



To be confirmed

**ROUNDTABLE ON THE ENVIRONMENT
MINUTES
MEETING 4**

Date of Meeting: September 22, 2005
Time: 6:30 p.m.
Location: Committee Room 2
City Hall
100 Queen Street West
Toronto, Ontario

Enquiry: Frank Baldassini
Committee Secretary
416-395-7352
fbalda@toronto.ca

Members

<p>Present: Deputy Mayor Joe Pantalone, Chair Councillor Paula Fletcher, Vice-Chair Susan Antler Bob Blazeovski John Cartwright Robert Kerr Mark G. Mitchell Paul Muldoon</p>	<p>Gord Perks Judy Simon Karen Sun Dr. Peter Victor Tim Woods</p> <p>Regrets: Dr. Roger Keil Steven Peck</p>
--	---

The meeting convened at 6:35 p.m. with Deputy Mayor Pantalone in the Chair.

There were no declarations of interest under the Municipal Conflict of Interest Act.

Confirmation of Minutes – January 20, 2005

Confirmed, subject to Minute 4.5 (1) (a) (iii) being amended to read as follows:

“4.5 (1) (b) (iii) bring to the September meeting of the Roundtable a proposed policy for Council to consider which would speed the approval process for elements of the Toronto Bike Plan”.

Action:

Arising from the Minutes, the following Resolution by Gord Perks, Toronto Environmental Alliance, was approved:

“That the Chair request the Policy and Finance Committee to request the General Manager, Transportation Services, to prepare a report, in consultation with the Toronto Cycling Committee, for the Works Committee meeting on November 8, 2005, on options for an expedited bike lane approval process for both road reconstruction and retrofitting; and that a copy of the requested report also be forwarded to the Roundtable on the Environment.”

Welcome and Introductions

The Members of the Roundtable on the Environment and staff members were welcomed. The Chair thanked everyone for attending the meeting.

The Chair also announced that Dr. Lambert Otten, Guelph University, has regretfully tendered his resignation due to his current position and other commitments at Guelph University that have prohibited him from participating fully in the Roundtable’s important activities. The Chair, on behalf of the Roundtable expressed his appreciation to Dr. Lambert Otten for his contribution to the work of the Roundtable on the Environment.

Reports/Communications

1. Progress Report from the Chair of the Roundtable on the Environment

Communication (September 9, 2005) from Deputy Mayor Pantalone, providing a progress report on the achievements of the Roundtable during the past year, and attaching the following documents:

- (a) List of Roundtable on the Environment Recommendations to City Council;
- (b) Toronto Transit Commission VIP Metropass Program; and
- (c) Excerpt of the RFP for the Supply and Delivery of Approximately 14 Regenerative-Air Street Sweepers.

Minute 5.1

Deputy Mayor Pantalone advised the Roundtable that it’s been just over a year since everyone first met as the Roundtable on the Environment.

He also advised that the Roundtable has accomplished many things, including:

- *accelerating some of the City’s existing environmental activities such as the transition to a greener fleet and the conversion of traffic signals to energy-efficient LED technology;*
- *stimulated new environmental initiatives;*
- *participating in the development of a green roofs policy for the City;*

- *the identification of potential green roof sites among City-owned properties has resulted in nearly 30 properties due for re-roofing in the next 3 years now being considered for green roofs, pending budget considerations;*
- *the Chief Financial Officer is coming forward with a cost-benefit analysis of greater enforcement of the Idling Control By-law;*
- *establishing a cross-divisional staff team organized around renewable energy planning, issues and projects;*
- *requesting that staff look at ways for moving forward on Green Economic Development has initiated work that will ultimately stimulate the economy, create jobs in the environmental sector and, potentially, foster the development of a made-in-Toronto green economic cluster;*
- *continuing to push for better air quality; the work in this area has supported large efforts such as the Comprehensive Air Quality Action Plan and the purchase of cleaner street sweepers and smaller initiatives such as a program to encourage staff to use public transit and development of a methodology to track annual per capita spending on air quality;*
- *the roundtable interest in carbon offsets trading has resulted in the City moving more quickly to define a position on the issue;*
- *other educational and promotional activities linked to the Roundtable include the Green Toronto Awards and the United Nations University's Regional Centre for Sustainable Development Education.*

The Chair further advised that he was grateful to have been given the opportunity to work with all Members of the Roundtable and that the City has benefited greatly from contribution of time and expertise made by the Members.

Action:

The Roundtable on the Environment received the communication (September 9, 2005) from Deputy Mayor Pantalone, with thanks.

2. City of Toronto's New Administrative Structure

Minute 5.2

Deputy City Manager Fareed Amin gave a 5-minute verbal presentation on the City of Toronto's new administrative structure and implications for the City's environmental work. He advised that he is responsible for overseeing the City's progress on environmental issues, and that he has established an Executive Environmental Management Committee, with Senior staff representatives from 14 City Divisions with major environmental responsibilities, and which will be a decision-making body. He also advised that the new committee will be working closely with the Roundtable on the Environment and the Standing Committees of Council, to help promote and elevate environmental initiatives and issues.

Action:

The Roundtable on the Environment received the presentation from Deputy City Manager Fareed Amin, with thanks.

3. Update on the Air Quality Strategy

Minute 5.3

Shelley Grice, Manager, Environmental Services, Technical Services Division, made a Power Point presentation on the progress to date on the City of Toronto's Comprehensive Air Quality Strategy. She advised that air quality in Toronto is an important issue for everyone and that many of the City's divisions are now working on air quality improvement.

She also advised of the following Air Quality initiatives:

- *Status report on Air Quality to be presented to the Board of Health on September 26, 2005 and to the Policy and Finance Committee on October 20, 2005;*
- *Regular input to be received from the Roundtable; and*
- *Draft 3-year Action Plan to be prepared and presented in June, 2006.*

Action:

The Roundtable on the Environment received the presentation from Shelley Grice, Manager, Environmental Services, Technical Services Division, with thanks.

4. Carbon Offsets Trading and Renewable Power Production Incentive

Communication (September 8, 2005) from Deputy Mayor Pantalone, enclosing a Briefing Note (September 1, 2005) from the Executive Director, Technical Services Division, a summary of the Consultation Paper (August 11, 2005) released by the Federal Government on August 11, 2005 outlining a proposed Canadian offset system for greenhouse gases and proposing the following recommendations:

Recommendations for Consideration by the Roundtable:

- (1) That the City of Toronto:
 - (a) sell only offset credits that result in environmental benefits, including selling credits to the Federal Government on the condition that credits are retired immediately;
 - (b) take immediate steps to ensure that new contracts with suppliers secure the City's ownership of carbon offset credits; and

- (c) ensure that any funds raised through the sale of offset credits are directed to supplementing funding for environmental initiatives such as transit, thereby multiplying the benefits of the original emissions reductions; and
- (2) Legal Services be requested to report to the Policy and Finance Committee on the appropriate wording to be included in contracts with suppliers who provide services or technologies with potential carbon offset credits (e.g. energy efficiency measures, renewable energy technologies, green roof technologies, methane recovery technologies, etc.).

Communication (September 21, 2005) from Deputy Mayor Pantalone, advising that as part of its consultation with stakeholders on environmental issues this fall, which includes the Offset System for Greenhouse Gas Emissions, the federal government is soliciting comments on the proposed Renewable Power Production Incentive (RPPI) that was announced in the 2005 federal budget, and recommending that:

City Council endorse and submit the following comments to Natural Resources Canada on the proposed Renewable Power Production Incentive:

- (1) that NRCan reconsider the limit of 450 megawatts (MW) per province/territory of renewable power eligible for incentives. It is likely that some of the smaller provinces and territories may not reach their limit, whereas Ontario might exceed it. NRCan should consider allocating limits on incentives on a per-capita basis, rather than a common cap;
- (2) that the 1 cent per kilowatt hour subsidy does not recognize the fact that different technologies produce different greenhouse gas emission reductions. For example, methane from landfill biogas is roughly twenty times more powerful than carbon dioxide in terms of its greenhouse impact, but the RPPI does not provide any extra incentive for methane as a renewable fuel. Therefore, NRCan should consider providing an extra methane incentive, or consider implementing another funding program for methane capture, in much the same way that a separate program has been created for wind power;
- (3) that NRCan consider increasing the subsidy for solar energy. Industry experts have suggested that a subsidy of 1 cent per kW hour for solar is not enough to make photovoltaic installations economically viable. Most new renewable energy technologies require a higher degree of subsidy in their early stages, but can move to market readiness if properly incubated;
- (4) that NRCan allow the aggregation of smaller projects to meet the 100 kW minimum threshold. It is also unclear whether installations must be connected to the electricity grid or if off-grid projects are eligible for the incentive. It is in the best interest of the City if aggregation and off-grid installations are permitted, enabling projects similar to the transit shelter solar lighting installations and SOLARWALL project at the Fleet Services' Central Garage to qualify for the incentive; and

- (5) that NRCan look towards developing a streamlined or “class” environmental assessment process for smaller renewable energy projects. Subjecting each project to a federal environmental assessment process might create barriers, particularly for the smaller projects that the RPPI is intended to encourage.

Minute 5.4

Dr. Peter Victor, Environmental Studies, York University, and Member, Roundtable on the Environment, made a Power Point presentation on a study he conducted 2 years ago on the options available to the City regarding carbon offsets trading.

Mary MacDonald, Senior Environmental Consultant, Environmental Services, Technical Services Division, made a Power Point presentation on administrative considerations regarding carbon offsets trading and highlights of the Federal Government’s Consultation Paper on Offset System for Greenhouse Gases.

The Chair advised that the Federal Government is requesting a response on their Consultation Papers by no later than September 30, 2005, and to that end, the Policy and Finance Committee on September 20, 2005, requested that the Roundtable send its recommendations directly to City Council on September 28, 29 and 30, 2005.

The Roundtable on the Environment also had before it the communications (September 8 and 20, 2005) from Deputy Mayor Pantalone, enclosing a Briefing Note (September 1, 2005) from the Executive Director, Technical Services Division, a summary of the Consultation Paper (August 11, 2005) released by the Federal Government on August 11, 2005 outlining a proposed Canadian offset system for greenhouse gases and the discussion paper regarding the Renewable Power Production Incentive, which is related to emissions trading and for which a response is also required by the Federal Government before September 30, 2005.

Action:

The Roundtable on the Environment:

- (1) *received the presentations from Dr. Peter Victor, Environmental Studies, York University, and Member, Roundtable on the Environment, and Mary MacDonald, Senior Environmental Consultant, Environmental Services, Technical Services Division, with thanks; and*
- (2) *requested the Chair to forward the following recommendations directly to City Council:*

That:

- (1) *the City of Toronto:*

- (a) *sell offset credits only to the Government of Canada Climate Fund on the condition that the offset credits be retired by the Federal Government;*

- (b) *take immediate steps to ensure that new contracts with suppliers secure the City's ownership of carbon offset credits; and*
 - (c) *ensure that any funds raised through the sale of offset credits are directed to supplementing funding for environmental initiatives such as transit, thereby multiplying the benefits of the original emissions reductions;*
- (2) *Legal Services be requested to report to the Policy and Finance Committee on the appropriate wording to be included in contracts with suppliers who provide services or technologies with potential carbon offset credits (e.g. energy efficiency measures, renewable energy technologies, green roof technologies, methane recovery technologies, etc.);*
- (3) *the City Manager be requested to investigate and report to the Roundtable on the Environment and to the Policy and Finance Committee on any other offset credit sales which may result in environmental benefits;*
- (4) *City Council endorse and submit the following comments to Natural Resources Canada on the proposed Renewable Power Production Incentive:*
 - (a) *that NRCan reconsider the limit of 450 megawatts (MW) per province/territory of renewable power eligible for incentives. It is likely that some of the smaller provinces and territories may not reach their limit, whereas Ontario might exceed it. NRCan should consider allocating limits on incentives on a per-capita basis, rather than a common cap;*
 - (b) *that the 1 cent per kilowatt hour subsidy does not recognize the fact that different technologies produce different greenhouse gas emission reductions. For example, methane from landfill biogas is roughly twenty times more powerful than carbon dioxide in terms of its greenhouse impact, but the RPPI does not provide any extra incentive for methane as a renewable fuel. Therefore, NRCan should consider providing an extra methane incentive, or consider implementing another funding program for methane capture, in much the same way that a separate program has been created for wind power;*
 - (c) *that NRCan consider increasing the subsidy for solar energy. Industry experts have suggested that a subsidy of 1 cent per kW hour for solar is not enough to make photovoltaic installations economically viable. Most new renewable energy technologies require a higher degree of subsidy in their early stages, but can move to market readiness if properly incubated;*
 - (d) *that NRCan allow the aggregation of smaller projects to meet the 100 kW minimum threshold. It is also unclear whether installations must be connected to the electricity grid or if off-grid projects are eligible for the incentive. It is in the best interest of the City if aggregation and off-grid installations are permitted, enabling projects similar to the transit shelter*

solar lighting installations and SOLARWALL project at the Fleet Services' Central Garage to qualify for the incentive; and

(e) that NRCan look towards developing a streamlined or "class" environmental assessment process for smaller renewable energy projects. Subjecting each project to a federal environmental assessment process might create barriers, particularly for the smaller projects that the RPPI is intended to encourage; and

(5) a copy of these recommendations be forwarded to the Toronto Atmospheric Fund and the Federation of Canadian Municipalities.

5. Request to Province Regarding Changes to the Building Code to Allow Use of Non-potable Water for Non-drinking Water Uses

Briefing Note (September 9, 2005) from the Chief Building Official and Executive Director, providing comments regarding non-potable water uses in the Ontario Building Code.

Recommendation for Consideration by the Roundtable:

The Policy and Finance Committee request City Council to request the province to amend the *Ontario Building Code*, subsection 7.1.6.3.(2), to permit the use of non-potable water for limited uses, even in situations where a supply of potable water is available.

Minute 5.5

John Humphries, Technical Advisor, Building Division, made a Power Point presentation outlining the benefits to the City of Toronto of allowing for the use of non-potable water for non-drinking water uses and current constraints in the existing Ontario Building Code surrounding the use of non-potable water.

Action:

The Roundtable on the Environment:

(1) received the presentation from John Humphries, Technical Advisor, Building Division, outlining the benefits to the City of Toronto of allowing for the use of non-potable water for non-drinking water uses, with thanks; and

- (2) *requested the Chair to advise the Policy and Finance Committee of the following recommendations:*
- (a) *the Policy and Finance Committee request City Council to request the province to amend the Ontario Building Code, subsection 7.1.6.3.(2), to permit the use of non potable water for limited uses, even in situations where a supply of potable water is available;*
 - (b) *the City of Toronto, in its negotiations on the new City of Toronto Act, look for opportunities to address the issue of the use of non-potable water and other issues regarding energy efficiency needs;*
 - (c) *the Chief Building Official and Executive Director be requested to report and make recommendations to the Policy and Finance Committee on other amendments that would be required to the Ontario Building Code, in order to address retro-fitting and green building issues; and*
 - (d) *a copy of these recommendations be forwarded to the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing and to the Minister of Energy.*

6. Discussion on information requests from previous Roundtable meetings

The Executive Director, Technical Services Division, has provided the following status reports and reports for information, which were requested by the Roundtable at its previous meetings:

Reports for Information:

- (a) Status on Renewable Energy Planning

Communication (September 8, 2005) from Deputy Mayor Pantalone, providing a report of progress to date on the use and production of renewable energy at the City, and suggesting the following recommendation:

Recommendation for Consideration by the Roundtable:

That City staff develop a renewable energy action plan with targets and timelines and report back to the Roundtable on the Environment at its first meeting in 2006. City staff should work together with the City of Toronto's energy partners such as Toronto Hydro, Enwave, the Toronto and Region Conservation Authority and other organizations as appropriate.

- (i) Communication (June 20, 2005) from the City Clerk advising that City Council on June 14, 15 and 16, 2005, considered Works Committee Report 6, Clause 10, and directed that a copy be forwarded to the Roundtable on the Environment, and that:

- (1) appropriate City staff provide an update to the Roundtable on the Environment at its September 2005 meeting on renewable energy, including the status of Recommendations (28) and (30) of the Environmental Plan; and
 - (2) the Roundtable be requested to provide advice to City Council on how to increase the City's use of renewable energy; and
- (ii) Status Report (September 8, 2005) from Environmental Services, Technical Services Division and Facilities and Real Estate Division, which includes Appendix A: City of Toronto Renewable Energy Projects (August 2005).
- (b) Rationale Calculation of Per Capita Spending on Air Quality
- Status Report (September 9, 2005) from Environmental Services, Technical Services Division.
- (c) Improved Enforcement of Idling Control By-law
- Memorandum (September 8, 2005) from the Director, Corporate Finance Division, advising that work requested by the Roundtable on the Environment, is presently underway, and will be completed for the December 12, 2005 Roundtable on the Environment meeting, on the business model detailing the expenditures required to enforce the Idling By-law and the revenues which would be generated; and the second request regarding a review of the feasibility of installing an automatic three minute stall feature on all appropriate City and Toronto Transit Commission vehicles.
- (d) List of City Properties Suitable for Green Roofs
- Communication (September 14, 2005) from Deputy Mayor Pantalone, advising that the attached memorandum (September 8, 2005) from the Executive Director, Technical Services, identifies three properties which are suitable for green roofs, and provides a list of re-roofing projects identified by Facilities and Real Estate Division of City-owned properties which require further study.

Recommendation for Consideration by the Roundtable:

That the Policy and Finance Committee direct the Executive Director, Technical Services Division, to determine if any of the properties on the attached list can incorporate a green roof or a green roof component within existing budgets, and report back to the Roundtable on the Environment.

(e) Energy and Air Quality Considerations in Procurement Decisions

Briefing Note (September 8, 2005) from Environmental Services, Technical Services Division, providing an update on the extent to which energy efficiency is being taken into consideration in the procurement of goods and services for the City of Toronto.

(f) Preliminary Work Plan Regional Centre for Expertise in Sustainable Development Education

Status Report (September 9, 2005) from Environmental Services, Technical Services Division, providing an update on the preliminary work plan for the United Nations University Regional Centre for Expertise in Sustainable Development Education.

(g) Green Roofs and Green Development Standards

Memorandum (September 9, 2005) from the Manager, Regional Growth, Economy and Environment, Policy and Research, City Planning Division, providing an update on the Green Roofs and Green Development Standards.

Minute 5.6

The Chair advised that the Roundtable had before it a number of reports from City staff on information that had been requested and that there are two recommendations associated with these reports – one related to renewable energy and the other related to the list of green roof sites at the City.

Action:

The Roundtable on the Environment requested the Chair to request the Policy and Finance Committee to:

(1) request City staff to:

- (a) develop a renewable energy action plan with targets and timelines and report back to the Roundtable on the Environment at its first meeting in 2006; and that City staff should work together with the City of Toronto's energy partners such as Toronto Hydro, Enwave, the Toronto and Region Conservation Authority and other organizations as appropriate that the Roundtable on the Environment strongly recommends increased idling enforcement all year with particular attention on smog days;*
- (b) report back to the Roundtable on the Environment on December 12, 2005, in consultation with the Energy Efficiency Office, and reviewing other published materials, on additional changes required and measures existing within the Ontario Building Code, that will assist in the development of proposals regarding the development of a renewable energy plan; and*

- (c) *forward a draft letter to Policy and Finance Committee urging Ontario Power Authority and the Ministry of the Environment to ensure that feed-in-tariffs rules for green power do not exclude City of Toronto projects;*
- (2) *ensure that:*
 - (a) *the City has an adequate complement of renewable planning staff to move green power projects forward; and*
 - (b) *the City's green power strategy includes efforts for all Torontonians to participate in green power purchasing.*

7. Response to request on Green Economic Development

Briefing Note (September 6, 2005) from Economic Development and Culture and Environmental Services, Technical Services Division, providing comments on how to move forward on developing a green economic development strategy and implementation plan as well as a “green auditor” function.

Minute 5.7

Randy McLean, Manager, Economic Research and Business Information, Economic Policy, Economic Development and Culture Division, made a Power Point presentation on how to proceed on a green economic development strategy and implementation plan, as well as a “green auditor” function.

The Roundtable on the Environment appointed John Cartwright as its liaison to the Core Internal Working Group (Briefing Note dated September 6, 2005, Appendix A – Internal Activities, Item 1).

Action:

The Roundtable on the Environment requested the Chair to:

- (1) *forward to the Policy and Finance Committee a copy of the Briefing Note (September 6, 2005) from Economic Development and Culture and Environmental Services, Technical Services Division, providing comments on how to move forward on developing a green economic development strategy and implementation plan as well as a “green auditor” function, subject to:*
 - (a) *amending Appendix A – Internal Activities, Item 2, to read as follows:*

“Commission a study to determine existing strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats to existing and potential new green industries and business sector.”;

and
 - (b) *deleting Appendix A – External Activities, Item 4; and*

- (2) *request the Policy and Finance Committee to endorse the activities outlined in the Briefing Note (September 6, 2005) from Economic Development and Culture and Environmental Services, Technical Services Division, with specific attention and priority being given to, Appendix A – Internal Activities, Items 1 and 2.*

8. Green Doors Open Proposal from the Clean Air Partnership

Communication (August 22, 2005) from Eva Ligeti, Executive Director, The Clean Air Partnership, advising that the Clean Air Partnership (CAP) is a registered charity that works in partnership to promote and coordinate actions to improve local air quality and reduce greenhouse gases for healthy communities.

The Clean Air Partnership's programs focus on energy conservation activities that motivate government, schools, businesses and communities to take action to clean the air. CAP's programs are generously sponsored by numerous private and public funding sources including industry, local utilities, municipal, provincial and federal governments, foundations, community groups and individuals. CAP's founding sponsor and core supporter is the Toronto Atmospheric Fund.

The Clean Air Partnership's programs include the Smog Summit, GTA Clean Air Council, Clean Air and Environment Guide, Cool Schools, Clean Air Online, Fresh Air Fair, 20/20 The Way to Clean Air, Idle-Free Research, Cool Toronto, and One-Tonne Toronto.

Recommendation for Consideration by the Roundtable:

The Roundtable on the Environment recommends that City Council direct the City of Toronto Culture Division, organizers of Doors Open Toronto, to implement a "Green Doors Open" component to the 2006 event.

Action:

The Roundtable on the Environment:

- (1) *received the communication (August 22, 2005) from Eva Ligeti, Executive Director, The Clean Air Partnership, advising that the Clean Air Partnership (CAP) is a registered charity that works in partnership to promote and coordinate actions to improve local air quality and reduce greenhouse gases for healthy communities, with thanks; and*
- (2) *requested the Chair to request the Policy and Finance Committee to request City Council to direct the City of Toronto Culture Division, organizers of Doors Open Toronto, to implement a "Green Doors Open" component to the 2006 event.*

Next Meetings

(a) Special Meeting – Green Roofs Policy

Wednesday, November 23, 2005, 6:00 p.m. to 9:00 p.m., Council Chambers, Toronto City Hall, 100 Queen Street West

(b) Regular Meeting

Monday, December 12, 2005, 6:30 p.m. to 8:30 p.m., Committee Room 1, 2nd Floor, Toronto City Hall, 100 Queen Street West

The meeting adjourned at 8:35 p.m.

Chair