

# TORONTO STAFF REPORT

---

May 23, 2006

To: City Council

From: William A. Stewart, Fire Chief and General Manager

Subject: Supplementary Public Version of In Camera Staff Report City Of Toronto Fire Services' Stolen Pumper on March 20, 2006 submitted to Community Services Committee May 8, 2006

Purpose:

The purpose of this report is to provide information on the investigation of the stolen pumper, damages, insurance claims and Toronto Fire Services' policies concerning unattended Apparatus/Vehicles and the confirmed cost of the repair.

Financial Implications and Impact Statement:

There is no immediate financial impact for Fire Services because the damages are insured under the City's Automobile Insurance Policy and no deductible amount applies to the insured program/division that sustained the loss. The City self-insures the financial impact of insurable automobile physical damage. The amounts that are qualified to be paid from the Insurance Reserve Fund are based on the terms and conditions of a Standard Ontario Automobile Insurance Policy.

The estimated amount suggested to cover only the visible exterior repairs as known at the time of the Community Services Committee May 8, 2006 was, \$25,000.00. At that time it was noted that given the loss details it was possible the unit had sustained mechanical damage. A tear down of the unit would be required and a further appraisal inspection for mechanical damages would take place. The unit sustained exterior body and under carriage damage due to loss.

Once Dependable made the unit available for the mechanical inspection RMES attended and inspected the unit. The additional repairs were mechanical repairs and accident related. Due to how the unit was driven during the theft the unit sustained under body damage both mechanical and body.

The specific cost of the repairs to the vehicle as determined by the same Appraiser selected by the City's insurance adjusters who quoted \$25,000.00 has confirmed as of May 23, 2006, a final price of \$40,798.63 inclusive of GST (the repairs are PST exempt). In order to resolve this

situation efficiently, additional repairs, previously scheduled, will also be performed while the unit is out of service. This will be in a separate work order and billed outside of the accident. Funding in the amount of \$3,631.42, inclusive of GST, is available in the approved 2006 Operating Budget of Fire Services in account FR0025 (Mechanical Maintenance-Vehicle Maintenance, Cost Element 2120). The completed work is found in Attachment three and four.

The actual cash (depreciated) replacement value of this vehicle as provided by the City's insurance appraiser has been stated to be \$200,000.00 to \$260,000.00. The comparable new cost of a vehicle of this type is estimated to be \$430,000.00.

The Deputy City Manager/Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and concurs with the financial impact statement.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that this report be received for information.

Background:

Councillor Pitfield requested a report to the Community Services Committee on the results of the investigation of the fire pumper stolen from a Home Depot store, damages, insurance claims, and discipline of the fire fighters involved.

The Community Services Committee at the May 8, 2006 meeting requested the Fire Chief and General Manager, in consultation with the City Solicitor, to sever the confidential portions of the confidential report (April 21, 2006) from the Fire Chief and General Manager respecting the City of Toronto Fire Services' Stolen Pumper on March 20, 2006, and provide City Council with a public version of the report. It was also requested that the Fire Chief and General Manager report to the next meeting of the Community Services Committee on June 8, 2006, on the status of the insurance claim with McLarens Canada and with respect to the repairs to Pumper 141, in particular:

- is there structural damage to the pumper;
- the cost of repairs;
- the length of time to repair Pumper 141; and
- why it has taken so long for the insurance adjuster to report on this vehicle.

Since the date of the May 8, 2006 meeting, Toronto Fire Services has confirmed the damage and cost from the independent Appraiser.

Comments:

On March 20, 2006, Pumper 141 was stolen from a Home Depot store on Steeles Avenue while the four members of the crew were in the store. The pumper was driven by the individual who proceeded on Highway 27 to the Kirby Side Road in York Region and was arrested by York Regional Police. The fact that the crew left the pumper unattended is unacceptable and contrary to procedures as stipulated in Toronto Fire Services' Standard Operating Guidelines.

The guideline, dated September 16, 1999, states, "All Toronto Fire Services' personnel assigned to drive are responsible for the security of the vehicle". It states further that, "Company Officers are responsible for ensuring this guideline is followed and that vehicles are not left insecure". It is clearly outlined that when vehicles are not equipped with mechanisms for locking cabinets or doors, the driver of the apparatus is responsible to stay with the vehicle unless otherwise instructed by the Company Officer. If the Company Officer gives such instruction, the Company Officer assumes responsibility for the vehicle. The Standard Operating Guidelines: Securing and Locking Vehicles, and Parked or Unattended Vehicles, are attached for reference. While the action of the crew leaving pumper 141 unattended is an anomaly, a Fire Chief's Advisory was issued to all personnel to reinforce and strengthen the current policy stating there will be no personal shopping for any reason.

After consultation with the Office of the City Solicitor, it was determined that as a result of the City's privacy obligations under the *Municipal Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*, issues related to the disciplinary action were the subject of an in camera report provided to Community Services Committee and that is now before Council. The issue of when disciplinary action is made public generally is the subject of a public report from the City Solicitor that is also before Council. Toronto Fire Services investigated the incident expeditiously and was decisive in implementing the appropriate discipline.

Damage to the pumper:

While the 1997 American LaFrance pumper received damage, there was not any compromise or damage to the structure of the fire pump. On the left and right side of the pumper there were scratches to the body paint as well as the roll-up doors and damage to the lower body rub rail. Further, the right side mirror was destroyed, one emergency light, the tread plate on the right side pump panel and the rear tailboard was bent. Because of the sporadic damage on the sides of the truck and the difficulty to determine where to start and stop with the painting, the entire truck will be painted.

Specifics on review of structural damage, costs of repairs, and length of time for the repair of the pumper and quote from Appraiser:

While there was no “structural” damage to the Pumper it was necessary to replace such components as the tires, that hit speed bumps at a high speed, front springs and spring shackles, and some steering column components. These components were at a reasonable level of maximum use and required replacement to ensure the integrity and safety of the vehicle in the future.

Required estimates for the cost of repairs could only be determined after all of the major components on the fire pumper had been disassembled for inspection. Along with parts, the appraisal includes the amount of labour that will be involved to repair the pumper. In reviewing the list of necessary repairs, parts required and the labour hours, a time frame of 60 to 70 days is reasonable to repair the fire fighting pumper. Dependable has stated the pumper will be available for service by May 26, 2006.

The repairs, made necessary by the accident, exacerbated the expected wear and tear on a nine year old truck that had also deteriorated due to corrosion. It was determined by the Appraiser that the entire body of the truck had to be repaired and painted to allow equipment and fixtures to be reattached to the body of the pumper. The Adjuster’s review has been complex and has proceeded in a timely manner considering the time required to tear down the unit to inspect for mechanical damage, part orders and availability. Additionally, 175 hours were required for body and mechanical work plus 215 hours for painting. The details concerning the work are found in Attachment 3.

In addition to the repairs caused by the incident, TFS had other previously scheduled work performed while the unit is out of service in a separate work order and billed outside of the accident costs. To meet the full requirements for using fire fighting foam the truck required a repair to the foam system that involved installation of additional piping and a valve to introduce hydrant pressure directly to the tank. This required modifications to the truck body, plumbing, and the pump panel. Further, to eliminate the need to remove all of the tires after the pumper was repaired, TFS authorized Dependable to perform the annual PMCV inspection on the truck at this time. Both of these repairs are being billed outside of the accident costs for a total of \$3,631.42, inclusive of GST. Attachment 4 provides the details concerning the work.

**Insurance Claim:**

McLarens Canada, the City's insurance adjusters, have assigned RMES Appraisals Services, to prepare an appraisal of the damages and repairs. The vehicle is presently at "Dependable Truck and Trailer" in Brampton, and undergoing a mechanical inspection. RMES Appraisals Services has advised that there is potential for extensive undercarriage damages, which are being inspected thoroughly prior to commencing repairs. The final estimate to cover the repairs as determined by the Appraiser is \$40,798.63 inclusive of GST, as compared to the earlier estimate

for only the exterior visible damage of \$25,000.00 quoted in the April 21, 2006 report to Council. The actual cash value of this vehicle has been stated to be \$200,000.00 to \$260,000.00.

The report has been developed in consultation with the Office of the City Solicitor. The Comments regarding the Damage to the Pumper and the Insurance Claim have been prepared in consultation with Insurance and Risk Management.

Conclusions:

Toronto Fire Services has taken decisive action with the crew who left the pumper unattended. A Fire Chief's Advisory was issued to all personnel to reinforce and strengthen the current policy stating there will be no personal shopping for any reason.

The Standard Operating Guidelines are being developed and will be reinforced and strengthened to prevent future occurrences.

Contact:

Jim Stoops, Executive Officer  
Toronto Fire Services  
Phone: 338-9550, Fax: 338-9060  
E-mail: jstoops@toronto.ca

---

William A. Stewart  
Fire Chief and General Manager

Attachments:

1. The Standard Operating Guideline: Securing and Locking Vehicles
2. The Standard Operating Guideline: Parked or Unattended Vehicles
3. Details on Repairs and Cost of Repairs
4. Work Completed Outside of the Repair Caused by the Incident

Attachment 1: Securing and Locking Vehicles



Date: 1999 September 16

---

## Standard Operating Guideline

**From:** Fire Chief **File as:** A-SECU  
**Effective Date:** Immediate **Rescinds:**  
**Subject:** Securing and Locking Vehicles  
**Attachments:** None  
**Related SOG/P:** A-PARK — *Parked or Unattended Apparatus/Vehicles*

**Purpose:** To provide all Toronto Fire Services personnel with a guideline regarding the security of Toronto Fire Services apparatus and other vehicles.

**Responsibility:** All Toronto Fire Services personnel assigned to drive are responsible for the security of the vehicle.

Company Officers are responsible for ensuring this guideline is followed and that vehicles are not left insecure.

**Guideline: 1.0 Locking Vehicles**

- 1.01 Drivers are responsible for ensuring that vehicles are locked and secured when left unattended and at a location other than a fire station.
- 1.02 When vehicles are not equipped with mechanisms for locking cabinets or doors, the driver of the apparatus is responsible to stay with the vehicle unless otherwise instructed by the Company Officer. With such instruction, the Company Officer assumes responsibility for the vehicle.
- 1.03 When on Toronto Fire Services arranged tours of buildings or facilities, apparatus should be parked in close proximity to one another in order to maximize the use of a T. F. S. member for the protection of more than one vehicle.
- 1.04 Upon return to a vehicle that has been left unattended, a quick check should be made to determine that the vehicle has not been tampered with or vandalized.
- 1.05 Keys for locked vehicles shall be the responsibility of the driver.

It is recognized that this guideline may not address all circumstances. Conditions may exist that shall require reasonable discretion on the part of the Officer In Charge. Decisions should always take into consideration the safety of the public and Toronto Fire Services personnel.

Attachment 2: Parked or Unattended Vehicles



Date: 1999 September 16

---

## Standard Operating Guideline

**From:** Fire Chief **File as:** A-PARK  
**Effective Date:** Immediate **Rescinds:**  
**Subject:** Parked or Unattended Vehicles  
**Attachments:** None  
**Related SOG/P:** A-SECU — *Securing and Locking Vehicles*

**Purpose:** To provide all Toronto Fire Services personnel a guideline for leaving apparatus and other Toronto Fire Services vehicles parked or unattended.

**Responsibility:** All Toronto Fire Services personnel assigned to drive are responsible for the state and security of the apparatus and shall immediately inform the Company Officer should the apparatus be compromised in any way.

Company Officers are responsible for ensuring this guideline is followed and that all Toronto Fire Services apparatus are safe and secure if left unattended at a non emergency.

**Guideline: 1.0 Parked at Emergencies**

- 1.01 Toronto Fire Services apparatus may be left unattended at an emergency scene.
- 1.02 At an emergency scene, apparatus shall be left running with emergency lights on when the apparatus is exposed to any vehicular traffic flow.

**2.0 Non Emergencies**

- 2.01 At a non emergency scene, Toronto Fire Services apparatus shall not be left unattended if all doors and compartments cannot be locked on the respective apparatus.
- 2.02 Toronto Fire Service vehicles shall never park in areas designated for the handicapped.
- 2.03 Toronto Fire Service vehicles shall be parked in such a manner that the unit is driven forward rather than reversed.
- 2.04 Wheel chocks shall be placed in the front and rear of one wheel on the drivers' side of the apparatus when apparatus are parked and the driver is not in the driver's seat.
- 2.05 Apparatus may be left unattended at fire stations and at all Toronto Fire Services training facilities.

**It is recognized that this guideline may not address all circumstances. Conditions may exist that shall require reasonable discretion on the part of the Officer In Charge. Decisions should always take into consideration the safety of the public and Toronto Fire Services personnel.**

**Attachment 3 – Details on Repairs and Cost of Repair**

**DEPENDABLE EMERGENCY VEHICLE  
275 CLARENCE ST  
BRAMPTON, ONTARIO  
L6W 3R3**

**QUOTE FR-189  
RE-UNIT P-141 (25006)  
MILEAGE 153,101  
PLATE # 597-9DF**

INSPECT AND REPAIR ACCIDENT DAMAGE AS PER FOLLOWING  
DESCRIPTION

- RE & RE FRONT BUMPER
- REBUILD AND REPAIR FRONT BUMPER
- POLISH FRONT BUMPER
- STRAIGHTEN AND RE-ALIGN BUMPER SUPPORTS
- RE & RE HOSE HOLDER
- RE & RE HORNS
- REMOVE AND REPLACE ELECTRIC SIREN FRONT BUMPER
- REMOVE AND REPLACE FRONT GRILL
- RE & RE WINDSHIELD WASHER AND WIPERS
- RE & RE LEFT AND RIGHT FRONT WINDSHIELD
- RE & RE LICENSE PLATE
- RE & RE BUMPER WARNING LIGHTS RIGHT AND LEFT SIDE
- REPAIR DAMAGE TO RIGHT SIDE OF CAB
- ALIGN CAB
- RE & RE LEFT SIDE DRIVER MIRROR
- RE & RE RIGHT SIDE PASSENGER MIRROR BRACKET
- SUPPLY AND INSTALL NEW PASSENGER MIRROR COMPLETE WITH MOUNTING BRACKETS
- RE & RE RIGHT FRONT CAB DOOR
- REMOVE AND REPLACE DOOR HINGE
- REMOVE AND INSTALL NEW AUTO EJECT OUTLET COMPLETE
- RE & RE ALL 4 DOOR PANEL'S FOR CAB ACCESS TO DOOR HANDLES
- RE & RE RIGHT FRONT DOOR HANDLE
- RE & RE LEFT FRONT & REAR SIDE DOOR HANDLES
- ALIGN ALL FOUR DOORS



- REMOVE AND REPLACE RIGHT REAR DOOR HANDLE
- REMOVE AND REPLACE TWO (2) GRAB HANDLES
- RE & RE VELCRO ON HOSEBED
- RE & RE LABELS UNDER TRANSVERSE BED (BOTH SIDES)
- RE & RE TELESOCOPIC ROLLERS ON ROOF TOP HOSEBED
- REMOVE AND REPLACE SIDE VENT GRILL
- REMOVE ALL FOUR (4) FENDERETTES
- SUPPLY AND INSTALL NEW FENDERETTE RIGHT FRONT
- SUPPLY AND INSTALL NEW FENDERETTE RIGHT REAR
- INSTALL NEW GRAB HANDLE ON CANOPY
- RE & RE ROLLERS AND GRAB HANDLE ABOVE PUMPHOUSE
- RE & RE 4 FOLDING STEPS ON RIGHT FRONT OF BODY
- REMOVE 1/8" ALUMINUM CHECKER PLATE ON COMPARTMENT #R1
- FABRICATE AND INSTALL NEW CHECKER PLATE PANNELLING IN FRONT OF WALL OF COMPARTMENT #R1
- RE & RE GRAB HANDLE ABOVE COMPARTMENT #1
- REMOVE AND REPLACE RUB RAIL FOR COMPARTMENT #R1
- REMOVE BROKEN CABLE FOR RELEASE AIR DRAIN FOR COMPARTMENT #R1 AND REPLACE
- SUPPLY AND INSTALL NEW LABELS FOR TANK DRAIN
- RE & RE MAGNET FOR EXHAUST
- REMOVE AND REPLACE AIR BOTTLE COMPARTMENT RIGHT REAR SIDE
- REMOVE AND INSTALL NEW SCBA BOTTLE HOLDER COMPARTMENT RIGHT REAR
- REMOVE AND REPLACE NEW RIGHT REAR FENDERETTE
- FABRICATE AND INSTALL RUB RAIL FOR COMPARTMENT #R3
- REMOVE AND REPLACE THREE (3) GRAB HANDLES FOR BACK WALL REAR OF TRUCK
- INSPECT ROLL UP DOORS
- RE & RE SIDE TRACKS AND STILL PLATE R3
- REMOVE AND REPLACE COMPLETE NEW BOTTOM RAIL R3
- REMOVE AND REPLACE NEW SIDE TRACKS R3
- RE & RE SIDE TRACK AND STILL PLATE R3
- RE & RE FOUR(4) WHEELS R2
- REMOVE AND REPLACE TWO (2) NEW SIDE TRACKS R2
- RE & RE SIDE TRACK AND STILL PLATE R2
- REMOVE AND REPLACE TWO (2) NEW SIDE TRACKS R1
- REMOVE AND REPLACE COMPLETE BOTTOM RAIL R1
- REMOVE AND REPLACE SEVENTEEN (17) SLATS R1
- RE & RE RUB RAIL FOR COMPARTMENT #L3
- RE & RE FUEL GAS DOOR AND REPLACE SPRINGS
- REMOVE AND REPLACE FENDERETTE LEFT REAR
- RE & RE RUB RAIL L1
- REMOVE AND REPLACE TWO (2) AIR DRAIN CABLES

- RE & RE ROLLERS ABOVE PUMPHOSE
- RE & RE MOULDING AROUND LEFT AND RIGHT CAB WINDOWS
- RE & RE FENDERETTE FOR LEFT FRONT WHEEL
- RE & RE GRAB HANDLE FOR LEFT SIDE OF CAB
- RE & RE GRILL ABOVE FRONT WHEEL
- REPLACE ONE (1) HOLOGEN WARNING LIGHT RIGHT SIDE BUMPER
- REMOVE AND REPLACE REAR SECTION OF HEAT PAN UNDERNEATH PUMPHOUSE
- STRAIGHTEN HEAT PAN SUPPORT UNDERNEATH PUMPHOUSE (FRONT)
- REMOVE AND REPLACE HEAT PAN SHIELD
- REPAIR AND STRAIGHTEN BRACKETS FOR MUFFLER
- STRAIGHTEN FRONT SECTION OF BODY UNDERNEATH IN FRONT OF PUMP HOUSE
- REPLACE BRACKET FOR MUFFLER SUPPORT
- INSPECT UNIT FOR MECHANICAL
- INSPECT SUSPENSION
- CHECK FOR STEERING COLUMN PLAY
- REPLACE STEERING COLUMN ASSEMBLY
- REPLACE UJOINT FOR STEERING COLUMN
- REPLACE FRONT STEER AXLE SPRING REAR SHACKLE PINS, AND BUSHINGS
- CHECK FRONT END ALIGNMENT
- ALIGN FRONT END
- REMOVE FRONT AND REAR WHEELS
- INSPECT BRAKE SHOES AND WHEEL BEARINGS
- REPLACE FOUR (4) WHEEL SEALS
- ADJUST ALL BRAKES
- REMOVE AND REPLACE FRONT WHEELS
- REMOVE AND REPLACE AIR TANK DRAIN VALVE
- REMOVE ALL DECALS FROM UNIT
- SANDBLAST AND PRIME UNIT AS NECESSARY
- PAINT UNIT TO TORONTO FIRE SPEC'S
- LETTER UNIT TO TORONTO FIRE SPEC'S

## **MATERIAL LIST**

ONE (1) RIGHT SIDE MIRROR  
ONE (1) MIRROR BACK  
ONE (1) CHROME GRILL  
ONE (1) REBUILD BUMPER  
ONE (1) RIGHT DOOR HANDLE  
ONE (1) GASKET FOR DOOR HANDLE  
ONE (1) RIGHT FRONT DOOR HINGE  
ONE (1) 100W SPEAKER

ONE (1) UJOINT ASSY  
THREE (3) AIR TANK DRAIN  
TWENTY (20) WHEEL BOTTOM FOR DOORS  
EIGHT (8) SEAL BOTTOM  
ONE (1) SPRING BAR  
SEVENTEEN (17) SLATS PAINTED  
ONE (1) BOTTOM SECTION  
ONE (1) SCBA DOOR COMPARTMENT  
ONE (1) AUTO EJECT COMPLETE  
ONE (1) LITE HAL 5" X 9"  
FOURTEEN (14) GRAB RAIL  
SEVEN (7) GASKETS FOR STANCHIONS  
TWO (2) STANCHION RIGHT 30 DEG  
TWO (2) STANCHION LEFT 30 DEG  
THREE (3) STANCHION END  
ONE (1) HINGE  
TWELVE (12) BODY SPACER  
TWO (2) FRONT TIRES  
PAINTING

**TOTAL QUOTE**

**\$ 40,798.63**

**Attachment 4 - Work Completed Outside of the Repair Caused by  
Incident**

**DEPENDABLE EMERGENCY VEHICLE  
275 CLARENCE ST  
BRAMPTON, ONTARIO  
L6W 3R3**

**QUOTE FR-192  
RE-UNIT P-141 (25006)  
MILEAGE 153,101  
PLATE # 597-9DF**

- Supply and Install a direct-to-tank fill line from rear of pumper to tank, complete with a 2.5" chrome elbow and cap
- Re and re L2 adjustable shelf
- Fabricate a entrance to tank from L2
- Supply and install outlet coupling on tank in L2
- Relocate temperature gauge on pump panel for installation for Akron control valve
- Supply and Install electric Akron control valve for direct-to-tank fill line mounted on pump panel
- Inspect vehicle for Annual Inspection (D.O.T)
  
- **Material List**
- Akron 86301313 Electric Valve
- 0373-2.5 Adaptor
- 0630-2.5 Elbow
- 0345-2.5 Cap
- 2.5 Piping

**TOTAL QUOTE           \$ 3,631.42**