# **TORONTO** STAFF REPORT

May 8, 2006

To:	Toronto Preservation Board Toronto and East York Community Council
From:	Director, Policy & Research, City Planning Division
Subject:	70 The Esplanade (Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishing Works Factory) and 6 Church Street (Greey's Factory Building) – Intention to Designate under Part IV of the <i>Ontario Heritage Act</i> , Approval of Alterations to a Heritage Building, and Authority to Enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement Ward 28, Toronto Centre-Rosedale

# Purpose:

This report recommends that Council state its intention to designate the property at 70 The Esplanade (Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishing Works Factory) and at 6 Church Street (Greey's Factory Building) under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, that the proposed alterations be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the recommendations of this report, and that authority be granted to enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement.

# Financial Implications and Impact Statement:

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report. The cost of publishing the notice of intention to designate in the daily newspaper is included in the approved 2006 Policy and Research budget.

# Recommendations:

It is recommended that:

- (1) City Council state its intention to designate the property at 70 The Esplanade (Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishing Works Factory) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*;
- (2) City Council state its intention to designate the property at 6 Church Street (Greey's Factory Building) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*;

- (3) if there are no objections to the designation in accordance with Section 29(6) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the solicitor be authorized to introduce the Bills in Council designating the properties under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*;
- (4) if there are any objections in accordance with Section 29(7) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the Clerk be directed to refer the proposed designation to the Conservation Review Board;
- (5) subject to Council adoption of a settlement report from the Chief Planner and Executive Director pertaining to Application No. 05 105693 STE 28 OZ for Official Plan and Zoning By-law Amendments, the alterations to the heritage buildings at 70 The Esplanade and at 6 Church Street be approved substantially in accordance with the plans and drawings prepared by Young and Wright Architects date stamped received by Heritage Preservation Services on April 6, 2006, and on file with the Manager of Heritage Preservation Services, subject to the following:
  - (a) that prior to the introduction of Bills in Council:
    - (i) the Owner enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement satisfactory to the City Solicitor and the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services or her designate under Section 37 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* with the City to provide for the permanent protection of each of the heritage buildings at 70 The Esplanade and 6 Church Street, and register such agreements as a first charge on title to the satisfaction of the City Solicitor;
    - (ii) the Owner retain an archaeologist, licensed by the Ministry of Culture under the provisions of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (R.S.O 1990 as amended), to monitor the site during the demolition and excavation phases of construction, and mitigate through preservation and resource removal and documentation, adverse impacts to any significant archaeological resources found;
    - (iii) City Council state its intention to designate the property at 70 The Esplanade and at 6 Church Street under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*;
  - (b) that prior to final site plan approval:
    - (i) the Owner provide final plans for the exterior design and detailing of the Front Street façade of the proposed development to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services or her designate;
    - (ii) the Owner provide a Conservation Plan to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services or her designate, prepared by a qualified heritage architect for the retention in situ of the heritage building at 70 The Esplanade, and of the Church Street façade of 6 Church Street including the portions of the north and south façade of 6 Church Street identified in

the Reasons for Designation set forth below, the Conservation Plan to also include:

- a. a bracing and foundations strategy for the 6 Church Street façade to be retained in situ;
- b. specifications for masonry repair/reconstruction, windows, doors, and parapet reconstruction of the heritage buildings;
- c. a detailed Landscape Plan;
- d. an Exterior Lighting and Signage Plan for The Esplanade, Church and Front Street facades;
- (c) that the condition set out in recommendation 5(b)(ii) above, may be varied by the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services or her designate to permit the dismantling and reconstruction of the entire Church Street façade at 6 Church Street only if the applicant can demonstrate to the satisfaction of the Manager of Heritage Preservation Services that:
  - (i) a bracing structure cannot be constructed which would hold the façade in situ and permit the construction of a stable foundation under the retained façade; or
  - (ii) Phase 2 construction access to the site necessitates dismantling of the façade; or
  - (iii) the condition of the masonry on the Church Street façade necessitates the reconstruction of the façade with reclaimed brick;
- (d) that in the event the Church Street façade is to be dismantled and reconstructed in accordance with recommendation 5(c) above, a documentation, storage and reconstruction strategy is first provided to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services or her designate in advance of any permit for the dismantling of the building at 6 Church Street;
- (e) that prior to the issuance of any building permit, including a permit for the demolition, excavation, and/or shoring on the subject property:
  - (i) the City's Planning Division and the Ministry of Culture confirm in writing that all archaeological licensing and technical review requirements have been satisfied;
- (6) authority be granted by City Council for the execution of a Heritage Easement Agreement under Section 37 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* with the owner of 70 The Esplanade (Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishing Works Factory) and 6 Church Street (Greey's Factory

Building), using substantially the form of easement agreement prepared in February 1987 by the City Solicitor and on file with the City Clerk, subject to such amendments as may be deemed necessary by the City Solicitor in consultation with the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning Division;

- (7) in accordance with the provisions of the Heritage Easement Agreement, the owner provide a letter of credit for each of the two phases of development, to provide for the protection of the heritage buildings during any demolition activity elsewhere on the site and construction, and to secure all work included in the Conservation Plan referred to in Recommendation 5(b)(ii) above, in a form and an amount satisfactory to the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning Division;
- (8) in accordance with the provisions of the Heritage Easement Agreement, the owner provide a record of the as-found condition of 70 The Esplanade and 6 Church Street; and
- (9) the appropriate City Officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

## Background:

Concert Properties, on behalf of Greey Realty Holdings Limited, proposes to redevelop the lands on Church Street, between Front Street East and The Esplanade for residential, retail and commercial uses and associated below grade parking. The site is an irregularly shaped parcel of land which extends along Church Street the full length of the block between Front Street East and The Esplanade. The proposal (Five Corners Development), involves two heritage buildings: the retention and restoration of the two principle street facades of 70 The Esplanade; and the reconstruction of the Church Street façade of 6 Church Street (Attachment No.1). The proposal also involves the demolition and replacement of 12 and 16 Church Street and 51-63 Front Street East. The Gooderham "Flatiron" Building (1892) is immediately across the street from the development site on the north side of Front Street.

The properties affected by this proposed development were originally assembled as the main factory for Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishing Works. The factory was an important manufacturing enterprise for the City of Toronto. The original section and main portion of Greey's factory complex, dating to 1882 (with a fourth-floor addition by 1903), is located at 70 The Esplanade. Greey's Factory Building at 6 Church Street is contextually significant in association with 70 The Esplanade and is separated by service lane (Attachment No.2).

## Comments:

The proposal has undergone three formal revisions since the original application for an Official Plan and Zoning By-law Amendment on January 31, 2005. The owner appealed both applications to the OMB on November 4, 2005. Staff has continued to review and discuss alternatives with the applicant with the objective of achieving a supportable proposal.

The current proposal is for development in two phases (Attachment Nos.5-9). The first phase is for an eleven-storey mixed-use building facing Church and Front Streets. Phase 2 is for an 8-storey mixed-use building facing Church Street and The Esplanade. Both buildings are proposed to be stepped back from the street, from level six on Front Street (the fifth storey above Front Street grade), and from level five on The Esplanade. Compared to the previous submissions which proposed a single tower from 16 to 22 storeys in height, this proposal is viewed by City Planning staff to generally be more sympathetic to the physical character of the area.

The development proposes 192 residential units with grade-related retail space. At street level, the elevations are punctuated with building entrances in keeping with the laneway pattern characteristic of the neighbourhood. Along Church Street, there are two proposed residential entrance lobbies: the south to follow the footprint of the existing service lane between 70 The Esplanade and 6 Church Street; and the north to be set back from the street and include a water feature to interpret the original Toronto shoreline. A carriage way entrance to be located directly north of 6 Church Street provides the future opportunity to connect with Scott Lane. An exterior walk leading to a secondary entrance is proposed on Front Street adjacent to the neighbouring building to the west, leading to a landscaped setback.

Generally, the development is intended to provide new buildings that draw from the neighbourhood's architectural character and massing.

#### Heritage Conservation Strategy

A Heritage Impact Statement for the Five Corners Development was prepared by ERA Architects Inc. (April 10, 2006). The conservation strategy proposed within this document for each of the two heritage buildings is discussed below.

#### 70 The Esplanade

The Heritage Impact Statement indicates the existing structure at 70 The Esplanade has been significantly modified and has suffered fire damage. There is evidence of structural cracking on the street facades. The bricks have been sandblasted, the brick foundation has been parged and painted, and the original windows have been replaced. Many of the ground floor windows have been further modified for an enlarged window opening or a new entrance.

The Heritage Impact Statement indicates that the structure cannot support additional floor loads in accordance with the proposed development. As such, it is proposed by the heritage architect that only the two street façades of 70 The Esplanade be retained to maintain the character of the street. It is the opinion of staff that sufficient evidence has not been presented for the need to remove all but the street facades of the heritage structure. Specifically, engineering investigations have not been undertaken to consider other means of supporting the new loads. Given the current condition of the building which is presently fully tenanted, and the absence of any proposed parking under the structure, staff is recommending the whole of the structure at 70 The Esplanade be retained in place.

#### 6 Church Street

The Heritage Impact Statement indicates the structural analysis of the foundation at 6 Church Street shows the building is slowly sinking. This is because the foundations are resting on wood planks that are sitting on early lake fill material. The building has also been heavily sandblasted, the windows have been modified and /or replaced and the turriculated roof parapet has been modified.

The conservation strategy for 6 Church Street proposes to rebuild the street façade and the north and south elevation returns (to a depth of one bay). In an addendum to the Heritage Impact Statement (May 3, 2006), the heritage architect indicates this will be done with reclaimed brick to match the existing appearance, brick patterning, size and colour.

The Heritage Impact Statement indicates that the condition of the wood pier foundations may make it necessary to rebuild rather that retain the facade in place. The heritage architect has also indicated concern regarding the condition of the masonry as well as potential need to remove the façade to facilitate site access in the second phase of construction.

The engineering report prepared by Jablonsky, Ast and Partners dated April 6, 2006 and submitted as part of the Heritage Impact Statement recommends "that a more detailed, duediligence structural survey be undertaken, including the testing of brick units, mortar and wood elements, in order to better evaluate what components need remedial work and the costing of same". As this more detailed study has not been undertaken, staff is recommending the heritage façade at 6 Church Street be retained in situ unless evidence can be provided to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services or her designate, that a stable foundation cannot be constructed under the façade, that Phase 2 construction access requires the dismantling of the façade, and/or that the masonry cannot be restored allowing the façade to remain intact.

Statement of Reasons for Designation

Staff is requiring as a condition of approval, that the properties at 70 The Esplanade and at 6 Church Street be designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

The Statement of Reasons for Designation is intended for publication according to the provisions of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The Reasons for Designation are attached (Attachment No.3, 4) and include a statement of cultural heritage value and description of the heritage attributes of each property. The complete Reasons for Designation will be served on the property owner and the Ontario Heritage Trust and included in the designating by-law.

The properties at 70 The Esplanade and 6 Church Street are recommended for designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* for their cultural heritage value or interest. Begun in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century and completed in the early 1900s for Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishing Works, the two buildings have design and contextual value as representative and well-crafted examples of industrial architecture that support the character of the St. Lawrence neighbourhood.

The Reasons for Designation, including a description of the heritage attributes of the properties, are available for viewing from the City Clerk's Department or from Heritage Preservation Services, Policy and Research, City Planning Division, City of Toronto.

## Conclusions:

It is recommended that City Council state its intention to designate the properties at 70 The Esplanade (Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishing Works Factory) and 6 Church Street (Greey's Factory Building) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage* Act, approve the proposed alterations in accordance with the recommendations contained in this report, and grant authority to enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement for each of the two heritage properties.

## Contact:

Sherry Pedersen Preservation Co-ordinator, Heritage Preservation Services Tel: 416-338-1089 Fax: 416-392-1973 E-mail: <u>speders@toronto.ca</u>

Barbara Leonhardt Director, Policy and Research

## List of Attachments:

Attachment No. 1 Location Map (70 The Esplanade and 6 Church Street)
Attachment No. 2 Photographs (70 The Esplanade and 6 Church Street)
Attachment No. 3 Reasons for Designation (70 The Esplanade)
Attachment No. 4 Reasons for Designation (6 Church Street)
Attachment No. 5 Proposed Development (Site Plan)
Attachment No. 6 Proposed Development (Ground Floor Plan)
Attachment No. 7 Proposed Development (North and South Elevation)
Attachment No. 8 Proposed Development (West Elevation)
Attachment No. 9 Proposed Development (East Elevation)





70 The Esplanade (left) & 6 Church Street (right)

#### REASONS FOR DESIGNATION

## 70 The Esplanade: Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishings Works Factory

#### Description

The property at 70 The Esplanade is worthy of designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage* Act for its cultural heritage value or interest, and meets the criteria for municipal designation prescribed by the Province of Ontario under the categories of design or physical value and contextual value. Located on the northwest corner of The Esplanade and Church Street, the building was first recorded in the city directories in 1882 as the main factory for Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishing Works. The building was expanded twice, with the west portion added by 1890 and the fourth floor in 1903. The property was listed on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties in 2004.

#### Cultural Heritage Value

The cultural heritage value of Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishing Works Factory is related to its design or physical value as a representative example of an industrial building from the late 19<sup>th</sup> century (with later additions) that demonstrates a high degree of craftsmanship. In height, scale and attention to detailing, the Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishings Works Factory complements the adjoining Greey's Factory Building (1903) at 6 Church Street.

The cultural heritage value of Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishing Works Factory also relates to its contextual value as it defines, maintains and supports the character of the St. Lawrence Neighbourhood as it developed as a commercial and manufacturing district south of Front Street West. With the neighbouring Greey's Factory Building, Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishings Works Factory anchors the northwest corner of The Esplanade and Church Street where the late 19<sup>th</sup> century warehouses at 15 Church Street, opposite, are designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

## Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes of the Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishing Works Factory related to its cultural heritage value as a representative example of a late 19<sup>th</sup> century industrial building (with later additions) that demonstrates a high degree of craftsmanship are found on the exterior walls and roof, with particular attention to the south and east elevations (facing The Esplanade and Church Street, respectively) and the roof detailing, consisting of:

- The red brick cladding with red and contrasting yellow brick trim
- The corbelled brickwork along the edges of the flat roof
- The organization of the four-storey east and south elevations, where brick pilasters divide the bays; the door and window openings in the first storey (the openings have been altered, and the five original window openings on the south wall have been covered); and, in the upper stories, the pairs of segmental-arched window openings with brick voussoirs, with contrasting yellow brick applied to those in the second and third floors

• Portions of the north elevation and all of the rear (west) wall are covered by the adjoining buildings

#### REASONS FOR DESIGNATION

ATTACHMENT NO. 4

#### 6 Church Street: Greey's Factory Building

#### **Description**

The property at 6 Church Street is worthy of designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage* Act for its cultural heritage value or interest, and meets the criteria for municipal designation prescribed by the Province of Ontario under the categories of design or physical value and contextual value. Located on the west side of Church Street, north of The Esplanade, the building was in place by 1903 as part of Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishings Works (with the main factory complex located directly south at 70 The Esplanade). The property was listed on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties in 2005.

#### Cultural Heritage Value

The cultural heritage value of Greey's Factory Building is related to its design or physical value as a representative example of an industrial building from the turn of the 20<sup>th</sup> century that demonstrates a high degree of craftsmanship. In height, scale and attention to detailing, the Greey's Factory Building complements the adjoining Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishings Works Factory at 70 The Esplanade.

The cultural heritage value of Greey's Factory Building also relates to its contextual value as it defines, maintains and supports the character of the St. Lawrence Neighbourhood as it developed as a commercial and manufacturing district south of Front Street West. With the neighbouring Greey's Toronto Mill Furnishings Works Factory, Greey's Factory Building anchors the northwest corner of The Esplanade and Church Street where the late 19<sup>th</sup> century warehouses at 15 Church Street, opposite, are designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

#### Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes of the Greey's Factory Building related to its cultural heritage value as a representative example of an industrial building from the turn of the 20<sup>th</sup> century that demonstrates a high degree of craftsmanship are found on the principal (east) façade, the first (east) bay on the north and south walls as described below, and the roof above the latter features, consisting of:

- The red brick cladding with brick and precast stone trim
- The detailing along the edges of the flat roof, where a parapet with corbelled brickwork extends across the east and north elevations, with brick corbelling along the portion of the south wall that is included in the Reasons for Designation
- The organization and detailing of the east façade, which is organized into three bays by brick piers; the main entrance with a wood entablature, which is placed in the left (south) bay beside segmental-arched window openings; and, the pairs of segmental-arched window openings in the upper stories

• The portions of the north and south elevations included in the Reasons for Designation, specifically the first bay on each wall that extends west from the east façade to the first brick pier, and the segmental-arched window openings within each bay





ATTACHMENT NO. 6



#### ATTACHMENT NO. 7



#### ATTACHMENT NO. 8

、



#### ATTACHMENT NO. 9