

THE CITY OF TORONTO

City Clerk's Division

Minutes of the Board of Health

Meeting No. 8

Tuesday, September 21, 1999

The Board of Health met on Tuesday, September 21, 1999, in Committee Room 1, 2nd Floor, City Hall, Toronto, commencing at 1:05 p.m.

Members Present:

	<u>1:05 p.m.-4:20 p.m.</u>
Councillor John Filion, Chair	x
Councillor Irene Jones, Vice-Chair	x
Ms. Jan Campbell	x
Mr. Robert Davies	x
Trustee Gerri Gershon	x
Councillor Anne Johnston	x
Councillor Joan King	x
Ms. Gail Lindsay	x
Mr. Brian MacKay	x
Councillor Joe Mihevc	x
Mr. Steven Pinnock	
Councillor Michael Prue	x
Mr. Lee Zaslofsky	x

Members were present for some or all of the time period indicated.

Confirmation of Minutes.

On motion by Councillor Prue, the minutes of the meetings of the Board of Health held on the following dates were confirmed:

- April 6, 1999;
- May 6, 1999;
- June 3, 1999;
- June 28 and 29, 1999; and
- July 22, 1999.

8.1 Retirement and Lodging Homes.

The Board of Health had before it a joint report (September 8, 1999) from the Commissioner of Community and Neighbourhood Services and the Medical Officer of Health, respecting short-term and longer-term steps that can be taken to investigate, report back on and help to address the health, social and legal issues arising from unregulated retirement homes; and recommending that:

- (1) a Retirement Homes Advisory Committee be established, comprised of Councillors Ootes (Deputy Mayor), Johnston (Seniors Advocate), Filion (Chair, Board of Health), Duguid (Chair Community Services Committee) and Flint (Chair Planning and Transportation Committee);
- (2) a Retirement Homes Action Team, led by Public Health, be established with membership from Homes for the Aged, Municipal Standards and Licensing, Fire, Ambulance, Buildings, Legal Services, Shelter Housing and Support and Toronto Police and Social Development. This team will immediately implement a short-term action plan to address complaints and concerns from the public regarding retirement homes;
- (3) the City of Toronto fully apply its existing legal powers to investigate complaints related to the health and safety of residents in retirement homes across the City;
- (4) the Commissioner of Community and Neighbourhood Services and the Commissioner of Urban Planning and Development Services, in consultation with the Medical Officer of Health and the City Solicitor, establish an interdepartmental working group comprised of staff from Police, Fire, Ambulance and Legal as well as other appropriate stakeholders. This working group will report back to the Retirement Homes Advisory Committee by November 1999, and by December 1999 to the Board of Health, the Community Services Committee and the Planning and Transportation Committee, on the scope of the problem, issues related to the development and monitoring of mechanisms for ensuring quality and standards of care, and possible roles for the City, the Province and other stakeholders in this regard;
- (5) this report be forwarded to the Planning and Transportation Committee and the Policy and Finance Committee;
- (6) the estimated funding of \$527,500.00 required for the short-term solution be absorbed in the Community and Neighbourhood Services 1999 approved Operating Budget, and that a report be submitted to the Budget Committee on the details of this expenditure, and the under expenditures in 1999 that may be reallocated for this purpose, as part of the 1999 Operating Budget Variance Reporting process;

- (7) the funding implications of a longer-term solution be subject to a report to the Budget Committee, for consideration with the year 2000 Operating Budget process; and
- (8) the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

The Board also had before it a communication (September 9, 1999) from the City Clerk advising that the Community Services Committee on September 9, 1999, recommended to the Policy and Finance Committee, and Council, adoption of the joint report dated September 8, 1999, from the Commissioner of Community and Neighbourhood Services and Medical Officer of Health respecting retirement and lodging homes, subject to amending the recommendations as outlined therein.

The Board also had before it a communication (September 17, 1999) from the City Clerk advising that the Policy and Finance Committee on September 16, 1999, recommended to City Council:

- (1) the adoption of the Recommendations of the Community Services Committee embodied in the communication (September 9, 1999) from the City Clerk, subject to amending Recommendation No. (6) by deleting the amount of \$527,500.00 and substituting therefor the amount of \$250,000.00; and
- (2) the adoption of the Recommendation of the Planning and Transportation Committee embodied in the communication (September 14, 1999) from the City Clerk, wherein it is recommended that the following Recommendation No. (1) (a) (8) of the Community Services Committee be amended to read as follows:

“(1) (a) (8) the funding implications of a longer-term solution be subject to a report to the Policy and Finance Committee, through the Budget Advisory Committee, for consideration with the year 2000 Operating Budget process;”;

so that the Recommendations now read as follows:

"It is recommended that:

- (1) a Retirement and Lodging Homes Advisory Committee be established, comprised of Councillors Ootes (Deputy Mayor), Johnston (Seniors Advocate), Fillion (Chair, Board of Health), Duguid (Chair, Community Services Committee), Jones (Vice-Chair, Community Services Committee), and Flint (Chair, Planning and Transportation Committee);

- (2) a Retirement and Lodging Homes Action Team, led by Public Health, be established with membership from Homes for the Aged, Municipal Standards and Licensing, Fire, Ambulance, Buildings, Legal Services, Shelter Housing and Support, Toronto Police, and Social Development. This team will immediately implement a short-term action plan to address complaints and concerns from the public regarding retirement homes;
- (3) the City of Toronto fully apply its existing legal powers to investigate complaints related to the health and safety of residents in retirement homes across the City;
- (4) the Commissioner of Community and Neighbourhood Services and the Commissioner of Urban Planning and Development Services, in consultation with the Medical Officer of Health and City Solicitor, establish an interdepartmental working group comprised of staff from Police, Fire, Ambulance and Legal as well as other appropriate stakeholders. This working group will report back to the Retirement and Lodging Homes Advisory Committee by November 1999, and by December 1999 to the Community Services Committee and the Planning and Transportation Committee on the scope of the problem, issues related to the development and monitoring of mechanisms for ensuring quality and standards of care, and possible roles for the City, the Province and other stakeholders in this regard;
- (5) this report be forwarded to the Planning and Transportation Committee and the Policy and Finance Committee;
- (6) the estimated funding of \$250,000.00 required for the short-term solution be absorbed in the Community and Neighbourhood Services 1999 approved Operating Budget, and that a report be submitted to the Policy and Finance Committee on the details of this expenditure, and the underexpenditures in 1999 that may be reallocated for this purpose, as part of the 1999 Operating Budget Variance reporting process;
- (7) the 1999 expenditures required to immediately implement the initiatives proposed by the Retirement and Lodging Homes Action Team be approved and further that the City seek 50/50 cost-sharing from the Province of Ontario to cover these expenditures;
- (8) the funding implications of a longer-term solution be subject to a report to the Policy and Finance Committee, through the Budget Advisory Committee, for consideration with the year 2000 Operating Budget process;

- (9) the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect hereto;
- (10) that all references to the Retirement Homes Advisory Committee and the Retirement Homes Action Team, referred to in the joint report, be amended to read Retirement and Lodging Homes Advisory Committee and the Retirement and Lodging Homes Action Team respectively; and
- (11) that the focus of both the Retirement and Lodging Homes Advisory Committee and the Retirement and Lodging Homes Action Team include retirement and lodging homes where personal support is being provided on site.”

The Board also had before it a report dated September 1987, entitled “The Regulation of Standards of Care in Rest Homes and Retirement Homes - A Study of Municipal Views and Concerns”, by Anne Johnston Associates.

Dr. Sheela Basrur, Medical Officer of Health, gave a presentation to the Board of Health in connection with the foregoing matter, and submitted a copy of her presentation..

Councillor Jones moved that the Board of Health:

- (I) recommend to City Council the adoption of the recommendations of the Policy and Finance Committee, embodied in the aforementioned communication (September 17, 1999) from the City Clerk, subject to:
 - (1) amending Recommendation No. (4) to provide that the Interdepartmental Working Group report to Council in December 1999 through the Board of Health, Community Services and Planning and Transportation Committees; and
 - (2) striking out Recommendation No. (6) and inserting in lieu thereof the following:
 - “(6) the amount of \$527,500.00 be allocated for the short-term solution, with \$250,000.00 to be reallocated from 1999 under expenditures and the remainder of the funds to be considered for pre-approval in the year 2000 Operating Budget, subject to a further report from the Interdepartmental Working Group”.

(Carried)

Councillor Johnston moved that the aforementioned report entitled “The

Regulation of Standards of Care in Rest Homes and Retirement Homes - A Study of Municipal Views and Concerns”, by Anne Johnston Associates, be referred to the Retirement and Lodging Homes Advisory Committee and Action Team. **(Carried)**

(City Council; Retirement and Lodging Homes Advisory Committee; Retirement and Lodging Homes Action Team; c: Commissioner of Community and Neighbourhood Services; Medical Officer of Health)

8.2 Response to 1999 Health Canada’s Nutrition Labelling Policy Review.

The Board of Health had before it a report (September 2, 1999) from the Medical Officer of Health recommending that:

- (1) the Board of Health, in response to Health Canada’s Nutrition Labelling Policy Review, urge the Federal Minister of Health to make nutrition labelling mandatory on all foods in Canada and to allocate resources to the development of a comprehensive consumer education plan to ensure that Canadians can understand and use nutrition labels to make healthier food choices; and
- (2) the Board of Health forward this report to other Boards of Health in Ontario, the Ontario Public Health Association and the Canadian Public Health Association and request them to join in advocating for mandatory nutrition labelling in Canada.

The Board also had before it a communication (September 20, 1999) from Ms. Anne Dubas, President, Canadian Union of Public Employees Local 79, in support of the recommendations of the Medical Officer of Health.

On motion by Ms. Lindsay, the Board of Health adopted the aforementioned report.

(Federal Minister of Health; Canadian Public Health Association; Ontario Public Health Association; Boards of Health in Ontario; CUPE Local 79; Medical Officer of Health)

8.3 Air Quality: Canada-Wide Standards for Particulate Matter and Ground Level Ozone.

The Board of Health had before it a report (August 27, 1999) from the Medical Officer of Health recommending that:

- (1) the Board of Health request the Canadian Council of Ministers of the Environment to adopt the following:
 - (a) establish Canada-wide standards for particulate matter (PM) and ozone as recommended by Toronto Public Health:
 - (i) PM₁₀: 50 µg/m³ by 2010, 40 µg/m³ by 2015 (24 h averaging);
 - (ii) PM_{2.5}: 25 µg/m³ by 2010, 20 µg/m³ by 2015 (24 h averaging);
 - (iii) Ozone: 82 ppb by 2010, 70 ppb by 2015 (1 h maximum);
 - (iv) Ozone: 68 ppb by 2010, 60 ppb by 2015 (1h, 4th highest);
 - (v) Ozone: 60 ppb by 2010, 50 ppb by 2015 (8 h equivalent, 4th highest);
 - (vi) Achievement measures:
PM: 98th percentile, averaged over three consecutive years; and
Ozone: 4th highest value, averaged over three consecutive years,

and develop mechanisms to ensure that actual emission and ambient level reductions are demonstrated by 2005;
 - (b) facilitate immediate implementation of the preliminary actions identified by each jurisdiction to achieve the standards;
 - (c) continue to invite and fund a representative group of public health professionals and health organizations to participate in consultation/workshop(s) in future Canada-wide standard setting exercises;
 - (d) request the Canadian Public Health Association to facilitate further consultation/workshop(s) on socioeconomic analysis relating to particulate matter and ozone; and
 - (e) facilitate the establishment of dedicated funding, legislation and policy to develop, improve and expand an integrated public transit system(s) within the Windsor-Toronto-Quebec corridor;
- (2) the Board of Health forward this report to the Ministers of the Environment, Transportation, and Energy, Science and Technology in Ontario, to encourage these ministries to implement the preliminary actions identified for Ontario and to report publicly on their progress;

- (3) the Board of Health forward this report for information to the Federation of Canadian Municipalities, the Association of Municipalities of Ontario, and the Greater Toronto Services Board;
- (4) the Board of Health forward this report to other municipalities in Ontario with a population greater than 50,000 and request that they endorse these recommendations; and
- (5) the Board of Health recommend that City Council endorse this report and recommendations.

On motion by Councillor King, the Board of Health:

- (1) adopted the aforementioned report, subject to amending Recommendation No. (1)(e) by adding thereto the following words: “making the Greater Toronto Area a priority” so that such recommendation reads as follows:
 - “(e) facilitate the establishment of dedicated funding, legislation and policy to develop, improve and expand an integrated public transit system(s) within the Windsor-Toronto-Quebec corridor, making the Greater Toronto Area a priority;”;and recommended that City Council endorse the action taken by the Board; and
- (2) requested the Greater Toronto Services Board to forward to the Board of Health any relevant studies with respect to the number of vehicles per day on the roads in the GTA, for the purposes of policy advocacy.

(Canadian Council of Ministers of the Environment; Minister of the Environment; Minister of Energy, Science and Technology; Minister of Transportation; Federation of Canadian Municipalities; Association of Municipalities of Ontario; Greater Toronto Services Board; Municipalities in Ontario with a population greater than 50,000; Medical Officer of Health)

(Clause No. 2, Report No. 7)

8.4 Environmental Health Issues in the City of Toronto.

The Board of Health had before it a report (September 2, 1999) from the Medical Officer of Health providing a summary of the environmental health issues that can and do affect the residents of Toronto; and recommending that:

- (1) the Board of Health receive this report and the attached background report, entitled "Environmental Health Issues in the City of Toronto" for information; and
- (2) the Board of Health refer both reports to the Environmental Task Force for information.

Mr. Mackay moved that the Medical Officer of Health, in conjunction with the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services, be requested to submit a report to the Board on the number of incidents during the previous three to five years of raw sewage discharges into Lake Ontario and upstream surface water, along with changes in wastewater monitoring systems designed to prevent such occurrences in the future. **(Carried)**

Councillor Johnston moved:

- (1) that congratulations be extended to Public Health staff for the excellent report;
- (2) the adoption of the aforementioned report, subject to adding to Recommendation No. (2) the words "and for development and implementation of an overall plan", so that such recommendation reads as follows:

“(2) the Board of Health refer both reports to the Environmental Task Force for information and for development and implementation of an overall plan”; and

- (3) that a copy of both reports also be forwarded to all Members of Council.

(Carried)

(Environmental Task Force; Members of Council; Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services; Medical Officer of Health)

8.5 Healthy Babies, Healthy Children Program Update.

The Board of Health had before it a report (September 1, 1999) from the Medical Officer of Health providing an update on Toronto Public Health's Healthy Babies, Healthy Children program, including the expansion of the "at-risk" component, the introduction of the new postpartum component, and its linkage with Family Health Planning; and recommending that this report be received for information.

On motion by Councillor Jones, the Board of Health received the aforementioned report for information.

(Medical Officer of Health)

8.6 Update on Strategic Planning for Toronto Public Health.

The Board of Health had before it a report (September 3, 1999) from the Medical Officer of Health providing a summary of the strategic planning process undertaken by the Public Health Division during 1999, and presenting goals and objectives to support the previously adopted vision, mission, principles and strategic directions; and recommending that the Board of Health endorse the revised strategic directions and the goals and objectives for each strategic direction as outlined in Appendix B of this report.

Councillor Jones moved that the strategic planning process be amended to include:

- (i) partnerships with other City divisions, agencies, boards and commissions; and
- (ii) input and participation in the City's long range plans, which have a bearing on the health of the City. **(Carried)**

Ms. Campbell moved that the word "inequalities" under the section of the Guiding Principles headed "Diversity, Access and Equity", be deleted and the word "inequities" inserted in lieu thereof. **(Carried)**

Councillor Johnston moved the adoption of the aforementioned report, as amended. **(Carried)**

(Medical Officer of Health)

8.7 Membership of Substance Abuse Sub-Committee.

The Board of Health again had before it a report (July 12, 1999) from the Medical Officer of Health recommending, in part, that:

- (1) the Board of Health implement the recommendation to establish a Substance Abuse Sub-Committee of the Board of Health according to the proposed membership and terms of reference outlined in Appendix B.

The following persons appeared before the Board of Health in connection with the foregoing matter:

- Mr. Arthur Potts, representing the Brewers of Ontario; and
- Mr. C.J. Helie, Association of Canadian Distillers.

Councillor Johnston moved that consideration of the membership of the Substance Abuse Sub-Committee be reopened, which was carried.

Councillor Johnston moved that:

- (1) the membership of the Sub-Committee be amended to include a representative of each of the Brewers of Ontario, Association of Canadian Distillers and Wine Council of Ontario and Vintners Quality Alliance, if they so wish; and
- (2) Mr. Davies, Councillor Prue and Mr. Zaslofsky be appointed as the Board of Health Members on the Sub-Committee.

(Carried)

Trustee Gershon moved that the foregoing motion by Councillor Johnston be referred to the Medical Officer of Health for a report thereon to the Board.

Having regard for the action taken by the Board, the foregoing motion by Trustee Gershon was not put to the vote.

(Mr. R. Davies; Councillor M. Prue; Mr. L. Zaslofsky; Mr. Arthur Potts; Brewers of Ontario; Association of Canadian Distillers; Wine Council of Ontario and Vintners Quality Alliance; Medical Officer of Health)

**8.8 Report of The Toronto Hoof and Cycle Courier Coalition,
“Choking us to Death: The Air Pollution Crisis and
its Effects on Bicycle Couriers”.**

The Board of Health had before it a communication (July 22, 1999) from the City Clerk advising that the Toronto Cycling Committee at its meeting on July 19, 1999, had before it a report from the Toronto Hoof and Cycle Courier Coalition, headed “Choking Us to Death: The Air Pollution Crisis and its Effects on Bicycle Couriers” (May 1999); and requesting the Board of Health to:

- (1) invite representatives of the Toronto Hoof and Cycle Courier Coalition, and any other interested representatives of the courier industry, to make a presentation to the Board respecting the report of the Coalition; and
- (2) participate in assisting the Coalition in research on the impact of smog on the health of workers in the courier industry.

Mr. Joe Hendry, Toronto Hoof and Cycle Courier Coalition, appeared before the Board of Health in connection with the foregoing matter.

The Board also heard a verbal report by Mr. Zaslofsky on the recommendations of the Planning and Transportation Committee at its meeting of September 13, 1999, respecting the foregoing matter.

Councillor King moved that the Board support the Toronto Hoof and Cycle Courier Coalition in making a request to the Ontario Medical Association to include research on the occupational health effects of smog among couriers in its research on the health impacts of air pollution. **(Carried)**

Mr. Zaslofsky moved that Board endorse the recommendations of the Planning and Transportation Committee at its meeting of September 13, 1999, in its consideration of the recommendations of the Toronto Cycling Committee with respect to the report of the Toronto Hoof and Cycle Courier Coalition. **(Carried)**

Councillor Jones moved that the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services be requested to submit a report to the Board of Health on providing a bicycle network system across the City. **(Carried)**

(City Council; Toronto Hoof and Cycle Courier Coalition; Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services; Medical Officer of Health; c: Toronto Cycling Committee)

**8.9 Combat Shooting as a Demonstration Sport
at the 2004 Olympic Games.**

The Board of Health had before it a communication (July 28, 1999) from Councillor Joe Mihevc, York Eglinton, forwarding a press release respecting Combat Shooting as a Demonstration Sport at the 2004 Olympic Games and thereafter; and advising of his intention to move that the Board of Health voice its opposition to the sport of Combat Shooting and that the appropriate organizations be so notified.

The Board also had before it additional documentation submitted by Councillor Mihevc.

The Board also had before it a motion by Councillor Mihevc wherein it is resolved:

THAT the Board of Health indicate to the Canadian Olympic Committee, the Toronto Bid Committee and the International Olympic Committee in the strongest possible terms its opposition to permitting combat (or Practical) shooting as a demonstration sport for the 2004 Olympics or any future Olympics; and

THAT this motion be forward to Toronto City Council and local Ontario Boards of Health for further endorsement; and

THAT the Board of Health, in consultation with the Coalition for Gun Control and other appropriate groups, direct staff to review its current activities with respect to gun violence and to develop strategies for further action.

Ms. Wendy Cukier, Chair, Canadian Coalition on Gun Control, appeared before the Board of Health in connection with the foregoing matter.

On motion by Councillor Mihevc, the Board of Health adopted the aforementioned motion.

(Canadian Olympic Committee; Toronto Bid Committee; International Olympic Committee; Boards of Health in Ontario; Coalition for Gun Control; Chief of Police; Medical Officer of Health; Councillor Mihevc)

(Clause No. 3, Report No. 7)

8.10 Food Banks.

The Board of Health had before it a communication (July 29, 1999) from Councillor Anne Johnston, North Toronto, requesting that the Medical Officer of Health report to the next meeting of the Board of Health regarding the adequacy of standards on the food being donated and distributed at food banks.

On motion by Councillor Johnston, the Board of Health referred the aforementioned communication to the Medical Officer of Health for a report thereon to the Board.

(Councillor Anne Johnston; Medical Officer of Health)

8.11 Review of Fluoride in the Toronto Water Supply, November, 2000 Municipal Election Ballot Question.

The Board of Health had before it a communication (September 7, 1999) from the City Clerk advising that the Administration Committee on September 7, 1999, referred a communication (June 10, 1999) from Mr. Tony O'Donohue, President, Environmental Probe Ltd., respecting the placing of a question on the ballot of the November, 2000, Municipal Election regarding the issue of adding fluoride to the Toronto water supply, to the Board of Health for consideration and report thereon to the Works Committee.

On motion by Councillor Prue, the Board of Health received the aforementioned communication.

(Mr. Tony O'Donohue, Environmental Probe Ltd.; c: Administrator, Administration Committee; Medical Officer of Health)

**8.12 Tuberculosis (TB) and Immigrants/Refugees:
Implications for Toronto Public Health's
TB Control Program.**

The Board of Health had before it a report (September 21, 1999) from the Medical Officer of Health recommending that:

- (1) the City of Toronto immediately pursue federal funding for Toronto Public Health to expand the capacity of the TB Control Program to provide outreach and post-landing medical surveillance for refugee influxes from TB endemic countries;

- (2) the City of Toronto urge Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC) to strengthen its post-landing surveillance mechanism to identify TB and other health issues (as appropriate) in refugee/immigrant groups, in consultation with Toronto Public Health and other key stakeholders. Specifically, the 60 day interval for medical examination of refugees must be shortened, and compliance monitored and enforced;
- (3) the City of Toronto request Citizenship and Immigration Canada and Health Canada to expand current research to determine the optimal process for the medical follow-up of immigrants and refugees from TB-endemic areas and recommend and fund a national program to accomplish this, in consultation with Toronto Public Health and other key stakeholders;
- (4) the City of Toronto urge the Province of Ontario to fully cost-share the harmonized base budget of Toronto Public Health's TB Control Program; and
- (5) this report be forwarded for information to the Community Services Committee and the Toronto Advisory Committee on Immigrant and Refugee Issues.

Dr. Barbara Yaffe, Associate Medical Officer of Health, gave a presentation to the Board of Health on the aforementioned report.

Councillor Johnston moved that the Chair of the Board of Health, Councillor Joan King and the Medical Officer of Health be requested to meet with the Federal Minister of Citizenship and Immigration to convey the Board's request for federal funding to address Tuberculosis among immigrants and refugees, with particular reference to recent influxes of refugee claimants from TB endemic countries, and report back to the Board thereon. **(Carried)**

Councillor King moved that the Board of Health recommend to City Council the adoption of the aforementioned report. **(Carried)**

(Federal Minister of Citizenship and Immigration; Federal Minister of Health; Ontario Minister of Health; Community Services Committee; Toronto Advisory Committee on Immigration and Refugee Issues; Medical Officer of Health)

(Clause No. 1, Report No. 7)

16
Board of Health Minutes
Tuesday, September 21, 1999

The Board of Health adjourned its meeting at 4:20 p.m.

Chair.