THE CITY OF TORONTO

City Clerk's Office

Minutes of the Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee

Meeting 1

Monday, September 13, 2004

A special joint meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee was held on Monday, September 13, 2004, concurrently with the Toronto Transit Commission, in the Council Chamber, City Hall, Toronto, commencing at 9:15 a.m.

Attendance

Members were present for some or all of the time periods indicated.

Planning and Transportation Committee	9:15 a.m. to 10:42 p.m.	12:20 a.m. to 12:45 a.m.
Councillor Gerry Altobello, Chair	X	X
Councillor Peter Milczyn, Vice-Chair	X	X
Councillor John Filion	X	
Councillor Cliff Jenkins	X	X
Councillor Howard Moscoe	X	X
(also Chair of the Toronto Transit Commission)		
Councillor Cesar Palacio	X	X
Councillor Bill Saundercook	X	X
Councillor Karen Stintz		

Works Committee		
Councillor Jane Pitfield, Chair	X	X
Deputy Mayor Sandra Bussin, Vice-Chair	X	X
(Also a Member of the Toronto Transit		
Commission		
Councillor Bas Balkissoon		
(Also a Member of the Toronto Transit		
Commission)		
Councillor Glenn De Baeremaeker	X	X
Councillor Mike Del Grande	X	X
Councillor Paula Fletcher	X	
Councillor Adam Giambrone	X	
(Also a Member of the Toronto Transit		
Commission)		
Councillor Michael Thompson	X	X

The following additional Members of the Toronto Transit Commission were also present:

- Commissioner Joe Mihevc, Vice-Chair
- Commissioner Brian Ashton
- Commissioner Peter Li Preti
- Mayor David Miller
- Commissioner David Shiner

Councillor Gerry Altobello chaired the meeting.

Deputy Mayor Joe Pantalone, during the morning session of the meeting, introduced the following guests, and their delegation, to the joint meeting:

- Mayor Enzo Cantagallo, City of Montesilvano, Province of Pescara, Abbruzzo, Italy; and
- Gr. Uff. Ezio Ardizzi, President, Camera Di Commercio Di Pescara.

1.1 St. Clair Avenue West Transit Improvements Environmental Assessment: Yonge Street to Gunns Road (just West of Keele Street) (St. Paul's, Davenport, York South-Weston)

The Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee considered a report (August 31, 2004) from the Commissioner of Urban Development Services, the Acting Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services, the Chief General Manager, Toronto Transit Commission, and the President, Toronto Parking Authority, providing the results of the St. Clair Avenue West Transit Improvements Class Environmental Assessment (EA) study, request approval of the Preferred Design Concept, and direct staff to continue with the Environmental Assessment approvals process.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that:

(1) the Preferred Design Concept identified through the St Clair Avenue West Transit Improvements Class Environmental Assessment study process, as described in this report

be approved, the principal elements of which are:

- (i) two centre lanes reserved for exclusive use by streetcars (and emergency vehicles) protected by a raised, but mountable, trackbed;
- (ii) during peak periods, two general purpose traffic lanes in each direction, located on either side of the streetcar tracks, providing sufficient capacity to accommodate all current peak period traffic volumes on St. Clair;
- (iii) during off-peak periods and weekends, one general purpose traffic lane and one parking lane in each direction providing sufficient capacity to accommodate all current off-peak and weekend traffic volumes;
- (iv) left-turns lanes at signalized intersections to permit left-turn and U-turns on their own exclusive signal phases;
- (v) on-street parking on both sides of the street during off-peak times on weekdays and at all times on weekends will be permitted in the majority of the curb lanes, and new off-street parking, resulting in a net increase in the parking supply along St. Clair Avenue West; and
- enhanced streetscape, urban design, streetcar shelters and platforms, public art and safety features in the overall design and implementation of the transit improvement project;
- (2) authority be granted to the Commissioner of Urban Development Services to file the Draft Environmental Study Report (ESR) for the St. Clair Avenue West Transit Improvements Environmental Assessment with the City Clerk and to give notification of such filing in accordance with the requirements of the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment process;
- (3) authority be granted to commence negotiations to acquire the property interests and initiate expropriations if required, to implement the Preferred Design Concept for the St. Clair Avenue West Transit Improvements Environmental Assessment;
- (4) a community design consultation group consisting of representatives of the St. Clair Avenue West business community, residents and other stakeholders be established to work with the project team to provide input during the detailed process;

- (5) additional funding be provided in the 2005-2009 TTC and City capital budgets to undertake the enhanced streetscape, urban design, and public art elements associated with the finalized design concept;
- (6) the Commissioner of Urban Development Services develop a proposal to engage the local arts communities to provide input on the development of a public art program and themes for St. Clair Avenue West, and report back to Council by December 2004 for approval;
- (7) the Commissioner of Economic Development, Culture and Tourism, in consultation with the City's Urban Design section, the City's Tree Advocate and project design team, develop a detailed implementation plan for landscaping along St. Clair Avenue West, with particular attention to creating viable tree plantings and associate attractive tree-pit containers, where possible, and report back to Council upon completion of the detailed design;
- (8) that approval be granted in principle for the traffic bylaws required to implement this project as summarized in Appendix A; and
- (9) the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary actions to give effect thereto.

The Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee also considered the following communications:

- (1) (July 28, 2004) from Ida Vivacqua, on behalf of concerned residents and business owners of St. Clair Avenue West;
- (2) (July 14, 2004) from Ida Vivacqua;
- (3) (September 1, 2004) from Wendy Strickland;
- (4) (August 31, 2004) from Linda Genova;
- (5) (September 2, 2004) from J.P. Beaudry, President, The WestClair, MTCC No. 778;
- (6) (July 14, 2004) from Carlu Bambi;

- (7) (September 8, 2004) from Andrew Tylman;
- (8) (September 3, 2004) from Jennifer McKay;
- (9) (Undated) from Richard Gilbert;

- (10) (September 3, 2004) from Mariela Soto, Chair, Rosemount Earlscourt Residents' Association (RERA);
- (11) (September 2, 2004) from Anthony Moscato, Chair, Lansdowne Residents' Association;
- (12) (July 20, 2004) from Howard Katz;
- (13) (July 20, 2004) from Don Murphy;
- (14) (July 20, 2004) from Henry Burstyn;
- (15) (July 20, 2004) from Linda Genova;
- (16) (July 20, 2004) from Mary Broadfoot;
- (17) (July 20, 2004) from H. Watts;
- (18) (Undated) from Dr. John Chan and Dr. Elaine Chong;
- (19) (July 20, 2004) from R. Li Volsi;
- (20) (Undated) from Rosemary Dunn;
- (21) (Undated) from Robert Heaton;
- (22) (Undated) from Lillian Copeland;
- (23) (July 20, 2004) from Dorothea Burstyn;
- (24) (Undated) from Deby Goldsmith;
- (25) (Undated) from Lucy Lobe;
- (26) (July 20, 2004) from Al Kruger;
- (27) (July 20, 2004) from David Nimmo;
- (28) (Undated) from John Chan;

- (29) (Undated) from G. Genna;
- (30) (Undated) from Eileen Kruger;
- (31) (July 20, 2004) from Valerie Marshall;
- (32) (July 20, 2004) from Brian Levie;
- (33) (July 9, 2004) from Pamilla Kuca;
- (34) (June 10, 2004) from 183 interested persons;
- (35) (September 2, 2004) from John Sewell;
- (36) (September 10, 2004) from Martin Abela;
- (37) (September 10, 2004) from Peter Volny;
- (38) (September 10, 2004) from Susan Ainley, President, North Hill District Home Owners' Association;
- (39) (undated) from Harold Smith;
- (40) (September 12, 2004) from Helen Riley for "Feet on the Street";
- (41) (September 13, 2004) from Ann Dembinski, President, CUPE Local 79;
- (42) (undated) from Cameron Johnstone, Owner, Delta Bingo Inc.;
- (43) (Undated) from Verna MacNeil;
- (44) (Undated) from Celeta Davis, Vice President of the Hotel and Restaurant Workers' Union;
- (45) (September 13, 2004) from Nicholas Provart;
- (46) (September 13, 2004) from Joe Nunez, Chair, St. Clair West BIA; and
- (47) (September 13, 2004) from Andrew Furman and Lisa Syverson.

The following persons appeared before the Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee:

-	Fred Dominelli;
-	Sam Zimmerman, York Rapid Transit;
-	Ed Levy - Director, BA Group, and filed a written submission;
-	Lee Simms, IBI Group;
-	Richard Soberman;
-	John Sweeney;
-	Phillipe Bellon on behalf of Michael Roschlau, President, Canadian Urban Transit Association;
-	David Rapaport;
-	Gary Shaul;
-	David Gurin;
-	Vivian Day on behalf of Dr. Marvin Shedletzky and filed a written submission;
-	Carmelina Macario;
-	Roger Brooks;
-	Carolyn Banjavcic;
_	John MacLennan;
-	Rebecca Smollett;
-	Tony Turrittin, and filed a written submission;

- John Cartwright, Toronto and York Region Labour Council;
- Barbara Cameron;
- Daniel Hammond;
- Sarah Climenhata, on behalf of the St. Clair Right-of-Way Initiative for Public Transit (SCRIPT);
- Danny Heap;
- Ida Vivacqua;
- Dante De Thomasis, and filed a written submission and submissions on behalf of neighbourhood children;
- David Ley;
- Daniella Molnar;
- Andrew Brooks;
- Zac Taylor;
- Loretta Ryan;
- Margaret Smith on behalf of Save Our St. Clair (SOS), and filed a written submission by herself and David Tarnow;
- Jeffrey Kay;
- Heather MacDonald, and filed a compact disc and written submission;
- Mary MacDonald;
- Howard Katz, President, Connaught-Lonsmount Area Ratepayers Association, and filed a written submission and a petition in opposition to this project;
- Jeff Gillan, Chair, Corso Italia BIA;

- Mary-Ann Virelli, Chair, St. Clare Catholic School Advisory Council;
- Phillip Goldsmith, on behalf of Wychwood Heights BIA;
- Vivian Day;
- Anna Cancelli;
- Michael Hussey;
- David Keith, and filed a written submission;
- Connie Lamanna;
- Rhona Swarbrick, and filed a written submission;
- Mike Foderick;
- John Viktorin;
- Paul Newby;
- Dick Watts, and filed a written submission;
- Ian Chamandy, and filed a written submission;
- Tony Bolla;
- John Lamanna;
- Don Panos, Chair, St. Clair Gardens BIA;
- Severino Centritto, and filed a written submission including a petition;
- Andy Manahan, on behalf of Universal Worker's Union, Local 183, and filed a written submission;
- Julian Heller;

Scott Freedman;

-	Linda Genova;
-	Michael McPherson, and filed a written submission;
-	Antony Manocchio;
-	Virginia Kelly;
-	David Tarnow;
-	Angela Roma;
-	Jennifer Mills;
-	Gianna Oliva;
-	Kelly O'Brien;
-	Dave Fisher;
-	Claude Bergeron;
-	Brett Kelly, CAA Central Ontario;
-	Martha Crean;
-	Mark Patamia;
-	J.S. Moore;
-	Maria Rodrigues, Toronto District School Trustee, Ward 9, Davenport;
-	John Tench;
-	Janice Etter;

- Paul Ferreira, Vice-President, York South Weston NDP;
- Sal Consiglio, and filed a written submission;
- Nello Bianco, Christian Boutique;
- Ida Vivacqua read a letter on behalf of Ellen Vivacqua, La Parigina Shoes, and filed a written submission;
- Mr. Alex Ling, Bloor West Village BIA, and filed a written submission on behalf of John Kiru, Executive Director, Toronto Association of Business Improvement Areas (TABIA);
- David Vallance;
- Alejandra Bravo;
- Eric Miller;
- June Rilett, and filed a written submission;
- Brian Levine;
- Eddie Zuniga;
- Andrew Jeanes;
- Dylan Penner, Campaign Co-ordinator, Sierra Club;
- Josh Matlow, Toronto District School Board Trustee, St. Paul's;
- Tony Mandl;
- Diana Jonas;
- Lowell Langille;

-	Gord Garland, and filed a written submission;
-	Nik Luka;
-	John Sewell;
-	Dr. Judy Adler;
-	Hamish Wilson, and filed a written submission;
-	Susan Noakes; Mike Noble;
-	Julius Deutsch;
-	David Kidd;
-	David Tarnow, on behalf of Rick Boem, and filed a written submission;

Richard Koo;

Joshua Albert;

- Helen Riley, on behalf of Feet on the Street;

Gord Perks, Toronto Environmental Alliance;

- Cameron Johnstone, Delta Bingo, and filed a written submission;
- Duff Scott; and
- Harold Smith, Member, Humewood Neighbourhood Ratepayers' Association.

The following Members of the Toronto Transit Commission were present during the joint meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee:

Mayor David Miller;

- Councillor Joe Mihevc, Vice-Chair, Toronto Transit Commission;
- Councillor Brian Ashton;
- Councillor Peter Li Preti: and
- Councillor David Shiner.

The following Members of Council also appeared before the Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee:

- Councillor Frances Nunziata, York South-Weston;
- Deputy Mayor Joe Pantalone, Trinity-Spadina; and
- Councillor Michael Walker, St. Paul's.

Mr. Rod McPhail, Acting Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning Division, and Mr. Mitch Stambler, Manager, Services Planning, Toronto Transit Commission, gave a presentation on the Environmental Assessment Study for the St. Clair Transit Improvement Project, and filed a copy of the staff presentation.

The Planning and Transportation Committee and Works Committee recessed their meeting at 10:42 p.m. in order to allow the Toronto Transit Commission to hold its meeting on this issue and to send its decision to the Committees.

The Planning and Transportation Committee and Works Committee reconvened their meeting at 12:20 a.m. to consider the recommendation of the Toronto Transit Commission.

The Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee also considered a communication (September 13, 2004) from the General Secretary, Toronto Transit Commission, advising that the Toronto Transit Commission at its meeting on September 13, 2004, considered the report entitled "St. Clair Avenue West Transit Improvement Environmental Assessment"; that the Commission struck out the Recommendations contained in the report and replaced them with the following:

"(A) recommend to the joint meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee that City Council approve the staff recommendations in the recommendations section of report (August 31, 2004) from the Commissioner of Urban

Development Services, the Acting Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services, the Chief General Manager, Toronto Transit Commission, and the President, Toronto Parking Authority; and

(B) forward to Toronto City Council, the results of the Commission's deliberations for consideration by the Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee at its meeting on September 13, 2004";

and further advising that the Commission also approved the following ancillary motions:

- "(1) waive fees related to hosting community festivals along St. Clair Avenue West from 2005 through to 2007, covering the construction period and one year after, to assist local businesses to endure and recover from the construction period;
- (2) request TTC staff to investigate and report to the September 22, 2004, Commission meeting on a Proof of Payment (POP) system on St. Clair Avenue West to begin immediately upon the re-opening of the line, such report to include an enhanced enforcement program to curb cheating; and
- (3) request TTC staff to investigate and report to the September 22, 2004, Commission meeting on a pilot program to begin at the start of construction consisting of a Time limited transfer system on St. Clair Avenue West, such a system to allow riders to depart and reenter the streetcar."

The Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee:

- (A) recommended to the Policy and Finance Committee that City Council approve the following:
 - (I) the adoption of Recommendation (A) of the Toronto Transit Commission in the communication (September 13, 2004) from the General Secretary, Toronto Transit Commission, subject to the following amendments to the staff recommendations in the Recommendations Section of the report (August 31, 2004) from the Commissioner of Urban Development Services, the Acting Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services, the Chief General Manager, Toronto Transit Commission, and the President, Toronto Parking Authority:
 - (i) amending Recommendation (1) to read as follows:

- "(1) the Preferred Design Concept identified through the St Clair Avenue West Transit Improvements Class Environmental Assessment study process, the principal elements of which are as follows, be approved"; (Motion by Councillor Moscoe)
- (ii) amending Recommendation (4) by adding the following words:
 - "(4) and that the Consultation Group participate in all streetscape enhancements, urban design decisions, streetcar shelter and platform design and public art decisions, and that this group include, and be co-chaired by the four local City Councillors and report to the Commissioner of Urban Development Services;"; (Motion by Councillor De Baeremaeker)
- (iii) amending Recommendation (7) by adding the following words:
 - "(7) and that any trees lost as a result of sidewalk cuts or other road widening be replaced with appropriate sized trees in the immediate vicinity, and that the overall number of trees be substantially increased on St. Clair Avenue West, and that the placement of these new trees be approved by the local BIA (or Councillor in the absence of a BIA);" (Motion by Councillor De Baeremaeker)

so that the recommendations now read as follows:

"It is recommended that:

- (1) the Preferred Design Concept identified through the St Clair Avenue West Transit Improvements Class Environmental Assessment study process, the principal elements of which are as follows, be approved;
 - (i) two centre lanes reserved for exclusive use by streetcars (and emergency vehicles) protected by a raised, but mountable, trackbed;
 - (ii) during peak periods, two general purpose traffic lanes in each

direction, located on either side of the streetcar tracks, providing sufficient capacity to accommodate all current peak period traffic volumes on St. Clair;

- (iii) during off-peak periods and weekends, one general purpose traffic lane and one parking lane in each direction providing sufficient capacity to accommodate all current off-peak and weekend traffic volumes;
- (iv) left-turns lanes at signalized intersections to permit left-turn and U-turns on their own exclusive signal phases;
- (v) on-street parking on both sides of the street during off-peak times on weekdays and at all times on weekends will be permitted in the majority of the curb lanes, and new off-street parking, resulting in a net increase in the parking supply along St. Clair Avenue West; and
- (vi) enhanced streetscape, urban design, streetcar shelters and platforms, public art and safety features in the overall design and implementation of the transit improvement project;

- (2) authority be granted to the Commissioner of Urban Development Services to file the Draft Environmental Study Report (ESR) for the St. Clair Avenue West Transit Improvements Environmental Assessment with the City Clerk and to give notification of such filing in accordance with the requirements of the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment process;
- (3) authority be granted to commence negotiations to acquire the property interests and initiate expropriations if required, to implement the Preferred Design Concept for the St. Clair Avenue West Transit Improvements Environmental Assessment:
- (4) a community design consultation group consisting of representatives of the St. Clair Avenue West business community, residents and other stakeholders be established to work with the project team to provide input during the detailed process, and that the Consultation Group be participate in all streetscape enhancements, urban design decisions, streetcar shelter and platform design and public art decisions, and that this group include, and be co-chaired by the four local City Councillors and report to the Commissioner of Urban Development Services;";
- (5) additional funding be provided in the 2005-2009 TTC and City capital budgets to undertake the enhanced streetscape, urban design, and public art elements associated with the finalized design concept;
- (6) the Commissioner of Urban Development Services develop a proposal to engage the local arts communities to provide input on the development of a public art program and themes for St. Clair Avenue West, and report back to Council by December 2004 for approval;
- the Commissioner of Economic Development, Culture and Tourism, in (7) consultation with the City's Urban Design section, the City's Tree Advocate and project design team, develop a detailed implementation plan for landscaping along St. Clair Avenue West, with particular attention to creating viable tree plantings and associate attractive tree-pit containers, where possible, and report back to Council upon completion of the detailed design; and that any trees lost as a result of sidewalk cuts or other road widening be replaced with appropriate sized trees in the immediate vicinity, and that the overall number of

trees be substantially increased on St. Clair Avenue West, and that the placement of these new trees be approved by the local BIA (or Councillor in the absence of a BIA);"

- (8) that approval be granted in principle for the traffic bylaws required to implement this project as summarized in Appendix A; and
- (9) the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary actions to give effect thereto.";
- (II) that a "Beautiful St. Clair Committee" be established in order to facilitate staff recommendations (6) and (7) in the report (August 31, 2004) from the Commissioner of Urban Development Services, the Acting Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services, the Chief General Manager, Toronto Transit Commission, and the President, Toronto Parking Authority; (Motion by Councillor De Baeremaeker on behalf of Councillor Miheve)
- (III) that Economic Development's Small Business and Local Partnership staff, working with local BIAs, support a "Shop St. Clair" campaign during the construction period; and that City departments waive fees related to hosting community festivals on St. Clair Avenue West from 2005 to 2007 (the construction period and immediately thereafter); (Motion by Councillor De Baeremaeker on behalf of Councillor Mihevc)
- (III) that businesses along all of St. Clair Avenue be entitled to apply for the Commercial Façade program, starting in 2005 and that Economic Development staff forward a budget request to this end through the 2005 Capital Budget process; (Motion by Councillor De Baeremaeker on behalf of Councillor Mihevc)
- (IV) that Transportation staff be directed to conduct polling on all Ward 21 local streets adjacent to St. Clair Avenue West and where signalized intersections exist to determine street support for speed humps, such polling to include residents two blocks north and south of St. Clair Avenue West; and (Motion by Councillor De Baeremaeker on behalf of Councillor Miheve)
- (V) that the preservation of the current sidewalk width on St. Clair Avenue West be made a key guiding principle in the detailed design work to be undertaken; and that the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services be requested

to investigate further possibilities to minimize and eliminate cuts to sidewalks and to add sidewalk space where possible; (Motion by Councillor De Baeremaeker on behalf of Councillor Miheve)

- (VI) that Council request that the Toronto Parking Authority, in order to allocate up to \$6 M in 2005-06 for necessary replacement parking to address the parking deficiencies identified in the Hillcrest Village BIA, St. Clair West BIA and Corso Italia BIA areas specifically, be requested to amend its capital budget submission to that effect; (Motion by Councillor De Baeremaeker)
- (VII) that Council request Toronto Hydro to move all the hydro lines under ground in the areas along St. Clair Avenue West where conduits and transformer vaults have already been installed, as part of this project; (Motion by Councillor De Baeremaeker)
- (VIII) that the project retain and/or replace a full inventory of street furniture and improvements of any kind paid for by BIA funds, affected by this proposal; (Motion by Councillor De Baeremaeker)
- (IX) that the Commissioner of Urban Development Services be requested to consider, as part of the St. Clair Avenue Study being conducted in 2005, the relocation of the Landsdowne Loop to Caledonia and the connection to the Bradford Line GO Station; and that the Mayor, the Chair of Toronto Transit Commission and the local Councillor be requested to meet with GO Transit to review the feasibility of the connection; and (Motion by Councillor De Baeremaeker)
- (X) that the Toronto Transit Commission be requested to consider:
 - (i) increasing the frequency of stops and streetcars on St. Clair Avenue West; and (Motion by Councillor Saundercook)
 - (ii) the possibility of converting short turn loops into parking lots to support the commercial district of St. Clair Avenue West. (Motion by Councillor Saundercook)
- (B) requested the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services to report directly to Council for its meeting on September 28, 2004 on:

- (i) the possibility of incorporating a bicycle lane on either the transit or vehicular Right of Ways of St. Clair Avenue West;
- (ii) the possibility of using the "Barnes Dance" signal operation for pedestrians to cross in any direction when all vehicular traffic is stopped in the St. Clair Avenue West proposal; and
- (2) requested the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services and the Commissioner of Urban Development Services to submit a report directly to Council revising Alternative 6 to guarantee that any trees to be removed will be replaced with a tree of a comparable size and no pedestrian space be reduced. (**Motion by Councillor Saundercook**)

The following motion was voted on and lost.

Moved by Deputy Mayor Bussin:

That the motions by Councillor De Baeremaeker be referred to the Commissioner of Urban Development Services for report thereon directly to Council for its meeting on September 28, 2004.

(Clause 1, Joint Report 1)

The Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee adjourned their joint meeting on Tuesday, September 14, 2004, at 12:45 a.m.

 Chair.	
Chan:	