

THE CITY OF TORONTO

City Clerk's Division

Minutes of the Urban Environment and Development Committee and the Works and Utilities Committee

Meeting No. 1

Tuesday, March 16, 1999

A special joint meeting of the Urban Environment and Development Committee and the Works and Utilities Committee was held on Tuesday, March 16, 1999, in the Council Chamber, City Hall, Toronto, commencing at 9:45 a.m.

Members Present:

	<u>9:45 a.m.-1:00 p.m.</u>	<u>1:20 p.m.-6:20 p.m.</u>	
<u>Works and Utilities Committee:</u>			
Councillor Betty Disero, Chair	x	x	
Councillor Lorenzo Berardinetti	x	x	
Councillor Ila Bossons	x	x	
Councillor Sandra Bussin			x
Councillor Tom Jakobek			x
Councillor Jack Layton	x	x	
Councillor Bill Saundercook			x
Councillor Sherene Shaw			x
Councillor David Shiner			x
Councillor Michael Walker			x
<u>Urban Environment and Development Committee:</u>			
Councillor Joe Pantalone, Chair			x
Councillor Irene Jones	x	x	
Councillor Blake Kinahan			-
Councillor Peter Li Preti			-
Councillor Pam McConnell			x
Councillor Ron Moeser	x	x	
Councillor Howard Moscoe			-
Councillor Judy Sgro			x
Councillor Mario Silva			-
Councillor Mike Tzekas			-

Members were present for some or all of the time period indicated.

Also Present:

Councillor Robert Davis
Councillor Mario Giansante
Councillor Douglas Holyday
Councillor Chris Korwin-Kuczynski
Councillor David Miller
Councillor Frances Nunziata

Councillor Betty Disero in the Chair.

1.1 Service Level Harmonization.

The Urban Environment and Development Committee and the Works and Utilities Committee jointly had before them the following reports and communications:

- (A) (February 24, 1999) from the City Clerk advising that the Strategic Policies and Priorities Committee, at its meeting on February 23, 1999, had before it a report (February 19, 1999) from the Chief Administrative Officer recommending that:
- (1) this report be forwarded to the Budget Committee for service level recommendations as part of the 1999 Operating Budget process;
 - (2) the shaded A Baseline Service Level[®] and options for the programs outlined in Tables 1 and 2 have formed the basis for the 1999 preliminary Operating estimates, and be considered by the Budget Committee as part of the 1999 Operating Budget process;
 - (3) service level harmonization reviews within Departments continue through 1999 resulting in the determination of Baseline Service Levels and options for other programs and services;
 - (4) this report be forwarded to Community Councils and the respective standing committees;
 - (5) the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto;

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

and further advising that the Strategic Policies and Priorities Committee:

- (1) endorsed the Recommendations embodied in the aforementioned report; and
 - (2) requested the Works and Utilities Committee and the Urban Environment and Development Committee to convene a joint meeting, as soon as possible, to consider policy issues, and report their findings to the Budget Committee for inclusion in the 1999 Operating Budget;
- (B) (March 5, 1999) from the City Clerk forwarding the following report and communication which were before the Works and Utilities Committee at its meeting on January 13, 1999, and setting out the action taken by the Committee at that time:
- (i) (November 27, 1998) from the General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services, recommending, based on the comments received at an informal meeting of the Works and Utilities Committee held on November 25, 1998, to review the issues and options discussed in this report, that:
 - (1) existing service levels for waste and recycling collection be continued into 1999, except for harmonization of the following services, which are to be referred to North York Community Council for comments before consideration by the Works and Utilities Committee:
 - (a) effective April 1, 1999, on an interim basis, the North York Community Council area be provided with once-a-week garbage collection and bi-weekly recycling collection, with twice-a-week garbage collection retained from the last week of June to the last week of August at an estimated annual cost savings of \$1.0 million; and
 - (b) effective April 1, 1999, optional rear and side yard collection service provided at an additional fee be terminated;
 - (2) effective January 2, 1999, rear and side yard collection service be provided at no direct charge to all residents in low density properties who, on the basis of a doctor's certificate, lack sufficient mobility to carry waste materials to curbside, and who do not live in a residence with a fully able person, at an estimated additional annual cost of \$50,000.00;

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

- (3) effective April 1, 1999, replacement blue and grey boxes be provided to residents at a charge of \$5.00 per box for pick-up at service yard and Civic Centre locations, and that green boxes be replaced with grey boxes as required, at an estimated saving of \$120,000.00 per year;
- (4) medium and high density residential buildings receiving municipal bulklift collection service be required to rent bulklift garbage bins from the City, as a condition of receiving garbage and recycling collection service from the City, at a rental fee sufficient to offset the cost of both bulklift garbage bins and recycling containers, subject to a further report on implementation issues to be submitted within approximately six months; and
- (5) staff undertake the evaluation of the options for service harmonization outlined in this report with respect to:
 - (a) frequency of garbage, recycling and yard waste collection for low density and medium density residential properties which receive curbside collection;
 - (b) the provision of blue bags and other recycling support services to high density residential properties which receive bulklift collection;
 - (c) the provision of waste management services to small commercial properties and institutional properties, including consideration of full cost recovery user fees; and
 - (d) the number of industrial properties where municipal collection is proposed to be terminated and the method of phase out;and that a report be brought forward in approximately six months; and
- (ii) (January 13, 1999) from the Ontario Waste Management Association expressing concerns with respect to the harmonization of service levels for waste and recycling collection, and the suggestion that the City begin to provide services already adequately and economically provided by private sector waste haulers; and requesting that the Committee not approve this item at this time;
- (C) (March 5, 1999) from the City Clerk forwarding the following reports and communications which were before the Urban Environment and Development Committee at its meeting on February 8, 1999, and setting out the action taken by the Committee at that time:

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

- (i) (January 25, 1999) from the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services providing an outline of the activities undertaken by Transportation Services staff in preparation for the 1998-1999 winter road maintenance season, the courses of action taken during the severe winter storms in the first two weeks of January, 1999, and the actions taken subsequent to those storms and recommending that:
 - (1) this report be received for information; and
 - (2) the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services prepare a detailed report for the March 31, 1999 meeting of the Urban Environment and Development Committee recommending a comprehensive winter maintenance plan for the City;
- (ii) (January 6, 1999) from Councillor Bill Saundercook, York Humber, requesting that Councillor Saundercook and Alana Butcher, Acting Executive Director of the George Syme Seniors= Centre appear before the Economic Development Committee to speak about the Snowlink program in the former City of York;
- (iii) (November 23, 1998) from the City Clerk forwarding the action of the Toronto Pedestrian Committee on November 19, 1998, and recommending that:
 - (1) Toronto City Council support the public funding for sidewalk clearance throughout the new City; and
 - (2) Joan Doiron, Co-Chair, be authorized to depute this matter at the Urban Environment and Development Committee;
- (iv) (January 5, 1999) from Councillor Lorenzo Berardinetti, Chair, Scarborough Community Council, recommending policies and procedures be established City-wide for snow removal;

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

- (v) (February 3, 1999) from the City Clerk forwarding the York Community Council recommendation, that an amount of \$25,000.00 be transferred to the appropriate budget of the Works and Emergency Services that funds the Snow Link Program, to provide for the increased costs associated with this program;
 - (vi) (February 5, 1999) from the General Manager, Transportation Services, recommending that a comprehensive winter maintenance plan for the City, to be submitted by the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services to the March 31, 1999 meeting of the Urban Environment and Development Committee, address seniors and disabled persons sidewalk snow removal; and
 - (vii) (February 8, 1999) from Mayor Mel Lastman recommending that this report be forwarded to the Chair of the Greater Toronto Services Board and request the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services to explore this opportunity and report back to the Committee as soon as possible;
- (D) (March 12, 1999) from the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services providing revised recommendations for harmonized waste and recycling collection service levels in 1999, based on input from the Works and Utilities Committee, the Budget Committee and the Chief Administrative Officer; and recommending that:
- (1) effective September 1, 1999, all low density residential properties be provided with once a week garbage collection and every second week (or alternating weekly) recycling collection, with summer twice a week garbage collection in areas of high waste generation and limited storage space (to be determined), at a cost saving of approximately \$533,000.00 in 1999;
 - (2) staff report back to the Works and Utilities Committee by January 2000 with the proposed eligibility criteria for residential areas that would receive summer twice a week garbage collection in 2000, and with the associated cost impacts;
 - (3) once a week yard waste collection service be provided to all low density residential properties from mid-April to May 31 and from October 1 to November 30, with once every second week collection from June 1 to September 30, at a 1999 operating cost saving of approximately \$200,000.00;

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

- (4) effective July 1, 1999, provide rear and side yard collection service at no direct charge only to residents in low density properties who, on the basis of a doctor's certificate, lack sufficient mobility to carry waste to the curbside and who do not live in a residence with a fully able person, and terminate optional rear and side yard collection service provided for a fee, at a 1999 operating cost increase of approximately \$25,000.00;
 - (5) effective July 1, 1999, charge \$5.00 to replace lost recycling boxes or provide additional recycling boxes, and exchange damaged boxes for new boxes at no charge, and provide new residents with recycling boxes at no charge (with proof of new residency); and that this policy be extended to Environment Days, at a 1999 operating cost saving of approximately \$30,000.00;
 - (6) existing service levels and eligibility criteria for garbage and recyclables collection service to the small commercial sector be maintained until the end of 2000;
 - (7) effective July 1, 1999, charge mandatory service fees to all small commercial locations currently receiving more than twice a week garbage collection at an annual rate of \$300.00 for three times a week garbage collection, \$1,200.00 for five times a week garbage collection and \$1,600.00 for six times a week garbage collection, resulting in a 1999 operating revenue increase of approximately \$2.3 million; and
 - (8) staff report back to the Works and Utilities Committee by June 2000 with harmonized eligibility criteria for garbage and recyclables collection service to the small commercial sector and a harmonized service fee structure to be effective January 2, 2001;
- (E) (March 11, 1999) from the General Manager, Transportation Services, respecting harmonization of service levels for winter maintenance; and recommending that:
- (1) the service strategy for the clearing of windrows of snow at the ends of driveways deposited during snow ploughing operations as recommended by the Chief Administrative Officer in his report of February 19, 1999, be adopted as the standard for the provision of this winter maintenance service (comprising the clearing of driveway windrows where it is feasible to do so using mechanized means, namely on local streets that are no less than 8.5 metres in width and/or with adequate boulevard storage space, and where long-term on-street parking is not permitted) at an estimated additional cost of \$1,600,000.00;

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

- (2) the service strategy for clearing snow from sidewalks as recommended by the Chief Administrative Officer in his report of February 19, 1999, be adopted as the standard for the provision of this winter maintenance service (comprising the clearing of walks adjacent to City properties and reverse frontage properties), resulting in an estimated annual savings of \$3,800,000.00;
- (3) snow removal (the melting or hauling away of snow accumulations) be provided on the various categories of City streets pursuant to the criteria, and follow the time frames outlined in Table 3 of this report; these respective parameters are guidelines and the initiation and undertaking of a snow removal operation will be subject to the consideration of such factors as anticipated further accumulation, time of year and probability of melt. To provide this level of service, Council endorse the following resource program:
 - (1) overhaul the 5 mobile snow melters owned by the City and provide regular annual maintenance (one time total cost of \$500,000.00 and annual total maintenance cost of \$75,000.00);
 - (2) purchase 10 additional snow blowers to provide a total City-owned complement of 20 (one time total cost of \$1,500,000.00 and annual total maintenance cost of \$50,000.00);
 - (3) establish a plan to secure hired snow removal equipment when necessary, comprising yearly contract to supply 700 tandem and tri-axle dump trucks (\$140,000.00 annually) and establish and maintain an equipment register for at least 50 front-end loaders, and associated bulldozers, graders, excavators, bobcats, etc. (\$20,000.00 annually); and
 - (4) establish a reserve account of \$20,000,000.00 to cover the snow removal operating costs which would be incurred in the eventuality of a 50 cm snow accumulation;
- (4) snow ploughing/de-icing services on local streets in the central areas of the City be enhanced resulting in an additional annual cost of \$1,000,000.00; and

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

- (5) the Chief Financial Officer and City Treasurer, in consultation with the Commissioners of Works and Emergency Services and Corporate Services (Fleet), report to the Budget Committee, in the context of the 1999 Current and Capital Budgets, on the appropriate cash flow and method to fund the items in Recommendations Nos. (1), (3) and (4) above;
- (F) (March 4, 1999) from the City Clerk advising that the Toronto Pedestrian Committee, at its meeting of February 18, 1999, referred the following recommendations to the Urban Environment and Development Committee for approval:
 - (1) sidewalks should be cleared first;
 - (2) pedestrians should have unimpeded access to the T.T.C.;
 - (3) bus and streetcar routes should be the first streets plowed;
 - (4) bus stops should be cleared and made accessible;
 - (5) in a snow emergency, parking on any bus or streetcar route should be prohibited;
 - (6) street plowing should facilitate pedestrian access; and
 - (7) windrows should be cleared at intersections and transit stops to provide accessibility to the T.T.C.

The Committees also had before them a submission filed by Councillor Jack Layton respecting the 1999 rate harmonization - Hydro impacts.

The Urban Environment and Development Committee and the Works and Utilities Committee also had before them the following communications:

- (i) (January 6, 1999) from Ms. Gay Cowbourne, President and Ms. Liz Bowers, Chair, Centennial Community and Recreation Association, expressing dissatisfaction with the snow removal from the earlier storm; and noting that in previous years, the snow removal in the area was always carried out expeditiously and thoroughly;
- (ii) (March 11, 1999) from Mr. Ronald Hart, North York Cycling & Pedestrian Committee, advising that the North York Cycling & Pedestrian Committee fully supports the Toronto Pedestrian Committee request for full public funding to clear sidewalks of snow; and urging that adequate funding be provided for sidewalk snow clearing in the 1999 budget.
- (iii) (March 15, 1999) from Ms. Helen Hansen and Ms. Joan Doiron, Feet on the Street;
- (iv) (March 16, 1999) from the Mirvish Village Association;

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

- (v) (March 15, 1999) from Ms. Frances Wood, Southern Accent Restaurant;
- (vi) (March 16, 1999) from Ms. Paula Pass, Toronto, Ontario;

- (vii) (March 15, 1999) from Ms. Lisa McGee, General Manager, Bloor Yorkville Business Improvement Association;

- (viii) (March 16, 1999) from Mr. Chris Kawalec, Community Development Co-ordinator, Parkdale/Liberty Economic Development Committee;

- (ix) (March 18, 1999) from O. Chabarsky, Manager, West End Medical Pharmacy;

- (x) (March 15, 1999) from Brother Ignatious Feaver, Director; Brother Alan R. Gaebel, Capuchin Animator; and Brother Barry Brown, Executive Secretary, St. Francis Table;

- (xi) (March 16, 1999) from Councillor Bill Saundercook, York Humber, and Chair, York Community Council;

- (xii) (March 15, 1999) from Councillor Mario Silva, Trinity Niagara;

- (xiii) (March 16, 1999) from Ms. Patty MacPherson, Chair, Bloor Bathurst Madison Business Improvement Area;

- (xiv) (undated) from Helens Natural Foods & Gifts; and

- (xv) (March 16, 1999) from Ms. Helen Hansen.

The following persons gave presentations to the Urban Environment and Development Committee and the Works and Utilities Committee with respect to service level harmonization:

- Mr. Angelos Bacopoulos, General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services; and

- Mr. David C. Kaufman, General Manager, Transportation Services, and submitted a copy of his presentation.

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

The following persons appeared before the Urban Environment and Development Committee and the Works and Utilities Committee in connection with the foregoing matters:

- Mr. Peter Chan, President, Ontario Chinese Restaurant and Food Services Association;
- Mr. Tony Silipo, MPP;
- Ms. Marilyn Churley, MPP, Riverdale, and Mr. Jason Wong, President, Chinese Chamber of Commerce (East Toronto);
- Mr. Alex Ling, President, TABIA;
- Mr. Doug Ward, Bloor West Village Business Improvement Area.;
- Mr. Chris Kawalec, Parkdale Liberty Economic Development Committee;
- Mr. Dale Ritch;
- Ms. Jutta Mason;
- Mr. Francis Sequeira;
- Mr. David Vallance, Bloor Bathurst Madison Business Improvement Area;
- Mr. Joe Cunha;
- Mr. John Bray, Ontario Waste Management Association;
- Mr. Gus Fisher, Kensington Market Businessmen=s Association;
- Ms. Helen Hansen, Feet on the Street;
- Mr. Tonny Louie, Toronto Chinatown Community Development Association;
- Mr. Terry Mundell, Ontario Restaurant Association;
- Mr. John Kiru, Weston Business Improvement Area;
- Mr. Alan Burke, President, East Beach Community Association;
- Mr. Garnett Martin, Toronto Pedestrian Committee;
- Ms. Joan Doiron, Co-Chair, Toronto Pedestrian Committee;
- Mr. Dietmar Lein, President, Long Branch Business Improvement Area;
- Mr. Mark Crowe, Chair, Parkdale Village Business Improvement Area.;
- Mr. Walker Kwok, Co-Chair, Toronto Fair Tax Chinatown Committee;
- Mr. Doug Power, Teamsters Union, Local 499; and
- Mr. Tony Pena.

The following Councillors appeared before the Urban Environment and Development Committee and the Works and Utilities Committee in connection with the foregoing matters:

- Councillor Robert Davis, York Eglinton;
- Councillor Mario Giansante, Kingsway Humber;
- Councillor Douglas Holyday, Markland Centennial;
- Councillor Chris Korwin-Kuczynski, High Park;
- Councillor David Miller, High Park; and
- Councillor Frances Nunziata, York Humber.

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

A. Councillor Pantalone moved that:

(1) the report (March 12, 1999) from the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services (Solid Waste Management) be adopted, subject to:

(a) deleting Recommendation No. (7);

(Lost on the following recorded vote:

**FOR: Bossons, Bussin, Disero, Layton, McConnell,
Pantalone, Saundercook, Walker**

**AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Jakobek, Jones,
Moeser, Sgro, Shaw, Shiner)**

(b) amending Recommendation No. (8) to read as follows:

A(8) staff report back to the Works and Utilities Committee by early 2001 with harmonized eligibility criteria for garbage and recyclables collection service to the small commercial sector and a harmonized service fee structure to be effective some time in 2001@,

(Lost on the following recorded vote:

**FOR: Bossons, Bussin, Layton, McConnell,
Pantalone, Walker**

**AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Jakobek, Jones,
Moeser, Saundercook, Sgro, Shaw, Shiner)**

(Adoption of report:

Recommendations Nos. (1), (2), (3), (4) and (6) - Carried

Recommendation No. (5) - Lost

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

Recommendation No. (7) - Lost on the following recorded vote:

**FOR: Altobello, Berardinetti, Jones, Moeser, Sgro,
Shaw, Shiner**

**AGAINST: Bossons, Bussin, Disero, Jakobek, Layton,
McConnell, Pantalone, Saundercook,
Walker**

Recommendation No. (8) - Lost on the following recorded vote:

**FOR: Altobello, Berardinetti, Jones, Moeser,
Saundercook, Shaw**

**AGAINST: Bossons, Bussin, Disero, Jakobek, Layton,
McConnell, Pantalone, Sgro, Walker)**

- (2) the Chief Financial Officer and the Commissioner of Economic Development, Culture and Tourism be requested to conduct an impact study on the introduction of user fees on the tourism industry and on the impact on neighbourhood-based establishment along commercial strips, to be forwarded to the Works and Utilities Committee; **(Carried)**
- (3) all affected parties, especially BIAs and restaurant associations be consulted prior to further consideration of this matter;

(Carried on the following recorded vote:

**FOR: Altobello, Bossons, Bussin, Jakobek, Layton,
McConnell, Pantalone, Walker**

**AGAINST: Berardinetti, Jones, Moeser, Saundercook,
Shiner)**

- (4) the report requests contained in the communication (March 15, 1999) from Councillor Mario Silva be referred to the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services for consideration; **(Carried)**

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

- (5) the report (March 11, 1999) from the General Manager, Transportation Services (Winter Maintenance) be adopted.

(Adoption of report:

Recommendation No. (1) - Carried, as amended;

Recommendation No. (3), (4) and (5) - Carried;

Recommendation No. (2) - Carried on the following recorded vote:

**FOR: Altobello, Berardinetti, Bussin, Disero,
 Jakobek, Layton, McConnell, Moeser,
 Pantalone, Saundercook, Walker**

AGAINST: Bossos, Jones, Shaw, Shiner)

- B. Councillor Jakobek moved that the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services be requested to submit a report to the Budget Committee clarifying the cost/budgetary implications and the implementation of the following:
- (i) once-a-week garbage collection for the whole city, with twice-a-week collection only from June 1 to September 1, in those areas known to be in need; **(Redundant)**
 - (ii) a charge for commercial waste collection, to be phased in with Current Value Assessment, in the former City of Toronto based on five-times-a-week waste collection; **(Carried)**
 - (iii) the cost of keeping the special area leaf collection on a revised area map; **(Carried)**
 - (iv) a basic snow removal program, identical for the whole city, prioritizing arterials, secondary arterials, transit roads and residential streets, together with the policy for the number of times for ploughing and timing for snow removal; **(Carried)**
 - (v) a windrow program, where feasible, for the whole city; **(Redundant)**
 - (vi) continuation of sidewalk snow removal in those areas where it exists and a cost phased in identical to Current Value Assessment; **(Carried)**

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

- (vii) costs for expansion of sidewalk snow removal in every area, by Community Council area. **(Carried)**

- C. Councillor Bussin moved that the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services be requested to submit a report to the Works and Utilities Committee on the feasibility of providing equivalent garbage service levels to small businesses (restaurants and greengrocers) with similar characteristics to business communities receiving multiple weekly garbage pick-up.

(Carried on the following recorded vote:

FOR: Bossons, Bussin, Jones, Layton, McConnell, Pantalone, Saundercook, Walker

AGAINST: Berardinetti, Disero, Jakobek, Moeser, Shaw, Shiner)

- D. Councillor Saundercook moved that:

- (1) the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services be requested to submit a report to the Urban Environment and Development Committee on the comments contained in the communication (March 16, 1999) from Councillor Bill Saundercook; **(Carried)**
- (2) the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services be requested to report to the Works and Utilities Committee on the potential savings in newfound economies of scale in the new City by streamlining operations; and
- (3) the Commissioner of Economic Development, Culture and Tourism be requested to submit a report to the Works and Utilities Committee on the feasibility of using organizations such as TABIA to support and enforce compliance to stricter rules of collection of garbage and recyclables.

(Parts (2) and (3) lost on the following recorded vote:

FOR: Bossons, Bussin, Pantalone, Saundercook, Shaw, Walker

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Jakobek, Jones, Layton, McConnell, Moeser, Shiner)

E. Councillor Shiner moved that:

- (1) the Chief Administrative Officer and Chief Financial Officer report to the March 29, 1999 meeting of the Budget Committee on the financial impact of winter maintenance and solid waste management service harmonization initiatives by former geographic communities, and that such report be forwarded at the same time to the special Community Council meetings on the 1999 Operating Budget;

(Lost on the following recorded vote:

FOR: Jones, Shaw, Shiner, Walker

AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Bossons, Jakobek, Layton, McConnell, Moeser, Pantalone, Saundercook)

- (2) the report dated March 12, 1999, from the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services (Solid Waste Management) be amended as follows:
 - (i) Recommendation No. (1) be amended by deleting the words "in areas of high waste generation and limited storage space (to be determined), at a cost saving of approximately \$533,000.00 in 1999", and inserting in lieu thereof the words "city-wide"; **(Lost)**
 - (ii) Recommendation No. (2) be deleted; **(Lost)**
 - (iii) Recommendation No. (3) be amended by adding thereto the following:

"all leaves to be bagged, except in areas identified by Council";

(Carried on the following recorded vote:

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

**FOR: Altobello, Bossons, Bussin, Disero, Jakobek,
Layton, McConnell, Shiner**

**AGAINST: Berardinetti, Jones, Moeser, Pantalone,
Saundercook, Sgro, Shaw)**

- (iv) Recommendation No. (6) be deleted and the following inserted in lieu thereof:

A(6) all small commercial locations city-wide be entitled to twice-a-week garbage collection@,

(Lost on the following recorded vote:

FOR: Shiner

**AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Bossons, Bussin,
Disero, Jakobek, Jones, Layton, McConnell,
Moeser, Pantalone, Saundercook, Sgro,
Shaw, Walker)**

- (v) Recommendation No. (7) be amended to provide that the charge for commercial collection for locations receiving more than twice-a-week collection be phased in over three years, effective July 1, 1999;

(Lost on the following recorded vote:

FOR: Bossons, Jones, Sgro, Shiner

**AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Disero, Jakobek,
Layton, McConnell, Moeser, Pantalone,
Saundercook, Shaw, Walker)**

- (vi) Recommendation No. (8) be amended by deleting "June 2000" and inserting in lieu thereof "June 1999", and further deleting the words "and a harmonized service fee structure to be effective January 1, 2001"; **(Lost)**

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

- (3) the current flower pot service in the North York area be replaced with bulk bins or curbside collection as the locations permit; **(On motion by Councillor Layton, referred to the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services for a report thereon to the Works and Utilities Committee, and to the Budget Committee if possible)**
- (4) the report dated March 11, 1999, from the General Manager, Transportation Services (Winter Maintenance) be amended by:

- (i) adding to Recommendation No. (1) the following:

That the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services be requested to review and report on new methods to clear windrows in areas where current mechanical methods cannot be utilized.

(Carried on the following recorded vote:

FOR: Altobello, Berardinetti, Bossons, Bussin, Jakobek, Saundercook, Sgro, Shaw, Shiner, Walker

AGAINST: Jones, Layton, McConnell, Moeser, Pantalone)

- (ii) adding to Recommendation No. (2) the following:

And sidewalks be cleared on all arterial and main local roads (main collectors), transit routes and school areas across the entire City.

(Lost on the following recorded vote:

FOR: Bussin, Layton, Shaw, Shiner

AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Disero, Jakobek, Jones, McConnell, Moeser, Pantalone, Saundercook, Walker)

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

- (iii) further recommending that staff be redeployed to clear sidewalks and residential streets not included in the first response as work is completed on the road and sidewalk clearing of the arterial roads and arterial main local roads, city-wide;

(Lost on the following recorded vote:

FOR: Bussin, Shiner

**AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Bossons, Jakobek,
Jones, Layton, McConnell, Moeser,
Pantalone, Saundercook, Shaw, Walker)**

- (iv) Recommendations Nos. (3)(a) and (3)(b) be struck out and the following inserted in lieu thereof:

Astaff report further on alternatives to the overhaul of the five snow melters and the purchase of ten additional snow blowers, including the leasing of additional snow blowers;@

(The following portion of the motion:

**Astaff report further on alternatives to the overhaul
of the five snow melters@,**

lost on the following recorded vote:

FOR: Saundercook, Shaw, Shiner, Walker

**AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Bossons, Bussin,
Jakobek, Jones, Layton, McConnell,
Moeser, Pantalone**

The remaining portion of the motion:

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

**And the purchase of ten additional snow blowers,
including the leasing of additional snow blowers ;@,**

lost on the following recorded vote:

FOR: Saundercook, Shaw, Shiner

**AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Bossons, Bussin,
 Jakobek, Jones, Layton, McConnell,
 Moeser, Pantalone, Walker)**

F. Councillor Sgro moved that:

- (1) the reports dated March 11, 1999, from the General Manager, Transportation Services, and dated March 12, 1999, from the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services be referred to the Budget Committee for review of budget priorities and recommended changes in budget allocation to provide \$1.4 million in conjunction with eliminating the twice-a-week collection in the North York area for the remainder of the year, and to provide summer garbage collection city-wide and \$1.6 million for enhanced services city-wide for windrows and sidewalk clearing; and **(Lost)**
- (2) the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services be requested to conduct an evaluation of service options with regard to garbage and recycling for ICI waste, and report back in six months on opportunities for further cost reduction and methods of improving waste diversion and efficiencies, and that that status quo continue until Council gives further direction. **(Lost)**

G. Councillor McConnell moved that:

- (1) no user fee be imposed for garbage or recycling collection for commercial properties currently collected through municipal service; **(Redundant)**
- (2) there be no reduction in current levels of collection for small commercial properties;

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

(Lost on the following recorded vote:

**FOR: Bossons, Bussin, Disero, Layton, McConnell,
Pantalone, Saundercook, Walker**

**AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Jakobek, Jones, Moeser,
Sgro, Shaw, Shiner)**

- (3) staff report in the late fall on any further efficiencies of services possible without jeopardizing the impact on the cleanliness of the City.
(Redundant)

H. Councillor Layton moved that:

- (1) any business wishing to have current levels of service reviewed be permitted to do so and that an appeal process be developed by the Chief Administrative Officer for cases where agreement between businesses and the City staff have not been resolved; **(Redundant)**
- (2) the Medical Officer of Health be requested to report on all measurable health impacts of snow storms to determine the extent of injury to pedestrians and cyclists compared to injuries to those using automobiles, such data to be used to shape snow clearing strategies in the future, and that the Pedestrian Committee be consulted in the preparation of the report.

(Lost, on the following recorded vote:

FOR: Bossons, Layton, McConnell, Pantalone, Walker

**AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Jakobek, Jones, Moeser,
Saundercook, Shaw, Shiner)**

I. Councillor Jones moved that:

- (1) Recommendation No. (2) of the report dated March 11, 1999, from the General Manager, Transportation Services (Winter Maintenance) be struck out and the following inserted in lieu thereof:

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

- A(2) that the service strategy for clearing snow from sidewalks be the enhanced sidewalk program at a cost saving of \$83,000.00; this would include sidewalks on arterials, transit routes and reverse frontage, eight times per season to a width of 1 - 1.5 metres@

(Lost on the following recorded vote:

FOR: Bossons, Bussin, Jones, Layton, McConnell, Shaw

AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Disero, Jakobek, Moeser, Pantalone, Saundercook, Walker)

- (2) Recommendation No. (1) of the report dated March 12, 1999, from the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services (Solid Waste Management) be amended by deleting "September 1, 1999" and inserting in lieu thereof "July 1, 1999", and that corresponding cost savings be amended accordingly. **(Lost)**

J. Councillor Bossons moved that:

- (1) respecting the report dated March 12, 1999, from the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services (Solid Waste Management), staff be requested to report on methods by which solid waste charges could be allocated on a weight basis;

(Lost on the following recorded vote:

FOR: Bossons, Jones, Layton, Shiner, Walker

AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Bussin, Disero, Jakobek, McConnell, Moeser, Pantalone, Saundercook, Shaw)

- (2) the report dated March 11, 1999, from the General Manager, Transportation Services (Winter Maintenance) be amended as follows:

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

- (i) by amending Table 1, Sidewalk Snow Clearing, by deleting A14 clearances@ under the column headed AComprehensive Service@ and inserting in lieu thereof A8 clearances@,
- (ii) to provide that AComprehensive Service@ for sidewalk snow clearing be approved as amended;

(Lost on the following recorded vote:

FOR: Bossons, Bussin, Layton, Sgro, Shiner

**AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Jakobek, Jones, Moeser,
Pantalone, Saundercook, Walker)**

- (3) the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services be requested to report to the Works and Utilities Committee, at regular intervals, on the cost per ton of solid waste removed from main streets by the private sector;

(Lost on the following recorded vote:

**FOR: Bossons, Bussin, Jakobek, Jones, Saundercook,
Shaw, Shiner**

**AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Disero, Layton, McConnell,
Moeser, Pantalone, Walker)**

- (4) the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services be requested to review the necessity of twice-a-week waste collection for the approximately 50,000 households in the Toronto community which currently are deemed Ahigh-need@, and submit a report thereon to the Works and Utilities Committee.

(Carried on the following recorded vote:

**FOR: Altobello, Berardinetti, Bossons, Bussin, Jones,
Layton, Moeser, Saundercook, Shaw**

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

AGAINST: Disero, Jakobek, McConnell, Pantalone, Walker)

- K. Councillor Walker moved that the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services, in consultation with the Chief Financial Officer, be requested to report to the Budget Committee on a user fee model where all ICI users are charged a portion of the \$4,700,000.00 cost identified under Section E in the report dated March 12, 1999, from the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services respecting Solid Waste Management Service Harmonization.

(Lost on the following recorded vote:

FOR: Walker

AGAINST: Altobello, Berardinetti, Bossons, Bussin, Disero, Jakobek, Jones, Layton, McConnell, Moeser, Pantalone, Saundercook, Shaw, Shiner)

The following is the action therefore taken by the Urban Environment and Development Committee and the Works and Utilities Committee:

The Urban Environment and Development Committee and the Works and Utilities Committee jointly:

- (1) recommended to the Budget Committee the adoption of the report dated March 11, 1999, from the General Manager, Transportation Services, headed **AWinter Maintenance Activities - Harmonization of Service Levels@**, subject to adding to Recommendation No. (1) the following:

Aand that the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services be requested to review and report on new methods to clear windrows in areas where current mechanical methods cannot be utilized@,

- (2) recommended the adoption of Recommendations Nos. (1), (2), (3), (4), and (6) embodied in the report dated March 12, 1999, from the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services, headed **ARevised 1999 Solid Waste Management Service Harmonization Recommendations@**, subject to adding to Recommendation No. (3) the following:

Aall leaves to be bagged, except in areas identified by Council@, and

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

- (3) submitted without recommendation Recommendations Nos. (5), (7) and (8) embodied in the aforementioned report dated March 12, 1999, from the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services, having regard that each of the aforementioned recommendations was voted on and lost.

The Urban Environment and Development Committee and the Works and Utilities Committee also took the following action:

- (1) requested the Chief Financial Officer and the Commissioner of Economic Development, Culture and Tourism to conduct an economic impact study on the introduction of user fees on the tourism industry and on the impact on neighbourhood-based establishments along commercial strips, to be forwarded to the Works and Utilities Committee;
- (2) requested that all affected parties, especially Business Improvement Associations and restaurant associations, be consulted prior to further consideration of this matter;
- (3) requested the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services to submit a report to the Budget Committee clarifying the cost/budgetary implications and implementation of the following:
 - (i) a charge for commercial waste collection, to be phased in with Current Value Assessment, in the former City of Toronto based on five-times-a-week waste collection;
 - (ii) the cost of keeping the special area leaf collection on a revised area map;
 - (iii) a basic snow removal program, identical for the whole city, prioritizing arterials, secondary arterials, transit roads and residential streets, together with the policy for the number of times for ploughing and timing for snow removal;
 - (iv) continuation of sidewalk snow removal in those areas where it exists and a cost phased in identical to Current Value Assessment; and
 - (v) costs for expansion of sidewalk snow removal in every area, by Community Council area;

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

- (4) referred the report requests contained in the communication (March 15, 1999) from Councillor Mario Silva to the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services for consideration;
- (5) requested the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services to report to the Works and Utilities Committee on the feasibility of providing equivalent garbage service levels to small businesses (restaurants and greengrocers) with similar characteristics to business communities receiving multiple weekly garbage collection;
- (6) requested the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services to review the necessity of twice-a-week waste collection for the approximately 50,000 households in the Toronto community which currently are deemed ~~A~~high-need~~@~~, and submit a report thereon to the Works and Utilities Committee;
- (7) referred the following motion to the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services for a report thereon to the Works and Utilities Committee, and to the Budget Committee if possible:

Moved by Councillor Shiner:

~~A~~That the current ~~s~~flower pot~~=~~service in the North York area be replaced with bulk bins or curbside collection as the locations permit~~@~~; and

- (8) requested the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services to submit a report to the Urban Environment and Development Committee on the communication (March 16, 1999) from Councillor Bill Saundercook.

(Budget Committee; Chief Administrative Officer; Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services; General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services; General Manager, Transportation Services; Toronto Pedestrian Committee; All Interested Parties - March 16, 1999)

(Clause No. 12(k), Works and Utilities Committee Report No. 4)

The Committees adjourned their meeting at 6:20 p.m.

Urban Environment and Development Committee and
Works and Utilities Committee Minutes
Tuesday, March 16, 1999

Chair.