

# STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

### Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Class Environmental Assessment Study

Date:	November 12, 2007
To:	Planning and Growth Management Committee
From:	General Manager, Transportation Services Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning
Wards:	Ward 5, Etobicoke -Lakeshore
Reference Number:	p:\2007\ClusterB\tra\tim\pg07034tim

#### **SUMMARY**

The Six Points Interchange is a complex grade-separated intersection of three arterial roads, namely Dundas Street West, Bloor Street West and Kipling Avenue. Built in 1961, its design is comparable to that of a highway interchange. The design was envisioned as a solution to improving the efficiency of the then existing six legged intersection of the three roads, at a time when little consideration was given to the long term development potential of abutting lands and the emphasis was on maximizing through traffic capacity.

For more than two decades, the reconfiguration of the Six Points Interchange has been a municipal objective, to help make what is now known as Etobicoke Centre a more urban, transit oriented, pedestrian and bike friendly place. This emerging centre, one of the four centres identified in the City's Official Plan and in Provincial planning policy, would realize improved development opportunities on both publicly and privately owned lands through the replacement of the existing interchange with a series of urban intersections and the creation of more conventional development blocks.

While various plans for the reconfiguration have been conceived in the past, none have been approved. This report recommends a preferred alternative for the reconfiguration of the interchange and that the Notice of Completion of the Class Environmental Assessment Study be issued. An approved Environmental Assessment Study Report would facilitate both short term and long range planning to accommodate change, including providing a context for private development approvals and public asset management.

Now is the right timing and opportunity to align a decision on the interchange reconfiguration with other decisions to be made by Council on opportunities for the future use of the Westwood Theatre Lands, transit improvements planned for Kipling and Islington subway stations and the continuing market interest in Etobicoke Centre.

A Municipal Class Environmental Assessment study examining the reconfiguration of the Six Points Interchange has been completed. The evaluation of alternative design solutions, which included consultation with the public and review agencies, resulted in the following Recommended Design:

- Removal of the existing interchange structures to create at-grade intersections between Kipling Avenue, Bloor Street West and Dundas Street West;
- A widening of Kipling Avenue to provide turning lanes at the new intersections, in addition to the existing 4 through lanes, from just south of Viking Lane to approximately 165 m north of Bloor Street, within a 42 m right-of-way;
- A 6-lane cross-section with exclusive left turn lanes at the appropriate intersections on a new Dundas Street West alignment through the Westwood Theatre Lands matching the existing Dundas Street cross-section west of Kipling Avenue to Bloor Street, within a 42 m right-of-way;
- Bloor Street West is directly connected east and west of Kipling Avenue via a new roadway with 4 through lanes, a 1.8 m bike lane in each direction, and the potential for on-street parking, within a 42 m right-of-way;
- A 4-lane cross-section on Dunbloor Road, within a 26 m right-of-way; and
- A new 2-lane roadway connection from St. Albans Road through the Westwood Theatre Lands to Dundas Street.

A Notice of Completion must now be issued and the Environmental Study Report filed in the public record for a 30-day review period in accordance with the requirements of the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

The Transportation Services and City Planning Divisions recommend that:

- 1. authority be granted to the General Manager, Transportation Services and the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning to issue a Notice of Completion and to file the Environmental Study Report for the Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Class Environmental Assessment Study in the public record for 30 days in accordance with the requirements of the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment;
- 2. authority be granted to the Chief Planner and Executive Director of City Planning to bring forward a report on any necessary amendments to the City of Toronto Official Plan to provide for the Recommended Design for reconfiguring the Six

Points Interchange upon approval of the Environmental Study Report under the Environmental Assessment Act; and

3. the General Manager of Transportation Services, the Chief Planner and Executive Director of City Planning, the Chief Corporate Officer, and the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer report jointly on a funding and staging strategy for implementing the reconfiguration of the Six Points Interchange, upon approval of the Environmental Study Report under the Environmental Assessment Act.

#### Financial Impact

There is no immediate financial impact resulting from the recommendations contained in this report.

The reconfiguration of the Six Points Interchange is closely tied to the future use, and potential disposition, of the Westwood Theatre Lands and adjacent surplus interchange lands. As indicated in the above recommendation, subsequent to the approval of the Environmental Study Report under the Environmental Assessment Act, a future staff report will be submitted that provides a funding and staging strategy for implementing the reconfiguration of the Six Points Interchange.

The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

#### **ISSUE BACKGROUND**

#### **Existing Configuration of the Six Points Interchange**

The existing Six Points Interchange was originally constructed by the Metropolitan Toronto Department of Roads in 1961. It provides a grade-separated interchange between Dundas Street West, Bloor Street West and Kipling Avenue. The design of the interchange is comparable to that of a highway interchange. Traffic generally moves freely across several sweeping interconnected ramps. Vehicular access to adjacent lands is limited and the environment for pedestrians and cyclists is poor. Attachment 1 illustrates the interchange as it exists today.

Planning for the existing configuration of the interchange predated consideration of the redevelopment of adjacent lands to a higher intensity of residential and commercial use, particularly in the context of developing transit-oriented centre. The Bloor-Danforth subway was not extended to Islington until 1968 and further west to Kipling until 1980.

#### Rationale for Reconfiguring the Interchange

Reconfiguration of the Six Points Interchange has been a municipal objective for more than two decades. The former City of Etobicoke initially pursued the reconfiguration of

the interchange in conjunction with the development of the Etobicoke *City Centre Secondary Plan (Centre Plan)*, which was approved in 1987. The secondary plan area generally included lands in the vicinity of the Islington and Kipling subway stations, from Shorncliffe Road in the west through to Montgomery Road in the east, along both Bloor Street West and Dundas Street West.

The *Centre Plan* recognized the area's high level of transit accessibility and encouraged the development of concentrations of high density office and residential uses in the vicinity of the Islington and Kipling subway stations, along with complementary retail, service and institutional uses. The preparation of the *Centre Plan* was consistent with the Metropolitan Toronto Official Plan (1983), which identified the area as an Intermediate Metropolitan Centre and required area municipalities to prepare development plans for Centres as amendments to their respective Official Plans. The *Etobicoke City Centre's* designation was subsequently upgraded to that of Major Centre in the new Metropolitan Toronto Official Plan approved in 1994.

Background studies prepared in support of the development of the *Centre Plan* identified the existing configuration of the Six Points Interchange as the most significant impediment to achieving the development of the *City Centre*. Consequently, the approved *Centre Plan* included a policy calling for the reconfiguration of the interchange to: foster a more urban pattern of development in the vicinity of the interchange; release surplus interchange land for redevelopment; improve vehicular access to adjacent lands; and, to improve pedestrian linkages between redevelopment sites.

Improving access to the abutting Westwood Theatre Lands was a specific objective. The site, then owned by Metropolitan Toronto and currently owned by the City of Toronto, is located south of Bloor Street West and east of Kipling Avenue. It comprises approximately 7.9 hectares (19.5 acres) of largely vacant land, with the exception of an old movie theatre that is no longer in operation, a 1.13 hectares (2.8 acres) parcel of land occupied by a police station (22 Division) and approximately 1.0 hectare (2.5 acres) occupied by the Bloor-Danforth subway right-of-way. These lands are highlighted on Attachment 1. The site was considered as a potential location for a new Etobicoke Civic Centre.

The City of Toronto recently reaffirmed the relevance of these policy directions through the adoption of a new secondary plan for the area. The *Etobicoke Centre Secondary Plan* (*Secondary Plan*) was approved in 2002 in the context of a program to develop a new Official Plan for the City of Toronto.

#### **Previous Interchange Redesign Initiatives**

Several studies were undertaken over the years to investigate alternative designs for reconfiguring the Six Points Interchange. Alternative interchange designs were investigated through the *Kipling / Islington Transportation Study* (1983), the *Six Points Interchange Redesign Study* (1989), and the *Review of Redesign Proposals for Six Points Interchange Study* (1989). The latter study recommended a design concept that

was endorsed by the former City of Etobicoke and Metropolitan Toronto staff in 1990. The proposed design did not entirely satisfy all of the City of Etobicoke's design criteria, but was accepted in the spirit of moving the project forward.

Further study of the endorsed design concept was suspended in the mid 1990's as a result of discussions between the City of Etobicoke and Metropolitan Toronto concerning the use of the then Metro-owned Westwood Theatre Lands for a new Etobicoke Civic Centre, and funding issues associated with the interchange reconfiguration. Consequently, no detailed plans were ever produced and no environmental approvals were obtained.

In the absence of any firm plans or funding commitments to reconfigure the interchange, a program to rehabilitate the interchange was initiated in 1996 in response to concerns regarding the age and physical condition of bridges within the interchange. All existing bridges were subsequently rehabilitated between 1998 and 2000.

In the intervening period the approval of development adjacent to the Six Points interchange has precluded the previously endorsed design option.

#### **Etobicoke Centre Secondary Plan**

The new *Etobicoke Centre Secondary Plan*, approved by City Council in November of 2002, continues to identify the reconfiguration of this interchange as a significant component of the development of *Etobicoke Centre*, notwithstanding the recent investment in the rehabilitation of the existing interchange bridges.

Etobicoke Centre is one of four designated growth centres identified in the City of Toronto Official Plan. The other three are North York Centre, Scarborough Centre and Yonge-Eglinton. The vision for Etobicoke Centre is for an integrated, mixed-use community with the feel and function of an urban core. The Secondary Plan's policies are intended to enhance the concentration of employment and housing in Etobicoke Centre to better utilize the substantial past investment in public transit and other urban infrastructure that currently exists. The envisioned vibrant mix of employment and housing will present opportunities for residents to live in close proximity to their work or use public transit to get to their jobs.

Seven distinct subareas are defined within the *Secondary Plan* area, and are shown on the Attachment 2. The Six Points "Focus Area", which includes the Westwood Theatre Lands, envisions a high-density, mixed-use neighbourhood around the Kipling Subway and GO Rail stations, with large development blocks divided by new public roads. Reconfiguration of the Six Points Interchange is a significant component of this vision, and is intended to: improve the connectivity and amenity of pedestrian and bicycle infrastructure through the interchange and to adjacent neighbourhoods and employment areas; improve access to adjacent development sites, particularly the Westwood Theatre Lands; create new development opportunities on surplus lands, and generally improve the streetscape.

Development throughout Etobicoke Centre has been proceeding relatively quickly since amalgamation. It is timely that a decision be made on the potential reconfiguration of the Six Points Interchange to ensure that appropriate measures are implemented to protect for the implementation of the Recommended Design.

#### The West District Study

In February 2003, City Council approved "in principle, the concept of a new West District Service Centre that is optimally located with respect to the Bloor-Danforth Subway Line," and directed "the Commissioner of Corporate Services, in consultation with the relevant City Departments, [to] commence the process to develop the new West District Service Centre and the disposal of certain West District Lands …"

This initiative is focused on selecting a site for a new civic centre complex to serve Etobicoke York District that would replace the Etobicoke Civic Centre currently located at the southeast corner of The West Mall and Burnhamthorpe Road. The initiative is known as the *West District Study* and focuses on three City-owned properties: the existing Etobicoke Civic Centre Complex on the West Mall; the northwest corner of Bloor Street and Islington Avenue; and the Westwood Theatre Lands. A component of the West District Study is the *West District Design Initiative (WDDI)*, which has explored potential development opportunities and urban design concepts for each of the three subject properties.

Reconfiguration of the interchange has the potential to improve vehicular and pedestrian access to the Westwood Theatre Lands, thereby broadening development opportunities. Furthermore, surplus interchange lands associated with the recommended interchange reconfiguration could potentially be consolidated with the existing Westwood Theatre Lands. Planning for the Westwood Theatre Lands will be guided, in part, by the preferred solution for the proposed reconfiguration of the Six Points Interchange.

Consequently, the *WDDI* took into consideration the preferred interchange design recommended through the Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Class Environmental Assessment Study. Facilities & Real Estate staff, in conjunction with City Planning staff, will be presenting the results of the *WDDI* in a separate report to the Planning and Growth Management Committee for consideration with the Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Class Environmental Assessment Study.

#### Other Major Strategic Infrastructure Initiatives In Etobicoke Centre

In addition to the reconfiguration of the Six Points interchange, the *Etobicoke Centre Secondary Plan* envisions the implementation of two significant transit initiatives to support the development objectives of the *Secondary Plan*. Both of these initiatives are presently in the detailed design stage.

The first transit initiative involves the relocation of Mississauga Transit bus terminal operations from Islington to Kipling Subway Station. The Province recently announced

funding for the construction of a new inter-regional bus terminal in the immediate vicinity of Kipling Subway Station, west of Aukland Road, to accommodate the relocation of Mississauga Transit bus terminal operations from the Islington Subway Station. The new terminal will also accommodate GO Bus operations. The new terminal is planned to be operational in the Winter of 2010/2011.

The project includes the construction of a new pedestrian entrance to the east-end of the existing Kipling TTC bus terminal. This new entrance will significantly reduce walking distance to the subway station from the Westwood Theatre Lands, thereby enhancing development opportunities across the site.

The second transit initiative involves the redevelopment of the TTC bus terminal at the Islington Subway Station to free-up land at the northwest corner of Bloor Street/Islington Avenue for future development. The existing bus terminal will be demolished and a new bus terminal will be constructed north of the existing terminal, just south of the Canadian Pacific Railway corridor, within the adjacent hydro corridor. The new terminal will be operational in the Fall of 2010 and demolition of the existing bus terminal will be completed in the Spring of 2011.

Again, it is timely that a decision be made on the future reconfiguration of the Six Points Interchange, to provide a context for decision-making on the development of the balance of undeveloped sites within *Etobicoke Centre*, particularly the Westwood Theatre Lands, recognizing the continued public investment in transit in the Centre.

#### COMMENTS

#### **Study Process**

The Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Class Environmental Assessment Study has been completed according to the requirements for a Schedule "C" project under the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (the Class EA). As a requirement of the Schedule "C" projects, if City Council endorses the recommendations of the Study, the Environmental Study Report (ESR) will be filed in the public record for a minimum 30-day review period. During this period, members of the public, and any other interested individual, interest group, or government agency, may request that a Part II Order be issued. A Part II Order, if granted by the Minister of Environment, elevates the status of the project from a Class EA Study to an Individual Environmental Assessment. If this occurs, the project cannot proceed until the proponent completes an Individual Environmental Assessment Study and receives approval from the Minister. If a Part II Order is not granted or if no requests or objections are received during the filing period, the project is approved under the Environmental Assessment Act and may proceed.

The ESR describes in detail the first three phases of the five-phase environmental planning process set out by the Class EA:

Phase 1 – identification of the problem or opportunity;

Phase 2 – identification and evaluation of alternative solutions; and

Phase 3 – identification and evaluation of alternative design concepts for the preferred solution.

The preparation of the ESR itself and the filing of the document in the public record constitute Phase 4 of the environmental planning process. Phase 5 is the construction and operation or implementation of the project, and monitoring of impacts, in accordance with the terms of the EA approval. The Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Class Environmental Assessment Study is currently at Phase 4 of the process.

The Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Class Environmental Assessment Study was carried out with the assistance of technical consultants and supported by a Technical Advisory Committee comprised of staff from Transportation Services, City Planning, Technical Services, Facilities and Real Estate, the Toronto Transit Commission (TTC) and Toronto Water.

#### **Public Consultation**

Public involvement is an integral and ongoing part of the study process for the Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Class Environmental Assessment Study. The minimum public consultation requirements of the Class EA were surpassed. Two public information centres (PIC) were held at key decision points during the study. Additional meetings were held with the specific community groups as well as joint meetings to discuss the Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Class Environmental Assessment Study and the WDDI.

Details of the public consultation process and the primary concerns expressed by the public and affected agencies are documented in Attachment 6 and in Chapter Nos. 4 and 5, as well as Appendix E of the ESR.

#### **Environmental Assessment Findings**

#### (1) Identification of the Problem or Opportunity

A Primary Study Area was established to identify where physical modifications to the road infrastructure would be developed. The area included the Etobicoke Centre limits, which includes an area roughly bounded by Montgomery Road in the east, Dundas Street West in the north, Shaver Avenue and Shorncliffe Road to the west and the Canadian Pacific Railway line to the south. A Secondary Study Area was identified for the purpose of analysing broader network impacts to the Six Points Interchange. The Secondary Study area, is bounded by Shorncliffe Road and Shaver Road to the west, Royal York Road to the east, Burnhamthorpe Road to the north and North Queen Street and Norseman Street to the south. Both the Primary and Secondary Study Areas are illustrated in Exhibit 1-2 of the ESR.

The following summarizes the results of a review of existing physical and operating conditions at the Six Points Interchange:

- The Six Points Interchange occupies a significant amount of land, some of which could potentially be freed up for alternative uses to support the development policies of the Etobicoke Centre Secondary Plan.
- Existing vehicular access to the Westwood Theatre Lands is poor, due to the existing freeway-type ramp configurations and site grading, adversely affecting future development potential.
- Pedestrian connections through the interchange are poor, particularly between lands on either side of Kipling Avenue, and pedestrian conflicts with vehicular traffic at the free flow ramps must be addressed. There is also a need for an improved pedestrian network to link the Kipling Subway Station with the Westwood Theatre Lands and to developing residential communities immediately north and east of the interchange.
- The Toronto Bike Plan identifies Bloor Street West, east and west of Kipling Avenue, as a candidate bike lane route and a section of Dundas Street between Kipling Avenue and Dunbloor Road as a candidate off-road bike route. Currently, use of the Six Points interchange by cyclists is difficult. The interchange is without facilities for cyclists, and the interchange-style road geometry and associated free-flow traffic conditions are not conducive to cycling and present safety concerns for cyclists.
- Some of the major signalized intersections on roads approaching the Six Points
  area, namely Dundas Street at Poplar Avenue and Dundas Street at Islington
  Avenue, are operating at capacity during the AM and PM peak hours. These
  gateway intersections are the major road network constraints in the study area and
  not the Six Points Interchange itself. This means that there are opportunities to
  reconfigure the interchange to take advantage of spare capacity on some traffic
  movements.
- Within the Six Points Interchange, the northbound Kipling Avenue to westbound
  Dundas Street ramp is operating at capacity during the AM and PM peak hours.
  During the weekday AM peak hour, the eastbound Dundas Street to southbound
  Kipling Avenue ramp is operating at capacity. All other movements within the
  interchange are operating within capacity.
- There were a high number of rear-end collisions where the loop ramp from northbound Kipling Avenue merges with westbound Dundas Street, and where the eastbound Dundas Street ramp merges with southbound Kipling Avenue. These merge points are controlled by stop and yield signs, respectively.

A full description of the inventory and analysis of physical and operating conditions can be found in Chapter Nos. 2 and 3 of the ESR.

(2) Evaluation of Alternative Solutions and Alternative Designs for the Preferred Solution

To address the issues described above, a "long-list" of 33 alternative solutions was developed and evaluated, resulting in the identification of the following 4 alternative designs:

**Do Nothing** – This alternative represents continuation of the status quo and would involve no changes or improvements to the existing Six Points Interchange. This option provides a baseline for comparison purposes.

**Modified Existing – Improved Westwood Lands Access** – This alternative represents continuation of existing conditions and would involve no significant changes to the existing Six Points Interchange, but would involve improved access to the Westwood Theatre Lands.

**Fully At-Grade, Dundas Street Loop** – This alternative includes all at-grade intersections, with Dundas Street realigned to the south through the Westwood Theatre Lands, and Bloor Street connected through the Kipling Avenue intersection.

**Dundas Street Underpass** – This alternative entails grade separating Dundas Street in an underpass of Kipling Avenue and of Bloor Street. Bloor Street would connect through the Kipling Avenue intersection at-grade.

Following a detailed evaluation and consultation with interested stakeholders and agencies, the Fully At-Grade Dundas Street Loop option was selected as the preferred design. This option provides a balance amongst City building/urban design objectives, traffic and transit operational requirements, accommodation for pedestrians and cyclists, protection of stable residential communities, and impacts to future developments. The cost of this option is lower than for the Dundas Street Underpass, and it has the highest potential return on land value of all the options.

A brief description of the alternatives and the results of the evaluation are provided in Attachment 5. Complete details on the evaluation are provided in Chapter Nos. 4 and 5 of the ESR.

#### (3) Recommended Design

The Recommended Design, illustrated in plan on Attachment 3 and on Exhibit 6-1 of the ESR, includes the following elements:

- Removal of the existing interchange structures to create an at-grade intersections between Kipling Avenue, Bloor Street West and Dundas Street West;
- A widening of Kipling Avenue to provide turning lanes, at the new intersections, in addition to the existing 4 through lanes, from just south of Viking Lane to approximately 165 m north of Bloor Street, within a 42 m right-of-way;
- A 6-lane cross-section with exclusive left turn lanes at the appropriate intersections on a new Dundas Street West alignment through the Westwood

- Theatre Lands matching the existing Dundas Street cross-section west of Kipling Avenue to Bloor Street, within a 42 m right-of-way;
- Bloor Street West, is directly connected east and west of Kipling Avenue via a new roadway with 4 through lanes, a 1.8 m bike lane in each direction, and the potential for on-street parking, within a 42 m right-of-way;
- A 4-lane cross-section on Dunbloor Road, within a 26 m right-of-way; and
- A new 2-lane roadway connection from St. Albans Road through the Westwood Theatre Lands to Dundas Street.

Attachment 3 also identifies the resulting parcels of developable land created by the consolidation of surplus interchange lands with the abutting Westwood Theatre Lands. Seven potential development blocks are created, assuming the longer term redevelopment of the police station. The seven blocks total approximately 6.19 hectares (15.3 acres) of developable land Approximately 0.71 hectare (1.75 acres) of additional surplus interchange land is freed for alternative use, however, the ability of these lands to accommodate independent development is constrained by their size and location. Some of this additional surplus land could potentially to be developed through consolidation with abutting privately owned lands. A small parcel, located immediately east of Kipling Avenue, is planned to be used to accommodate part of a new TTC passenger pick-up and drop-off area being constructed in conjunction with a planned new east pedestrian entrance to Kipling Subway station.

By comparison, the existing Westwood Theatre Lands comprise approximately 6.88 hectares (17 acres), including the police station lands, but excluding the TTC subway right-of-way. It is highly likely that the hypothetical redevelopment of the site, assuming the existing configuration of the Six Points interchange, would require the extension of new public roads through the site, potentially reducing the developable area to approximately 5.26 hectares (13 acres).

Attachment 4 is a rendering of the recommended design for the Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration, in the context of one potential option for the treatment of built-form and open space associated with the future redevelopment of lands abutting the new road network. This rendering, prepared through the *WDDI*, shows a potential Civic Centre and Civic Square at the northeast corner of Kipling Avenue and Dundas Street West and is shown for illustrative purposes only, as no decisions have been made by Council on the future use of the Westwood Theatre Lands to date.

#### **Property Impacts**

While the majority of the lands required to implement the Recommended Design are City owned, some acquisition of private property is required. The existing right-of-way width of Dunbloor Road is 20 m, but a 26 m right-of-way is required for the Recommended Design. Building setbacks have already been secured to protect for a 26 m right-of-way on Dunbloor Road in conjunction with proposed developments on the east side of Dunbloor Road (5145 Dundas Street West) and on the west side of Dunbloor Road (2 Dunbloor Road). A 1.5 m strip of property will need to be acquired along the east side of

Dunbloor Road, in addition to the 1.5 m wide strip previously secured by the City, and 3.0 m of property will need to be acquired along the west side. The property requirement is estimated to be approximately 230 m<sup>2</sup> (2,476 ft<sup>2</sup>) on the east side of Dunbloor Road and 355 m<sup>2</sup> (3,821 ft<sup>2</sup>) on the west side, for a total of approximately 585 m<sup>2</sup> (6,297 ft<sup>2</sup>).

#### **Cost and Staging**

The estimated new construction capital cost of the Recommended Design is \$37.0 million (2007 dollars), excluding property acquisition, remediation and landscaping costs.

No funding is provided in the Transportation Services Capital Budget for this work at this time. The implementation of the Recommended Design is closely tied to the redevelopment of the Westwood Theatre Lands. A strategy for funding the interchange reconfiguration will be developed in the context of a development strategy for the Westwood Theatre Lands. This will be the subject of a future staff report. The time to construct the preferred design, assuming that full funding is available, is estimated to be 2 to 3 years.

Alternatively, there is the possibility that the Recommended Design could be implemented over an extended period to spread-out capital expenditures. Construction could be staged to permit the incremental development of the Westwood Theatre Lands. This would entail the construction of some elements of the preferred design but would not require complete removal of the overpass structures. Any extended staging option would need to ensure that access to and from the Kipling Subway Station is maintained for TTC vehicles at acceptable levels so that the interim condition is not worse for transit than would be the case with the Recommended Design.

#### **Next Steps**

Following approval of this report by City Council, the ESR will be filed in the public record for a minimum 30-day period. Once EA approval is received, design and construction of the Recommended Design may proceed. However, decisions concerning the implementation of the recommended design, particularly funding and staging decisions, are closely tied to decisions yet to be made about the future use, and potential disposition, of the Westwood Theatre Lands and adjacent surplus interchange lands. A funding and staging strategy for the Six Points reconfiguration will be developed in the context of a strategy for developing the under-utilised Westwood Theatre Lands and adjacent surplus interchange lands. This will be the subject of a future staff report. In the meantime, once EA approval is received, the preparation of any necessary Official Plan amendments and the protection for the ultimate road network can be pursued.

#### CONTACT

John P. Kelly, P.Eng. Mike Wehkind

Manager, Infrastructure Planning Program Manager, Transportation Planning

Transportation Services Division City Planning Division (416) 394-8217 Tel: (416) 392-8340 Tel: Fax: (416) 392-4808 Fax: (416) 394-6063

E-mail: jkelly@toronto.ca E-mail: mwehkind@toronto.ca

#### **SIGNATURE**

Gary Welsh, P.Eng. Gary Wright

General Manager, Acting Chief Planner & Executive Director,

City Planning Transportation Services

UCM/JPK/MW/cs

#### **ATTACHMENTS**

Attachment 1: **Existing Six Points Interchange** 

Attachment 2: Etobicoke Centre Secondary Plan Areas

Attachment 3: Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Recommended Design Attachment 4: Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Recommended Design:

Ariel View Illustrating a Potential Civic Centre Development

Concept

Attachment 5: Results of the Evaluation of Alternative Solutions and Alternative

Designs for the Preferred Solutions

Public Consultation and Public/Agency Concerns Attachment 6: Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Environmental Attachment 7:

Study Report

#### **ATTACHMENT 5**

#### Results of the Evaluation of Altenative Solutions and Alternative Designs for the Preferred Solutions

1. Identification and Evaluation of Alternative Solutions

A "long list" of 33 alternative solutions was developed from a number of sources, including three separate studies conducted between 1983 and 1989 to review redesign concepts for the interchange, an urban design charrette held in 1999 in conjunction with the 'City Centre Secondary Plan' review, and concepts developed though this study.

The resulting concepts and those from the previous studies were grouped into the following six families to facilitate analysis:

- 1. **Do Nothing** This alternative represented continuation of the status quo and would involve no changes or improvements to the existing Six Points Interchange. This option provides a baseline for comparison purposes.
- 2. **Fully At-Grade** This alternative included options with all at-grade intersections. No grade separation of the road network would be involved.
- 3. **Bloor-Dundas Connected with Grade Separation** This alternative included grade separated options with Bloor Street west of Kipling Avenue connected to Dundas Street east of Kipling Avenue, or Dundas Street west of Kipling Avenue connected to Bloor Street east of Kipling Avenue.
- 4. **Bloor Connected with Grade Separation** This alternative included options with Bloor Street east and west of Kipling Avenue directly connected at-grade. These options would involve a grade separation between Kipling Avenue and Dundas Street West.
- 5. **Bloor Not Connected with Grade Separation** –This alternative included options with Dundas Street east and west of Kipling Avenue directly connected, or with modifications to existing conditions. All options involved no direct connection of Bloor Street east and west of Kipling Avenue and a grade separation between Dundas Street and Kipling Avenue.
- 6. **Roundabout and Ring Road** This alternative included options with a ring-road system, and no grade separation.

#### **Initial Screening**

A set of coarse criteria was developed to provide a first-step elimination of some of the 33 "long list" of options. These criteria are as follows:

- The ability to release interchange lands to create better development parcels in the Westwood Theatre Lands;
- The ability to support the Etobicoke Secondary Plan vision of creating an urban core type environment, including normalizing intersections (i.e. intersect at-grade, meet typical geometric design criteria, pedestrian and cyclist accessibility, etc.);
- The ability to maintain arterial road continuity / connectivity (i.e. Dundas-Dundas connection, Bloor-Bloor connection, and Kipling-Kipling connection);
- No "above grade" grade separations (in keeping with the vision of an urban core);
- No significant impacts on active development sites.

The "long list" of alternative solutions was analysed based on the ability of each alternative solution to address the coarse criteria and this resulted in an initial "short list" of six alternative solutions, including the "Do-nothing" alternative. These alternative solutions were carried forward for more detailed evaluation. The "short list" is as follows:

- 1. **Do Nothing** This alternative represents continuation of the status quo and would involve no changes or improvements to the existing Six Points Interchange. This option provides a baseline for comparison purposes.
- 2. **Fully At-Grade, Dundas Street Loop** This alternative includes all at-grade intersections, with Dundas Street realigned to the south through the Westwood Theatre Lands, and Bloor Street connected through the Kipling Avenue intersection.
- 3. Fully At-Grade, Bloor Street Loop This alternative includes all at-grade intersections and connecting Bloor Street east and west of Kipling Avenue via a new alignment through the Westwood Theatre Lands. Dundas Street West and Kipling Avenue would be connected at-grade on their current alignments, resulting in a skewed intersection.
- 4. Fully At-Grade, Kipling Avenue Loop This alternative includes all at-grade intersections. To achieve right-angled intersections, Kipling Avenue would be realigned to the east, and Bloor Street east and west of Kipling Avenue connected via a new alignment through the Westwood Theatre Lands. Dundas Street would connect on its current alignment.
- 5. **Dundas Street Underpass** This alternative entails grade-separating Dundas Street in an underpass of both Kipling Avenue and Bloor Street. Bloor Street would connect at-grade through the Kipling Avenue intersection.
- 6. **Kipling Avenue Underpass** This alternative entails directly connecting Bloor Street east and west of Kipling Avenue at-grade. Dundas Street would be realigned to the south to account for appropriate intersection angles. A grade separation of Kipling Avenue would result in it passing, via an underpass, under both Bloor Street and Dundas Street.

Full details on the evaluation of the long list of alternative solutions is provided in the Chapter 4 of the ESR.

2. Identification and Evaluation of Alternative Design Concepts

After developing alternative designs for the preliminary "short list" of alternative solutions, a further screening was undertaken to identify options with significant impacts or deficiencies.

The result of the screening was that three alternatives – the Fully At-Grade Bloor Street Loop, the Fully At-Grade Kipling Avenue Loop, and the Kipling Avenue Underpass – were screened out from further evaluation. The main reasons for eliminating these alternatives include impacts on existing properties and poor development potential. The full rationale can be found in Chapter 5.1 of the ESR.

In consideration of the cost of removing the existing interchange structures, the City also developed an alternative solution that would maintain the existing structures and provide access improvements through the Westwood Theatre lands. This alternative solution was added to the "Short List", and is referred to as the Modified Existing – Improved Westwood Lands Access alternative.

Refined design concepts were developed for the four alternative solutions and these are described below:

- 1. **Do Nothing** This alternative represented continuation of the status quo and would involve no changes or improvements to the existing Six Points Interchange. This option provides a baseline for comparison purposes.
- 2. **Modified Existing Improved Westwood Lands Access –** This alternative represents continuation of existing conditions and would involve no significant changes to the existing Six Points Interchange, but would involve improved access to the Westwood Theatre Lands.
- 3. **Fully At-Grade, Dundas Street Loop** This alternative includes all at-grade intersections, with Dundas Street realigned to the south through the Westwood Theatre Lands, and Bloor Street connected through the Kipling Avenue intersection.
- 4. **Dundas Street Underpass** This alternative entails grade separating Dundas Street in an underpass to Kipling Avenue and to Bloor Street. Bloor Street would connect through the Kipling Avenue intersection at-grade.

These options are shown in the ESR as Exhibit 5-1, Exhibit 5-2, Exhibit 5-3 and Exhibit 5-4, respectively.

A set of criteria for evaluating these design options was developed. The criteria included impacts on the social and economic environments, transportation network, the natural environment, implementation, costs, and land value, as follows:

- Land Use and Socio-Economic Impact: this criterion considered such things as impacts on the surrounding residential community and businesses, use of lands adjacent to the Six Points Interchange, property impacts on active development sites; property acquisition and impacts on existing utilities/services;
- City Building: This criterion considered such things as the ability to provide a compact transit-oriented street and block pattern, the provision for the integration of surplus interchange lands into the existing urban fabric, the ability to promote street-oriented buildings and the ability to promote pedestrian scale building-to-street relationships;
- Transportation Transit: this criterion considered surface transit operations, enhanced transit service, access for surface transit vehicles; and vehicular access to ancillary subway station facilities;
- Transportation Traffic: this criterion considered arterial road continuity / connectivity, traffic levels of service and vehicular access to the Westwood Theatre Lands, and adjacent sites;
- Transportation Pedestrians: this criterion considered such thing as the overall pedestrian environment / experience;
- Transportation Cyclists: this criterion considered bicycle access to/from the Kipling Station, provision of bicycle friendly streets, and implementing the City's Bikeway Network;
- Environmental Impacts: this criterion considered the natural environment including air quality;
- Implementation: this criterion considered the construction feasibility and staging opportunities;
- Costs: this criteria considered construction costs and maintenance costs; and
- Land Value: this criterion compared the relative land value of the alternatives.

Based upon these criteria, the Fully At-Grade Dundas Street Loop option was selected as the preferred design. This option provides a balance amongst City building/urban design objectives, traffic and transit operational requirements, accommodation for pedestrians and cyclists, protection of stable residential communities, and impacts to future developments. The cost of this option is lower than for the Dundas Street Underpass, and it has the highest potential return on land value of all the options.

A detailed description of the evaluation of the "short-list" of alternative designs is provided in Chapter 5 of the ESR.

#### **ATTACHMENT 6**

## Public Consultation and Public/Agency Concerns

A Notice of Study Commencement appeared in two issues of the Etobicoke Guardian on November 28 and December 3, 2003. This notice announced the initiation of the Class EA study and invited interested stakeholders to participate. Two Public Information Centres (PIC) were held at key decision points during the study.

The first PIC was held on March 2, 2004. At this PIC, Transportation Services and City Planning staff presented an overview of the Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Class Environmental Assessment Study, the selected "short list" of proposed alternative design options, the preliminary criteria to evaluate these options and an outline of the next steps in the project. A Notice was placed in the Etobicoke Guardian (south section) on February 18 and 25, 2004, informing the public of the study and of the PIC. Beginning on February 18, approximately 10,000 notices were delivered, via Canada Post, to residents and businesses in the study area. Notification was also mailed to 120 people on the project contact list.

Approximately 230 members of the public attended the first PIC. The public had a number of questions pertaining to such things as the use of the reconfigured interchange lands, the rationale for reconfiguring the interchange, construction cost, and questions about other planning and development issues within the study area which are outside of the scope of the Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Class Environmental Assessment Study, including the potential future use of the Westwood Theatre lands and details concerning the proposed relocation of Mississauga Transit bus terminal facilities from Islington Station to Kipling Station. Comment sheets were handed out to all meeting attendees requesting feedback on the "short list" of proposed six alternative design options. A total of 71 comment sheets were received. The majority of the respondents preferred either the Fully At-Grade Dundas Street Loop alternative or the Do-nothing alternative. Of these two alternatives, there was a slight preference for the At-Grade Dundas Street Loop.

The second PIC was held on Tuesday, June 20, 2006. At this PIC, Transportation Services and City Planning staff presented an overview and background of the Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Class Environmental Assessment Study, the short-list of proposed alternative design options, the updated evaluation criteria to evaluate these options, the preliminary preferred design option, and an outline of the next steps for the project. Notices were mailed and/or e-mailed to 446 individuals on the project mailing list. Notices were placed in the Etobicoke Guardian (south section) on June 7 and 9, 2006, informing the public of the meeting. Approximately 12,000 notices were distributed via Canada Post, to residents and businesses in the study area.

Approximately 180 people attended the second PIC, with 155 of these signing the optional sign-in sheets. The public had a number of questions pertaining to such things

as the potential for increased traffic on Bloor Street west of Kipling Avenue, the potential for traffic infiltration through adjacent stable residential communities, the impact the proposed relocation of Mississauga Transit bus terminal facilities from Islington Station to Kipling Station would have on future interchange traffic operations, construction costs, timing of construction, and questions about other planning and development issues within the study area which are outside of the scope of the Six Points Reconfiguration Class Environmental Assessment Study, including the potential future use of the Westwood Theatre lands. Comment sheets were handed out to all meeting attendees requesting feedback on the four "short listed" alternative design options. A total of 54 comment sheets and or/letters and e-mails were submitted that clearly indicated a preferred option. The majority of the respondents preferred either the Fully At-Grade Dundas Street Loop design or the Do-nothing design. Of these two alternatives there was a slight preference for the At-Grade Dundas Street Loop design.

Beyond the public consultation program that formed part of the Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Study in April and May of 2007, the Ward Councillor held three community consultation meetings regarding the potential future development of the Westwood Theatre Lands and the reconfiguration of the Six Points Interchange. These meetings were not part of the Municipal Class EA public consultation requirements.

The first meeting, dealing with the Westwood Theatre lands, took place on April 28, 2007. The purpose of the meeting was to inform the public regarding the results of a design charrette held in November 2006 for the WDDI and to seek public comments. The second meeting was held on May 15, 2007 and dealt exclusively with questions concerning the proposed Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Class Environmental Assessment Study. The third meeting was held on May 30, 2007, and provided a final information meeting to discuss both the Westwood Theatre Lands and the Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration Class Environmental Assessment Study in one forum, as the two initiatives are closely tied together.

A full description of the public consultation program can be found in Chapter Nos. 4 and 5 as well as Appendix E of the ESR. Throughout the public consultation process a wide variety of valuable comments were received from the general public and review agencies, which assisted in the development and evaluation of the alternatives. The primary concerns identified through the consultation process and our responses are summarized below:

1. Future Use of the Westwood Theatre Lands and Surplus Interchange Lands Resulting from the Reconfigured Interchange

At both PICs questions were asked about the potential future development of the Cityowned Westwood Theatre lands and any future surplus interchange lands. Some residents expressed a desire for community uses on some or all of the lands including parks, a community centre, sports facilities and a library. Some residents had concerns about potential future new high rise residential condominium development. The recommendations of the Six Points Environmental Study Report have no impact on the Westwood Theatre lands' existing zoning designation. These lands were rezoned in November of 2002 in conjunction with the approval of the *Etobiocoke Centre Secondary Plan*. By-Law Number 1088-2002 designates the subject lands EC2, which is a mixed use designation allowing a wide range of commercial, institutional, municipal and residential uses at a maximum gross Floor Space Index (i.e. density) of 3.5. The maximum permitted height ranges between 60 and 72 metres. The range of public uses some residents would like to see developed on the Westwood site is currently permitted. Recommendations concerning the future development of the Westwood Theatre lands are outside of the scope of the Six Points Environmental Study Report. To date, Council has not taken any position on the future development of the Westwood Theatre lands.

Issues concerning the zoning designation of surplus interchange lands are outside of the scope of the Six Points Environmental Study Report and would be the subject of a future report to Council. For the purpose of evaluating future traffic conditions associated with the recommended reconfiguration of the Six Points Interchange, the Environmental Study Report conservatively assumed that the zoning designation of developable surplus interchange lands would be comparable to that of the adjacent Westwood Theatre lands.

#### 2. Increased Traffic Resulting from the Interchange Reconfiguration

At the second PIC residents expressed concern about the possibility for additional traffic on Bloor Street west of Kipling Avenue as a result of the preferred solution as well as infiltration into residential neighbourhoods.

Modelling undertaken for the Recommended Design indicates that local traffic on Bloor Street between Jopling Avenue and Kipling Avenue is anticipated to increase. This increase in traffic is due to the redistribution of local traffic due to the connection of Bloor Street through Kipling Avenue, and the development potential of large nearby properties. It is anticipated that the Bloor Street connection will not draw significant new through traffic to the Bloor Street corridor. Future traffic volumes on Bloor Street, in the vicinity of Aukland Road and Poplar Avenue, are estimated to increase by 5% and 7% during the weekday AM and PM peak periods respectively, compared to the Do-Nothing option.

The analysis undertaken for the Recommended Design indicates that the travel times for traffic, both transit and vehicular, will increase compared to the Do-nothing option. While it is not anticipated that this increase will result in infiltration into residential neighbourhoods, it is not possible to predict the changes in travel patterns with absolute certainty. For this reason, Transportation Services will commit to developing a monitoring program for traffic infiltration into residential neighbourhoods. The program would monitor infiltration prior to the reconfiguration, during the construction period, and post construction. In the event that infiltration is encountered, Transportation Services staff would work with area residents to develop appropriate mitigation measures. Potential mitigation measures could include changing signal timing to

encourage traffic to use the arterial roads, introduction of turn prohibitions into residential neighbourhoods, and traffic calming measures.