THE CITY OF TORONTO

Clerk's Department

Minutes of the Audit Committee

Meeting No. 1

Monday, March 1, 1999

The Audit Committee met on Monday, March 1, 1999, in Committee Room B, 2nd Floor, City Hall, commencing at 9:30 a.m.

Members Present:

Councillor Mahood, Chair Councillor Adams Councillor Lindsay-Luby Councillor Bussin Councillor Holyday Councillor Minnan-Wong Councillor Sgro

1.1 1999 Audit Workplan

The Audit Committee had before it a report (February 8, 1999) from the City Auditor respecting the 1999 Audit Workplan and recommending that the audit work plan set out in the report (February 8, 1999) from the City Auditor be approved.

On motion by Councillor Lindsay-Luby, the Audit Committee recommended to City Council the adoption of the foregoing report.

(Report 2 - Clause 1)

1.2 Review of Staff, Councillors' and Mayor's Office Expenses

The Audit Committee had before it a report (January 15, 1999) from the City Auditor respecting Review of Staff, Councillors' and Mayor's Office Expenses and recommending that:

- (1) To increase awareness of and ensure compliance with the expense claim policy, the Chief Administrative Officer:
 - (a) ensure all staff and Councillors are aware of the new City's expense claim and related policies;

- (b) in consultation with the Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer and the City Auditor, formalize policies and procedures governing expenditures in the Office of the Mayor, specifically the administrative and approval requirements with respect to the purchase of goods and services, business meetings, travel, etc., as well as appropriate expenditure control procedures;
- (c) advise all staff, Members of Council and the Mayor's Office that business meeting expense claims must be supported by original restaurant receipts, with the names of the attendees and the purpose of the meeting documented, and that payment will be withheld if the required supporting documentation is not provided;
- (d) advise all staff that business lunch and dinner meetings involving City staff should be kept to a minimum and should only occur when time schedules do not permit such a meeting during normal working hours;
- (e) reiterate to department heads that all staff travel outside of Canada requires the Chief Administrative Officer's written pre-approval;
- (f) advise all staff, Councillors and the Mayor's Office that it is their responsibility to abide by all parking and traffic regulations, even when on City business, and that fines and penalties relating to violations of such regulations will not be reimbursed; and
- (g) advise staff that meal allowances should not be claimed when visiting another Civic Centre, and request the Executive Director of Human Resources to formulate a mileage reimbursement policy for staff who have been re-located to a new location. Costs related to travel to and from permanent work places is considered a taxable benefit by Revenue Canada;
- (2) To ensure that costs are encumbered against Councillors' global budgets and that management reports are accurate, complete and provide a proper audit trail:
 - (a) the City Clerk advise Councillors that all their expenses, including any requests for services (ie. printing, postage, distribution) be processed directly through Council Services, Clerks Division, and all payments be made directly to suppliers;
 - (b) Finance Department ensure that all Councillors' expenses, which have been processed through their former municipalities, are allocated to the proper accounts on a timely basis. In order to improve controls, Councillors' expenses should not be processed through their former municipalities;

- (c) Clerks Division staff review with Finance Department staff, system deficiencies with respect to the timely reporting of Councillors' staff salary costs, for appropriate corrective action; and
- (d) Finance staff advise all departments/divisions that all business meeting expenses, cellular phone charges and kilometres reimbursements be charged to specific accounts, established for these types of expenses;
- (3) With respect to the "Office Administration and Expenses for Members of Council" policy, the City Clerk:
 - (a) advise Councillors that any additional work performed by Councillors' staff be remunerated in the form of lieu time or paid overtime and not through the Accounts Payable system as payment for consulting services or an honorarium;
 - (b) reiterate to Councillors the policy requirements with respect to consulting services, and advise that payment will be withheld if proper supporting documentation (ie. nature of services provided, per diem or hourly rate) is not provided;
 - (c) prepare a policy with respect to expenditures incurred by Members of Council in their capacities as members of local boards, including whether such expenditures should be charged to the Councillors global office budget; and
 - (d) clearly outline to Councillors and their staff the purpose of the global office budget and that payments to community organizations, including sports teams, in the form of sponsorships, donations, etc. are not permitted;
- (4) To ensure the necessary supporting documentation is provided for expense approval and reimbursement and to promote consistency across the Corporation, the Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer:
 - (a) advise all staff, Councillors and the Mayor's office that travel expense reimbursements must be accompanied by a properly completed and approved Request for Travel form;
 - (b) develop a standard kilometres claim form for the Corporation and advise all staff, Councillors and the Mayor's office that when submitting kilometres claims, appropriate supporting detail must be provided for each trip, specifically, the destination and purpose of the trip and the number of kilometres travelled; and

-4-Audit Committee Minutes Monday, March 1, 1999

- (c) advise all staff, Councillors and the Mayor' s Office that reimbursement of expenses, whether processed through petty cash, payroll or accounts payable, must be supported by original receipts indicating what was purchased and be approved by the individual's immediate supervisor, in accordance with the department's delegation of financial signing authority;
- (5) Due to the delay in settling travel claims, and the fact that many expenses (ie. air fare, registration fees) relating to travel can be paid directly by the Corporation:
 - (a) the Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer consider eliminating travel advances; and
 - (b) Accounting staff follow up on all advances currently outstanding for more than 30 days, to either recover any unspent funds or to settle the advance, and that any travel advance still outstanding after follow up by Accounting, be escalated to the respective department head for appropriate action;
- (6) With respect to cellular telephones:
 - (a) the Telecommunications Division, Corporate Services, in consultation with Departments, Agencies and Commissions, develop a policy covering the criteria and authorization for purchase and issuance of cellular telephones, guidelines for business and personal use, and procedures for the reassignment and return of these telephones;
 - (b) a complete inventory of all cellular telephones be undertaken by each department, and a listing indicating the staff member assigned each telephone be forwarded to the Telecommunications Division, Corporate Services;
 - (c) all future purchases of cellular telephones be made through the Telecommunications Division, Corporate Services, which will also maintain an inventory of cellular telephones for the Corporation; and
 - (d) cellular telephone bills be reviewed and approved by the appropriate departmental staff and any personal calls reimbursed to the City;
- (7) To ensure that travel arrangements are made at the lowest possible cost, more than one quote be obtained and documented for all travel by Councillors and the Mayor's Office, including a quote from the corporate travel agent; and
- (8) In view of the fact the majority of Councillors' expenses will be well below the \$70,000 allocated to each Councillor for office expenses in 1998, the Councillors' global office budget should be reviewed.

The Audit Committee recommended to City Council that:

On motion by Councillor Minnan-Wong:

(1) the report (January 15, 1999) from the City Auditor be adopted;

On motion by Councillor Holyday:

(2) staff, Members of Council and the Mayor's Office be requested to refund all monies which they have received for expense claims for which proper supporting documentation was not submitted, or for matters which do not comply with Council's policy and accepted business practices;

On motion by Councillor Lindsay-Luby:

(3) the City Clerk, in the outline of the purpose of the global office budget requested in Recommendation No. 3(d) of the report (January 15, 1999) from the City Auditor, clarify in a detailed manner what is permitted and what is not, particularly, whether a Councillor paying for City pins and T-Shirts for community groups promoting the City, or a Councillor paying for the costs of advertising activities done by local groups, would be permitted;

On motion by Councillor Adams:

(4) the City Auditor, in consultation with the Chief Administrative Officer and the City Solicitor, report to the Audit Committee on a policy on the receipt of donations of cash, goods, services and other benefits by Members of Council;

On motion by Councillor Mahood (with Councillor Lindsay-Luby in the Chair):

(5) a charge-back fee be established immediately for the City's limousine service;

On further motion by Councillor Mahood (with Councillor Lindsay-Luby in the Chair):

(6) Council request that the <u>City of Toronto Act, 1997</u> be amended to delete the provision that Members of Toronto City Council receive a third of their salary tax-free;

On motion by Councillor Adams:

(7) the Commissioner of Corporate Services, in her expected report on charge-back for all office space, base the report on a policy of full-cost accounting for such space for all Members of Council.

The Audit Committee also:

(1) requested the City Auditor to:

On motion by Councillor Adams:

(a) report to the Audit Committee on whether the cost of design, lay-out and printing of Councillors' newsletters being done by the City Clerk is on a full cost recovery charge-back basis;

On motion by Councillor Bussin:

(b) report to the Audit Committee on the establishment of a charge-back policy for those Councillors who use civic space for second offices;

On motion by Councillor Mahood (with Councillor Lindsay-Luby in the Chair):

- (c) clarify that senior staff cannot receive a car allowance and a full mileage allowance, and report thereon to the Audit Committee, at its meeting to be held on April 7, 1999;
- (2) On motion by Councillor Bussin, directed the Audit Committee receive:
 - (a) a detailed breakdown of each individual Councillor's office expenses, including the Mayor's office and staff;
 - (b) a list of remuneration and expenses received by each individual Councillor for activities in their duties as a Member of a local Agency, Board or Commission; and

On motion by Councillor Lindsay-Luby:

(3) referred the following motion by Councillor Lindsay-Luby to the Budget Committee for consideration:

"That the global office budget for Councillors be \$40,000, such monies to include the charge-back of all office expenses."

(Letters sent to:Budget Committee and City Auditor)

(Report 2 - Clause 2)

1.3 Investment Policy Compliance

The Audit Committee had before it a report (February 1, 1999) from the City Auditor respecting Investment Policy Compliance and recommending that:

- (1) monthly reporting procedures be put in place by City Finance staff relating to the investing of City Funds. Such reporting procedures to include details of all investments held and maturity dates of such investments. The review of monthly reports be conducted by staff independent of the investment function and include an analysis as to whether or not the City's investment policies and procedures are complied with. Evidence of the review be documented in writing. Immediate and appropriate action be taken for all instances of non compliance;
- (2) City Finance staff seek legal advice and clarification relating to the scope of the Council approved policy entitled "Investment Policy and Procedures" and determine whether or not such policy applies to Agencies, Boards and Commissions. If it is determined that the policy does apply to these entities, management of the City Finance Department forward the policy to staff of all Agencies, Boards and Commissions for which the policy is deemed to be applicable. All applicable Agencies, Boards and Commissions be advised that they are required to comply with such policy;
- (3) where practical, consideration be given to the consolidation of Agencies, Boards and Commissions investing activities by the City Finance staff. In addition, the decision on whether to consolidate should consider whether or not the services of outside professional investment managers are utilized, the practicality based on dollar amounts and the average length of terms investments are held, the types of investments allowed under legislation and the degree of control exercised by the City over the Agencies, Boards and Commissions;
- (4) a reporting procedure be put in place by City Finance staff relating to the investing activities of those Agencies, Boards and Commissions for which the policy is deemed applicable. The reporting procedure be consistent with those recommendations as outlined under Recommendation 1;
- (5) consolidated financial reporting of all City investments be reported to Council on a more regular basis than once a year;
- (6) Management take immediate action to ensure compliance with policy limits on maximum amounts and durations of specific investments;
- (7) the document approved by Council entitled "Investment Policy and Procedures" be finalized, particularly in terms of addressing key management administrative procedures;

- (8) performance benchmarks for investment returns be set for those funds administered by the City without an established performance benchmark;
- (9) the investment policy and procedures manual be amended and updated to include the York Employees' Pension and Benefit Fund. Clarification be sought in regards to the responsibility for the investment of the assets of this fund; and
- (10) appropriate staff be requested to provide a complete and updated reconciliation of all investment balances at the City. This information be submitted to senior staff for their review and approval. Evidence of approval be documented in writing. Specific deadlines be set for the preparation of such reconciliations. Reconciliation of the investment portfolio to the general ledger be performed on a monthly basis for all investment funds.

On motion by Councillor Adams, the Audit Committee deferred consideration of the following report until its meeting to be held on April 7, 1999 and requested the Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer to respond to the issues raised by the City Auditor.

(Letter sent to: Chief Financial Officer)

(Report 2 - Clause 8)

1.4 Consolidation of City Audit Activities

The Audit Committee had before it a report (February 17, 1999) from the City Auditor respecting Consolidation of City Audit Activities and recommending that:

- (a) The Chief Administrative Officer request the firm of Ernst & Young, the City's External Auditors to evaluate the efficiency and effectiveness of the City Auditor's Office, the Internal Audit and Program Review Unit of the Police Services Board, and the Internal Audit Unit of the Toronto Transit Commission and report to the Audit Committee by May 31, 1999. This evaluation should be done as part of the 1998 financial audit. Such evaluation to include, but not be limited to:
 - Potential for Consolidation and Streamlining
 - Reporting Relationships
 - Staff Requirements
 - Staff Qualifications
 - Audit Workload
 - Efficiency and Effectiveness Measures
 - Potential Cost Savings

- (b) Additional external audit costs, if any, in relation to this review be shared equally by the City Auditor's Department, the Police Services and the Toronto Transit Commission;
- (c) The Chief Administrative Officer request the firm of Ernst & Young to evaluate the merits of establishing a separate internal audit unit at the Toronto Housing Company. Additional external audit costs, if any, be borne by the Toronto Housing Company;
- (d) The City Auditor be requested to follow up his review of the efficiency and effectiveness of the Quality Control and Assurance Group of the Social Services Division, and
- (e) The hiring of audit staff by any of these Units be discontinued until such study is complete.

On motion by Councillor Lindsay-Luby, the Audit Committee recommended to City Council the adoption of the foregoing report from the City Auditor.

(Report 2 - Clause 7)

1.5 Chemical Procurement

On motion by Councillor Lindsay-Luby, the Audit Committee met in Camera to consider a matter the subject of which dealt with litigation or potential litigation, including matters before administrative tribunals, affecting the municipality or local board.

The Committee resumed its public session and had before it a report (February 15, 1999) from the City Auditor respecting Chemical Procurement and recommending that the report (February 15, 1999) from the City Auditor be received for information.

On motion by Councillor Bussin, the Audit Committee received the foregoing report for information.

(Report 2 - Clause 8)

1.6 Review of Parking Tag Operations

The Audit Committee had before it a report (December 23, 1998) from the City Auditor respecting the Review of Parking Tag Operations and recommending that:

-10-Audit Committee Minutes Monday, March 1, 1999

- in preparing the 1998 financial statements, management should provide an additional allowance for doubtful accounts of \$6.4 million relating to parking tag receivables. In addition, a projected final collection rate of 78 percent should be used for accrual purposes at 1998 year end;
- (2) Parking Tag Operations (PTO) staff review its current arrangement with the Ministry of Transportation (TO) relating to the administration of plate denial and enter into a formal agreement with TO which outlines the administrative responsibilities of the respective parties regarding the collection of parking fines at plate denial;
- (3) priority be given to the reconciliation of PTO records with TO records to ensure that all tags filed for plate denial are in fact awaiting collection at plate denial. This reconciliation should be done at least annually;
- (4) PTO staff perform an analysis of the tags outstanding at plate denial, investigate the reasons for the delay of their collection and assess their current collectability. In addition, management should evaluate TO's collection procedures and take appropriate action to ensure that reliance can be placed on the Ministry's processes for the collection of outstanding fines at plate denial;
- (5) the Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer and the City Solicitor report to the Corporate Services Committee on the changes required to the current provincial legislation and regulations, to enable the City to collect outstanding fines at any stage, as well as to use private collection agencies in this regard;
- (6) PTO staff work with the Ministry to actively pursue collection of the old outstanding fines at plate denial, specifically those individuals or companies identified as owing more than \$5,000;
- (7) the Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer meet with the appropriate senior Ministry officials to expedite the resolution of the issues relating to the plate denial process in order to improve the collection of outstanding fines at plate denial;
- (8) in view of the loss of revenue from parking tags issued to out-of-province vehicles, management pursue with the Province of Ontario the extension of reciprocal agreements with other Canadian provinces and United States cities, to parking violations. Consideration should also be given to assigning the outstanding fines relating to out-of-province vehicles to a private collection agency;
- (9) in consultation with the City Solicitor, management request an appropriate change in legislation to provide an alternative means of serving parking tags to drove-away vehicles, which could include mailing the notice of infraction;

- (10) the Parking Enforcement Unit of the Toronto Police Services report to the Corporate Services Committee on the reasons for the increase in the number of spoiled tags and the action that will be taken to keep this number to a minimum;
- (11) the current report from the Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer relating to parking tags be modified to include additional management information such as the total number of tags written, spoiled, available for collection, withdrawn, status of outstanding fines, including those that are issued to out-of-province vehicles, as well as an analysis of any significant trends or problem areas; and that this report be submitted to the Corporate Services Committee on a quarterly basis, rather than monthly;
- (12) PTO management establish key indicators to monitor the activity with respect to the issuance and processing of parking tags. This should include monitoring the number of spoiled tags, withdrawn tags, illegible tags, etc. In this regard, management should designate an individual the responsibility for this function as well as for the analysis of trends and the provision of relevant reports to management;
- (13) PTO management utilize other available tools and resources within the City to generate customized reports to facilitate the review and monitoring of activity within PTO and discontinue the need to manually re-input data;
- (14) the monthly reconciliation of the Parking Tag Management System (PTMS) to the general ledger be reviewed and approved by the Manager of PTO;
- (15) PTO management make arrangements for the First Appearance Facilities to deposit all monies directly to the nearest financial institution, having a banking arrangement with the City;
- (16) a transaction report showing the details of all tags withdrawn be provided to all First Appearance Facilities locations. To help ensure compliance with the guidelines, the respective supervisors should scan the transaction report and, on a test basis, examine the supporting documentation of tag withdrawals. Evidence of such review should be documented in writing;
- (17) priority be given to acquiring the required computer server for the Parking Tag Management System and making the necessary arrangements with the appropriate provincial ministries and financial institutions to ensure that all computer systems related to parking tag operations are Year 2000 compliant by September 1999, as planned;
- (18) PTO management develop an action plan with specific time lines to implement the recommendations contained in this report; and

(19) that this report be forwarded to the Corporate Services Committee for consideration.

On motion by Councillor Adams, the Audit Committee recommended to the Corporate Services Committee the adoption of the foregoing report.

(Letter sent to: Corporate Services Committee; cc: City Auditor)

(Report 2 - Clause 8)

1.7 Transfer of Parking Operations from the Former Municipalities to the Toronto Parking Authority

The Audit Committee had before it a report (December 15, 1998) from the City Auditor respecting the transfer of Parking Operations from the Former Municipalities to the Toronto Parking Authority and recommending that:

- (1) The Toronto Parking Authority should ensure all receipts are promptly deposited to the bank;
- (2) The Toronto Parking Authority should change the accounting policies and practices of the former municipal parking operations to ensure they are appropriate and consistently applied;
- (3) the Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer should ensure that the five former municipalities expedite the closing of all accounts related to parking operations and transfer same to the Toronto Parking Authority in accordance with the requests of Council;
- (4) the Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer should ensure the Toronto Parking Authority remits progress payments on a monthly basis as specified in the Council minutes, and
- (5) the City Auditor be requested to report back to Council through the Audit Committee on the operating results of the transferred parking operations both before and after the transfer to the Toronto Parking Authority.

On motion by Councillor Holyday, the Audit Committee:

(1) recommended to City Council the adoption of the foregoing report (December 15, 1998) from the City Auditor; and

(2) requested the City Auditor to review with appropriate parties, the issue of loss of revenue because of theft from parking meters, and report thereon to the Audit Committee.

(Letter sent to: City Auditor)

(Report 2, Clause 3)

1.8 Audit Projects Update

The Audit Committee had before it a report (February 9, 1999) from the City Auditor respecting Audit Projects Update and recommending that the report (February 9, 1999) from the City Auditor be received for information.

On motion by Councillor Lindsay-Luby, the Audit Committee received the foregoing report for information.

(Report 2 - Clause 8)

1.9 Year 2000 Project Update

The Audit Committee had before it a report (February 10, 1999) from the City Auditor respecting the Year 2000 Project Update and recommending that:

- (1) The Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer develop a contingency plan to provide a backup location for the SAP project office;
- (2) The SAP Steering Committee closely monitor the progress of the Human Resource and Payroll project and effect a process to facilitate the removal of roadblocks which may compromise delivery; and
- (3) The role and responsibility of the Quality Assurance Manager be redefined to ensure the benefits derived from a quality assurance function are not lost.

On motion by Councillor Lindsay-Luby, the Audit Committee recommended the adoption of the foregoing report from the City Auditor.

(Report 2, Clause 4)

1.10 Audit Services 1999 Operating Plan and Budget

The Audit Committee had before it a report (February 12, 1999) from the City Auditor respecting Audit Services 1999 Operating Plan and Budget and recommending that the 1999 Operating Plan and Budget be approved by the Audit Committee and forwarded to the Budget Committee.

On motion by Councillor Adams, the Audit Committee approved the Audit Services 1999 Operating Plan and Budget and forwarded same to the Budget Committee.

(Letter sent to: Budget Committee)

(Report 2 - Clause 8)

1.11 Toronto Civic Employee's Pension Fund and Toronto Fire Department Superannuation and Benefit Fund Review of Data Conversion

The Audit Committee had before it a report (February 19, 1999) from the City Auditor respecting Toronto Civic Employee's Pension Fund and Toronto Fire Department Superannuation and Benefit Fund Review of Data Conversion and recommending that the report entitled, "Toronto Civic Employee's Pension Fund and Toronto Fire Department Superannuation and Benefit Fund Review of Data Conversion, dated February 4, 1999, be received for information.

On motion by Councillor Lindsay-Luby, the Audit Committee received the foregoing report for information.

(Report 2 - Clause 8)

1.12 Ernst & Young - Update on the 1998 External Audit

The Audit Committee had before it a communication (February 22, 1999) from Ernst & Young respecting an Update on the 1998 External Audit and recommending that the Audit Committee receive the memo (February 22, 1999) from Ernst & Young as an update on the progress of the audit of the 1998 financial statements.

On motion by Councillor Lindsay-Luby, the Audit Committee received the foregoing communication.

(Report 2 - Clause 8)

1.13 Ferrous Chloride Contract

The Audit Committee met in Camera to consider a matter the subject of which dealt with litigation or potential litigation, including matters before administrative tribunals, affecting the municipality or local board.

The Audit Committee had before it a confidential report (February 15, 1999) from the City Auditor, respecting a matter dealing with Litigation or Potential Litigation, including Matters before Administrative Tribunals, affecting the Municipality or Local Board.

On motion by Councillor Lindsay-Luby, the Audit Committee recommended to City Council, the adoption of the confidential report (February 15, 1999) from the City Auditor.

(Report 2, Clause 5)

1.14 Chemical Pricing

The Audit Committee met in Camera to consider a matter the subject of which dealt with litigation or potential litigation, including matters before administrative tribunals, affecting the municipality or local board.

The Audit Committee had before it a confidential report (February 19, 1999) from the City Auditor, respecting a matter dealing with Litigation or Potential Litigation, including Matters before Administrative Tribunals, affecting the Municipality or Local Board.

On motion by Councillor Adams, the Audit Committee recommended to City Council that:

- (1) Council receive the confidential report (February 19, 1999) from the City Auditor; and
- (2) the Mayor write to the Minister of Industry Canada requesting him to investigate this matter and to give the investigation a high priority.

(Report 2, Clause 6)

1.15 External Firms Retained for Insurance Claim Defence

The Audit Committee had before it a report (February 17, 1999) from the City Clerk, Corporate Services Committee, referring the following motions to the Audit Committee for report thereon to the Corporate Services Committee: Moved by Councillor Lindsay-Luby:

(1) That any future reports regarding the outsourcing of legal work, determine the cost effectiveness of work undertaken inside vis-a-vis outside and particularly when specific expertise is needed; and that this cost-benefit analysis be undertaken by the City's External Auditor.

Moved by Councillor Rae:

(2) That the foregoing motion by Councillor Lindsay Luby be referred to the Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer for report thereon to the next meeting of the Corporate Services Committee respecting the cost of the City employing an External Auditor.

On motion by Councillor Holyday, the Audit Committee deferred consideration of the foregoing communication until its meeting to be held on April 7, 1999.

(Letter sent to: Audit Committee; Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer; City Solicitor)

(Report 2 - Clause 8)

The meeting adjourned at 11:50 a.m.

Chair.