
City Clerk's Office
City Hall, 1st Floor West
100 Queen Street West
Toronto, Ontario M5H 2N2

Tel: 416-392-8027
Fax: 416-392-2983
E-mail: tperrin@city.toronto.on.ca
Web: www.city.toronto.on.ca

June 25, 2002

To: Policy and Finance Committee
From: City Clerk
Subject: Intersection Safety Program to Reduce Red-Light Running

Recommendation:

The Works Committee at its meeting on June 25, 2002, recommended the adoption of the report dated June 7, 2002, from the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services respecting the Intersection Safety Program to Reduce Red-Light Running.

City Clerk

Trudy Perrin/lv.013

c: Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services
General Manager, Transportation Services

(Report dated June 7, 2002, addressed to the
Works Committee from the
Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services)

Purpose:

The purpose of this report is to provide information on the projected costs and revenues of the two-year red-light camera pilot project (November 2000 - November 2002), and to request authority and funding to operate the red-light camera systems for a third year (November 2002 - November 2003).

Financial Implications and Impact Statement:

Funding to complete the existing two-year pilot project is available in the current Transportation Services Division's Capital Program. Funding in the amount of \$1,910,000.00 gross, \$0 net is required to operate the red-light camera systems for a third year. Funds for the third year of this program will be identified in the Transportation Services Division's 2003-2007 Capital Budget submission. The Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer has reviewed the financial implications and concurs.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that:

- (1) approval be granted to extend Contract No. 9119-00-7004, in the amount of \$ 294,300.00 (\$60,800.00 net) to complete the two-year pilot project (funding is available in the Transportation Services Division's 2002 Capital Program);
- (2) approval be granted for the City of Toronto to operate the red-light camera systems from November 2002 to November 2003, contingent upon the Province of Ontario extending the legislation for the use of red-light camera systems, thereby requiring that:
 - (a) funding in the amount of \$1,910,000.00 be identified in the Transportation Services Division's 2003-2007 Capital Program and subsequently approved by City Council;
 - (b) approval be granted to extend Contract No. 9119-00-7004, in the amount of \$913,500.00 for the third year of operation of the red-light camera systems (in accordance with the unit prices bid as part of the original tender);
 - (c) approval be granted to continue the operation of the centralized municipal processing centre for issuing offence notices under the program on behalf of the City of Toronto, as well as other participating municipalities and that the agreements with the participating municipalities, regarding the sharing of staff, office space and equipment costs be extended; and

- (d) approval be granted to extend the operational agreement with the Ministry of Transportation, Ontario which clarifies the responsibilities of both parties under the program thereby permitting the City to obtain motor vehicle registration information necessary to lay charges under this program;
- (3) staff be authorized to negotiate the cost of operation and maintenance of red-light camera systems for a fourth year (November 2003 to November 2004) with Affiliated Computer Systems (formerly Lockheed Martin IMS Canada Inc.), for future consideration by City Council; and
- (4) the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

Background:

On December 18, 1998, the Red-Light Cameras Pilot Projects Act, 1998 (Bill 102) received Royal Assent. The Act amends the Highway Traffic Act to enable municipalities, for a period of two years, to use evidence obtained from red-light cameras to issue violation notices.

In announcing Bill 102, the Province stipulated that municipalities wishing to introduce red-light camera pilot projects would be required to:

- (a) conduct stepped-up police enforcement at other high-risk intersections;
- (b) participate in a comprehensive “before and after” statistical evaluation to determine the combined effect that both red-light camera systems and police enforcement has on the frequency of red-light running; and
- (c) reimburse the Province for all of its costs associated with the program.

There are six municipalities in Ontario who have been designated by the Ministry of Transportation, Ontario as red-light camera pilot areas, namely, City of Toronto, City of Hamilton, City of Ottawa, Regional Municipality of Halton, Regional Municipality of Peel, and the Regional Municipality of Waterloo.

On November 20, 2000, the Lieutenant Governor proclaimed Bill 102 and on the same day, the City of Toronto and the participating municipalities began operation of the red-light cameras.

On February 13, 14 and 15, 2002, City Council adopted Clause No. 8 of Works Committee Report No. 2, recommending that:

“City Council request the Government of Ontario, through the Minister of Transportation, Ontario to extend Bill 102 for an additional two years, until November 20, 2004.”

The City of Hamilton, City of Ottawa, Regional Municipality of Peel, and the Regional Municipality of Waterloo have also made similar requests of the Government of Ontario.

To date, the Government of Ontario has not responded to Council's request for a two-year extension from November 2002 until November 2004. However, Provincial staff have confirmed that this request is under active consideration.

Discussion:

At its meeting on April 11, 12 and 13, 2000, City Council granted approval to execute an agreement with Lockheed Martin IMS Canada Inc. (now Affiliated Computer Systems), for the supply, installation, operation and maintenance of red-light camera systems in the City of Toronto at a cost not to exceed \$3,720,000.00, subject to the successful completion of a "proof of performance phase". This contract with Affiliated Computer Systems (ACS) is funded from Capital Budget CTP 700-11, which has a total project budget authorization of \$7,570,000.00.

This report discusses the following items:

- (1) Contract Extension – Pilot Project;
- (2) Pilot Project Costs and Revenues;
- (3). Project Extension – Years 3 and 4;
- (4) Agreement with Participating Municipalities;
- (5) Agreement with Ministry of Transportation; and
- (6) Public Awareness Program.

- (1) Contract Extension – Pilot Project:

The estimated cost of \$3,720,000.00 for the supply, installation, operation and maintenance of red-light camera systems did not include costs for the additional photographic prints, the bonus payments and the additional computer hardware, as outlined in the following paragraphs.

- (a) At the time the "proof of performance" phase was being conducted, during the spring/ summer of 2000, the pilot project team, including representatives of the Ministry of Transportation and Ministry of the Attorney General, was finalizing the evidentiary requirements for red-light camera systems. The final evidentiary requirements resulted in additional photographic requirements not identified nor costed in the RFP for the supply, installation, operation and maintenance of red-light camera systems.
- (b) The RFP for the supply, installation, operation and maintenance of red-light camera systems included a performance based payment formula for image quality. In accordance with the system specifications, a penalty is assessed in the event that the proponents image quality is lower than the minimum specified level and a bonus payment is due if image quality exceeds the specified level.
- (c) During the first year of operation, it was determined that the computer hardware requirements included in the RFP did not have sufficient capacity. In order to

meet the operational requirements of the municipal processing centre, the computer storage hardware was upgraded by ACS.

As a result of these three components, it is expected that there will be additional costs for Contract No. 9119-00-7004, in the amount of \$294,300.00, of which \$233,500.00 will be reimbursed by the other participating municipalities.

(2) Pilot Project Costs and Revenues:

City of Toronto Council has directed that debt charges for this project (total project budget authorization of \$7,570,000.00) be offset from the revenue generated by tickets produced by the red-light camera system. Revenue from charges laid during the two-year pilot project is currently estimated at \$2,650,000.00. The City has entered into agreements with the other participating municipalities to recover their portion of the applicable costs for the centralized municipal processing centre, operated by the City of Toronto. In addition to processing centre and equipment costs, the other participating municipalities have contributed to the proof of performance phase and the public awareness campaign. Revenue in the amount of \$1,006,500.00 will be collected from the other participating municipalities.

(3) Project Extension – Years 3 and 4:

As part of the project, an independent comprehensive “before and after” statistical evaluation is being undertaken. The evaluation study includes 58 sites in total throughout Ontario, with approximately equal numbers of red-light camera sites, stepped-up police enforcement sites, and control sites. Data collected from the study sites indicates that in the first year of operation (November 2002 – November 2001), the frequency of red-light running has decreased, at the red-light camera sites being evaluated, by more than 40 percent on average.

The Province has indicated that the long-term future of the red-light camera legislation will depend upon the results presented in the final evaluation report, which will summarize statistically the combined effect of police enforcement and red-light cameras. However, the final evaluation report, summarizing the two years of the pilot project (years 1 and 2) will only be complete in the summer of 2003 following receipt and analysis of all 2002 collision information.

The three reasons for recommending that the Government of Ontario extend the Red Light Camera Pilot Project and that the City of Toronto participate in an extension of two years are the same, namely:

- (a) initial results from the first year of operation of the red-light cameras show a reduction in the frequency of red-light running;
- (b) there is strong public support for camera enforcement of red-light running; and

(c) it would permit municipalities to continue operating red-light cameras beyond November 20, 2002, while waiting for the Government of Ontario's decision regarding continuation of the project (expected in the fall of 2003) thereby avoiding a period of non-operation, which may be unnecessary.

The estimated gross cost of operating red-light cameras in the City of Toronto for an additional year (November 2002 – November 2003) is \$1,910,000.00. This includes costs for extending the contract with ACS (Affiliated Computer Systems) as well as operating the Centralized Municipal Processing Centre, reimbursement to the Province, and continuing the public awareness campaign.

Revenue in the amount of \$440,000.00 will be collected from the other participating municipalities for the third year of operating the joint municipal processing centre. Revenue from charges laid during a one-year extension is estimated at \$1,500,000.00.

The RFP for the supply, installation, operation and maintenance of red-light camera systems required proponents to bid costs for the two-year pilot project plus an optional one-year extension for the operation and maintenance elements. The contract costs associated with the operation and maintenance of the City's red-light camera systems for an additional one year is \$913,500.00. However, proponents were not requested to bid for an optional second year extension (November 2003 - November 2004) for the operation and maintenance elements. Consequently, an estimate of the costs to operate a second extension year is not available at this time.

There are two options for operating and maintaining the City's red-light camera systems during a fourth year of operation (November 2003 - November 2004) as follows:

- (a) enter into an agreement extension with Affiliated Computer Systems (formerly Lockheed Martin IMS Canada Inc) with terms and conditions satisfactory to the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services; or
- (b) tender the operation and maintenance of red-light camera systems for November 2003 - November 2004 and possibly future years.

Staff are requesting approval to explore Option "a" before initiating a new tender process. Staff will report back to City Council on the outcome of this process, seeking authority and funding for a fourth year of operating red-light camera systems.

(4) Agreement with Participating Municipalities:

The centralized municipal processing centre performs several functions for the red-light camera project, primarily: matching photo and plate information, laying of charges, and assisting the Prosecutor in preparing the photographic evidence for first attendance and trial. Processing centre staff, who are designated by regulation, review images taken by the camera systems and determine if an offence has occurred. If an offence has occurred, licence plate registration

information is collected from the Ministry of Transportation, Ontario and the Offence Notice Form is completed and mailed to the owner of the vehicle.

The City's agreements with the participating municipalities for the centralized municipal processing centre include a cost-sharing formula for the operating costs. To operate the red-light camera project for an additional two years, it is recommended that the City's agreements with the participating municipalities be extended.

(5) Agreement with Ministry of Transportation:

In order to obtain access to the Province of Ontario's motor vehicle registration information, which is necessary to lay charges under this program, participating municipalities have signed an operational agreement with the Ministry of Transportation. Provisions of the agreement include requirements for Provincial cost recovery and compliance with the applicable laws. In accordance with the agreement, the Province recovers costs from municipalities through a transaction fee each time municipalities request motor vehicle plate registration information. Provincial costs, for the extension of red-light camera operations, include providing project facilitation, legal services and supporting systems to provide motor vehicle plate registration information. Provincial costs for a one-year extension are estimated at \$50,0000. Services provided by the Province of Ontario are required to operate the red-light camera project, and it is recommended that the City's agreements with the Ministry of Transportation be extended.

(6) Public Awareness Program:

As part of the two-year pilot project, the City of Toronto has implemented a public awareness program that targets intersection safety. Posters depicting the dangers of red-light running have been posted in public places along with radio service announcements. In addition, the City has issued press releases detailing the number of charges laid for red-light running. It is recommended that the City continue the public awareness program in conjunction with an extension of red-light camera operation.

Conclusion:

This report requests funding in the amount of \$1,910,000.00 for a third year of operation of the City's red-light camera systems. Authority is also requested for the appropriate City officials to extend agreements with Affiliated Computer Systems, other participating municipalities and the Ministry of Transportation Ontario, necessary to operate the Intersection Safety Program to Reduce Red-Light Running for a one-year extension, subject to the Province of Ontario extending the appropriate legislation. Initial results from the first year of operating red-light camera systems indicate the red-light camera pilot project is reducing the frequency of red-light running.

Contacts:

Mike Brady, Manager, Red Light Camera Operations, Tel.: (416) 397-5016, Fax: (416) 392-4919; e-mail: mbrady@city.toronto.on.ca

Les Kelman, Director, Traffic Management Centre, Tel.: (416) 392-5372, Fax: (416) 397-5011; e-mail: lkelman@city.toronto