

THE CITY OF TORONTO

City Clerk's Division

Minutes of the Works Committee

Meeting No. 5

Friday, September 24, 1999

A special meeting of the Works Committee was held on Friday, September 24, 1999, in Committee Room 1, 2nd Floor, City Hall, Toronto, commencing at 1:40 p.m.

Members Present:

1:40 p.m. – 4:40 p.m.
(In Camera: 2:55 p.m. – 3:50 p.m.)

Councillor Bill Saundercook, Chair		x
Councillor Ila Bossons	x	
Councillor Rob Davis		x
Councillor Betty Disero	x	
Councillor Dennis Fotinos		x
Councillor Jack Layton	x	
Councillor Judy Sgro		-
Councillor David Shiner		x
Councillor Bruce Sinclair		-

Members were present for some or all of the time period indicated.

5.1 Toronto Integrated Solid Waste Resource Management Process Request for Proposals for Disposal Services.

The Works Committee again had before it a report (August 30, 1999) from the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services recommending that the Toronto Integrated Solid Waste Resource Management Process Request for Proposals for Disposal Services be approved for issuance on or about October 4, 1999, substantially in accordance with the Request for Proposals document attached to this report as Appendix "A".

Works Committee Minutes
Friday, September 24, 1999

The Committee also had before it a communication (September 8, 1999) from the City Clerk advising that the Works Committee at its meeting on September 8, 1999, during consideration of various reports respecting the Toronto Integrated Solid Waste Resource Management Process, deferred consideration of the report (August 30, 1999) from the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services respecting the issuance of a Request for Proposals for Disposal Services, to a special meeting of the Committee to be held at the call of the Chair prior to the Council meeting scheduled for September 28, 29 and 30, 1999, to receive comments and depositions on the proposed Terms of Reference for the Request for Disposals; and tabled a motion by Councillor Fotinos respecting amendments to the weighting factors under Table 5.2, "Comparative Evaluation Criteria" in the RFP in accordance with the attached table.

The Committee also had before it a communication (September 8, 1999) from Councillor Jack Layton, Don River, recommending that the Request for Proposals be amended as follows:

"The City will only enter into a contract with a proponent of waste disposal capacity option if the host community has endorsed the proponent's plans. Endorsement would be demonstrated by a municipally organized referendum where residents of the affected municipalities indicated over 50 percent support for the proponent's plans."

The Committee also had before it the following communications:

- (1) (September 8, 1999) from Mr. Kevin Heise, Thornton, Ontario, respecting the AGRA Birwelco sponsored incinerator proposal for Simcoe County;
- (2) (September 8, 1999) from Mr. John Jackson, Citizens' Network on Waste, respecting the communication process for the Toronto Integrated Solid Waste Resource Management Process and the disposal RFP comparative evaluation criteria;
- (3) from the following in opposition to the Rail Cycle North proposal for Toronto garbage:
 - (i) (August 16, 1999) from Ms. Elizabeth Dexter, Tarzwell, Ontario;
 - (ii) (August 16, 1999) from Susie and Paul Gatz, Tarzwell, Ontario;
 - (iii) (August 16, 1999) from Ms. Beatrice Grant, Tarzwell, Ontario;
 - (iv) (August 16, 1999) from Mrs. Jean Simms, Tarzwell, Ontario;
 - (v) (August 16, 1999) from Ms. Kylli Swanson, Tarzwell, Ontario;
 - (vi) (August 18, 1999) from Fern and Pauline Bruneau, Swastika, Ontario;
 - (vii) (August 18, 1999) from Ms. Marlene Pitcaithley, Swastika, Ontario;

Works Committee Minutes
Friday, September 24, 1999

- (viii) (August 19, 1999) from Mr. Norman Macdonald, Swastika, Ontario;
 - (ix) (August 20, 1999) from Ms. Anne Parkman, Tarzwell, Ontario;
 - (x) (August 20, 1999) from Ms. Frances Swanson, Tarzwell, Ontario;
 - (xi) (September 6, 1999) from Mr. John Patterson, North Bay, Ontario;
 - (xii) (September 7, 1999) from Mr. Dennis Hakola, Cobalt, Ontario;
 - (xiii) (September 7, 1999) from Ms. Kathy Hakola, Cobalt, Ontario; and
 - (xiv) (September 7, 1999) from Mr. Bob Meister, Trout Creek, Ontario;
- (4) (September 3, 1999) from the City Clerk, City of Vaughan, forwarding a copy of Item 4, Report No. 61, of the Committee of the Whole, which was adopted by the Council of the City of Vaughan at its meeting of August 30, 1999, respecting the City of Toronto Integrated Solid Waste Resource Management Process, wherein it is resolved that:
- “The City of Vaughan Council, on behalf of its constituents and residents, strongly supports and encourages the City of Toronto to devote all possible energies, resources and resolve to the finalization of its long-term waste management objectives in sufficient time to meet its projected 2002 closure date for the Keele Valley Landfill Site; it being pointed out that the City of Vaughan is prepared to assist and cooperate in any way possible with the City of Toronto in meeting its objectives provided the interests of Vaughan continue to be maintained and that the projected closure date of the Keele Valley Landfill Site is not compromised”;
- (5) (September 17, 1999) from Rail Cycle North Ltd. forwarding comments respecting the September 1, 1999 draft Request for Proposals for Waste Disposal Services;
- (6) (September 23, 1999) from Mr. Michael Bryson, Toronto, Ontario, expressing concern that the evaluation criteria proposed as part of the Toronto Integrated Solid Waste Resource Management Process will result in environmental and social impacts which would be unacceptable to the citizens of Toronto; and requesting adoption of the best waste management strategy (with the greatest amount of waste reduction) and the siting of small landfills close to the waste source to deposit any remaining volume;
- (7) (September 23, 1999) from Mr. Joe Muething;
- (8) (September 24, 1999) from Ms. Anne Dubas, President, CUPE Local 79, expressing concern regarding contracting-out of disposal services to the private sector, and urging the Committee to put in place a diversion plan to reduce the amount of waste going to landfill before an RFP for disposal is considered;

Works Committee Minutes
Friday, September 24, 1999

- (9) (September 17, 1999) from Mr. Nigel G.H. Guilford, Vice President, Rail Cycle North, addressed to the Manager of Strategic Planning, Solid Waste Management Services, submitting constructive comments of a technical nature, and addressing what they believe to be errors or omissions in the draft RFP;
- (10) (September 24, 1999) from Mr. Jim Hamilton, Thornton, Ontario, addressed to Ms. Nancy Martins, Toronto Works and Emergency Services, and attaching a copy of a news release and petition containing approximately 1,131 signatures opposed to the waste and composting facility proposed in the Town of Innisfil;
- (10) Excerpt from Canada's Second National Report on Climate Change, submitted by Councillor Layton;
- (11) (September 8, 1999) from Adrian Van Luyk, Bradford, Ontario, in opposition to the proposed garbage incinerator facility for the Town of Innisfil; and
- (12) (September 8, 1999) from Tony Moro, President, Bradford & District Vegetable Growers Association, expressing opposition to the proposed garbage incineration plant in the Town of Innisfil.

The following persons appeared before the Committee in connection with the foregoing matter:

- Mr. Blair McArthur, and Mr. Scott Wolfe, Rail Cycle North, and submitted material with respect thereto;
- Mr. Jim Hamilton, Thornton, Ontario, member of Stop Incineration Now, and submitted a communication, News Release and Petition from approximately 1,131 persons in opposition to the waste and composting facility proposed in the Town of Innisfil;
- Ms. Elizabeth Denton, Tarzwell, Ontario;
- Mr. Richard Gilbert, and Mr. Harry Poch, Environmental Lawyer, representing AGRA Resource Management; and
- Ms. Karen Buck, Toronto, Ontario.

Works Committee Minutes
Friday, September 24, 1999

On motion by Councillor Bossons, the Committee met privately to discuss the foregoing matter having regard that the subject matter being considered relates to the security of the property of the municipality or local board, in accordance with the Municipal Act.

Councillor Fotinos moved that the weighting factors under Table 5.2, "Comparative Evaluation Criteria", in the Request for Proposals for Disposal Services be amended in accordance with the table submitted to the meeting of September 8, 1999, referred to in the aforementioned communication from the City Clerk. **(Lost)**

Councillor Layton moved that:

- (1) the social benefits be limited to the Greater Toronto Area (GTA); **(Carried)**
- (2) the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services be requested to report directly to Council on the possibility of including a requirement that any landfilling proposals include front-end processing plants for any disposal option; **(Carried)**
- (3) the carbon dioxide criteria be amended to provide that it be greenhouse gases as set out in the Kyoto Protocol, and as measured by CO² equivalents (eCO²); **(Carried)**
- (4) the City will only enter into a contract with a proponent of waste disposal capacity option if the host community has endorsed the proponent's plans; endorsement to be demonstrated by a municipally organized plebiscite where residents of the affected municipalities indicated over 50 percent support for the proponent's plans; and that if Council adopts this position, a further report be developed in consultation with Members of the Committee on the development of an appropriate description of the plebiscite; and **(Lost)**
- (5) all proposals including incineration be deleted from the list. **(Lost)**

Councillor Saundercook appointed Councillor Bossons Acting Chair, and vacated the Chair.

Councillor Saundercook moved the adoption of the aforementioned report, subject

Works Committee Minutes
Friday, September 24, 1999

to deleting the words “Fatality Rates” under Section 1.2 “Traffic Safety” in Table 5.2, entitled “Comparative Evaluation Criteria”, and inserting in lieu thereof the words “Accident Rates”. **(Carried)**

Councillor Saundercook resumed the Chair.

Councillor Bossons moved the reaffirmation of the position set out in the ‘Request for Expressions of Interest’ document, as follows:

“Respondents to this combined transport and disposal service RFP will be required to provide a price for the combined service, and separate prices for each of the following (if applicable): truck; rail; and disposal service only.”

(Carried)

The following is the action therefore taken by the Committee:

The Works Committee:

(A) recommended to Council, for consideration with Clause No. 1 of Report No. 3 of The Works Committee, the adoption of the aforementioned report dated August 30, 1999, from the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services, subject to the following amendments:

(1) deleting the words “Fatality Rates” under Section 1.2 “Traffic Safety” in Table 5.2, entitled “Comparative Evaluation Criteria”, and inserting in lieu thereof the words “Accident Rates”;

(2) reaffirmation of the position set out in the ‘Request for Expressions of Interest’ document, as follows:

“Respondents to this combined transport and disposal service RFP will be required to provide a price for the combined service, and separate prices for each of the following (if applicable): truck; rail; and disposal service only”;

(3) that the social benefits be limited to the Greater Toronto Area (GTA); and

Works Committee Minutes
Friday, September 24, 1999

- (4) that the carbon dioxide criteria be amended to provide that it be greenhouse gases as set out in the Kyoto Protocol, and as measured by CO² equivalents (eCO²); and
- (B) requested the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services to report directly to Council on the possibility of including a requirement that any landfilling proposals include front-end processing plants for any disposal option.

(City Council; c: Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services; General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services – September 24, 1999)

(Clause No. 1, Report No. 3)

The Works Committee adjourned its meeting at 4:40 p.m.

Chair.