

Consolidated Clause in Planning and Transportation Committee and Works Committee Joint Report 2, which was considered by City Council on December 5, 6 and 7, 2005.

1

**Spadina Subway Extension
Environmental Assessment Study**

City Council on December 5, 6 and 7, 2005, amended this Clause by adding the following:

“That Council adopt the following staff recommendation contained in the Recommendation Section of the supplementary report (December 5, 2005) from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning:

‘It is recommended that City Council direct the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning, in consultation with the Chief General Manager of the Toronto Transit Commission (TTC), to report further to Council on the order of magnitude costs associated with expanding the City’s transit system including subways, streetcars and buses.’ ”

This Clause, as amended, was adopted by City Council.

Council also considered additional material, which is noted at the end of this Clause.

The Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee recommend that City Council:

(A) adopt the staff recommendations in the Recommendations Section of the report (November 8, 2005) from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning, the General Manager, Transportation Services, and the Chief General Manager, Toronto Transit Commission, as follows:

“It is recommended that City Council:

- (1) approve the 6.2 kilometre extension of the Spadina Subway along the preferred north-westerly alignment with four new stations at:**
- (i) the interchange with the GO Bradford Rail Line;**
 - (ii) the intersection of Keele Street and Finch Avenue West;**
 - (iii) at the York University Campus; and**
 - (iv) on Steeles Avenue West between Keele and Jane Streets,**

as more fully described in the attached Executive Summary report of the Spadina Subway Extension Environmental Assessment Draft Report;

- (2) authorize the Chief General Manager of the Toronto Transit Commission to submit the complete Environmental Assessment Report to the Minister of the Environment for approval;**
 - (3) forward this report to the Regional Municipality of York, the City of Vaughan, GO Transit and the Ministry of Public Infrastructure Renewal for Ontario, for information; and**
 - (4) the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary actions to give effect thereto.”;**
- (B) endorse the following ancillary motions (1) to (8) approved by the Toronto Transit Commission at its meeting on November 28, 2005:**
- “(1) that staff review the feasibility of making minor adjustments to the route and consider construction methods that will minimize the disruption to industrial properties in the Kodiak industrial subdivision;**
 - (2) that staff work with business owners and the administration of Downsview Park to assist with the relocation of these businesses on the nearby Downsview lands, and that this be part of the negotiations with the Park regarding the locating of a station on the Downsview Park lands;**
 - (3) that staff convene a meeting of the business owners and the Downsview Park administration including the local councillor and local MP to negotiate a possible relocation package that will assist businesses being displaced to relocate to Downsview lands currently designated industrial or such other locations that can prove to be mutually beneficial;**
 - (4) that staff report on the possibility of building Fire Station #141 into the Finch West Subway Station;**
 - (5) that staff consult with Toronto Water and Technical Services and develop plans for the completion of the trunk sewer north from Sheppard towards Grandravine in conjunction with the construction of this subway;**
 - (6) that staff report on possible alternative names for the Finch West Station (Keele North Station) and Sheppard West Station (Park Station);**
 - (7) that staff report back on the rationale of the three-track system versus the two-track system; and**

- (8) WHEREAS it is important to continue with property investigations and related engineering support to further define property interests, and respond to more detailed enquiries in response to EA recommendations;**

WHEREAS it is important to commence geotechnical and environmental investigations along the recommended alignment and station locations; and

WHEREAS it is important to establish a terms of reference for the Federal Environmental Screening Report in the event that the Canadian Environmental Assessment Act (CEAA) requirements are triggered by federal contributions to the Spadina Subway Extension project;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT:

- (i) the Commission recommend approval for an increase of \$1.3 million to the Toronto Transit Commission's Preliminary 2006-2010 Capital Budget to reflect reallocation of expenditures from the "below the line" Spadina Subway Extension project found in the TTC 2006-2010 Capital Program submission to allow TTC staff to:**
- (a) continue with property investigations and related engineering support to further define property interests and to respond to more detailed enquiries in response to the EA recommendations;**
 - (b) commence geotechnical and environmental investigations along the recommended alignment and station locations; and**
 - (c) establish a terms of reference for the Federal Environmental Screening Report in the event that the Canadian Environmental Assessment Act (CEAA) requirements are triggered by Federal contributions to the Spadina Subway Extension project; and**
- (ii) the Ontario Ministry of Public Infrastructure Renewal, the Regional Municipality of York and all other participating stakeholders recognize these costs as part of the formal cost-share agreement to be developed respecting the Spadina Subway Extension project";**
- (C) require that all emergency exit buildings for the Spadina Subway Extension project be subject to site plan control;**
- (D) request the Toronto Transit Commission to ask the Chief General Manager, Toronto Transit Commission to submit a report to the February 2006 meeting of the Commission on the feasibility of relocating the three-track structure from under the affected businesses on Kodiak Crescent and Sheppard Avenue West;**

- (E) **request the Federal Government to invest \$10 billion in the Greater Toronto Area over the next five years for subway(rail) expansion; and**
- (F) **in future, the appropriate staff send Registered Letters to all property owners and tenants where there is a possibility of expropriation of property.**

Action taken by the Committees:

The Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee:

- (1) requested the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning, in consultation with the Chief General Manager, Toronto Transit Commission, to report directly to Council for its meeting on December 5, 2005, on the need and order of priority for subway extensions on Sheppard Avenue, Eglinton Avenue, Yonge Street, the Bloor Street westerly extension, and replacement of the Scarborough LRT; and
- (2) requested the General Manager, Transportation Services, to submit a report to the Works Committee on the feasibility of a further northbound extension of Tangiers Road, in order to provide a northern access to the commuter parking via a public street along the north side of the Hydro Corridor.

The Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee submit the report (November 8, 2005) from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning, General Manager, Transportation Services, and the Chief General Manager, Toronto Transit Commission.

Purpose:

To provide the results of the Spadina Subway Extension Environmental Assessment Study, request approval of the preferred alignment, station and commuter facility locations, and direct staff to continue with the Environmental Assessment approvals process.

Financial Implications and Impact Statement:

There are no financial implications arising from this report. However, sufficient funds have been included for work related to the Environmental Assessment in Project 3.9, under Environmental Assessment for Spadina Subway Extension to Steeles, as set out on pages 871 to 874 - Category Expansion, in the TTC 2005-2009 Capital Program as approved by City Council on February 23, 2005. The Environmental Assessment is jointly funded by the Province of Ontario, Toronto Transit Commission and the Regional Municipality of York.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that City Council:

- (1) approve the 6.2 kilometre extension of the Spadina Subway along the preferred north-westerly alignment with four new stations at:

- (i) the interchange with the GO Bradford Rail Line;
- (ii) the intersection of Keele Street and Finch Avenue West;
- (iii) at the York University Campus; and
- (iv) on Steeles Avenue West between Keele and Jane Streets,

as more fully described in the attached Executive Summary report of the Spadina Subway Extension Environmental Assessment Draft Report;

- (2) authorize the Chief General Manager of the Toronto Transit Commission to submit the complete Environmental Assessment Report to the Minister of the Environment for approval;
- (3) forward this report to the Regional Municipality of York, the City of Vaughan, GO Transit and the Ministry of Public Infrastructure Renewal for Ontario, for information; and
- (4) the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary actions to give effect thereto.

Background:

Upon completion of the 1994 Environmental Assessment Report for the Yonge-Spadina Loop Project, the Minister of the Environment and Energy authorized the extension of the Spadina Subway from Downsview Station to York University only. Since this time, several important policy changes, planning initiatives, transit improvement projects, land development decisions and property acquisition activities have occurred. These changes require that a new Environmental Assessment study be undertaken for the extension of the Spadina Subway.

Consequently, the City of Toronto and the Toronto Transit Commission are joint proponents for a new Individual Environmental Assessment (EA) (in accordance with the requirements of the Ontario Environmental Assessment Act), for a 6.2 kilometre, four-station underground extension of the Spadina Subway from Downsview Station to Steeles Avenue, with related commuter facilities (bus terminals, passenger pick-up and drop-off and commuter parking).

The TTC and the City prepared a Terms of Reference (TOR), as required by the Environmental Assessment Act (EAA) for an Individual EA. The TOR phase included consultation with key stakeholders and the public and was approved by the Minister of the Environment in September 2004.

URS Canada Inc. was retained in October 2004 to conduct the Environmental Assessment Study. The Environmental Assessment Study was conducted in three phases, as follows:

- (1) Phase One – Development of alternative subway routes and evaluation criteria.
- (2) Phase Two – Analysis/evaluation and selection of the preferred subway route and development of alternative subway alignments.

- (3) Phase Three – Selection and detailed Environmental Assessment of the preferred alignment and study recommendations and conclusions.

Public and key stakeholder agency consultation was held during each of the three Study phases.

Comments:

A copy of the Executive Summary for the Spadina Subway Extension Environmental Assessment Study Draft Report is attached. If authorized by Council, the complete EA Report will be submitted to the Minister of the Environment and will be available for public review and comment.

The purpose of the EA Study is to develop and analyze alternative alignments and station locations for the 1994 Approved EA to extend the Spadina Subway from Downsview Station to York University and to study a further extension to a terminal station at Steeles Avenue.

Consistent with the 1994 Approved EA, the objectives of the Spadina Subway Extension are to:

- (1) provide subway service to the Keele/Finch area, York University and a new inter-regional transit gateway and commuter parking facility at Steeles Avenue;
- (2) provide improved connections between the TTC subway system and GO Transit, York Region Transit and other inter-regional transit services;
- (3) support local population and employment growth up to 2031, in accordance with the land use and transportation policies of the new City of Toronto Official Plan and York Region Official Plan;
- (4) minimize any negative environmental impacts; and
- (5) extend the subway in the most cost-effective manner.

The Executive Summary recommends the Spadina Subway Extension alignment shown in the attached Exhibit 1, with subway stations located:

- (1) at an interchange with the GO Bradford Rail Line (Sheppard West Station) (Exhibit 2);
- (2) in the vicinity of Keele Street and Finch Avenue West (Finch West Station) (Exhibit 3);
- (3) on the York University campus (York University Station) (Exhibit 4); and
- (4) at Steeles Avenue West (between Keele and Jane Streets) (Steeles West Station) (Exhibit 5).

The alignment at the Steeles West Station will also protect for the long-term extension of the Spadina Subway to Vaughan Corporate Centre.

Property Requirements:

During the EA Study, the following property requirements have been identified:

- (1) full acquisition, (including demolition of buildings and relocation of existing businesses) on 9 properties (including Toronto Fire Services Station #141);
- (2) acquisitions on Parc Downsview Park and York University lands; and
- (3) partial acquisitions on 16 other properties.

TTC and the City of Toronto will:

- (1) proceed with a Property Protection Study during the design of the Spadina Subway Extension, which will determine detailed property requirements, including temporary construction easements;
- (2) continue with property negotiations with York University for property required for the Subway Extension, in accordance with the commitments made by the University during the 1994 EA and reflecting more recent discussions on detailed property acquisition principles;
- (3) initiate discussions with Parc Downsview Park, in accordance with direction received by Toronto City Council at its September 30, 2005, meeting;
- (4) continue discussions with Toronto Fire Services for proposed relocation of Station #141; and
- (5) for all other properties, at the appropriate time, the City of Toronto will acquire property by negotiation or expropriation as required.

Project Costs and Schedule:

The order-of-magnitude cost estimate for the 6.2 kilometre subway extension, including design and construction costs, property, yard improvements and vehicles, is \$1.4 billion in 2005 dollars. Design, construction, and testing and commissioning will take approximately seven years. Implementation of the Project would be subject to Environment Assessment approval and funding.

Next Steps:

Upon approval by the Toronto City Council, the Environmental Assessment Report will be finalized and submitted to the Ministry of the Environment. In accordance with the Environmental Assessment Act, a Decision by the Minister of the Environment will be made within 30 weeks following submittal of the EA Report. This 30-week review period includes a 30-day period for the public and the Government Review Team (consisting of key stakeholder agencies) to review and comment on the EA Report.

Conclusions:

The recommendations of the Spadina Subway Extension Environmental Assessment have been developed in consultation with a wide range of community and institutional stakeholders and in accordance with the Environmental Assessment Act. The study recommends an updated alignment for a radial extension of the Spadina Line with stations at Sheppard Avenue/GO Bradford Line, Keele Street/Finch Avenue West, the York University Commons and at Steeles Avenue West between Keele and Jane Streets.

Contact:

Rod McPhail, Director
Transportation Planning, City Planning Division
Telephone: 416-392-8100
Fax: 416-392-3821
e-mail: rmcphail@toronto.ca

List of Attachments:

Exhibits 1 to 5; and Spadina Subway Extension Environmental Assessment Draft Report – Executive Summary

(A copy of each of Exhibits 1 to 5 and the “Spadina Subway Extension Environmental Assessment Report Executive Summary” referred to the report was forwarded to all Members of Council with the agenda for the joint meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee on November 30, 2005, and a copy is on file in the office of the City Clerk’s, City Hall.)

The Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee also submit the following communication (November 29, 2005) from the General Secretary, Toronto Transit Commission.

At its meeting on Monday, November 28, 2005, the Commission considered the attached report entitled, “Spadina Subway Extension Environmental Assessment Study Final Recommendations.”

The Commission approved the Recommendation contained in the report, as listed below:

“It is recommended that the Commission:

- (1) approve the Spadina Subway Extension alignment, stations and related commuter facilities, as described in the attached “Spadina Subway Extension Environmental Assessment Draft Report Executive Summary”;
- (2) forward this report to the City of Toronto Council (through Planning and Transportation Committee and Works Committee) for approval;

- (3) subject to City of Toronto Council approval, authorize the Chief General Manager to submit the complete Environmental Assessment Report to the Ministry of the Environment for approval; and
- (4) forward this report to the Regional Municipality of York, the City of Vaughan, GO Transit and the Ministry of Public Infrastructure Renewal for Ontario, for information.”

The Commission also approved the following ancillary motions:

- (1) that staff review the feasibility of making minor adjustments to the route and consider construction methods that will minimize the disruption to industrial properties in the Kodiak industrial subdivision;
- (2) that staff work with business owners and the administration of Downsview Park to assist with the relocation of these businesses on the nearby Downsview lands, and that this be part of the negotiations with the Park regarding the locating of a station on the Downsview Park lands;
- (3) that staff convene a meeting of the business owners and the Downsview Park administration including the local councillor and local MP to negotiate a possible relocation package that will assist businesses being displaced to relocate to Downsview lands currently designated industrial or such other locations that can prove to be mutually beneficial;
- (4) that staff report on the possibility of building Fire Station #141 into the Finch West Subway Station;
- (5) that staff consult with Toronto Water and Technical Services and develop plans for the completion of the trunk sewer north from Sheppard towards Grandravine in conjunction with the construction of this subway;
- (6) that staff report on possible alternative names for the Finch West Station (Keele North Station) and Sheppard West Station (Park Station);
- (7) that staff report back on the rationale of the three-track system versus the two-track system; and
- (8) Whereas it is important to continue with property investigations and related engineering support to further define property interests, and respond to more detailed enquiries in response to EA recommendations;

Whereas it is important to commence geotechnical and environmental investigations along the recommended alignment and station locations; and

Whereas it is important to establish a terms of reference for the Federal Environmental Screening Report in the event that the Canadian Environmental Assessment Act (CEAA) requirements are triggered by federal contributions to the Spadina Subway Extension project;

Therefore be it resolved that:

- (1) the Commission recommend approval for an increase of \$1.3 million to the Toronto Transit Commission's Preliminary 2006-2010 Capital Budget to reflect reallocation of expenditures from the "below the line" Spadina Subway Extension project found in the TTC 2006-2010 Capital Program submission to allow TTC staff to:
 - (a) continue with property investigations and related engineering support to further define property interests and to respond to more detailed enquiries in response to the EA recommendations;
 - (b) commence geotechnical and environmental investigations along the recommended alignment and station locations; and
 - (c) establish a terms of reference for the Federal Environmental Screening Report in the event that the Canadian Environmental Assessment Act (CEAA) requirements are triggered by Federal contributions to the Spadina Subway Extension project; and
- (2) the Ontario Ministry of Public Infrastructure Renewal, the Regional Municipality of York and all other participating stakeholders recognize these costs as part of the formal cost share agreement to be developed respecting the Spadina Subway Extension project.

The foregoing is forwarded to City of Toronto Council, through the joint meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee and Works Committee for approval of the Spadina Subway Extension alignment, stations and related commuter facilities, as described in the attached "Spadina Subway Extension Environmental Assessment Draft Report Executive Summary."

(Report dated November 10, 2005, addressed to the
Toronto Transit Commission from the
Chief General Manager)

Recommendations:

It is recommended that the Commission:

- (1) approve the Spadina Subway Extension alignment, stations and related commuter facilities, as described in the attached "Spadina Subway Extension Environmental Assessment Draft Report Executive Summary";

- (2) forward this report to the City of Toronto Council (through Planning and Transportation Committee and Works Committee) for approval;
- (3) subject to City of Toronto Council approval, authorize the Chief General Manager to submit the complete Environmental Assessment Report to the Ministry of the Environment for approval; and
- (4) forward this report to the Regional Municipality of York, the City of Vaughan, GO Transit and the Ministry of Public Infrastructure Renewal for Ontario, for information.

Funding:

While there is no funding implication associated with this report, sufficient funds have been included for work related to the Environmental Assessment in Project 3.9, under Environmental Assessment for Spadina Subway Extension to Steeles, as set out on pages 871 to 874 - Category Expansion, in the TTC 2005-2009 Capital Program as approved by City Council on February 23, 2005. The Environmental Assessment is jointly funded by the Province of Ontario, the City of Toronto and the Regional Municipality of York.

Background:

The City of Toronto and the Toronto Transit Commission are joint proponents for an Individual Environmental Assessment (EA) (in accordance with the requirements of the Ontario Environmental Assessment Act), for a 6.2 kilometre, four-station underground extension of the Spadina Subway from Downsview Station to Steeles Avenue, with related commuter facilities (bus terminals, passenger pick-up and drop-off and commuter parking).

The TTC and City prepared a Terms of Reference, as required by the Environmental Assessment Act for an Individual EA. The Terms of Reference included consultation with key stakeholders and the public and was approved by the Minister of the Environment in September 2004.

URS Canada Inc. was retained at the October 20, 2004, Commission Meeting to conduct the Environmental Assessment Study. The Environmental Assessment Study was conducted in three phases, as follows:

- (1) Phase One – Development of alternative subway routes and evaluation criteria.
- (2) Phase Two – Analysis/evaluation and selection of the preferred subway route and development of alternative subway alignments.
- (3) Phase Three – Selection and detailed Environmental Assessment of the preferred alignment and study recommendations and conclusions.

Public and key stakeholder agency consultation was held during each of the three Study phases.

Discussion:

A copy of the Executive Summary for the Spadina Subway Extension Environmental Assessment Draft Report is attached. A copy of the EA Draft Report will be available with the General Secretary on November 28, 2005. The final EA Report will be submitted to the Minister of the Environment and will be available for public review and comment.

The purpose of the EA Study is to develop and analyze alternative alignments and station locations for the 1994 Approved EA to extend the Spadina Subway from Downsview Station to York University and to study a further extension to a terminal station at Steeles Avenue.

Consistent with the 1994 Approved EA, the objectives of the Spadina Subway Extension are to:

- (1) provide subway service to the Keele/Finch area, York University and a new inter-regional transit gateway and commuter parking facility at Steeles Avenue;
- (2) provide improved connections between the TTC subway system and GO Transit, York Region Transit and other inter-regional transit services;
- (3) support local population and employment growth up to 2031, in accordance with the land use and transportation policies of the new City of Toronto Official Plan and the York Region Official Plan;
- (4) minimize any negative environmental impacts; and
- (5) achieve reasonable capital and operating costs.

The Executive Summary recommends the Spadina Subway Extension alignment shown in the attached Exhibit 1, with subway stations located:

- (1) at an interchange with the GO Bradford Rail Line (Sheppard West Station) (Exhibit 2);
- (2) in the vicinity of Keele and Finch (Finch West Station) (Exhibit 3);
- (3) on the York University campus (York University Station) (Exhibit 4); and
- (4) at Steeles Avenue (between Keele and Jane Streets) (Steeles West Station) (Exhibit 5).

The alignment at the Steeles West Station will also protect for the long-term extension of the Spadina Subway to Vaughan Corporate Centre.

Property Requirements:

During the EA Study, the following property requirements have been identified:

- (1) full acquisition, (including demolition of buildings and relocation of existing businesses) on nine properties (including Toronto Fire Services Station #141);

- (2) significant takings on Parc Downsview Park and York University lands; and
- (3) partial takings on 16 other properties.

TTC and the City of Toronto will:

- (1) proceed with a Property Protection Study during the design of the Spadina Subway Extension, which will determine detailed property requirements, including temporary construction easements;
- (2) continue with property negotiations with York University for property required for the Subway Extension, in accordance with the commitments made by the University during the 1994 EA and reflecting more recent discussions on detailed property acquisition principles;
- (3) initiate discussions with Parc Downsview Park, in accordance with direction received by Toronto City Council at its September 30, 2005, meeting;
- (4) continue discussions with Toronto Fire Services for proposed relocation of Station #141; and
- (5) for all other properties, at the appropriate time, the City of Toronto will acquire property by negotiation or expropriation as required.

Project Costs and Schedule:

The order-of-magnitude cost estimate for the Project, including design and construction, property, subway yard improvement and vehicles, is \$1.4 billion in 2005 dollars.

Design, construction, and testing and commissioning would be approximately seven years. Implementation of the Project would be subject to Environmental Assessment approval and funding.

Next Steps:

Because TTC and the City of Toronto are joint proponents for the Environmental Assessment, the attached Executive Summary will be submitted for approval to:

- (1) Planning and Transportation Committee and Works Committee (joint meeting to be held on November 30, 2005); and
- (2) Toronto City Council (December 5-7, 2005 meeting).

Upon approval by the Commission and Toronto City Council, the draft Environmental Assessment Report will be finalized and submitted to the Ministry of the Environment. In accordance with the Environmental Assessment Act, a Decision by the Minister of the Environment will be made within 30 weeks following submittal of the EA Report. This 30-week review period includes a 30-day period for the public and the Government Review Team (consisting of key stakeholder agencies) to review and comment on the EA Report.

Justification:

Toronto Transit Commission and Toronto City Council approval of the Environmental Assessment Study recommendations is required prior to submission of the Environmental Assessment Report to the Ministry of the Environment.

The Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee also considered communications from the following:

- (November 30, 2005) from Brian Shifman, Executive Director, Smart Commute – North Toronto, Vaughan, in support of the Environmental Assessment recommendations for the Spadina Subway Extension; and
- (November 30, 2005) from T. W. Bermingham, Blake, Cassels & Graydon LLP, representing Quontlan Realty Inc. (UPS).

The following persons appeared before the Planning and Transportation Committee and the Works Committee:

- Tom Middlebrook, Chief Engineer, Engineering Department, Toronto Transit Commission, and gave a presentation on the Spadina Subway Extension Environmental Assessment Study;
- Stephen D'Agostino, Solicitor, Thomson Rogers, representing a tenant and property owner on Kodiak Crescent, and filed a map of the proposed subway stations;
- Andrew Merceles;
- Brian Shifman, Executive Director and Niki Popper, Program Manager, Smart Commute - North Toronto, Vaughan;
- Dr. Ted Spence, Senior Policy Advisor, Office of the President, and Chris Wong, York University, and filed a submission;
- Councillor Sandra Yeung Racco, Ward 4, City of Vaughan, and Chair of the Spadina York Subway Extension Committee, and filed a submission;

- Tony Genco, President and CEO, Parc Downsview Park Inc., and filed a submission, together with a copy of their Annual Report 2004-2005, and various pamphlets on Parc Downsview Park;
- Courtney Jewell, representing Prudent Financial at 1150 Sheppard Avenue West, and filed a submission;
- Ronald Klausz, representing owners and businesses at 40 Kodiak Crescent;
- Vic Caldana, Vice-President, Downsview Chrysler and Downsview KIA, and filed a submission;
- Councillor Peter Li Preti, Ward 8, York West; and
- Councillor Frances Nunziata, Ward 11, York South-Weston.

City Council – December 5, 6 and 7, 2005

Council also considered the following:

- *Report (December 5, 2005) from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning [Communication 28(c)].*

Subject: Future Subway Expansion

Purpose:

To respond to a request from the joint Planning and Transportation and Works Committee that the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning, report to City Council on the City's priorities for future subway expansion.

Financial Implications and Impact Statement:

There are no financial implications arising from this report.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that City Council direct the Chief Planner, in consultation with the Chief General Manager of the Toronto Transit Commission (TTC), report further to Council on the order of magnitude costs associated with expanding the City's transit system including subways, streetcars and buses.

Background:

The joint Planning and Transportation and Works Committee at its meeting of November 30, 2005, recommended to City Council that the recommendations in the staff report (November 8, 2005) entitled “Spadina Subway Extension Environmental Assessment Study” be approved. In addition, the joint Committee requested that “the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning, in consultation with the Chief General Manager, Toronto Transit Commission, to report directly to Council for its meeting on December 5, 2005, on the need and order of priority for subway extensions on Sheppard Avenue, Eglinton Avenue, Yonge Street, the Bloor Street westerly extension, and replacement of the Scarborough LRT.”

History of the Subway Construction:

One of the City’s greatest accomplishments during the 1950’s, 1960’s and 1970’s was the aggressive subway construction program. This construction program kept pace with and accommodated the rapid growth taking place in the City. Subways were built at an average rate of 2 kilometres per year for 30 years until 1980. Since then, only 8 kilometres of subway have been built (over the past 25 year period).

As can be seen on the following table, 90% of the City’s subway system was constructed prior to 1980. If Toronto is to continue to prosper and be the economic engine of the nation, we must return to the pre-1980’s aggressive subway construction program complimented by an improved and expanded network of streetcars and buses.

<u>Decade</u>	<u>Subway Construction Completed</u>	<u>Length (km.)</u>
1950’s	Yonge-Union Eglinton	7.3
1960’s	University-Union to St. George	3.8
	Bloor-Danforth-Keele to Woodbine	13.0
	Bloor-Danforth east to Warden	4.4
	Bloor-Danforth west to Islington	<u>5.5</u>
		26.7 km.
1970	Yonge ext. to York Mills	4.3
	Yonge ext. to Finch	4.4
	Spadina to Wilson	9.9
	Bloor-Danforth east to Kennedy	2.8
	Bloor-Danforth west to Kipling	<u>1.5</u>
		22.9 km.
1980	Scarborough RT	7 km.
1990	Spadina ext. to Downsview	1.6 km.
2000	Sheppard - Yonge to Don Mills	6.4 km.

Comments:

Priorities for the expansion of the rapid transit system were established by City Council in 2002. Specifically, Council at its meeting of April 16, 17 and 18, 2002, adopted Clause No. 3 of Report No. 4 of the Planning and Transportation Committee, entitled "Toronto Transit Commission - Rapid Transit Expansion Study and Spadina-York Subway Extension: A Business Case from the Spadina-York Subway Extension Committee".

The Rapid Transit Extension Study (RTES) was completed by the TTC in August 2001 and adopted by the Toronto Transit Commission on August 29, 2001. The purpose of the RTES was to examine the needs and priorities for expansion of the TTC's rapid transit system to support the anticipated levels of growth envisaged in the City of Toronto's new Official Plan and to respond to predicted growth trends in the larger Greater Toronto Area (GTA). The projects studied were the extensions to the Sheppard Subway; Scarborough RT; Eglinton subway; Bloor subway; Spadina subway; and Yonge subway.

The RTES concluded that the TTC's highest priority for rapid transit expansion would be the northerly extension of the Spadina Subway to York University/Steeles Avenue and an easterly extension of the Sheppard Subway to Victoria Park Avenue, CN/CP mainline or the Scarborough Civic Center. Each of the options studied are included in Map 4, Higher Order Transit Corridors, of the new Official Plan for the City of Toronto.

The staff report to Planning and Transportation Committee from the Commissioner of Urban Development Services (February 28, 2002) respecting the TTC Rapid Transit Expansion Study recommended that Council, among other things, endorse the findings of the RTES and direct that the appropriate City of Toronto and Toronto Transit Commission officials "commence an updated Environmental Assessment study to amend the Yonge-Spadina Subway EA to examine the alternate alignments for the extension of the Spadina subway line between Downsview subway station and Steeles Avenue and work with the Region of York to co-ordinate the respective jurisdictions' EA Studies in this corridor."

The Environmental Assessments (EA) for the Spadina Subway Extension and Sheppard Subway Extension were approved by the Minister of the Environment on April 27, 1994 and March 24, 1994 respectively. The preferred route of the Spadina Subway studied in RTES varies substantially from the approved EA and therefore required an updated EA. The staff report (November 8, 2005) entitled "Spadina Subway Extension Environmental Assessment Study" now before Council provides the results of the updated EA. The proposed alignment of the Sheppard Subway Extension does not significantly vary from the approved EA and would likely be subject to only minor modifications.

In February, 2005 City Council, while dealing with the Bus-Only Lanes from Downsview Subway Station to York University, re-affirmed that the extension of the Spadina/University subway to Steeles Avenue is the City's top priority for subway expansion. The Minister of Finance and the Government of Ontario were so advised.

In addition to the EA for the Spadina Subway Extension, the TTC has begun the Strategic Plan for the Future of the Scarborough RT. This study is examining options for dealing with the need to replace the existing Scarborough RT cars by 2015. The study is examining a full range of options from buying new RT cars to replacing the RT with Bus Rapid Transit, streetcars, or a subway. The Strategic Plan for the Future of the Scarborough RT is not yet completed. It is expected that the results of this study will be available by the summer of 2006.

Conclusions:

The extension of the subway system, supported and complimented by an improved surface transit network, of streetcars and buses must be a priority of City Council over the next 20 years if the City is to solve the mobility challenges both current and future. City and TTC staff produced a document "Building a Transit City" and presented this to the Commission earlier this year. This transit plan for the City incorporates the strategies of the new Official Plan and the Ridership Growth Study prepared by TTC.

Near term priorities for the expansion of the rapid transit system were established by City Council in 2002 through their endorsement of the recommendations surrounding the RTES. The conclusion of the RTES was that the near term priorities for rapid transit expansion in the City of Toronto are the extensions of the Spadina and Sheppard subways. Based on the direction from City Council and the Toronto Transit Commission, the City and TTC have completed the Spadina Subway Extension Environmental Assessment Study. Those recommendations have been endorsed by the Toronto Transit Commission and the Planning and Transportation and Works Committees and are now before City Council. Once the TTC's Strategic Plan for the Future of the Scarborough RT study has been completed, City Council will be in a better position to deliberate on priorities for future rapid transit expansion in the city.

City and TTC staff should report to City Council, following the completion of the current Scarborough RT study, on the expansion to the Transit System including subways, streetcars and buses and the associated order of magnitude costs.

The Chief General Manager, Toronto Transit Commission, has been consulted in the preparation of this report.

Contact:

*Rod McPhail
Director,, Transportation Planning,
City Planning Division
Telephone: 416-392-8100
e-mail: rmcphail@toronto.ca*

Communications:

- *(December 2, 2005) from Mayor Michael Di Biase, City of Vaughan [Communication 28(a)];*
- *(December 2, 2005) from the Chief Administrative Officer, Toronto and Region Conservation Authority [Communication 28(b)];*
- *(December 5, 2005) from Brian Shifman, Executive Director, Smart Commute - North Toronto, Vaughan [Communication 28(d)];*
- *(November 29, 2005) from Tony Genco, President and CEO, Parc Downsview Park Inc. [Communication 28(e)];*
- *(December 5, 2005) from Mayor Rob Hamilton, City of Barrie [Communication 28(f)]; and*
- *(December 6, 2005) from Bill Fisch, Regional Chair and CEO, The Regional Municipality of York [Communication 28(g)].*