



**ROUNDTABLE ON ACCESS, EQUITY AND HUMAN RIGHTS
MINUTES
MEETING 1**

Date of Meeting: April 5, 2006
Time: 5:00 p.m.
Location: Committee Room 1
City Hall
100 Queen Street West
Toronto, Ontario

Enquiry: Margaret Lewis
Committee Secretary
416-395-7354
mlewis@toronto.ca

Frank Baldassini
Committee Secretary
416-395-7352
fbalda@toronto.ca

Members

Present: Councillor Joe Mihevc, Chair Councillor Pam McConnell Councillor Michael Walker Zanana Akande Andalee Adamali Debbie Douglas Prabha Khosla Marie Moliner Cathy Pawis (replacing Roger Obonsawin) Gabriela Rodriguez (alternate) Sam Savona (alternate) Pura Velasco	Absent: Mayor David Miller, Ex-officio Member Michelle Amerie Jacqueline Brooks (resigned) Gurpreet S. Malhotra (resigned) Uzma Shakir (resigned) Roger Obonsawin (resigned) Fiona Sampson (resigned) Tatum Wilson (on leave of absence) Gary Malkowski (sent regrets) Josephine Grey (alternate) Austin Reiscen
---	--

The meeting convened at 5:00 p.m. with Councillor Mihevc in the Chair.

There were no declarations of interest under the *Municipal Conflict of Interest Act*.

Councillor Mihevc welcomed the following new members to the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights: Catherine Pawis, Aboriginal Education; Andalee Amdali, Council of Agencies Serving South Asians; and Gabriela Rodriguez, Toronto Youth Cabinet alternate.

1.1 Disability Issues Committee Representatives

Communication (April 22, 2005) from the City Clerk advising that the Disability Issues Committee, on April 5, 2005 selected Michelle Amerie and Gary Malkowski to attend the meetings of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights.

Minute 1.1

Action:

The Roundtable:

- (1) received the communication; and*
- (2) requested that the Chair advise the Policy and Finance Committee that Michelle Amerie and Gary Malkowski have been selected by the Disability Issues Committee, to attend meetings of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights.*

1.2 Working Group on the Status of Women and Gender Equity Representatives

Communication (April 25, 2005) from the Diversity Management and Community Engagement Consultant, advising that the Working Group on the Status of Women and Gender Equity, on April 15, 2005 selected Prabha Khosla and Josephine Grey to attend the meetings of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights.

Minute 1.2

Action:

The Roundtable:

- (1) received the communication; and*
- (2) requested that the Chair advise the Policy and Finance Committee that Prabha Khosla and Josephine Grey have been selected by the Working Group on the Status of Women, to attend meetings of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights.*

1.3 Change in Board of Trade Representative

E-mail (May 11, 2005) from Mr. Peter Broadhurst advising that he will be replacing Norm Tulsiani as the Board of Trade representative.

Minute 1.3

Action:

The Roundtable:

- (1) received the E-mail; and*
- (2) requested that the Chair advise the Policy and Finance Committee that Norm Tulsiani has resigned as the Board of Trade representative on the Roundtable; and that he has been replaced by Peter Broadhurst, to attend meetings of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights.*

1.4 Human Rights 2003 and 2004 Annual Report

Communications:

- (a) (June 29, 2004) from the City Clerk forwarding Policy and Finance Committee Report 5, Clause 19 titled "Human Rights 2003 Annual Report" containing the report (April 27, 2004) from the Chief Administrative Officer presenting an overview of the Human Rights Office activities and initiatives for the year 2003, which was referred to the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights by City Council on June 22, 23 and 24, 2004.*
- (b) (April 20, 2005) from the City Clerk forwarding Policy and Finance Committee Report 4, Clause 16 titled "Human Rights 2004 Annual Report" containing the report (February 25, 2005) from the Chief Administrative Officer presenting an overview of the Human Rights Office activities and initiatives for the year 2004, which was referred to the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights by City Council on April 12, 13 and 14, 2005.*

Minute 1.4

Action:

The Roundtable received the aforementioned communications for information.

1.5. Working Group on the “Equity Lens”

Communication (October 30, 2005) from the Chair, Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights providing an update on the action taken by the Working Group on the Equity Lens at its meeting held on October 14, 2005.

1.5(a) Equity Lens – Draft # 2

Draft # 2 of the Equity Lens (October 24, 2005) prepared by the Diversity Management and Community Engagement Unit, City Manager’s Office.

1.5(b) Equity Lens – Draft # 3

Draft # 3 of the Equity Lens (November 2, 2005) prepared by the Diversity Management and Community Engagement Unit, City Manager’s Office, was presented by Rose Lee, Diversity Management Coordinator, Diversity Management and Community Engagement Unit, City Manager’s Office.

1.5(c) Equity Lens – Draft #4 Working Document – Equity Lens Application and Test Results

The Equity Lens Working Document, Equity Lens Application and Test Results (April 2006) and a slide presentation headed “Equity Lens Application Test Results – April 5, 2006” prepared by the Diversity Management and Community Engagement Unit, City Manager’s Office, was presented by Rose Lee, Diversity Management Coordinator, Diversity Management and Community Engagement Unit, City Manager’s Office.

Minute 1.5

Action:

On December 12, 2005, the informal group of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights endorsed the proposal of the Diversity Management and Community Engagement Unit, City Manager’s Office, that strategies and tools be developed and implemented to integrate the equity analysis in City business and practices by:

- (a) including an “equity impact statement” in reports to Standing Committees and Council;*
- (b) providing resource materials on the equity lens to City employees; and*
- (c) establishing discussion groups and learning circles on the equity lens and related issues for City employees.”*

On April 5, 2006, the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights:

- (1) reaffirmed the proposal endorsed by the informal group of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights on December 12, 2005;*

- (2) *agreed in principle with the proposals and the approach outlined in the slide presentation and the draft document titled “Equity Lens Working Document – Equity Lens Application and Test Results” dated April 2006;*
- (3) *requested that, since the next meeting of the Roundtable will not be held until June 26, 2006:*
 - (a) *a final joint staff report be prepared by the Diversity, Management and Community Engagement Office, and circulated to all Roundtable Members for comments;*
 - (b) *if agreed to by all Members, the Chair and the City Manager present the report on the Equity Lens to a future meeting of the Policy and Finance Committee; and*
 - (c) *in the event that there are concerns or issues to be resolved, the Chair and the Manager, Diversity Management and Community Engagement report back to the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights; and that such report include information on how the existing program would change once the barriers were identified.*

The Chair thanked Rose Lee and the Diversity Management and Community Engagement Unit for the excellent report.

Rose Lee thanked the following participating divisions:

Emergency Medical Services (EMS); Human Resources (HR); Municipal Licensing and Standards (MLS); Parks, Forestry and Recreation (PFR) and Public Health.

1.6 Working Group on the “Mentoring Program”

Communication (October 30, 2005) from the Chair, Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights providing an update on the action taken by the Working Group on Mentoring and Internship at its meeting held on October 14, 2005.

- 1.6(a)** Report (undated) titled “Starting and Implementing a Mentoring Immigrants Program” from Jo-Anne Barnard, Senior Employment Equity Consultant, Human Resources Division, and Rose Lee, Diversity Management Coordinator, Diversity Management and Community Engagement Unit, City Manager’s Office.
- 1.6(b)** Communication (October 18, 2005) from Councillor Janet Davis, Chair, Working Group on Immigration and Refugee Issues, advising that on September 21, 2005, the Working Group on Immigration and Refugee Issues recommended to the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights that:

- (1) the City of Toronto develop strategies with goals and timetables to increase significantly the number of mentoring opportunities to internationally trained persons;
- (2) the City of Toronto lobby:
 - (a) the Federal and Provincial governments to:
 - (i) create a coordinated body, like the International Qualifications Assessment Service in Alberta, to provide information and streamline the accreditation process for internationally trained persons;
 - (ii) increase resources to provide information and encourage internationally trained persons to pursue accreditation prior to arrival in Canada;
 - (iii) set up an accreditation subsidy fund and provide financial support to immigrants when they retrain or study for accreditation.
 - (b) the Minister for Training, Colleges and Universities to reduce the waiting time for immigrants to be eligible to apply for OSAP;
 - (c) the Provincial Minister responsible for professional regulatory bodies to regulate the fees for accreditation, examination and other requirements to make accreditation affordable;
 - (d) Professional regulatory bodies to streamline the notarization of documents and reduce waiting time for internationally trained persons to be accredited.

1.6(c) Mentoring and Internship Program Updates

Jo-Anne Barnard, Senior Employment Equity Consultant, Human Resources Division, presented an update on the Mentoring and Internship Program.

Minute 1.6

Action

On December 12, 2005, the informal group of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights endorsed the recommendations of the Working Group on Immigration and Refugee Issues.”

On April 5, 2006, the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights:

- (1) received the above-mentioned communications, report and the Mentoring and Internship Program updates presented by Jo-Anne Barnard, Senior Employment Equity Consultant, Human Resources Division.*
- (2) re-affirmed the decision of the informal group on December 12, 2005 and in so doing, endorsed the recommendations of the Working Group on Immigration and Refugee Issues outlined in the communication (October 18, 2005) from Councillor Janet Davis, Chair, Working Group on Immigration and Refugee Issues; and*
- (3) requested the Chair to advise the Policy and Finance Committee accordingly.*

1.7 “Stability and Equity”: Community-City Working Group on Stable Core Funding

Communication (December 6, 2004) from the City Clerk forwarding Policy and Finance Committee Report 9, Clause 19 titled “Stability and Equity: Community-City Working Group on Stable Core Funding – Final Report” which was referred to the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights by City Council on November 30, December 1 and 2 2004 along with the following Recommendation (4) for consideration and direction:

- “(4) that the City mandate and fund a separate Community-City Working Group on Ethno-racial Community Access to City Resources beginning in January 2005.”

Minute 1.7

Action:

On December 12, 2005, the informal group of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights proposed that Chris Brillinger, Director, Community Resources, Social Development and Administration Division be invited to give a presentation on the grants process to the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights.

On April 5, 2006, the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights endorsed the suggestion of the informal group on December 12, 2005 and requested that the Chair, on behalf of the Roundtable, invite Chris Brillinger, Director, Community Resources, Social Development and Administration Division to give a presentation on the grants process at the next meeting of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights on June 26, 2006.

1.8 Low Income Women of Colour

Communication (December 6, 2004) from the City Clerk forwarding Policy and Finance Committee Report 9, Clause 55 titled “If Low-Income Women of Colour Counted in Toronto” which was referred to the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights by City Council on November 30, December 1 and 2, 2004, along with the following

Recommendation (11) respecting Initiative 6 – “Multi-lingual Information on Women’s Rights and Services”:

“(11) that the recommendation for a City-wide multi-lingual information campaign aimed at women whose first language is not English be referred to the Mayor’s Roundtable on Access and Equity for further consideration and implementation;”

Minute 1.8

Action:

The Roundtable received the communication (December 6, 2004) from the City Clerk forwarding Policy and Finance Committee Report 9, Clause 55 titled “If Low-Income Women of Colour Counted in Toronto”, for information.

1.9 2004 Annual Report on Multilingual Services

The Roundtable considered the following communications:

- (a) (January 10, 2005) from the City Clerk forwarding for information, a report (December 13, 2004) from the Commissioner of Corporate Services presenting an overview of translation and interpretation activities undertaken in 2004 by the various City departments in order to meet the language needs of City of Toronto residents.
- (b) (undated) from Councillor Chow forwarding a report (February 21, 2005) titled “Assessment of Multilingual Services Provided by the City of Toronto”, assessing the quality of the City’s language line services and presenting the following recommendations to improve and enhance the services:
 - (1) It is recommended that translation services must be incorporated in the implementation of Toronto’s 3-1-1 customer service program. The City would bear little cost, if any, since translation services are currently made available through Access Toronto and a number of City Departments.
 - (2) It is recommended that there should be an indication that translation services are available. For example, greetings given in the most widely spoken languages in Toronto would signal to 3-1-1 callers that translation services are provided. This should be done even if no menu choices are provided and the call is immediately forwarded to an operator.
 - (3) It is recommended that 3-1-1 staff, City Departments, and ABCs should be made aware of the availability of translation services, in addition to training on handling non-English callers. This would not incur any extra

costs to the City since it would be incorporated within the training program of 3-1-1 staff.

- (4) It is recommended that upon transferring calls from the 3-1-1 line to other departments, the translation service should also be transferred. This could potentially cost the City money, especially if the respective Department does not provide translation services. The cost of translation service is \$2.30 per minute. Hence, the only added cost would be the transfer time, which often takes no longer than a minute or two.
- (5) It is recommended that during the time of transfer to translation services music should be played in the background to indicate that the call is being transferred.
- (6) It is recommended that since the City is to create one-stop access for all on-line services on the Web through the “3-1-1” service portal, key translated documents should be made available through this website. Incorporation of translated documents will not incur the City any extra costs. The actual translation of key documents will come at some cost, but will be limited.
- (7) It is recommended that the City should provide a brochure on the procedures of calling the 3-1-1 number for non-English speakers. This brochure should include a step-by-step explanation. It should then be posted on the 3-1-1 website. The cost will be limited and included with the translation of other documents.

Patricia MacDonell, Manager, Public Information addressed the Roundtable and provided an update on the 3-1-1 Customer Service.

Minute 1.9

Action:

On December 12, 2005, the informal group of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights proposed that the communication (January 10, 2005) from the City Clerk, Administration Committee and the communication (February 21, 2005) from Councillor Olivia Chow be referred to the Council-Staff Working Group involved in the implementation of the 3-1-1 Customer Service Strategy; and that staff be requested to look for a way of promoting the 3-1-1 Customer Service campaign.”

On April 5, 2006, the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights:

- (1) *re-affirmed the decision of the informal group on December 12, 2005, that the communication (January 10, 2005) from the City Clerk, Administration Committee and the communication (February 21, 2005) from Councillor Olivia Chow be referred to the*

Council-Staff Working Group involved in the implementation of the 3-1-1 Customer Service Strategy; and that staff be requested to look for a way of promoting the 3-1-1 Customer Service campaign.”; and

- (2) *requested that the Chair request the Policy and Finance Committee to:*
- (a) *refer the communication (January 10, 2005) from the City Clerk, Administration Committee and the communication (February 21, 2005) from Councillor Olivia Chow to the Council-Staff Working Group involved in the implementation of the 3-1-1 Customer Service strategy;*
 - (b) *request staff to look for a way of promoting the 3-1-1 Customer Service campaign; and*
 - (c) *request the Manager, Public Information to report to the Roundtable at its next meeting on June 26, 2006 regarding the feasibility of keeping track of the 3-1-1 Customer Service calls by gender, subject matter and the area of the City from which the calls are received.*

1.10 Mandarin Community Development Proposal

The Roundtable considered a communication (March 17, 2005) from the Economic Development and Parks Committee advising that on March 10, 2005 the Economic Development and Parks Committee considered a presentation from Simon Zhong, Executive Director, Toronto Community and Culture Centre, requesting the assistance of the Economic Development and Parks Committee to provide suitable space for recreational usage and 4 – 5 full-time positions to support the development of Mainland Chinese Community in co-operation with the City, as outlined in the proposal (undated) submitted by Mr. Zhong.

Minute 1.10

Action:

On December 12, 2005, the informal group of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights received a verbal presentation from Mr. Simon Zhong, Executive Director, Toronto Community and Culture Centre regarding the Mandarin Community Development Proposal.

The Chair, on behalf of the informal group of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights subsequently advised Mr. Zhong that the Roundtable is unable to grant any funding for the Mandarin Community development proposal, and suggested that he submit a formal grant application to the Community Service Partnership or the Community Safety Investment Partnership, which would report to the Community Services Committee on the grant applications that are received.”

On April 5, 2006, the Roundtable endorsed the action taken by the Chair, on behalf of the informal group of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights.

1.11 Accessible Taxicabs within the City of Toronto

Communication (November 1, 2005) from the City Clerk forwarding Planning and Transportation Committee Report 9, Clause 4 titled “Accessible Taxicabs within the City of Toronto” which was forwarded to the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights by City Council on October 26, 27, 28 and 31, 2005, for information.

Minute 1.11

Action:

The Roundtable received the communication for information.

1.12 Update – Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights

Communication (February 6, 2006) from the City Clerk forwarding Clause 22 of Policy and Finance Committee Report 2 and advising that City Council on January 31, February 1 and 2, 2006, considered this Clause headed “Update – Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights”, and adopted the following recommendations:

- (1) the mandate and membership of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights be reaffirmed and extended to the end of the current Council term (November 30, 2006); and
- (2) the alternates of organizational representatives to the Roundtable be permitted to participate when regular members are unable to attend meetings.

Minute 1.12

Action:

On December 12, 2005, the informal group of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights endorsed the proposal by the Chair, Councillor Mihevc, that he forward a communication to the Policy and Finance Committee recommending that:

- (1) *the mandate and membership of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights be reaffirmed and extended to the end of the current Council term of November 30, 2006; and*
- (2) *that the alternates of organizational representatives to the Roundtable be permitted to participate when regular members are unable to attend meetings.*

On April 5, 2006, the Roundtable endorsed the action taken by the Chair, Councillor Mihevc, and received the communication (February 6, 2006 from the City Clerk, for information.

1.13 SIU Special Investigations Unit – Annual Report

Communication (December 28, 2005) from the Director, Special Investigations Unit, forwarding a copy of the Unit's Annual Report for the fiscal Year 2004 – 2005; and advising that this report can also be found on their web site at www.siu.on.ca.

Minute 1.13

Action:

The Roundtable received the communication for information.

1.14 Next Steps

Minute 1.14

Action:

The Roundtable deferred this matter was deferred for future discussion.

1.15 Dates of Future Meetings

The Roundtable was advised that the next meeting has been scheduled for Monday, June 26, 2006, from 4:00 p.m. to 6:00 p.m. in Committee Room 2 at Toronto City Hall.

Minute 1.15

Action:

The Roundtable decided to hold the next meeting on Monday, June 26, 2006 from 5:00 p.m. to 7:00 p.m. since the later start time is more convenient for the majority of members and the ASL Interpreters.

1.16 City of Toronto Participation – UNESCO Coalition of Cities Against Racism

Report (March 28, 2006) from the City Manager, addressed to the Policy and Finance Committee, responding to the Federation of Canadian Municipalities' request that its

members join the UNESCO initiative to establish a Coalition of Municipalities against Racism and develop Action Plans against racism.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that:

- (1) the City of Toronto join the UNESCO Coalition of Municipalities against Racism and Discrimination;
- (2) the City of Toronto submit Council's plan of Action against Racism and Discrimination adopted by City Council in April 2003 as Toronto's Action Plan; and that
- (3) the appropriate City Officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

Minute 1.16

Action:

The Roundtable:

- (1) *endorsed the recommendations of the City Manager's report (March 28, 2006) regarding the City of Toronto's participation in the UNESCO Coalition of Cities Against Racism; and*
- (2) *requested that the Chair forward this matter to the Policy and Finance Committee for consideration at its meeting on April 11, 2006.*

1.17 Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act Alliance's Discussion Paper on Human Rights Reforms

Communication (April 4, 2006) from Gary Malkowski, requesting that the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights call upon the Government of Ontario, not to proceed with Human Rights Reforms and demand that the Ontario Government have full and accessible and open public consultation on Human Rights Reforms to strengthen the Human Rights Code before the proposed Bill is tabled in the House; and submitting a Discussion Paper (April 3, 2006) from Catherine Dunphy, Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act Alliance (AODA).

Minute 1.17

Action:

The Roundtable requested the Chair to request the Policy and Finance Committee to recommend to Council that the Premier and the Attorney General of Ontario be requested to delay the introduction of legislation on Human Rights Reforms until there is a broad community consultation and wide discussion regarding the impact of the various proposals.

Committee Member, Marie Moliner declared her interest in Policy and Finance Committee Report 4, Clause 19a, headed “Support for the Efforts of the Undocumented Workers Committee”, in that she is an employee of the Federal Government and did not take part in the consideration or vote on this matter.

1.18 City Council Resolution on Support for Undocumented Workers

- (a) Consolidated Clause 19a headed “Support for the Efforts of the Undocumented Workers Committee”, contained in Policy and Finance Committee Report 4, which was considered by City Council at its Special meeting on May 4, 2005.
- (b) Consolidated Clause 3b headed “Council Resolution on Support for the Undocumented Workers”, contained in Administration Committee Report 6, which was considered by City Council on October 26, 27, 28 and 31, 2005.

Minute 1.18

Action:

The Roundtable requested that the Chair of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights, on behalf of the Roundtable, urge the Minister of Citizenship and Immigration, based on Council’s Policy, to undertake a moratorium review and grant regularization to undocumented workers.

1.19 Toronto Youth Cabinet Representation - Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights

Communication (April 5, 2006) from Rachna Contractor, Co-ordinator, Toronto Youth Cabinet advising that Gabriela Rodriguez has been selected by the Toronto Youth Cabinet to attend the meetings of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights from September 2005 to September 2006.

Minute 1.19

Action:

The Roundtable:

- (1) received the communication; and*
- (2) requested that the Chair advise the Policy and Finance Committee that Gabriela Rodriguez has been selected by the Disability Issues Committee, to attend meetings of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights from September 2005 to September 2006.*

Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 6:40 p.m.

Chair