review of existing policies and programs. These recommendations can be seen in the context of a comprehensive review of all policies and programs that has been ongoing since the amalgamation. The Task Force’s recommendations provide an opportunity to focus the review of particular policies and to incorporate specific principles and priorities into the policy review process. In and of themselves, these recommendations do not have direct resource implications over and above the application of resources to normal City business. Rather, they provide guideposts that will be helpful to departments in setting their priorities and developing their business plans within their normal resource allocations.

Issues:

A number of Task Force recommendations do raise issues relating to the number and role of advisory committees as well as the expansion of the former City of Toronto’s day care grants program across the City (recommendation 70); the conduct of an external audit on the implementation of the City’s access, equity and human rights policies and programs (recommendation 85), priority setting in capital improvement programs (recommendations 15, 16 and 34).

- (a) Establishment of Community Advisory Committees:

The Task Force is proposing the establishment of seven separate City-wide advisory committees. It is understood that these committees would replace the former municipalities' access and equity committees. The Task Force is further recommending

that the community councils establish working groups on access, equity and human rights issues as they deem necessary. The Task Force has proposed a formal nominating process for making appointments to these various advisory committees, all of which would have a reporting relationship to Council's decision-making structure.

Further consideration is needed to ensure that the community advisory committee mechanism works in tandem with the proposed working groups as well as other program advisory committees and to help focus the community's input on the broader access, equity and diversity management issues and objectives. In addition, mechanisms are needed to minimise artificial divisions among equity seeking groups, limit fragmentation of policy issues and strengthen the policy development and monitoring process.

Therefore, it is recommended that except for the Aboriginal Affairs Committee, which addresses the aboriginal community's unique set of issues relating to governance and self determination, the Task Force be requested to work with the Chief Administrative Officer to prepare a joint report on options for the establishment of these committees.

(b) Day Care Grants Program Expansion:

Recommendation 70 in the Task Force report proposes that the former City of Toronto's day care grants program be expanded across the City. Staff in the Children's Services Division estimate that it would cost approximately \$2 million annually to expand this program across the City. The Commissioner of Community and Neighbourhood Services has an outstanding request to report on the program. Accordingly, it is recommended that the Task Force's recommendation 70 be referred to the Commissioner of Community and Neighbourhood Services for consideration in her forthcoming report.

(c) External Audit:

The Task Force is proposing that, in each term of Council, an external firm conduct an evaluation or audit on the implementation of Council's access, equity and human rights programs. As noted in the CAO's report on "Resources for Access and Equity" (adopted by Council on June 9, 10 and 11, 1999 as part of SPPC Report 10 (2)), this type of audit falls within the mandate and competence of the City Auditor and need not be managed by an external party. Accordingly, Council adopted the CAO's recommendation that "once in each term of Council, the City Auditor oversee an internal audit of the performance by the corporation as a whole in achieving its access, equity and human rights goals."

As part of the same clause, and as noted above, Council also adopted the CAO's recommendation that, "in order to ensure that there is an external community perspective on the City's progress towards access, equity and human rights goals, the City organize

an annual community consultation on access, equity and human rights issues that will provide input to planning, policy and program development in subsequent years.”

In light of these two recommendations adopted by Council in June, it is recommended that Task Force recommendation 85 be struck out and Council reaffirm the City Auditor’s responsibility to oversee an internal audit once in each term of Council.

(d) Implications for Capital Programs:

Task Force recommendation 15 proposes “that City Council authorize an external review of the policies and services and establish timelines for changing or improving the mobility and access of people with disabilities including all forms of transportation services in the City...” This recommendation will influence priority setting in the capital improvement programs for transit and transportation services. It is recommended that Task Force recommendation 15 be referred to the Toronto Transit Commission and the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services for consideration during the preparation of their business plans and capital spending priorities.

Task Force recommendation 16 proposes that “City Council establish TTYs in all departments, in public areas of City facilities and in the community.” This recommendation has clear capital and operating expenditure implications and should be referred to the Commissioner of Corporate Services for consideration during development of the department’s business plan.

Task Force recommendation 34 proposes that “the City provide space in its press gallery for the “ethnic and community” media to help expand coverage of municipal issues.” Currently, all space in the press gallery is occupied. Therefore, this recommendation would likely have financial implications associated with the provision of additional space. This recommendation should be referred to the Commissioner of Corporate Services for a report on its implications.

(B) Clarification of the Term “Employment Equity”:

Council’s definition of the term “employment equity” is embodied in Corporate Services Committee Report No. 15 (3), entitled “Employment Equity in the City of Toronto”, which Council adopted as amended on October 28, 29 and 30, 1998. In adopting the clause, Council affirmed “its commitment to employment equity that incorporates the following principles and practices:

- (a) a corporate employment equity plan which is proactive and includes special programs, and which is results oriented;
- (b) a mechanism for monitoring downsizing, hiring, promotions, and appointments, as well as measuring outcomes and results; and
- (c) public reporting of results through an annual report to City Council.”

In addition, on October 9, 1998 the Corporate Services Committee requested the Executive Director of Human Resources to “submit a report to the Corporate Services Committee (now the Administration Committee):

- (a) on the current status of employment equity programmes in the City of Toronto, and recommend a strategy to ensure that the policies already in place in the former municipalities are maintained until such time as a new City-wide policy is adopted by Council; and
- (b) suggesting a leadership role that the City of Toronto can take respecting Employment Equity, including proactive measures in contract compliance and whether the City can legally enforce these measures.”

Staff in the Human Resources Division have reviewed the employment equity programs of the former municipalities and are in the process of harmonizing past policies and practices into a consolidated employment equity policy for the City of Toronto. The Acting Commissioner of Corporate Services has advised that a report on the consolidated policy will be submitted to Council in the new year.

The Chief Administrative Officer’s report on “Resources for Access and Equity Functions”, which Council adopted as part of SPPC Report No. 10 (2) advised Council that a Human Rights Office was being created within the Human Resources Division. The Office was to be comprised of the existing Human Rights specialists and a program administrative assistant. The report also recommended that the staff positions that were reassigned from the pool of corporate access and equity resources to the human resources business units in 1998 be explicitly defined and function as employment equity and human rights consultants. It is recommended that, as part of her forthcoming report on the consolidated employment equity policy for the City of Toronto, the Acting Commissioner of Corporate Services report to Council, through the Administration Committee, on the implementation of the Human Rights Office and on how the expertise and skills of the employment equity and human rights consultants are being used to enhance the activities of the human resources business units.

Conclusions:

This report analyses the resource implications of the final recommendations of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity and identifies where further discussion is required with the Task Force. The report also clarifies the term “employment equity” as it is applied in City policy.

The analysis shows that most of the Task Force’s recommendations provide guideposts and principles that will help Council and staff to set priorities during the business planning and budgeting processes. These types of recommendations do not, in and of themselves, commit Council to the expenditure of new resources. They reaffirm Council’s commitment to the continuation of access and equity values, policies and programs that evolved in the former municipalities. They commit Council and the corporation to ensure that access, equity and human rights considerations are included in the decision making hopper.

Toronto prides itself on its diversity and the tremendous benefits that brings the City. The Task Force report sets out an action plan for the City to turn its diversity into strength. As the government of the metropolitan heart of the Greater Toronto Area, Ontario and Canada, Council has a significant opportunity to lead all of Toronto's people into the new millennium. Council can take a major step in that direction by adopting the Task Force recommendations, as amended in this report.

Contact:

Phillip Abrahams, Strategic and Corporate Policy Division, Tel: 392-8102, Fax: 696-3645;
Pabraham@mta1.metrodesk.metrotor.on.ca

Ceta Ramkhalawansingh, Interim Manager of Access and Equity, Tel: 392-6824,
Fax: 397-0888;cramkhal@city.toronto.on.ca

Attachment 1.
Analysis of Resource Implications of Task Force Recommendations

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(1) City Council establish seven City-wide access, equity and human rights community advisory committees to address the priorities faced by the human rights protected groups:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) Aboriginal Affairs Committee; (b) Disability Issues Committee; (c) Status of Women Committee; (d) Racial Minorities Committee; (e) Ethnocultural and Faith Issues Committee; (f) Immigrant and Refugee Issues Committee; and (g) Committee on Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgendered Issues. 	<p>This, in combination with recommendations 3 – 7, establishes a new structure of formal advisory committees. These committees cannot be supported from within the City Clerk's existing secretariat resources. If each committee met at least 4 times per year, secretariat support would be required for at least 28 formal meetings, involving secretariat staff, agenda preparation and distribution, recording, preparation and distribution of transmittal reports to standing committees. If these committees meet more frequently, and if committees are set up under recommendation 2, the workload would be even greater.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(2) Community Councils establish working groups on access, equity and human rights issues as needs currently exist or arise and permit membership on these working groups to include individuals who work or reside in the City.</p>	<p>It is understood that any committees set up to advise a community council should fit the mandate of the community council and would be advisory around programs such as parks, recreation, local planning and local roads services. Such advisory committees should be supported by relevant departmental program staff. It is noted that some departments have already established advisory bodies of various types.</p>
<p>(3) the community advisory committees advise City Council, its agencies, boards and commissions, and advocate to external bodies on removing barriers that restrict human rights protected groups from participating in public life and achieving social, cultural, economic and political well-being.</p>	<p>This recommendation specifies the role and focus of the community advisory committees. See comments for recommendation 1.</p>
<p>(4) the community advisory committees include: individuals; individuals who work in community agencies serving the human rights protected groups; individuals with technical expertise; and, that the membership represent all regions of the City, and reflect the diversity of the City's population.</p>	<p>This recommendation specifies the composition of the community advisory committees. See comments for recommendation 1.</p>
<p>(5) the community advisory committees on access, equity and human rights report to Council through the appropriate Standing Committees on issues within the mandate of the Standing Committees and to the Policy and Finance Committee for issues which are strategic in nature.</p>	<p>See comments for recommendation 1.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(6) a publicly advertised process with a nominating committee be used to select the members of the community advisory committees and working groups on access, equity and human rights.</p>	<p>The process would have to be administered to ensure that it utilizes funds budgeted for nominations processes within existing budgets. See comments for recommendation 1.</p>
<p>(7) City Council appoint at least 2 Members of Council to serve on each of the above named community advisory committees on access, equity and human-rights.</p>	<p>This would have to be accomplished through the existing resources assigned to support the Striking Committee. See comments for recommendation 1.</p>
<p>(8) City Council appoint a Member of Council as a special advocate on disability issues.</p>	<p>Existing specialist staff in the Strategic and Corporate Policy Division and in departments can provide advice and support to the advocate. No additional new resources are required. The responsibilities of disability issues advocate could be assumed by the recently appointed seniors' advocate . See Recommendation 1.</p>
<p>(9) the City provide sensitivity and awareness training and materials on access, equity and human rights issues to all persons involved with the municipal structure, including elected officials, emergency services personnel, staff, contractors and persons appointed to city committees.</p>	<p>This is ongoing. It must be built into the business plans and work programs of the Corporate Services Department and be accomplished within existing resources, which may entail a clarification of priorities. Advice and support for this activity forms part of the ongoing, budgeted corporate access and equity workplan.</p>
<p>(10) City Council endorse the principle of Aboriginal self-determination and work with Aboriginal people to achieve this goal.</p>	<p>There are no direct resource implications.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(11) City Council establish an Office of Aboriginal Affairs.</p>	<p>Council did not support this recommendation when it was before Council on June 9, 10 and 11, 1999. There is and will continue to be specialized corporate access and equity staff with an Aboriginal Affairs portfolio. This is ongoing and does not require additional new resources.</p>
<p>(12) City Council establish initiatives to support the cultural, social, economic and political participation of Aboriginal communities in Toronto's civic life.</p>	<p>This work is ongoing. Its future direction should be influenced by consultation with the Aboriginal community and advice from a community committee on Aboriginal Affairs.</p>
<p>(13) City Council establish an Office of Disability Issues.</p>	<p>Council did not support this recommendation when it was before Council on June 9, 10 and 11, 1999. There are and will continue to be specialized corporate access and equity and departmental staff with a Disability Issues portfolio. This is ongoing and does not require additional new resources.</p>
<p>(14) City Council and City staff review all disability-related policies of former municipalities, and compile best practices to remove systemic barriers in employment, goods, services and facilities, and that City Council endorse these best practices.</p>	<p>This work is already underway and will continue. It is coordinated through the Urban Planning and Development Services Department.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(15) City Council authorize an external review of the policies and services and establish time lines for changing or improving the mobility and access of people with disabilities including all forms of transportation services in the city, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) adding streetscaping amenities (e.g. ramped corners with tactile warning strips, practical street door accesses, and enforcing clear paths on all pedestrian walkways); (ii) installing specialized traffic signals (e.g. audio signals at which those users who cannot cross safely during the standard cycle timing can prolong the pedestrian walk cycle); and (iii) improving the services provided by the TTC, Wheeltrans and increasing the number of accessible taxicabs. 	<p>This recommendation will influence priority setting in the capital improvement programs for transit and transportation services. The recommendation should be referred to the Toronto Transit Commission and the Works and Emergency Services Department to incorporate into their business plans and capital programs.</p>
<p>(16) City Council establish TTY's in all departments, in public areas of City facilities and in the community.</p>	<p>This recommendation has clear capital and operating expenditure implications. The recommendation should be referred to the Corporate Services Department for incorporation into their business planning process.</p>
<p>(17) City Council continue to act as an advocate for the equal treatment of same-sex spouses.</p>	<p>There are no direct additional resource implications.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(18) City Council take steps to establish parallel pension benefits programs for same-sex spousal families and that these remain in place until other governments remove legislative prohibitions, and that no limits be set on retroactivity for these benefits.</p>	<p>Same sex benefits are now in place.</p>
<p>(19) work against hate activity include hate crimes and incidents motivated by racism, sexism, antisemitism, bigotry, or homophobia.</p>	<p>There are no new resource requirements.</p>
<p>(20) the City request the inter-agency working group on hate activity to continue its work.</p>	<p>This is ongoing and supported by corporate access and equity staff within the existing budget. There are no additional new resource requirements.</p>
<p>(21) (a) where required, City Council and City staff should work to establish inter-agency staff working groups to address specific problems; and</p> <p>(b) that a working group be established on Language Equity and Literacy and that the International Literacy Decade be extended for another decade to the year 2010; and</p> <p>(c) that the working group on Employment Equity include the City's bargaining agents as well as community organizations.</p>	<p>Part (b) represents a formalization of an ongoing initiative which is supported by corporate access and equity staff within the existing budget.</p> <p>Part (c) is ongoing and is led by human resources staff.</p> <p>No additional new resources are required for either initiative.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
(22) the City vigorously implement the already approved implementation strategy arising from the Urban Forum on Immigration and Refugee Issues.	This is ongoing.
(23) for the purpose of implementing Council's policy on appointments to agencies, boards, commissions and special purpose bodies, the City will define 'citizen' to include all persons who pay property taxes or business taxes or who live within the boundaries of the City of Toronto including permanent residents, refugees, refugee claimants, residents without homes.	<p>Council adopted an appointments policy on April 13, 14 and 15, 1999 (Report No. 3 (2) of the Special Committee to Review the Final Report of the Toronto Transition Team).</p> <p>There are no additional resource implications.</p>
(24) the City use the foregoing definition of 'citizen' in making appointments to agencies, boards, commissions and special purpose bodies, except where law requires Canadian Citizenship for an individual to serve as a member of these bodies.	There are no direct resource implications. See comments for recommendation 23.
(25) the City remove the age restriction in making appointments to agencies, boards, commissions and special purpose bodies except where law requires an individual to attain a particular age to serve as a member of these bodies.	There are no direct resource implications. See comments for recommendation 23.
(26) City Council advocate for changes to any law which creates barriers to civic appointments for persons who are residents or who pay property taxes or business taxes.	There are no direct resource implications.

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
(27) the Nominating Committee establish goals and timetables for increasing the diversity among persons it recommends for civic appointments.	The research and monitoring activity which this recommendation generates will be built into the work programs of the City Clerk and the Strategic and Corporate Policy Division and will have to be undertaken within current resources.
(28) City staff provide an annual report to City Council on the participation rates of the human rights protected groups in appointments made to agencies, boards, commissions and special purpose bodies.	Same comments as provided for recommendation 27.
(29) the City make resources available to facilitate members of the public in participating on advisory committees which Council establishes and the advisory or management committees/boards of agencies, boards, commissions and special purpose bodies, including providing information in alternate formats, languages, attendant care, child care, and using accessible locations.	These initiatives fall within the mandate of the Corporate Services Department. This recommendation should be referred to the Clerks, Corporate Communications and Facilities and Real Estate Divisions for incorporation into their ongoing business plans.
(30) the communications strategies for municipal elections take account of the City's linguistic diversity and levels of literacy.	This is an ongoing responsibility of the City Clerks Division.
(31) all graphic design, cultural programs and special events of the City reflect the diversity of the City's population.	This recommendation impacts the approach to work rather than any need for additional resources.

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(32) the City continue to provide awareness and public education programs which support the principles of including all groups, respecting differences, achieving human rights, and eliminating harassment and hate activities.</p>	<p>These initiatives are an ongoing part of the City's efforts to market its services and reach out to the communities that it serves. The recommendation impacts the approach to the initiatives rather than any need for additional resources.</p>
<p>(33) the City continue its awards and scholarship programs which recognize and contribute to the City's objectives regarding access, equity and human rights.</p>	<p>These programs are ongoing.</p>
<p>(34) the City provide space in its press gallery for the "ethnic and community" media to help expand coverage of municipal issues.</p>	<p>It is understood that all space in the press gallery is occupied. Therefore, this recommendation would likely have financial implications associated with the provision of space. This recommendations should be referred to the Commissioner of Corporate Services for a report on its implications.</p>
<p>(35) the City maintain and enhance its multi-lingual capacity by encouraging staff to use the multi-lingual AT&T telephone service, providing printed materials in various languages, purchasing service agreements with community agencies, identifying and remunerating staff with language skills, and continuing to use in-house interpreters and community liaison staff.</p>	<p>This is part and parcel of improving corporate effectiveness and efficiency in service delivery. It should not result in a net increase in costs. Implicit in this recommendation is the need for the Human Resources Division of Corporate Services to maintain an up to date inventory of employee skills.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
(36) City extend guidelines regarding anti-discrimination which govern the use of Nathan Phillips Square to all “civic squares” and that the City amend the Municipal Code accordingly.	There are no additional resource implications.
(37) the City set annual targets for increasing the number of child care spaces and their hours of operation.	The Community and Neighbourhood Services Department is limited by provincial funding allocations. The City will continue to lobby senior governments for additional funding.
(38) the City make housing services for refugees a priority.	The City has adopted a housing policy and has set in motion various initiatives in response to the findings of the Mayor’s Homelessness Action Task Force. The City is continuing to lobby the senior levels of government for adequate funding for affordable housing. The City continues to lobby the federal government to provide funding for services to people seeking determination of refugee status.
(39) the Official Plan and the Social Development Strategy respond to the barriers and specific needs identified during the consultations held by the Task Force.	There are no direct resource implications.
(40) the Official Plan provide for recognizing the ethno-racial and cultural heritage and needs of the diverse communities in the City.	There are no direct resource implications.

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(41) City Departments involve residents in program advisory committees to evaluate services and make sure that these processes include persons who are from the City's diverse communities.</p>	<p>This is related to recommendation (2). This is ongoing and should continue as part of the responsibility of providing services to the community. No additional new resources are required.</p>
<p>(42) the City continue recreation programs which are targeted to specific communities, including lifeguard training for black youth, special hours for Muslim women, and leadership training for youth from high-risk populations.</p>	<p>This is ongoing, led by the Parks and Recreation Division of the Economic Development Culture and Tourism Department. No additional new resources are required.</p>
<p>(43) (a) the City review its zoning, building and fire regulations to address the barriers faced by Aboriginal people and other communities practising cultural and spiritual traditions, and identify those regulations which fall under the mandate of other levels of government, and advocate for changes as required; and</p> <p>(b) appropriate civic officials be requested to report further on these matters including the provision of residential uses at places of worship and various burial traditions.</p>	<p>This entails a review of current policy and requires no additional new resources.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(44) City Council adopt a set of accessibility guidelines for all City-owned buildings and other properties and that it determine accessibility gaps and implement an action plan to address these gaps.</p>	<p>This falls within the mandate of the Facilities and Real Estate Division of the Corporate Services Department and does not require immediate additional new resources.</p>
<p>(45) the City work to proactively respond to accessibility issues with architects and developers by seeking to enhance the legislated requirements under the Ontario Building Code and more stringently enforcing them.</p>	<p>This will help to focus the development review process. No new resources are required.</p>
<p>(46) the City investigate means of augmenting the city's stock of affordable accessible housing for people with disabilities, both privately and publicly owned.</p>	<p>This falls within the ongoing mandates of the Shelter, Housing and Support Division of the Community and Neighbourhood Services Department and the Planning Division of the Urban Planning and Development Services Department.</p>
<p>(47) the City modify its subsidies program to create portability which matches the need of the tenant with the disability, rather than the unit.</p>	<p>This recommendation modifies how resources are used and does not require additional new resources.</p>
<p>(48) the City adopt an employment equity policy to achieve a workforce which reflects the population at all occupational levels of the City.</p>	<p>Council adopted an employment equity policy on October 28, 29 and 30, 1999 (Report No. 15 (3) of the Corporate Services Committee).</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(49) the City conduct additional workforce surveys as needed to assemble a complete data base from which to monitor the ongoing participation of designated groups in the City's workforce.</p>	<p>This is part of the existing employment equity policy and should be ongoing.</p>
<p>(50) when the City establishes any new compensation and benefit programs for employees it arrange for an independent "gender equity"/ "wage gap" analysis to determine the impact of new systems on the "wage gap".</p>	<p>This recommendation introduces criteria for assessing ongoing work within the Human Resources Division. This could require that the new compensation system be evaluated by a third party.</p>
<p>(51) the City establish "mentoring" and "job demonstration" programs to help individuals from groups who face barriers gain work experience, and that the City encourage and recognize employees who act as volunteers for these programs.</p>	<p>This is ongoing.</p>
<p>(52) the City offer specialized training programs to employees to enhance their language and literacy skills or to facilitate entry into "non-traditional" work, paying particular attention to employees whose first language is not English, or for whom technology and high literacy levels have not been occupational requirements.</p>	<p>This recommendation entails a modification of existing training and development programs to refocus on high needs of all employees within a diverse workforce.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(53) Council allocate sufficient resources to accommodate employees with disabilities in the workplace so that their productivity and work experience parallels as nearly as possible that of their peers.</p>	<p>The Human Resources Division is the lead on this initiative and should set out protocols for how to access these resources.</p>
<p>(54) the City's Fair Wage and Labour Trades Office continue to oversee the anti-discrimination requirement of the Workers Rights Policy and that it update the grounds of anti-discrimination to include those covered by the Human Rights Policy.</p>	<p>This is ongoing and does not require new resources.</p>
<p>(55) the City continue its employee working groups, as needed, on issues related to the designated groups to address emerging issues, and that they liaise with the relevant community advisory committees on an ongoing basis.</p>	<p>This is ongoing and does not require new resources.</p>
<p>(56) the City encourage employees to participate in corporate and community programs to help staff better understand the City's diverse communities.</p>	<p>This could be achieved by including more information about community activities in the City's various employee newsletters and web pages. No additional resources are required.</p>
<p>(57) the City establish a Human Rights Office to receive inquiries and investigate complaints of discrimination regarding employment, access to services, and hate-related activities.</p>	<p>This has been implemented as a result of the adoption of SPPC Report No. 10 (2) on June 9, 10 and 11, 1999.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(58) the organizational placement of the City's Human Rights Office facilitate arm's-length investigations, including those relating to complaints of discrimination in employment, service delivery and hate activity.</p>	<p>This is part of the responsibility of the Human Rights Office.</p>
<p>(59) (a) the Human Rights Office submit an annual report to Council on its activities; and</p> <p>(b) this Annual Report include the success rates of resolving complaints, including those which have been filed with the Ontario Human Rights Commission.</p>	<p>This is part of the responsibility of the Human Rights Office.</p>
<p>(60) the City's Economic Development Strategy specifically outline proactive strategies that include the City's diverse communities.</p>	<p>There are no direct resource implications.</p>
<p>(61) the City implement the implementation strategy arising from recommendations of the Urban Aboriginal Economic Development Seminar and that it provide progress reports.</p>	<p>This is being led by corporate access and equity staff in the Strategic and Corporate Policy Division. The division includes staff specializing in Aboriginal Affairs.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(62) to promote the image of Toronto as a “global city”, city-endorsed programs, such as the Olympic Bid, The Gay Games, small business outreach, strategies be implemented to use these as opportunities for businesses owned and operated by members of the human rights protected groups.</p>	<p>This suggests a policy direction and has no direct resource requirements.</p>
<p>(63) the City use its purchasing process for communicating the City’s leadership role on employment equity, anti-discrimination and against harassment in the workplaces of Toronto.</p>	<p>This is the continuation of a policy direction.</p>
<p>(64) the City continue information and outreach activities, which make sure that businesses from various communities have access to the procurement process of the City and its agencies.</p>	<p>This is ongoing.</p>
<p>(65) the City’s purchasing process utilize strategies such as reducing the size of contracts and sub-contracts to increase the number of businesses owned by designated groups participating in the process and for achieving employment equity among firms seeking to do business with the City.</p>	<p>This suggests a policy direction.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(66) (a) City staff submit an annual report to Council on the proportion of expenditure the City spent with businesses owned by the designated groups and that this report include information on the employment equity policies of firms who are suppliers to the City; and</p> <p>(b) a report be submitted to Council every 5 years, coinciding with the Census, on the status of designated groups in supplier workforces.</p>	<p>Part (a) is ongoing as a result of the adoption of Council’s “Equal Opportunity – Anti-Discrimination Policy Requirements for Suppliers” on July 29, 30 and 31, 1998 (Report No. 6 (6) of the Corporate Services Committee).</p> <p>The cost of administering the survey required to undertake part (b) can be built into the Purchasing and corporate access and equity work programs every fifth year.</p>
<p>(67) City Council continue to support community organizations through its various grants programs and that it develop a strategy to facilitate the equitable distribution of grants funding.</p>	<p>This is ongoing.</p>
<p>(68) the City continue to provide resource support, such as meeting space, information sessions and research information to community organizations to assist them in providing services to their communities and to facilitate their participation in civic society.</p>	<p>This is ongoing.</p>
<p>(69) the City require all organizations receiving City grants to demonstrate their commitment to access and equity.</p>	<p>This is already being done.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
(70) the City expand its Day Care grants program across the City.	It is estimated that expanding this grants program across the City would cost approximately \$2 million. The Commissioner of Community and Neighbourhood Services has an outstanding request to report on this program. This recommendation should be struck out and referred to the Commissioner of Community and Neighbourhood Services for consideration in her report.
(71) the City expand its Breaking the Cycle of Violence (BTCV) grants program across the City.	This is being phased in by the Community and Neighbourhood Services Department.
(72) the Multicultural grants program maintain anti-racism and anti-hate as program criteria, if no new funds are available in 1999.	This is being done.
(73) City Council work to establish a comprehensive access and equity grants program to support the advocacy efforts of human rights protected groups.	A comprehensive review of the program is underway.
(74) City staff modify the report template for all reports to Council to include an impact statement on access, equity and human rights.	This can be accomplished at no cost by the City Clerks Division, in consultation with corporate access and equity staff.
(75) City staff prepare comprehensive demographic profiles of all City wards to guide policy development, program planning and service delivery.	This is an ongoing part of the work programs in the Urban Planning and Development Services and Community and Neighbourhood Services Departments.

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(76) (a) the community advisory committees on access, equity and human rights issues meet jointly at least twice per year to review the ongoing implementation of the corporate action plan for access, equity and human rights and to review the annual reports;</p> <p>(b) these joint meetings include any access, equity and human rights working groups established by Community Councils; and</p> <p>(c) during this annual meeting, the schedule be arranged to provide for participants to come together on a geographical as well as on an issue basis.</p>	<p>This recommendation is redundant. In adopting SPPC Report No. 10 (2) on June 9, 10 and 11, 1999 Council approved a recommendation by the CAO that:</p> <p>“in order to ensure that there is an external community perspective on the City’s progress towards access, equity and human rights goals, the City organize an annual community consultation on access, equity and human rights issues that will provide input to planning, policy and program development in subsequent years.”</p> <p>Organization of this consultation is being built into the corporate access and equity work program within the Strategic and Corporate Policy Division.</p>
<p>(77) each Department, Agency, Board, Commission or special purpose body submit an Access, Equity and Human Rights Action Plan to City Council.</p>	<p>This will be coordinated by corporate access and equity staff. The preparation of action plans within departments will require a refocusing of the approach to their work programs. The development of action plans can be built into the business planning process and need not require additional new resources.</p>
<p>(78) each Department evaluate its policies, programs and services to identify barriers experienced by the human rights protected groups and that measurement tools be prepared for this purpose.</p>	<p>Corporate access and equity staff will provide support and guidance as part of their ongoing work program.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(79) City Council request its Agencies, Boards, Commissions and special purpose bodies to provide an annual report on how they implemented employment equity, community access, service equity and human rights.</p>	<p>This requires a particular focus on access and equity goals by ABCs and should be part and parcel of effective and efficient service delivery. Corporate access and equity staff will provide support.</p>
<p>(80) the annual employment equity report to Council on the status of the human rights protected groups include data on its workforce as a whole and by Departments regarding representation, occupations, promotions, compensation, training, benefits, exits, and developmental opportunities.</p>	<p>This provides focus to an existing requirement as a result of Council's adoption of an employment equity policy on October 28, 29 and 30, 1998. It is related to recommendations (48) and (49).</p>
<p>(81) the City produce an annual consolidation of access and equity measures in a report card format.</p> <p>(82) the City establish organizational structures and resources for access, equity and human rights:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) to provide policy development; (ii) to facilitate community advisory processes including committees relating to the human rights protected groups and other Committees of Council as required; 	<p>This is built into the corporate access and equity work program as part of the coordination of the access action planning process. No additional new resources are required.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="310 264 800 338">(iii) to administer anti-racism, access and equity grants; <li data-bbox="310 369 800 443">(iv) to investigate human rights issues at arm's length; <li data-bbox="310 474 800 621">(v) to implement awareness and public education programs on access, equity and human rights issues; <li data-bbox="310 653 800 800">(vi) to act as a resource for departments and agencies in developing and implementing action plans; <li data-bbox="310 831 800 978">(vii) to liaise with community organizations regarding emerging issues and to assist them with civic involvement; <li data-bbox="310 1010 800 1188">(viii) to conduct research on the needs of the human rights protected groups and to provide results to departments to use in delivering services; <li data-bbox="310 1220 800 1367">(ix) to monitor legislative proposals that impact on the human rights protected groups; <li data-bbox="310 1398 800 1545">(x) to implement communication strategies to increase involvement and access to services; <li data-bbox="310 1577 800 1692">(xi) to promote the City's position to other levels of government and external bodies; and <li data-bbox="310 1724 800 1797">(xii) to provide advice and research to Council Committees. 	<p data-bbox="820 264 1408 443">This has been done as described in the CAO's report, entitled "Resources for Access and Equity Functions", as part of SPPC Report No. 10 (2) adopted as amended by Council June 9, 10 and 11, 1999.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(83) Agencies, Boards and Commissions be requested to implement access, equity and human rights policies and programs consistent with those of City Council.</p>	<p>There are no direct resource implications.</p>
<p>(84) the Workers Information and Action Centre be continued as a resource for addressing employment discrimination in the Toronto labour market and that the Small Business Centres operated by the City ensure that information regarding employment equity and human rights are provided to business owners.</p>	<p>A review of the placement and funding of WIACT has recently been undertaken by the Community and Neighbourhood Services Department under the direction of a Council Steering Group. The recommendations arising from the review will be before Council on November 23, 1999.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
<p>(85) (a) an external evaluation or Access, Equity and Human Rights Audit be conducted by City Council every three years for each term of Council on the implementation of Council's access, equity and human rights policies and programs”;</p> <p>(b) a reference group be established to oversee the evaluation process and that this include representatives of the community advisory committees and community organizations, and be chaired by a Member of Council serving on one of the community advisory committees; and</p> <p>(c) the external evaluation be conducted by individuals/firms who are recognized as professionals with experience and expertise in the access, equity and human rights field.</p>	<p>As noted in the CAO's report on “Resources for Access and Equity” (adopted by Council on June 9, 10 and 11, 1999 as part of SPPC Report 10 (2)), this falls within the mandate and competence of the City Auditor and need not be managed by an external party. Therefore Council adopted the CAO's recommendation that “once in each term of Council, the City Auditor oversee an internal audit of the performance of the corporation as a whole in achieving its access, equity and human rights goals.”</p> <p>The external perspective and input would come from the annual community consultation also approved by Council (see comments alongside recommendation (76) above.</p> <p>This recommendation should be struck out.</p>
<p>(86) the Chief Administrative Officer provide a status report 12 months after approval by Council on the implementation of recommendations.</p>	<p>This is being built into the corporate access and equity work program. No additional resources are required.</p>

Task Force Recommendations	Comments on Resource Implications
(87) the Toronto District School Board and all Boards of Education be requested to implement comprehensive access, equity and human rights policies.	There are no additional resource requirements for the City.
(88) the Government of Ontario be requested to provide resources for education, transportation, housing, etc., to improve the status of the human rights protected groups.	There are no additional resource requirements for the City.
(89) the Government of Canada be encouraged to provide resources to the City, and other agencies for settlement, education and employment certification for immigrants and refugees.	There are no additional resource requirements for the City.

The Policy and Finance Committee also submits the following communication (November 30, 1999) from the City Clerk:

Recommendation:

The Task Force on Community Access and Equity recommends that:

- (1) the Policy and Finance Committee be requested to defer consideration of the report (November 22, 1999) from the Chief Administrative Officer entitled, "Human Resources and Cost Implications of the Recommendations of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity and Clarification of the Term 'Employment Equity'", to its meeting of February 17, 2000;
- (2) the Task Force on Community Access and Equity from a Writing Team Subcommittee to prepare a response to the noted report from the Chief Administrative Officer and present the written response to the Policy and Finance Committee of February 17, 2000; and
- (3) the Writing Team Subcommittee be comprised of Councillor Joe Mihevc, Mr. Dennis Fong and Ms. Sonja Greckol.

Background:

The Task Force on Community Access and Equity at its meeting held on November 29, 1999 had before it a report (November 22, 1999) from the Chief Administrative Officer entitled, "Human Resources and Cost Implications of the Recommendations of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity and Clarification of the Term 'Employment Equity'".

The noted report analyzes the resource implications of the recommendations contained in the final report of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity. It recommends some changes to ensure that the intent of the Task Force's action plan can be achieved within the City's financial constraints. The report also responds to Council's request for a clarification of the term "employment equity".

The recommendations in the noted report are intended to ensure that the intent of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity's action plan and recommendations, as amended, may be implemented within the existing resources of the City. Rather than requiring new, additional resources, the Task Force's recommendations will provide some of the context for establishing priorities within the City's ongoing programs and activities.

The following persons appeared before the Policy and Finance Committee in connection with the foregoing matter:

- Mr. Frank Prospero, Etobicoke Barrier Free Assembly Committee;
- Mr. Peter Sheppard;
- Ms. Janice Tait;
- Mr. Shane Holton;
- Councillor Joe Mihevc, York – Eglinton; and
- Councillor Sherene Shaw, Scarborough Agincourt.

(City Council on December 14, 15 and 16, 1999, had before it, during consideration of the foregoing Clause, the following joint report (December 14, 1999) from the Chief Administrative Officer and the Chair, Task Force on Community Access and Equity:

Purpose:

This report responds to the Task Force on Community Access and Equity's recommendations 1 through 8 and 76. These recommendations deal with the establishment of City-wide community advisory committees.

Financial Implications and Impact Statement:

Support to the community advisory committees described in this report requires the commitment of corporate access and equity staff resources in the Strategic and Corporate Policy Division and secretariat staff resources in the City Clerk's Division. Support to the proposed advisory committees will be provided within existing budget allocations. The support needs of these committees will be considered as part of the recommended review of their effectiveness midway through the next Council term.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that:

- (1) Recommendation No. (1) of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity be replaced with the following recommendation:*
 - (a) in addition to an Aboriginal Affairs Committee, City Council establish four city-wide access, equity and human rights community advisory committees as follows:*
 - Disability Issues Committee;*
 - Status of Women Committee;*
 - Race and Ethnic Relations Committee; and*
 - Committee on Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgendered Issues; and*
 - (b) the community advisory committees on access, equity and human rights consider rotating the location of their meetings across the City;”;*
- (2) Council adopt Task Force Recommendations Nos. (2) through (5) and (8);*
- (3) in view of Council's adoption, on April 13, 14 and 15, 1999, of a policy for citizen appointments (Clause No. 2 of Report No. 3 of The Special Committee to Review the Final Report of the Toronto Transition Team), Task Force Recommendation No. (6) be replaced with the following:*
 - “(a) the members of the city-wide access, equity and human rights community advisory committees be recommended for appointment by the Nominating Committee using the existing Council Policy for Citizen Appointments and, for the initial appointments, the Nominating Committee conduct the interview process using community persons nominated by the Task Force on Community Access and Equity;*
 - (b) the guidelines developed by the Task Force for appointments to these advisory committees be considered in making these appointments; and*
 - (c) the term for the initial appointments to these advisory committees continue until the end of the next term of Council;”;*

- (4) *Council amend Task Force Recommendation No. (7) to provide for “at least one Member of Council” to serve on each of the city-wide access, equity and human rights community advisory committees;*
- (5) *Task Force Recommendation No. (76) be implemented as outlined in Clause No. 2 of Report No. 10 of The Strategic Policies and Priorities Committee, adopted by Council on June 9, 10 and 11, 1999, which provides for an annual community consultation on access, equity and human rights to provide input to planning, policy and program development;*
- (6) *the Chief Administrative Officer work with the Aboriginal Affairs and Disability Issues Committees towards the establishment of an Aboriginal Affairs Office and an Office on Disability Issues;*
- (7) *the Chief Administrative Officer report to Council on the effectiveness of the city-wide access, equity and human rights community advisory committees mid-way through the next term of Council;*
- (8)
 - (a) *a reference group be established to advise the City Auditor in carrying out his responsibility to oversee an internal audit of the performance of the Corporation in achieving its access, equity and human rights goals once in each term of Council; and*
 - (b) *the membership of the reference group include members of the community advisory committees and be chaired by a member of Council;*
- (9) *Council thank the members of the various municipal advisory committees on access, equity and human rights and the members of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity for their work over the past two years and their important contribution to City policy; and*
- (10) *the appropriate City Officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.*

Background:

On December 7, 1999 the Policy and Finance Committee considered a report from the Chief Administrative Officer entitled “Human Resource and Cost Implications of the Recommendations of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity”. The report recommended the adoption of the majority of the Task Force’s recommendations. It also recommended referring Task Force recommendations 1 through 8 and 76 to the Chief Administrative Officer and the Task Force on Community Access and Equity for a joint report on options for the establishment of various advisory committees.

Comments:

The Task Force's final report recommended the establishment of seven city-wide access, equity and human rights advisory committees. This recommendation was based on the findings of community consultations undertaken by the Task Force during 1998. The advisory committees would be formally supported by the City Clerk's secretariat staff and corporate access and equity staff in the Chief Administrative Officer's Strategic and Corporate Policy Division.

During his review of the resource implications of the Task Force recommendations, the Chief Administrative Officer concluded that seven advisory committees could not be supported within existing secretariat resources and may not be the most effective way to provide Council with advice on policy development. In a meeting with the Task Force on November 29, 1999 staff in the Chief Administrator's Office proposed the establishment of a single city-wide diversity management and human rights committee as an alternative to seven separate committees. The Task Force did not support the alternative model and members expressed concern that a single committee would limit community access to City decision-making and was contrary to the findings of the community consultation.

The referral of the Task Force recommendations dealing with community advisory committees, approved by the Policy and Finance Committee on December 7, 1999, was intended to provide an opportunity to find an advisory committee model that met the Task Force's needs and satisfied the Chief Administrative Officer's concerns.

On December 9, 1999 staff of the Chief Administrator's Office and three Members of the Task Force met to consider options.

The three options for City wide committees discussed during this meeting were:

- (1) seven City-wide committees as proposed in the Task Force report;*
- (2) a City-wide diversity management and human rights committee plus an Aboriginal Affairs Committee; and*
- (3) four City-wide committees, in addition to the Aboriginal Affairs Committee.*

It was agreed that:

- to respect the integrity of the community consultation process, it would be appropriate to establish issue-specific advisory committees;*
- the number of advisory committees proposed by the Task Force could be reduced and community issues would still be addressed;*
- staff roles as well as the annual community consultation process, which Council adopted in June 1999 as part of SPPC Report No. 10 (2), would be used to help integrate and coordinate the issues raised in the separate community advisory committees;*

- *Council's existing policy for making citizen appointments (adopted in April 1999) could be used to appoint members of the advisory committees and that guidelines developed by the Task Force would be taken into consideration in making these appointments;*
- *the advisory committees would be supported from within existing staff resources and the Chief Administrative Officer would review the committees' effectiveness mid-way through the next term of Council.*

The Task Force on Community Access and Equity reviewed and concurred with this approach to the establishment of community advisory committees at a special meeting on December 13, 1999.

Conclusions:

The Chief Administrative Officer and the Task Force on Community Access and Equity reviewed options for the establishment of City-wide access, equity and human rights community advisory committees. They have agreed to a model that respects the integrity of community input to the Task Force and is supportable within the City's existing resource constraints. The effectiveness of the model will be reviewed in the middle of the next Council term.)

(City Council also had before it, during consideration of the foregoing Clause, the following communications in support of the recommendations of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity:

- (a) (December 14, 1999) from Ms. Holly Kirkconnell, Times Change;*
- (b) (December 14, 1999) from Ms. Terry S. Winston, Executive Director, National Council of Jewish Women of Canada; and*
- (c) (December 14, 1999) from Ms. Rose Jacobson, Cross Cultural Director, Toronto Theatre Alliance.)*