

**Management's Response to the Auditor General's Review of
City of Toronto Pandemic Planning and Preparedness**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Dis- agree (X)	<u>Management's Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
1.	The City Manager define in writing the lines of authority and roles of the Pandemic Influenza Steering Committee, and establish a regular reporting relationship for the Steering Committee to report to the Toronto Emergency Management Program Committee on pandemic planning and preparedness.	X		<p>Roles and responsibilities of the Pandemic Influenza Steering Committee in our opinion are clearly defined. The Steering Committee is the lead corporate coordinating body for pan flu planning and preparedness across the City. Formal documentation to acknowledge this role will be completed by mid December, 2007.</p> <p>A mechanism to report on pan flu activities already exists. Updates are provided as necessary to Division Heads, Division Representatives on Business Continuity Planning, staff through all staff bulletins as necessary, as well as to Toronto Emergency Management Program Committee (TEMPC) at the call of City Manager. There has been regular reporting to TEMPC on pan flu by Medical Officer of Health (MOH) and Toronto Public Health (TPH). Office of Emergency Management (OEM) reported on Exercise Health Guard 2006.</p> <p>In our opinion, a reporting relationship between the Pandemic Influenza Steering Committee and TEMPC already exists given the City Manager's role in TEMPC and as Chair of the Steering Committee. The City Manager also reports to Executive Committee which is the standing committee responsible for emergency management at the City. The Mayor sits as Chair of both TEMPC and Executive Committee and receives regular updates from the City Manager as required. As a result internal stakeholders are kept adequately informed.</p>	<p>To be completed by mid December, 2007</p> <p>Completed</p>

**Management's Response to the Auditor General's Review of
City of Toronto Pandemic Planning and Preparedness**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Dis- agree (X)	<u>Management's Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
2.	The City Manager amend the Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 59 "Emergency Planning" to reflect the replacement of the former Community Services Committee with the Executive Committee.	X		Under the new governance structure that took effect January 1, 2007, the Executive Committee is the committee that considers emergency planning matters as this committee is responsible for issues requiring a city-wide plan or approach. Changes to the Municipal Code will be reported to the November 26, 2007 Executive Committee meeting.	To be completed by November 26, 2007
3.	The Toronto Emergency Management Program Committee consider providing periodic reports on the progress of emergency management activities and/or emerging issues to City Council	X		The regulation states... "The committee shall advise the council on the development and implementation of the municipality's emergency management program. O. Reg. 380/04, s. 11 (5)." The City will continue to report on the development and implementation of Emergency Management program. The Mayor and City Manager, in consultation with Office of Emergency Management, will report to the Executive Committee and Council when the testing and refinement of this phase of the plan are completed.	Underway

**Management's Response to the Auditor General's Review of
City of Toronto Pandemic Planning and Preparedness**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Dis- agree (X)	<u>Management's Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
4.	The City Manager ensure that the operational support functions listed in the City of Toronto Emergency Plan are finalized and authorized by responsible agencies before December 2008.	X		<p>The process to finalize the four outstanding operational support functions (OSFs) is underway.</p> <p>OEM will co-ordinate divisional efforts to sign off on all operational support function procedures. OEM informed the Emergency Management Working Group in the September 2007 meeting that sign off will be required.</p> <p>OSF's are procedural in design and applicable for all hazards not just pan flu. Emergency Management Ontario when directly asked stated that these procedures need not be included in the City's Emergency Plan. In other words they distinguish between the Plan and procedures. As such in our opinion, as well as Emergency Management Ontario, it is unnecessary to include these procedures in our Plan.</p> <p>The four operational support functions referred to include Damage Assessment; Volunteer Management; Donations Management; and Mass Fatalities. The first three are in draft format. 'Mass Fatalities' is complete except for sign off.</p>	To be completed by December 2008

**Management's Response to the Auditor General's Review of
City of Toronto Pandemic Planning and Preparedness**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Dis- agree (X)	<u>Management's Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
5.	Toronto Public Health develop timelines for completion of specific pandemic planning and preparedness activities, monitor the completion of these activities, and report progress to the Board of Health.				Completed October 15, 2007
6.	The City Manager undertake a detailed review of the proposed actions to sustain critical City functions in a pandemic emergency to ensure that the proposed actions represent the most effective and appropriate options. Such a review should include, but not be limited to, an examination of the viability, effectiveness, and resource requirements of the proposed preparedness actions.			<p>There are Division-specific strategies and Corporate level strategies. Corporate level strategies include work underway with Unions, corporate stockpile and warehousing, cost tracking, HR, OHS, corporate communications, etc. See project organizational chart.</p> <p>Divisional strategies are described in each division's COOP. Division Heads signed off the COOP spreadsheets and DCMs signed off on Cluster Priority Tier 1 functions. Meetings have been scheduled throughout November 2007 between each cluster senior management team and the unions and COTAPSAI to discuss each division's continuity of operations plans. Copies of the plans were sent to each union in advance of each scheduled meeting.</p> <p>City of Toronto has adopted a 'strong Divisional model' for planning. Divisions are in the best position to assess whether alternate strategies are viable. Most critical functions are 'hands-on', e.g., Toronto Police, Toronto Fire, EMS, TTC, Toronto</p>	Completed

**Management’s Response to the Auditor General’s Review of
City of Toronto Pandemic Planning and Preparedness**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Dis- agree (X)	<u>Management’s Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
				<p>Water, Homes for the Aged, Toronto Public Health.</p> <p>As such, in our opinion, a detailed review as recommended would not be cost beneficial nor achieve any further efficiency. In discussing and reviewing / considering alternate strategies the City has consistently considered and prioritized strategies according to risk, impact, costs and feasibility.</p> <p>The EMS plan was developed as a collaborative effort involving ten people representing various aspects of EMS service. The group identified options for alternative methods of providing services, and where possible, incorporated them into the plan. Other staffing strategies are noted in the COOP spreadsheets on Sheet 4. Where no options for alternatives were realistic, the plan reflects this. Some of the barriers cited include the availability of other paramedics, training required and the safety issues involved in using untrained, retired or non-paramedics to fill in for absenteeism. A declaration of emergency does not override the Occupational Health and Safety Act.</p> <p>The City currently has tokens in use by mostly management staff. The proposed remote access work strategy will consider the alternate strategy of co-ordinating the reallocation of the tokens currently in use to those needing to work off site as an initial step prior to determining the need for further investment in technology given cost considerations.</p>	

**Management’s Response to the Auditor General’s Review of
City of Toronto Pandemic Planning and Preparedness**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Dis-agree (X)	<u>Management’s Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
7.	The City Manager take necessary steps to ensure a coordinated corporate process to prioritize and implement the proposed preparatory actions to sustain critical City services in a pandemic emergency			A comprehensive Corporate process as recommended has in our opinion been established to prioritize and implement the City’s Pandemic Influenza Integrated Corporate Response Plan including the Pandemic Influenza Steering Committee, the Core Planning Group, the Stockpiling Sub-Group, the Business Continuity Planning Group, etc. A detailed illustration of the elements of the corporate coordination process is attached in the project organizational chart.	Completed

**Management's Response to the Auditor General's Review of
City of Toronto Pandemic Planning and Preparedness**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Dis-agree (X)	<u>Management's Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
8.	The City Manager take necessary steps to develop a corporate procurement policy and plan for infection control supplies, personal protective equipment, and critical operational supplies, in preparation for a pandemic emergency. Such steps should include, but not be limited to, a review, prioritization, and alignment of purchasing requirements with the World Health Organization pandemic alert phases.	X		<p>Steps that would inform a Corporate Procurement Plan were initiated with the issues that emerged as a result of the 2006 Health Guard simulation exercise. After this exercise identified a need for a co-ordinated effort of purchasing and stockpiling to the Pandemic Steering Committee, direction was given to PMMD to conduct a preliminary survey of stockpiling needs of key operational divisions. Results were compiled in December 2006 and updated in February 2007 in consultation with Divisions. Around the same timeframe, the Medical Officer of Health (MOH) issued interim recommendations to the City Manager (of required personal protective equipment and infection control supplies in the event of a pandemic) while acknowledging that clear direction in this regard had not been received from the federal and provincial levels of government and that he was advocating further for this direction.</p> <p>A decision was made by the City Manager to await the results of these advocacy efforts by the MOH prior to taking further actions on the MOH's interim recommendations. At the same time however, to be better informed when the anticipated direction was received, the City Manager requested updated information on items stockpiled to date by divisions and this request was complied with and replies received from Divisions in May 2007.</p> <p>Starting in June 2007 despite no direction from the higher levels of government, the Steering Committee made specific decisions to further proceed with the Corporate Procurement Plan and took action to establish a stockpiling sub committee to address related</p>	To be completed beginning of first quarter, 2008.

**Management’s Response to the Auditor General’s Review of
City of Toronto Pandemic Planning and Preparedness**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Dis- agree (X)	<u>Management’s Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
				<p>issues. This group in turn initiated action to provide warehousing and distribution options for pandemic supplies as well as to proceed to communicate to all divisions and ABCs the MOH recommendations.</p> <p>It is noted in the AG report that certain divisions had stockpiled supplies sufficient for 6 months or longer, while others had not taken any action. It should be clarified that the divisions were firstly not aware of the MOH recommendations at this time due to the City Manager decision to await direction from other levels of government and also that the recommendations made by the MOH for 8 weeks of personal protective equipment and infection control supplies was only a recommendation and did not necessarily consider specific operational needs of divisions based on the divisions’ past experience responding to emergencies such as SARS.</p> <p>We affirm that we are now in a position to further the development of an informed and meaningful Corporate Procurement and Stockpiling Policy. We expect the policy to be finalized once more recent requirements are received from the divisions and ABCs based on MOH recommendations and their own expertise and operational needs on handling emergencies.</p> <p>The City will align its purchasing requirements in this regard with the WHO alert phases but will not be purchasing the required items on a phase by phase basis, rather on a total estimated requirements to be replenished to ensure a continuous supply of a</p>	

**Management's Response to the Auditor General's Review of
City of Toronto Pandemic Planning and Preparedness**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Dis-agree (X)	<u>Management's Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
				minimum of 8 weeks of stockpiling to achieve better efficiencies in procurement.	
9.	The City Manager set a timeline for completion of the corporate pandemic response plan and the corporate pandemic communications strategy, and ensure that both documents contain essential details facilitating a timely and effective City response to the World Health Organization's pandemic alert phases.	X		<p>An updated draft of the Integrated Corporate Response Plan has been circulated to the Core Planning group for comment. It will be tabled with the Steering Committee in December 2007. Response tipping points are included based on WHO Phases.</p> <p>The Strategic Communications Division is responsible for leading the Toronto Government's communications activities for a range of high profile events that affect the City. Work on a communications strategy about and in support of City operations and employee communications before, during, and after an influenza pandemic outbreak began in mid-2006. The strategy is based on proven tactics successfully executed for significant events such as the SARS outbreak, the 2003 blackout and labour disruptions. It is anticipated to be complete by February 29, 2008. The strategy relies on the World Health Organization's pandemic alert phases and will be informed by the Toronto Public Health Plan for an Influenza Pandemic and the Office of Emergency Management's integrated corporate response plan.</p>	<p>Draft Integrated Corporate Response Plan to be tabled with Pandemic Influenza Steering Committee in December 2007. Timing of final report to be determined by Steering Committee following December discussion.</p> <p>Communications Plan to be developed by February 29, 2008.</p>

**Management’s Response to the Auditor General’s Review of
City of Toronto Pandemic Planning and Preparedness**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Dis-agree (X)	<u>Management’s Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The impact would be high if the service was eliminated completely • There is a low feasibility and high cost of creating an alternate transportation system for all City employees using the public transportation system. In addition, employee surveys historically have low response rates making it difficult to create and maintain a useful database of public transit users over an extended period of time. Also, the random nature of the illness would make it difficult to create specific transportation plans for individual employees. This is further complicated by the diverse locations City employees reside and the multitude of work locations across the City • If necessary, the City would replicate a plan similar to that contemplated in the event of a TTC disruption which would encourage the use of personal vehicles, taxis, and walking and biking where and when feasible, In addition car pooling would be encouraged and supported through an intranet website though a concern for social distancing may impede this effort. 	

**Management's Response to the Auditor General's Review of
City of Toronto Pandemic Planning and Preparedness**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Dis- agree (X)	<u>Management's Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
11.	The City Manager take necessary steps to develop and implement a process to systematically track and monitor costs associated with pandemic preparedness.	X		<p>The Accounting Services Division will set up a cost centre to track costs associated with the corporate activities. To date, key divisions, such as EMS and Homes for the Aged as part of their regular operating budgets, have spent funds to stockpile essential items. However, at this time, no money has been spent out of the amount approved by Council to fund the pandemic preparedness activities, since the staff Committee is still in the process of determining the specific items and optimum amount of the various materials and supplies to be purchased and stored. Once these activities are completed, staff will determine if the approved budget meets needs identified. After this process is completed, costs centres will be set up and expenses monitored in relation to the approved budget.</p> <p>It should be noted that the process described above is very similar to the method followed in the tracking costs associated with SARS, whereby costs were tracked within cost centres and reported to Council and the province for cost recovery. The costs accumulated based on the process adhered to for SARS was subject to audit by the provincial ministry auditors which provides assurance that costs related to SARS were maintained within the system in a format that facilitated the audit of these costs.</p> <p>Accounting Services will work with Divisions to track their spending for all pan flu related items based on Division's specific needs for health and safety or in compliance with any legislative</p>	To be completed by the end of first quarter 2008.

**Management’s Response to the Auditor General’s Review of
City of Toronto Pandemic Planning and Preparedness**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Dis-agree (X)	<u>Management’s Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
				requirements.	
12.	The City Manager develop a corporate pandemic implementation plan outlining goals, specific short-term objectives and targeted timelines, as well as assignment of responsibilities.	X		The process to monitor the implementation of the City’s Pandemic Influenza Integrated Corporate Response Plan will be undertaken through a workplan of tasks, target timelines, deliverables, assignment of responsibilities and a system to determine the completion of tasks.	A work plan is prepared and will be updated as required. It will be revised to reflect the elements as outlined in the Management Response. To be completed by mid-December 2007.