

**Consolidated Clause in Administration Committee Report 8, which was considered by City Council on October 26, 27 and 28, 2004.**

**7**

**Redevelopment of the St. Lawrence Market North  
Property (Ward 28 - Toronto Centre - Rosedale)**

*City Council on October 26, 27 and 28, 2004, adopted this Clause without amendment.*

---

**The Administration Committee recommends that City Council adopt the staff recommendations in the Recommendations Section of the report (September 20, 2004) from the Commissioner of Corporate Services.**

Purpose:

The purpose of this report is to seek City Council's endorsement of a set of development parameters for the St. Lawrence Market North property and an updated Strategic Vision statement for the entire St. Lawrence Market Complex.

Financial Implications and Impact Statement:

There are no financial implications arising from the recommendations of this report.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that:

- (1) Council adopt the development parameters for St. Lawrence Market North and Strategic Vision statement for the entire St. Lawrence Market Complex as set out in Appendices 1 and 2(A) respectively;
- (2) the Commissioner of Corporate Services investigate and report back on access and parking options for St. Lawrence Market North; and
- (3) the appropriate City Officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

Background:

First established in 1803, the St. Lawrence Market is one of Toronto's most valuable historic sites, and has remained Toronto's oldest and best established food market for over 200 years. St. Lawrence Market includes property at the south-west corner of Front Street East and Jarvis

Street (the South Market Building), and at the north-west corner of these streets (the North Market Building). The North Market was initially outdoors, followed by a primitive wooden structure and then a series of more permanent buildings. The current North Market building was built in 1968. It is one storey in height, utilitarian and undistinguished in appearance, and represents a vast underutilization of the development potential of its site.

The planning controls on the North Market property are as follows:

Height limit - 23 metres

Current Zoning - CR T4.0 C3.0 R4.0

Current Official Plan - Medium Density Mixed Commercial-Residential Area

New Official Plan (not yet in force) - Mixed Use

In 1999, the St. Lawrence Neighbourhood Association (SLNA) began to publicly advocate redevelopment of the St. Lawrence Market North property. The SLNA elected a subcommittee known as the St. Lawrence Community and Farmers (North) Market Redevelopment Initiative (the St. Lawrence NMI), whose goal was redevelopment of the North Market as a multipurpose facility for farmers, the community, general commerce and other users.

The City's Facilities & Real Estate staff provided support and direction to the SLNA, but at the same time, made it clear that any redevelopment of the North Market property would require strong stakeholders' support and a supportable business case.

At its Special Meeting held on July 30, 31 and August 1, 2002, Council adopted Clause 14, Report No. 10 of the Administration Committee, titled "Studying the Redevelopment of the St. Lawrence Market North Building (Ward 28 - Toronto Centre-Rosedale)". In doing so, Council:

- (1) approved in principle the concept of redeveloping the St. Lawrence Market North Building;
- (2) directed "the Commissioner of Corporate Services to study redevelopment options with due consideration to transitional planning issues that optimize the accommodation of existing tenants for the St. Lawrence Market North Building and, after consultation with affected stakeholders, report back to the Administration Committee in the Spring of 2003 on a preferred redevelopment option"; and
- (3) authorized and directed the appropriate City officials to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

The SLNA obtained Federal funds and developed a building proposal, consulting some community groups in this process, and approached City staff with its proposal. While the SLNA proposal had some merit, City staff declined the SLNA proposal for a number of reasons (as described in Clause 24, Administration Report No. 5, 2003). The SLNA's efforts were instrumental in mobilizing City staff to seek a more inclusive vision for the property, involving dialogue with the community and the City's agencies, boards, commissions and departments (ABCDs).

### The St. Lawrence Market North Working Committee:

To achieve a more inclusive vision for St. Lawrence Market North, in June, 2003, City Council directed the establishment of a Working Committee for the site (reference: Clause 24, Administration Report No. 5, 2003), composed of members of the community, City staff and the Ward Councillor's office. As mandated by City Council, the objective of the St. Lawrence North Working Committee was to provide a prompt and efficient forum for community and City staff input into a set of planning and design guidelines for redevelopment of the property.

Community members took time off from their jobs and businesses to devote energy to this cause, and they approached the task with enthusiasm, creativity, long hours and excellent ideas. City staff members also contributed many excellent ideas, along with a great deal of technical feedback, evocative drawings, and an effective forum for discussion.

As per Council's direction, the Working Committee was composed of:

- Two designates from St. Lawrence Neighbourhood Association
- Two designates from St. Lawrence North Market Initiative
- One designate from the South Market Merchants' Association
- One designate from the North Market
- One designate from the St. Lawrence BIA
- One designate from Citizens for the Old Town
- One designate from Heritage Toronto
- Representation from Councillor Pam McConnell's office
- City staff representation from the following departments:
  - Corporate Services - F&RE - Business & Strategic Innovation
  - Corporate Services - F&RE - Real Estate Services
  - UDS – Community Planning
  - UDS – Urban Design
  - EDCT – Heritage Preservation Services
  - EDCT – Parks & Recreation Policy and Development
  - EDCT – Economic Development
  - EDCT – Culture
  - WES - Development Engineering
  - WES - Traffic Planning
  - Toronto Parking Authority

A representative from the Sunday Antique Market subsequently joined the group.

Working Committee meetings were held on July 16<sup>th</sup>, 23<sup>rd</sup>, and 30<sup>th</sup>, August 6<sup>th</sup>, 13<sup>th</sup>, 20<sup>th</sup> and 26<sup>th</sup>, and September 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2003, and on January 14<sup>th</sup> and 28<sup>th</sup>, 2004. Minutes were kept of each meeting, have been vetted by all Working Committee members, and are on file.

The schedule, agendas and detailed work programmes for the Working Committee meetings were suggested by the designate from F&RE/Business & Strategic Innovation, in consultation with the rest of the Working Committee members. A facilitator participated in all the meetings. All decisions – not only those regarding site development parameters but also those regarding all

group logistics - were arrived at through consensus of the Working Committee. Further, the Working Committee agreed that any matters that could not be decided by consensus would be identified as such, and would be forwarded to Council for its consideration.

The Working Committee decided to form two sub-groups to focus on specific issues. "Group A" dealt with parking, loading and other servicing needs, site access and circulation, and potential redesign of Market Square Park. "Group B" dealt with urban design issues, heritage/architectural considerations, aesthetics and, like Group A, dealt with the potential redesign of Market Square Park. On some of the meeting dates noted above, Groups A and B convened separate meetings, while on other dates, the Working Committee convened as a whole to discuss the efforts and findings of the sub-groups.

The Committee also convened electronically on a web-based bulletin board, and continues to do so. This bulletin board is still up and running, and will stay "live" through the fourth quarter of 2004, to enable continued discussions and information sharing among group members.

As per Council's direction, the following matters were included for discussion at the meetings.

- background information - e.g., Official Plan and zoning provisions, land easements or restrictions, existing urban design guidelines;
- site access and circulation;
- parking;
- loading and other servicing needs;
- urban design, massing and height, aesthetics, streetscape;
- heritage/architectural sensitivity;
- treatment of surrounding open spaces - e.g., management of development impacts, including noise; and
- potential uses.

#### Points of consensus:

The Working Committee achieved full consensus amongst all participants on the following matters:

- urban design, massing and height, aesthetics, and streetscape treatments;
- how heritage/architectural compatibility could be achieved on the site;
- treatment of surrounding open spaces;
- management of development impacts, including noise;
- potential uses; and
- loading and other servicing needs.

Appendix 1 details these planning and development parameters in both words and sketch drawings. It is recommended that Council endorse Appendix 1. Appendix 1 would form part of any future Request for Qualifications or Request for Proposals for the redevelopment of the St. Lawrence Market North site.

### Update of 1990 Strategic Vision for St. Lawrence Market

In 1990, City Council of the former City of Toronto adopted a Strategic Vision statement for the entire St. Lawrence Market complex, which includes the heritage building south of Front Street as well as St. Lawrence Market North.

During the 2003-04 Working Committee meetings, members of the Committee requested that the 1990 vision statement be revisited to reflect current thinking. Community members and City staff reviewed the document and found that, while the statement is still highly relevant, certain edits are desirable in order to emphasize environmental sustainability. In addition, Committee members have suggested some non-substantive updates, mostly for clarity. It is recommended that Council adopt the revised document contained in Appendix 2(A). For ease of reading and understanding all the changes relative to the original text, all recommended edits to the original 1990 Strategic Vision statement are shown highlighted in Appendix 2(B) as "tracked changes".

### Ramp access to below-grade parking

One of the operating principles of the St. Lawrence Market North Working Committee has been that any matters that could not be decided by consensus would be identified as such, and would be forwarded to Council for its consideration. Although the Working Committee achieved consensus on a great number of matters, one item is still outstanding – ramp access to below-grade parking.

Despite intensive study and many hours of discussion and debate, the Working Committee could not arrive at a joint decision as to where the ramp or ramps to below-grade parking on the site should be situated. Consequently, it is recommended that the Commissioner of Corporate Services report back to Administration with all the options, including the pros and cons of each, so that Council can consider them all and arrive at some decision.

Even though the matter of locating the parking ramp(s) has not yet been resolved, the development parameters contained in Appendix 1 and the Strategic Vision contained in Appendix 2 still stand and would not require amendment once the parking ramp issue has been resolved.

### Conclusions

It is recommended that City Council endorse the set of development parameters for the St. Lawrence Market North property contained in this report (as Appendix 1), and that the Commissioner of Corporate Services report back on options for ramp access to below-grade parking for this property. In addition, the report seeks Council endorsement of an updated Strategic Vision statement for the entire St. Lawrence Market Complex (contained in this report as Appendix 2).

### Contacts:

Anne Milchberg, Manager, Development & Portfolio Planning, Facilities & Real Estate Division  
Phone (416) 397-4437, fax (416) 392-4828, e-mail [amilchbe@toronto.ca](mailto:amilchbe@toronto.ca)

## Appendix 2(A)

### Strategic Vision Statement St. Lawrence Market Complex

Revised to October, 2004

#### Mission

The St. Lawrence Market is to become a daily public market centre which provides a full range of food and food related products; functioning as a meeting place for people, while promoting food education, entertainment, and exemplifying the living history of the City of Toronto in an environmentally sustainable way. The market is the focal place within Toronto's most historic neighbourhood. The market will be a leader in the community and not a follower.

The Market Complex, which includes the St. Lawrence Hall and the North and South Market Buildings, should be a unique place to see in Toronto, attracting both residents of the region and visitors who would make it a must during their stay in Toronto. People would shop for competitively priced, high quality, fresh produce, and complementary products, in a stimulating, festive atmosphere and have chance to enjoy varied forms of art, history, and entertainment during their visit.

Increased tourism would be best promoted as a consequence of the successful operation of a market serving the needs of Toronto residents in an authentic, exciting, and unique way.

The Farmer's Market would be a prime attraction of the Market Complex on the weekend, where patrons could buy produce and "homemade" foods from farmers of the region. People would be drawn to the market throughout the week for a variety of different activities. The market itself would spill out into the surrounding area as the reason and weekday permits. To achieve this, the present strengths and future development of the market must be highlighted through active merchandising and publicity.

#### Physical Structure

##### St. Lawrence Hall:

Ideally, the entrance to the St. Lawrence Hall from King Street, would be restored as an entry way to the entire Market Complex, with consideration given to the physical reintegration of the three buildings. The restoration of this north-south axis would create a market interior which invites a person to enter from King and walk to the Esplanade or enter from the Esplanade and walk right out to King.

In the reintegration of the St. Lawrence Hall with the North Market building, the use of the north-east and the north-west corners of the Hall for long lease retail purposes should be conserved. The courtyard at the southwest corner of the Hall should also be conserved in any future reintegration.

## North Market

It is generally agreed that the North Market Building, in its current state, is underutilized on this designated Farmers' Market historical site. The Farmers find that the design and structure is not well suited to the Farmers Market activity. The main focus of any redeveloped building, consequently, will be market and market-related activities.

The North Market building is seen as available to create new opportunities for expansion and increased market activity. Any redevelopment of the North Market will be undertaken with the understanding that an amount of floor space will be made available in the building for the purposes of a Farmers' Market equal to the amount of floor space currently available to the farmers in the existing building, and with the goal of sustaining an authentic Farmers' Market.

Any redevelopment of the North Market building will conform to the existing Official Plan and Zoning by-law limitations for the site. The design of a new building will respect the architecture of its surroundings and, in particular, will have a height and massing which does not detract from the St. Lawrence Hall. At the same time, it should be recognized that the North Market is a building that houses activities which are distinct from those that take place in the St. Lawrence Hall, and that the architecture of any new building should recognize and express the distinct activity. In addition, any redevelopment would integrate environmentally sustainable technologies including possibly a roof top garden.

Any redevelopment of the North Market building should make provision for on-site customer parking. Redevelopment should also take into consideration tenants' concerns with access for loading and unloading. Further, redevelopment should provide some flexibility to provide for the needs of a range of ancillary businesses which might use the North Market on days on which the Farmers' Market is not in operation.

## South Market

Along with the St. Lawrence Hall, the South Market Building is a designated historical structure, indicating that its distinctive appearance, particularly its exterior, must be carefully considered in any proposed alternative. Consideration should be given, however, to the provision of more levels inside the South building. Consideration should also be given to the better utilization of the South Market building ramps, including, for example, patio restaurant and public seating uses where people could relax and soak up the atmosphere. The strategy would be to move towards smaller, more varied stalls, as opportunities permit.

A redesign of the South Market floor plan should be conducted by the Facilities & Real Estate Division of the Corporate Services Department in close consultation with the South Market Tenants' Association, the St. Lawrence Market Working Committee, tenants, community groups and other stakeholders. This redesign should take into account the public character of the building and make explicit provision of public seating and spaces for small, community oriented events. Consideration should be given to the introduction of street-related uses in the basement of the building.

In the future, the market should have more of an outward focus with an orientation of shops and stalls to the surrounding streets. The market itself would be patterned after the European concept of flowing out of the buildings and then contracting back as the season and activity dictates.

An attempt should be made to improve the approach to the building, from the south and from the St. Lawrence parking garage at 2 Church Street, which is the point of origin of a major stream of pedestrian traffic.

#### Adjacent Lands

Spaces adjacent to the Complex should be considered for market purposes. They include the spaces on and below the ramps surrounding the South Market Building, and the temporary closing of Front Street between Jarvis and Church Streets on special festival days. Surrounding developments like the Gross Machinery property, the development site immediately east of the South Market Building, and the Market Square Retail Mall should be examined to identify ways in which they can be designed to work synergistically with the Market Complex.

Linkages to the new developments to the east and south of the Market complex should be explored to encourage the use of the new parking facilities by Market patrons.

Market activities should be encouraged to spill out into adjacent park lands with the seasons. In particular, consideration should be given to designing the future City park at 125 The Esplanade (south side, between Market and Jarvis Streets) as a market square that could be used for residents' passive recreational purposes on non-market days.

Uses for these surrounding spaces could include the development of market carts to sell crafts and food related items, provision of arts and entertainment, the celebration of special festivals at holiday times or based on special themes like a strawberry festival in the spring or a harvest festival in the fall. Unique market activities like tailgate markets could allow farmers to sell food directly from their trucks. Some of the spaces could be desirable as outdoor cafes or eating places where people could relax and soak up the atmosphere. Any links that could be made to retail spaces in surrounding developments would support the integration of the market with the neighbourhood, e.g. an east-west link with any development to the east of the South Market.

The idea of an outreach market that could move from location to location in the City and having the complex as its base of operations should be studied.

#### St. Lawrence Neighbourhood Integration Strategy

The development of the project will focus on the market as a centre of interest in the neighbourhood. The St. Lawrence Market area is emerging as a centre of retail activity in the City. The St. Lawrence Market should be integrated with the retail development in a way that the market function becomes the dominant presence in the evolution of the area. The retail activity of the neighbourhood should be integrated in or related to the Market rather than the Market being swallowed up the general retail activities in the area. The unique characteristics of the retail activity at the St. Lawrence Market must be maintained through a continued emphasis on the role of producers in the Farmers Market, the pre-eminence of food products as the



fundamental retail function of the Market, the historical atmosphere and structures of the Market, and the opportunities which are provided in the Market for people to meet and gather.

Any new development in the neighbourhood should be evaluated in relation to the market project and strategies designed to create a synergism between the market and those developments. The Official Plan for the neighbourhood should be reviewed to strengthen the position of the market. An example of this might be the philosophy of the buildings in the neighbourhood becoming more permeable and oriented towards the Market Complex from the pedestrian traffic point of view. The Market itself should become more permeable and oriented towards the neighbourhood from a pedestrian traffic point of view.

### Atmosphere

The Market Complex should be an open and public place where impromptu and spontaneous events occur. It would be informal, exciting, and full of people. It would look colourful and lively, with pedestrians dominating the scene; congestion improves the market. In fact the Committee believes that the present state of the market proper is considered too neat, tidy and structured. The Complex should be a centre of festivity allowing people to enjoy themselves as well as shop for food and food related products. The place should smell of food, and displays will be attractive to look at.

The Market Complex should be distinct and special in the City of Toronto, offering both variety and the unusual. There would be a sense of natural integration between the entertainment offered and the activity of the Market itself.

The atmosphere desired for the St. Lawrence Market is that of an old-fashioned market where real farm produce and speciality food items are sold.

### Product Mix

The product mix should include a full range of consumable, allied products and anything else associated with food. The mix would be controlled strategically to encourage multicultural visibility reflecting the City's cultural mix, unique and different foods, seasonal character of foods, and to showcase Canadian products. Preference would be given to regionally grown farm product and homemade exclusive jams, chutneys, baked goods, etc. Uniformity of products would be discouraged.

The desirable product mix will be considered both in relationship to what is available in the market and the products sold in the rest of the neighbourhood.

There should be an informal, inexpensive variety of snacking and restaurant foods with pleasant and readily accessible places to sit down and eat it. A continuously open restaurant (24 hr.) could be considered if it were possible to develop a limited wholesale function for restaurants that would occur in the early hours of the morning.

The Market Gallery and/or other arts need(s) to be built into the market. Outdoor art/entertainment space would be available and utilized. Education in food and food preparation could be developed at the market through the Community colleges. Crafts and food related products would be sold throughout the complex in push carts. The sale of unique specially items, which are in keeping with the product mix, might be considered in a low fixed percentage of the Market's floor space, should the Market area be expanded.

The St. Lawrence Hall should continue to function as a social centre for Torontonians and others interested in renting space for parties, dinners, weddings, etc.

### Transportation

Public transportation should be made more readily available to the market through increased TTC service. A special bus route might be developed to bring people from the subway to the market as they do in Harbourfront. Another possibility might be an LRT down King Street. Pedestrians would dominate the scene, having a distinct advantage over cars.

It would be desirable for the market to continue to have readily accessible parking lot to the three buildings in the complex. Other possibilities for improved parking include; relaxation of on street parking regulations on market days on the streets immediately surrounding the market, the development of underground parking on the lot at Jarvis and Front Streets, the reduction in rates by the Parking Authority for people who shop at the market and the accelerating of parking construction in surrounding projects.

### Financial Picture

Consideration will be given to the relative merits of public initiative and public/private partnership in carrying through any capital projects. The capital funding should be based on a solid business plan. The complex should be financially self-supporting including a capital maintenance allowance to cover building renewal. Being self-supporting doesn't mean profit maximization at the expense of the mission of the complex.

There will be no public subsidy required, once the potential of the market has been realized. There may be some loss leader, i.e. the Farmers' market, but the overall market will be self-supporting. Tenants would find their businesses more profitable and there will be an improved climate for doing business. Extension of the Farmers' Market into the week would be encouraged and full utilization of the North Market space would be promoted.

### Technology

The complex would have a method of moving people to different floor/levels in a way that would make mezzanine levels feasible. There would be sufficient loading and unloading elevators, along with state-of-the-art, energy efficient lighting, up-to-date heating and air-conditioning. Although this may seem paradoxical, the technology needs to be both modern and also integrate with the historical building atmosphere and context. Noise level should be taken into consideration. People, materials and equipment movement throughout the complex must be addressed, i.e. ways of checking coats, how to carry packages, and how to store them.

## Management/Ownership

There are several options as to how the Market Complex could be managed. These include the following:

- (a) The Facilities & Real Estate Division of the Corporate Services Department would continue to manage the property as part of its portfolio.
- (b) The City would become a partner with private enterprise in the management of the complex. The objective would be for both parties to benefit from the arrangement.
- (c) Management would take place by a Corporation tied to the City. An example of this type of operation is the Toronto Parking Authority. The concern here would be to ensure that the organization caters to the public's needs and not just making money.
- (d) Management would take place by an Agency, Standing Committee, or Board reporting to City Council.

Concerns have been raised about some of the options mentioned above. For example, private sector involvement in the management of public buildings could result in lost financial opportunity for the City and loss of the "public" spirit of the market. In addition, the choice of administration could have an impact on approach to heritage preservation. Any decisions about ownership and/or management shall examine these concerns prior to selecting the appropriate alternative. The option(s) selected should blend the requirements of efficient administration with continued input of relevant stakeholders in Market policy development.

## Administration

The management structure should support administration of the complex as a business.

### (a) Leasing

There should be different leasing strategies for each type of business. Leases should follow function. Varied tenure and rent structure should also be considered. The question of percentage rents needs to be carefully evaluated; maybe some kind of incentive leasing is needed. Leases do need to be flexible enough to incorporate unique aspects of the market merchandising policy: they should be precise and in plain English. The whole structure of merchandising and leasing should be developed professionally.

### (b) Tenant Responsibilities

It would be desirable to have a tenant association with quality control responsibility. The farmers have indicated that they would like to be more responsible for the overall operation of the farmers market by: managing clean-up functions, performing quality control tasks, encouraging reasonable prices and drawing more patrons to the market. Farmers would participate more in finding solutions to the day-to-day problems arising in the market.

(c) Operations and Maintenance

The contracting out of operations and maintenance should be considered.

Marketing

The target market segments for the complex include daily neighbourhood shoppers, restaurant owners/operators who would buy wholesale, weekly shoppers from other areas of the City and surrounds, students, lunchtime eaters, and visitors. Analysis of consumer market surveys should be undertaken to determine what measures should be taken to enhance the attractiveness of the Market to each of these consumer groups.

Space in the St. Lawrence Hall for social events should be available to groups and individuals. The complex needs a marketing program, with promotional events, that build on current and enhanced strengths of the market. The direct contact between the merchant and the client should be taken as a plus. People want to feel that they are getting quality at a good price. The uniqueness of the market could be highlighted through the combination of products or types of food.

Human Resources

The Market Complex should have people on its staff with varied skills in property management. Some specific skills include merchandising, display design, marketing/service, ability to promote the complex, and good negotiating ability. Although these staff members should have skills as entrepreneurs, they would also have strong sense of public service. The resident management team will have the "hands on" authority to manage the complex within clearly enunciated policy guidelines set by City Council, in consultation with relevant stakeholders.

Once facet of the market that should be retained is the face-to-face relationships between management and tenants. These strategic supports the idea that people go to the market to rub elbows with the farmers, and tenants and management should know each other well. A fee manager concept is a possibility but not seen as particularly desirable, because of the concerns raised about private management of a public facility.

Strategy for Change

The strategic for change needs to be based on a long-range plan. How the project is actually implemented will depend on the development proposal itself although it was agreed by all that the complex be developed as one entity and integrate the individual buildings. If the current mix of products and tenants needs to be changed, the City should aim for attrition or a reallocation of space throughout the buildings. It was proposed that the Farmers' Market run uninterrupted during the renovations and that the market be open daily. The City would develop a transition leasing strategy, which builds the new market gradually. One alternative would be to stage target markets for the future, building on the existing tenants in doing so, i.e. the development of a limited, controlled wholesale business at the market.

---

(Appendix 1 - Development Parameters for St. Lawrence Market North and Appendix 2(b) - Strategic Vision Statement, St. Lawrence Market Complex, Revised to October, 2004, Tracked changes version, attached to the above report (September 20, 2004) from the Commissioner of Corporate Services, are on file in the City Clerk's Office, City Hall, and are also included in the Council agenda material package.)

Anne Milchberg, Manager, Development and Portfolio Planning, Facilities and Real Estate Division and James Parakh, Urban Designer, South District, Urban Development Services, gave a presentation to the Committee on this matter.