



**ROUNDTABLE ON ACCESS, EQUITY AND HUMAN RIGHTS
MINUTES
MEETING 2**

Date of Meeting: June 26, 2006
Time: 5:00 p.m.
Location: Committee Room 1
City Hall
100 Queen Street West
Toronto, Ontario

Enquiry: Margaret Lewis
Committee Secretary
416-395-7354
mlewis@toronto.ca

Frank Baldassini
Committee Secretary
416-395-7352
fbalda@toronto.ca

Members

Present: Councillor Joe Mihevc, Chair Councillor Pam McConnell Andalee Adamali Peter Broadhurst Connie Gruberman for Prabha Khosla Gary Malkowski Marie Moliner Pura Velasco	Absent: Mayor David Miller, Ex-officio Member Councillor Michael Walker Zanana Akande Michelle Amerie Jacqueline Brooks (resigned) Debbie Douglas Gurpreet S. Malhotra (resigned) Cathy Pawis replacing Roger Obonsawin Uzma Shakir (resigned) Roger Obonsawin (resigned) Gabriela Rodriguez replacing Austin Reiscen Fiona Sampson (resigned) Tatum Wilson Josephine Grey (alternate) Austin Reiscen
---	---

The meeting convened at 5:00 p.m. with Councillor Mihevc in the Chair.

There were no declarations of interest under the *Municipal Conflict of Interest Act*.

Confirmation of Minutes – April 5, 2006 – Confirmed.

2.1 Multilingual Services – 3-1-1 Customer Service

Report (June 13, 2006) from the Deputy City Manager, Sue Corke responding to a request by the Roundtable to report back on the feasibility of keeping track of 3-1-1 Customer Service calls by gender, subject matter and the area of the City from which the calls are received and recommending that this report be received for information.

2.1(a) Consolidated Clause 35(e) headed “2004 Annual Report on Multilingual Services”, embodied in Policy and Finance Committee Report 4, considered by City Council on May 23, 24 and 25, 2006.

2.1(b) Report (June 12, 2006) from the Chair, Working Group on the Status of Women and Gender Equity, recommending that:

(1) that the City Manager’s Office in collaboration with City researchers with demographic expertise and the City’s working and advisory groups, including the Status of Women Committee and Gender Equity, the Aboriginal Affairs Committee, the Disability Issues Committee and the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights

(a) develop a template for the collection of demographic reporting data that would:

(i) include sex, gender, age, race, ability/disability, language, literacy, period of immigration and sexual orientation; that these minimal variables be applied routinely in all City research programmes, projects, special initiatives, consultations, open houses and working and advisory groups, and

(ii) provide an agreed upon mechanism for basic demographic data to be collected and alleviate the need for each task group to struggle with demographics enhance data availability and increase efficiency in the use of municipal funds.

2.1(c) Report (June 13, 2006) from the Chair, Working Group on the Status of Women and Gender Equity requesting that the additional words “income” and “immigration status” be added to recommendation 1(a)(i), so that the recommendation now reads as follows:

“(1) that the City Manager’s Office in collaboration with City researchers with demographic expertise and the City’s working and advisory groups, including the Status of Women Committee and Gender Equity, the Aboriginal Affairs Committee, the Disability Issues Committee and the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights

(a) develop a template for the collection of demographic reporting data that would:

(i) include sex, gender, age, race, ability/disability, language, literacy, income, period of immigration, immigration status and sexual

orientation; that these minimal variables be applied routinely in all City research programmes, projects, special initiatives, consultations, open houses and working and advisory groups, and”

In response to a request by the Roundtable at its meeting on April 5, 2006 (Minute 1.9) Colleen Bell, Manager 3-1-1 Project Initiative and Patricia MacDonell, Manager, Public Information presented a verbal update regarding the feasibility of keeping track of the 3-1-1 Customer Service calls by gender, subject matter and the area of the City from which the calls are received. The Roundtable was advised that as part of the 3-1-1 planning, the Corporate Access and Privacy Office is currently in the process of conducting a full Privacy Impact Assessment on the proposed approach to customer service through a 3-1-1 operation which will include the collection of personal information that may be required such as name, address, phone number, and subject matter of the inquiry or service requested.

The Roundtable was further advised that the Corporate Access and Privacy Office was not requested to include the collection of gender information in its assessment because the Municipal Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act is clear that the collection of personal information (including gender) should be closely linked to a statute that provides the mandate to collect such information; therefore personal information may not be collected if it is not necessary to provide the services in question.

With respect to the tracking of the subject matter and the area of the City from which the call originates, the Roundtable was advised that this will likely be part of the 3-1-1 operation, but the final decision will be made once the results of the Privacy Impact Assessment have been completed and reviewed by the 3-1-1 Council Staff Working Group.

Connie Gruberman gave a presentation on behalf of Prabha Khosla regarding minimal requirements for disaggregated data collection in all of City of Toronto’s activities - and suggested that a template be developed for the collection of demographic reporting data.

Minute 2.1

Action:

The Roundtable:

- (1) received the verbal update from Colleen Bell, Manager, 3-1-1 Project Initiative, Patricia MacDonell, Manager, Public Information and the verbal presentation by Connie Gruberman on behalf of the Working Group on the Status of Women and Gender Equity;*
- (2) requested that the Chair:*
 - (a) advise the Policy and Finance Committee that the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights endorses the following recommendations from the Working Group on the Status of Women and Gender Equity:*

- “(1) that the City Manager’s Office in collaboration with City researchers with demographic expertise and the City’s working and advisory groups, including the Status of Women Committee and Gender Equity, the Aboriginal Affairs Committee, the Disability Issues Committee and the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights:*
- (a) develop a template for the collection of demographic reporting data that would:*
 - (i) include sex, gender, age, race, ability/disability, language, literacy, income, period of immigration, immigration status and sexual orientation; that these minimal variables be applied routinely in all City research programmes, projects, special initiatives, consultations, open houses and working and advisory groups; and*
 - (ii) provide an agreed upon mechanism for basic demographic data to be collected and alleviate the need for each task group to provide an agreed upon mechanism for basic demographic data to be collected and alleviate the need for each task group to struggle with demographics, enhance data availability and increase efficiency in the use of municipal funds.”*
 - (b) request the Policy and Finance Committee to endorse the recommendations of the Working Group on the Status of Women and Gender Equity and forward these recommendations to the City Manager for implementation by the Policy Coordinating Team.*
 - (c) invite Colleen Bell, Corporate Lead, 3-1-1 Project Management Office, to attend the next meeting of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights on September 5, 2006, to provide a further update with respect to the 3-1-1 Customer Service and the progress made with respect to implementing the tracking of the subject matter and the area of the City from which the call originates; and*
 - (d) invite Suzanne Craig, Director, Corporate Access and Privacy Office, or her designate, to attend the next meeting of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights on September 5, 2006, to provide information regarding the feasibility of keeping track of the 3-1-1 Customer Service calls by gender, as well as subject matter and the area of the City from which the calls are received.*

2.2. “Stability and Equity” - Community City Working Group on Stable Core Funding

Communication (December 6, 2004) from the City Clerk, forwarding Policy and Finance Committee Report 9, Clause 19 concerning the above-noted subject, which was referred to the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights by City Council on November 30, December 1 and 2, 2004 along with the following Recommendation 4 for consideration and direction:

- “(4) That the City mandate and fund a separate Community-City Working Group on Ethno-racial Community Access to City Resources beginning in January 2005.”

In response to a request by the Roundtable at its meeting on April 5, 2006 (Minute 1.7), Chris Brillinger, Director, Community Resources, Social Development and Administration Division gave a presentation on the grants process and provided the Roundtable with a list of contacts for the City of Toronto Community Partnership and Investment Programs, revised in October 2005 for the 2006 grant year by the Social Development Division for the Toronto Grants Co-ordinating Committee. The Roundtable was advised that to qualify for funding the organization must be community-based and that funding requests must be project or program related and not for the purpose of maintaining the organization.

Minute 2.2

Action:

The Roundtable received the communication from the City Clerk and the presentation from Chris Brillinger, Director, Community Resources, Social Development and Administration Division.

2.3 Diversity in the Appointments Process

Joanne Hamill, Senior Corporate Management and Policy Consultant, Strategic and Corporate Policy Division, City Manager's Office and Karen Jones, Corporate Management and Policy Consultant, Chief Administrator's Office gave a presentation regarding diversity in the appointments process and presented a report on initiatives headed "Increasing Diversity on City Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations" (June 26, 2006) and a City of Toronto brochure titled "A Great City needs great people - Seeking Diversity on boards and committees".

The Roundtable was advised that a diversity analysis was undertaken of the ABC's (Agencies, Boards and Commissions) to determine where there were inadequacies, and as a result, it was determined that there were areas where improvement was needed, particularly with respect to Asians, Southeast Asians, minorities and young people. The Roundtable was further advised that in order to improve the number of appointments in those areas, some outreach activities would be undertaken, which will include improving the access to information on the City's web site. In addition the Roundtable was advised that there is a need to resolve some outstanding issues related to privacy, access to information and the impact those issues have on the collection of data. In conclusion, the Roundtable was advised that a report will subsequently be forwarded to the Nominating Committee for its consideration.

Minute 2.3

Action:

The Roundtable:

- (1) *received the presentation, the brochure and the report on initiatives from Joanne Hamill, Senior Corporate Management and Policy Consultant, Strategic and Corporate Policy Division, City Manager's Office and Karen Jones, Corporate Management and Policy Consultant, Chief Administrator's Office; and*
- (2) *endorsed the outreach activities proposed by the Senior Corporate Management and Policy Consultant, to ensure that there are diverse candidates to choose from when making appointments to agencies, boards and commissions.*

2.4 United Nations Report on Canada's Compliance with the Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Human Rights. (See also Minute 2.8)

The Roundtable considered the following:

- (a) Communication (June 6, 2006) from Josephine Grey requesting an opportunity to address the Roundtable regarding the United Nation's May 19, 2006 report on Canada's compliance/lack of with the covenant on economic, social and cultural human rights.
- (b) Report (May 19, 2006) from the United Nations Economic and Social Council – Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, concluding observations of the Committee.
- (c) St. James Town Press Release (May 23, 2006) Informing UN on Basic Human Rights Violations in downtown Toronto.
- (d) St. James Town L.E.A.D. (Local Empowerment and Access to Democracy) Project - Community Report on Economic Social and Cultural Human Rights in St. James Town Toronto.
- (e) Selected UNESCR Concluding Observations relevant to L.E.A.D. (Local Empowerment and Access to Democracy).

Minute 2.4

Action:

The Roundtable received the United Nations Report on Canada's Compliance with the Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Human Rights and the related background material, for information.

2.5 Ontario Human Rights Reforms

The Roundtable considered the following:

- (a) Communication (April 10, 2006) from the Chair, Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights addressed to the Honourable Michael Bryant, Attorney

General of Ontario, Ministry of the Attorney General requesting that the formalization of any further proposals to change the structure of the Ontario Human Rights Commission and the Tribunal be delayed until a comprehensive consultation process, combined with a research and policy review process has been carried out;

- (b) Bill 107 - An Act to amend the Human Rights Code;
- (c) Human Rights 2005 Annual Report;
- (d) Report (June 1, 2006 from the City Manager addressed to the Employee and Labour Relations Committee presenting an overview of the Human Rights Office activities for 2005 and recommending that the annual report be forwarded to City Council for information;
- (e) Report (June 22, 2006) from Michael Ornstein, Institute for Social Research, York University, titled "Ethno-Racial Groups in Toronto 1971 – 2001 – A Demographic and Socio-Economic Profile; and
- (f) Draft communication to Anne Stokes, Clerk of the Committee, Standing Committee on Justice Policy, Room 1405 Whitney Block, 99 Wellesley Street West, Toronto, M7A 1A2 requesting an opportunity to make an oral presentation to the Standing Committee on Justice Policy, on the topic of Bill 107, the proposed law to amend the Ontario Human Rights Code; and advising that this is a request to make a presentation during the hearings.

The Chair, Councillor Mihevc, addressed the Roundtable and provided an update with respect to the Human Rights Reforms.

The following persons addressed the Roundtable regarding Bill 107 – An Act to amend the Human Rights Code:

Juliet S. Robin, Counsel, Policy Division, Ministry of the Attorney General;

Douglas Sanderson, Senior Policy Advisor, Office of the Honourable Michael Bryant, Attorney General; and

Avvy Yao-Yao Go, Clinic Director, Metro Toronto Chinese and Southeast Asian Legal Clinic, who suggested that the Justice Committee at the legislature be requested to delay the public hearings until August or September and to increase the number of days for the public hearings.

Minute 2.5

Action:

The Roundtable:

- (1) *received the oral presentations, background material, reports and communications;*

- (2) *requested that all interested persons in attendance, write the chair within 1 week (June 27 – July 5, 2006), commenting on Bill 107 and expressing their concerns; which will subsequently be compiled by the Chair and included as part of the submission from the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights to Ann Stokes, Clerk of the Committee, Standing Committee on Justice Policy.*

2.6 Final Report on the Equity Lens

Communication (June 5, 2006) headed “Utilization of an Equity Lens and an Equity Impact Statement” from the Chair, Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights addressed to the Policy and Finance Committee, advising that the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights recommends that:

- (1) City Council endorse the utilization of an “equity lens” as outlined in Appendix One and the inclusion of an equity impact statement in reports to Council;
- (2) the City Manager be requested to utilize these tools for a six month trial basis and report back to Council on the results; and
- (3) the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

The Chair, Councillor Mihevc presented a brief oral update on the status of the “Equity Lens” and advised that the communication was considered by the Policy and Finance Committee at its meeting on June 20, 2006, at which time the Policy and Finance Committee referred the communication to the City Manager for a report to the September 18, 2006 meeting of the Policy and Finance Committee respecting the implementation of this project.

Minute 2.6

Action:

The Roundtable received the communication (June 5, 2006) and the oral update from the Chair, Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights for information.

2.7 Next Steps – Discussion on Roundtable Report to Council

The Chair, Councillor Mihevc advised the Roundtable that he had met with staff to review the accomplishments of the Roundtable and discuss the report to Council on the Roundtable’s workplan and future structure to provide community advice to City Council on equity and human rights issues.

Minute 2.7

Action:

The Roundtable received the oral update from the Chair, Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights, for information.

2.8 United Nations Report on Canada's Compliance with the Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Human Rights (See also Minute 2.4)

The Roundtable reopened this matter which was considered earlier in the meeting in order to allow Josephine Grey, Lead Project Co-ordinator for LIFT to address the Roundtable.

Councillor Mihevc vacated the Chair.

Marie Moliner assumed the Chair and advised the Roundtable that as an employee of the Government of Canada, she would only be acting as a facilitator.

Josephine Grey, Lead Project Co-ordinator for LIFT gave an oral presentation regarding the United Nations report on Canada's compliance with the Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Human Rights and suggested that the Roundtable:

- (a) receive the United Nations report on Canada's compliance with the Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Human Rights;
- (b) request City Council to consider utilizing the United Nations report; and adopt the recommendations that are relevant to the City of Toronto; with respect to economic, social and cultural human rights.

Minute 2.8

Action:

The Roundtable:

- (1) *received the oral presentation from Josephine Grey, Lead Project Co-ordinator for LIFT;*
- (2) *requested the Chair to:*
 - (a) *remind the Ministry of the Attorney General of their obligations to comply with the covenant on economic, social and cultural human rights;*
 - (b) *follow up the motion of the Human Rights Commission with the Ombudsman's Chief Executive in an open letter to the Editor where it can be publicly viewed.*
 - (c) *request the Policy and Finance Committee to request City Council to:*
 - (i) *receive the United Nations report and review its recommendations to determine which ones are relevant to the City of Toronto; and reaffirm the continuation of disability rights;*

- (ii) *reaffirm its position to the Ministry of the Attorney General to stop the process of reducing the human rights system and address human rights reform.*

Date of Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights will be held on Tuesday, September 5, 2006 at 5:00 p.m. in Committee Room 4 at Toronto City Hall.

Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 7:30 p.m.

Chair