

TORONTO STAFF REPORT

August 21, 2006

To: Employee and Labour Relations Committee
From: City Manager and Executive Director of Human Resources
Subject: Employment Equity Survey

Purpose:

To report on the results of the City's Employment Equity (EE) Workforce Survey conducted between June of 2003 and September of 2005, current employment equity activities and the plan to re-survey the City's workforce.

Financial Implications and Impact Statement:

There are no financial implications arising from this report.

Recommendations:

1. It is recommended that, in order to address the low response rate to the Employment Equity workforce survey, divisions/work units with return rates less than 50% be re-surveyed.

Background:

At its December 14, 15 & 16, 1999 meeting, City Council adopted the action plan from the Task Force Report on Community Access and Equity including:

Recommendation #49 - "The City conducts an employment equity workforce survey measuring the participation of designated group members in the City's workforce"; and

Recommendation #80 - "The City submits annual report to Council including data on its workforce as a whole and by departments regarding representation, occupations, promotions, compensation, training, benefits, exits and developmental opportunities."

In July 2000, Council approved the City's Employment Equity (EE) Policy (see Appendix 1).

At its meeting of May 10, 2006, the Employee and Labour Relations Committee referred the April 10th 2006 report from the Chair of the Working Group on Immigration and Refugee Issues titled "Implementation of the Employment Equity Policy Report" to the City Manager for a report back to the June 19th 2006 meeting of the Employee and Labour Relations Committee. The April 10th report recommended that the City:

- (1) expedite the implementation of the Employment Equity policy;
- (2) complete the existing or implement a new employment equity survey; and
- (3) review and undertake new methods to increase participation of City employees in the survey

Comments:

Employment equity is both a process and a result. The result is fairness in the workplace. Experts recommend that the following five basic steps be followed in the employment equity process to reach this result:

1. Data Collection – A survey of the workforce is conducted that asks employees to self-identify their membership in 4 designated groups: women, persons with disabilities, visible minorities and Aboriginal people. The survey information is integrated with information about the employees' occupations and salaries. The combined information shows the designated group representation and distribution throughout an organization. This information is kept confidential.
2. Data Analysis - The above internal workforce data is then compared with external employment data. The comparison shows whether designated group members are “under-represented” or “over-represented” in any one occupational group. The data analysis identifies areas where employers need to focus their employment equity efforts, depending on where there is under-representation and for which designated group.
3. Employment Systems Review – The analyzed data is then used in the employment systems review. This review looks at all employment policies as well as informal and formal practices, and identifies where any of these may act as barriers to designated groups.
4. Action Planning – Employers then develop a plan to remove barriers and replace them with positive practices. This could include doing outreach to designated group members so that they are more aware of job opportunities offered by the employer. In addition, action plans often include goals for improving representation of specific designated groups. It could also include activities that support opportunities for training and promotion.
5. Monitoring Change – Employers continue to update their data to see whether designated groups are faring better in the workplace. The result may be an ongoing requirement to change employment practices and further accommodate the needs of designated group members in the workplace until the group's representation matches their representation externally.

The City's Employment Equity policy commits the City to following the above five steps. This includes the requirement to conduct voluntary employment equity surveys of the applicant and workforce populations and establish and maintain a confidential employment equity database.

In addition to meeting the commitments in the Task Force on Community Access & Equity Report and the EE policy, the information obtained from a workforce survey would allow the City to demonstrate the progress it has made in ensuring its workforce represents the communities that make up the City as well as set priorities in areas where representation is low.

In the absence of the workforce survey data, the City has in the interim implemented some employment equity initiatives (see Appendix 2). It should be noted, however, that these activities are just a start and that significant progress in employment equity will occur only when the City completes the five steps in the employment equity process starting with the implementation of a successful workforce survey.

Survey Implementation

The Employment Equity Unit developed and led the workforce survey implementation strategy in consultation with senior management, divisional managers and other stakeholders.

The unions were briefed about the City's plan to survey the workforce and were asked to provide feedback. All unions were invited to support the survey and sign the survey introductory memo. Locals IAFF 3888 and CUPE 79 co-signed the memo that went out to employees.

Contacts in each division were identified to co-ordinate the education/information and distribution of the survey. The EE Unit developed a Managers Information Kit and a presentation to assist Human Resources staff and managers in the successful implementation of the workforce survey.

Employees were asked to fill out their name, employee number and work unit and to answer four questions related to their membership in the four designated EE groups: women, visible minority, Aboriginal peoples and persons with disabilities. Participation in the survey was voluntary. A process for new hires was established where new employees were given the survey at the documentation stage and asked to send back the survey.

In order to ensure the City can accurately identify areas where under representation occurs and focus efforts on identifying and removing barriers, a goal of an 80% return rate was adopted. The Canadian Human Rights Commission is the established authority on employment equity and when it audits an organization's employment equity program it considers a return rate of 80% of the surveys to be a reasonable response rate for a workforce survey.

Return Rate

The City had an active workforce of approximately 36,494 employees at the implementation of the survey. "Active employees" are those currently employed by the City who are not on a leave of absence (see Appendix 3 - Table 1). All active employees were approached to participate in the workforce survey. Less than one-third of the active workforce (33.1%) returned the survey (see Appendix 3 - Table 2). This number is considerably lower than the 80% benchmark and makes the interpretation of the data unreliable.

On-going communication along with support and endorsement of the survey by all levels of management are known factors to positively affect the return rate. Divisions where the survey was well-communicated distributed and followed-up had the highest return rates.

Union membership also had an impact on the return rate of the survey. Overall, non-union employees had a higher return rate than those who were union members. Of the three City unions, Local 416 members had the lowest return rate. Divisions with higher concentrations of part-time, shift-work, multiple work locations and seasonal employees had the lowest response rates.

For those employees who participated in the workforce survey, most (86.2%) returned a fully completed form (see Appendix 3 - Table 3).

Plan for Re-Surveying the City's Workforce

It is necessary to re-survey the workforce in order to have reliable data and obtain an accurate picture of the representation of employment equity groups in the City's workforce. This data will

then allow the City to identify areas where representation is low and to establish priorities for improving representation through outreach and the development of special programs. The need to re-survey the workforce was tabled at the Labour Relations Steering Committee both with Local 79 and Local 416. Local 79 confirmed its ongoing support for the workplace survey. Local 416 expressed concerns and agreed to have further discussions with Human Resources staff. Given the evaluation of the factors influencing the low response rate, the following approach is recommended for the re-surveying of the workforce:

1. Continue discussions with Local 416 to hear their concerns.
2. Develop and implement a communications strategy to let employees know about the status of the current survey return rate and the importance of completing the survey.
3. Focus the re-surveying efforts on divisions/work units where the response rates are less than 50%.

Conclusion:

The implementation of the City's Employment Equity Workforce Survey resulted in a low response rate. A higher response rate is required for the City to properly review its employment systems and set priorities for programming that will remove barriers and increase the representation of designated groups. A plan to re-survey is recommended.

Contact:

Alison Anderson
Director, Employment Services
Tel: (416) 392-5028
Fax: (416) 392-3920
Email: aanderso@toronto.ca

Jo-Anne Barnard
Senior HR Consultant, Employment Equity Unit
Tel: (416) 392-9597
Fax: (416) 392-4686
Email: jbarnar@toronto.ca

Shirley Hoy
City Manager

Brigitte Hohn
Executive Director, Human Resources

List of Attachments:

Appendix 1 – Employment Equity Policy

Appendix 2 – List of Employment Equity Activities

Appendix 3:

Table 1: Number of Employees by City Offices and Service Areas (3rd Quarter, 2005)

Table 2: Return Rate Distribution by City Offices and Service Areas

Table 3: Survey Completion Rate and Type of Survey Form Returned by
City Offices and Service Areas

APPENDIX 1

<p>Human Resources Policies Employment Equity Policy</p> <p>Category: Human Rights and Employment Equity</p>	
---	---

Policy Statement

The City of Toronto is committed to a policy of fairness and full equity in employment and services in recognition of its obligations and responsibilities as an employer and of its leadership role in the community.

The citizens of Toronto are best served by a public service which reflects the diversity of the community which it serves. This will be achieved through employment equity programs that remove barriers and monitor outcomes rather than by establishing requirements to precisely reflect the percentage of designated groups in the community.

The City of Toronto will:

- i. hire and promote on the basis of merit and potential;
- ii. compensate fairly according to the value of the work performed;
- iii. set objectives for equitable representation;
- iv. develop a proactive equity plan which will include special programs to support the objectives;
- v. and mechanisms for measuring and monitoring outcomes and results;
- vi. publicly report results through an Annual Report; and
- vii. create a climate of understanding and mutual respect for the dignity of each individual.

Full equality will be achieved through the combined efforts of the City of Toronto, its employees, employee associations, its unions, and the community. Specifically, the City of Toronto will:

1. provide equality of opportunity to all individuals, and identify and remove artificial and systemic barriers to full employment with respect to an employees' or potential employees' race, ancestry, place of origin, colour, ethnic origin, citizenship, creed, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, age, record of offences, marital status, family status, disability and level of literacy;
2. commit to principles of potential and merit as key criteria for hiring and promotion; will make the best use of the talents of all available workers regardless of their gender, sexual orientation, disability, racial status or Aboriginal status;
3. ensure equitable compensation practices consistent with pay equity requirements;
4. work with its employees, its unions, its employee associations and community organisations, representing women, racial minority people, people with disabilities, Aboriginal people and other groups, in the development of strategies and special initiatives to promote equity in the workplace;
5. implement special programs and accommodation as required to

assist specific groups of workers to overcome discrimination, and the barriers of systemic discrimination;

6. promote the development of proactive strategies by establishing qualitative and quantitative objectives specific to equity principles. Progress on the achievement of results will be measured and reported to Council and the public;
7. undertake to educate and inform its employees on equity principles;
8. undertake public education programs regarding the City's commitment to equity principles; and
9. support Council Committees committed to addressing equity issues.

Application

This policy covers all employees and prospective employees of the City of Toronto. This policy takes into account issues regarding protection of privacy and freedom of information.

Program Components

The City of Toronto's Employment Equity Program will consist primarily of the following components:

- i. communication about equity principles, practices and programs;
- ii. policy review and development on equity issues (work and family life initiatives which highlight corporate policies and departmental practices);
- iii. consultation, input and support to the collective bargaining process;
- iv. advice and support to departments on the development and implementation of special programs (training programs for women interested in pursuing a career in non-traditional work, contracts/purchasing); initiatives (support groups); equity reports (departmental equity plans); reviews (employment systems reviews); barrier removal (accommodation measures); supportive measures (retention, retraining, deployment); and positive measures (outreach);
- v. for the purpose of identifying barriers and improving process, monitor, provide input and make recommendations on the recruitment, selection, promotional and appointment processes and outcomes when required;
- vi. support and advice to established equity committees and task forces on equity-related issues and subjects;
- vii. input on staff development and training programs; and
- viii. exchange of information via networks at other municipal, provincial and federal levels and with community agencies.

Information Requirements

To support the implementation of the employment equity policy and specific program components, the City will engage in the following activities:

- i. conduct voluntary employment equity surveys (applicants and workforce); and
- ii. re-establish and maintain confidential employment equity databases in which:

Equity-related information regarding designated group status is maintained in a confidential

database.

Use is restricted solely to staff who are authorised to engage in activities specifically related to the City's achievement of equity in employment and services. Applicant data are kept separate from employee data.

Employee and applicant data on designated group status are used for monitoring participation rates, measuring and identifying outcomes, identifying outreach priorities and for responding to Ontario Human Rights Commission complaints.

Data are compiled through a voluntary survey conducted with employees and verified periodically for accuracy and changes, particularly with respect to disability status.

Approved by

City Council

Date Approved

July 4, 2000

Related Information



APPENDIX 2

LIST OF EMPLOYMENT EQUITY INITIATIVES

- On an on-going basis, Employment Equity staff and hiring divisions do outreach to community groups concerning employment opportunities at the City. This includes sending job postings to agencies that serve the employment needs of equity seeking groups, making presentations to clients of these agencies about how to apply to City employment and inviting agencies to attend meetings of the staffing community and make presentations.
- The development/approval process for human resources policies, guidelines and programs includes a review by Employment Equity and Human Rights Office staff. Staffing policies and procedures such as the hiring guide, setting qualifications, screening candidates or conducting interviews all include references to employment equity and human rights.
- Training on the City's Human Rights and Employment Equity policies is delivered on an on-going basis to employees and managers and is reinforced in the staffing training provided to managers.
- City job postings indicate the City's commitment to employment equity and encourage applications from women, Aboriginal persons, persons with disabilities and members of visible minority groups.
- Development and implementation of an Employment Accommodation policy and guidelines. When applicants are invited to participate in the staffing process (e.g., test or interview), they are made aware that the City will accommodate individuals who have special needs and that they should make their needs known. In addition, at the job offer stage, successful candidates are informed of the City's commitment to accommodating employees in the workplace and that they should make their needs known.
- Two successful year's of the Profession to Profession Mentoring Immigrants Program. The program matches internationally trained professionals who are new to Canada and looking for employment with City mentors in the same professions who provide advice and guidance. In 2004 and 2005 a total of 71 internationally trained professionals were matched with City mentors.
- The City participates in the Career Bridge, an internship program to provide internationally trained newcomers with work experience in Canada, since its inception. From 2004-2005, the City hired 15 interns and 4 have been hired into more permanent positions in the City workforce.
- In the Labour Force Readiness Plan, HR has agreed to develop a Bridging to Employment Strategy. Draft guidelines for volunteer and unpaid work placements have been developed.
- The Toronto Public Service Initiative 18 month work plan includes initiatives to increase attention to access and equity issues.

APPENDIX 3

Table 1: - Number of Employees By City Offices and Service Areas

City Offices	Total (#)	Active		Non-Active	
		(#)	(%)	(#)	(%)
City Manager's Office – Shirley Hoy	1,046	986	94.3	60	5.7
Citizen Focused Services – Sue Corke	24,488	23,459	95.8	1,029	4.2
Citizen Focused Services – Fareed Amin	9,766	9,399	96.2	367	3.8
Internal Services – Joe Pennachetti	2,507	2,361	94.2	146	5.8
Auditor General's Office	26	25	96.2	1	3.8
City Council	256	250	97.7	6	2.3
Mayor's Office	14	14	100.0	0	0.0
Total – City of Toronto	38,103	36,494	95.8	1,609	4.2

Table 2: - Return Rate Distribution by City Offices and Service Areas

City Offices	Total Active	Survey Returned		Survey Not Returned	
		(#)	(%)	(#)	(%)
City Manager's Office – Shirley Hoy	986	555	56.3	431	43.7
Citizen Focused Services – Sue Corke	23,459	5,198	22.2	18,261	77.8
Citizen Focused Services – Fareed Amin	9,399	5,208	55.4	4,191	44.6
Internal Services – Joe Pennachetti	2,361	1,017	43.1	1,344	56.9
Auditor General's Office (AGO)	25	15	60.0	10	40.0
City Council (Council)	250	75	30.0	175	70.0
Mayor's Office (MO)	14	14	100.0	0	0.0
Total – City of Toronto	36,494	12,082	33.1	24,412	66.9

Table 3:- Survey Completion Rate and Type of Survey Returned by City Offices and Service Areas

City Offices	Participated	Status of Survey						Type of Survey			
		Completed		Partially Completed**		Empty***		Electronically		Paper & Pencil	
		(#)	(%)	(#)	(%)	(#)	(%)	(#)	(%)	(#)	(%)
SH	555	503	90.6	46	8.3	6	0.1	493	88.8	62	11.2
SC	5,198	4,627	89.0	401	7.7	170	3.3	2,227	42.8	2,971	57.2
FA	5,208	4,252	81.6	422	8.1	534	10.3	877	16.8	4,331	83.2
JP	1,017	937	92.1	64	6.3	16	1.6	832	81.8	185	18.2
Auditor	15	14	93.3	1	6.7	0	0.0	14	93.3	1	6.7
Council	75	68	90.7	7	9.3	0	0.0	4	5.3	71	94.7
Mayor	14	13	92.9	1	7.1	0	0.0	0	0.0	14	100.0
Total	12,082	10,414	86.2	942	7.8	726	6.0	4,447	36.8	7,635	63.2

* SH – Shirley Hoy; SC – Sue Corke; FA – Fareed Amin; JP – Joe Pennachetti.

** Identified employees who answered some of the questions in the survey.

*** Identified employees who did not answer any of the questions in the survey.