
Audit Committee

Meeting No.	7	Contact	Rosemary MacKenzie, Council Administrator
Meeting Date	Tuesday, April 22, 2008	Phone	416-392-8021
Start Time	9:30 AM	E-mail	rmacken@toronto.ca
Location	Committee Room 1, City Hall		

Audit Committee		
Councillor Doug Holyday, Chair	Councillor Rob Ford	Councillor Anthony Perruzza
Councillor Mike Del Grande, Vice-Chair	Councillor John Parker	Councillor Karen Stintz

Members of Council and Staff: Please keep this agenda and the accompanying material until the City Council meeting dealing with these matters has ended. **The City Clerk's Office will not provide additional copies.**

Special Assistance for Members of the Public: City staff can arrange for special assistance with some advance notice. If you need special assistance, please call (416-392-8021), TTY 416-338-0889 or e-mail rmacken@toronto.ca.

Closed Meeting Requirements: If the Audit Committee wants to meet in closed session (privately), a member of the committee must make a motion to do so and give the reason why the Committee has to meet privately. (City of Toronto Act, 2006)

Notice to people writing or making presentations to the Audit Committee: The City of Toronto Act, 2006 and the City of Toronto Municipal Code authorize the City of Toronto to collect any personal information in your communication or presentation to City Council or its committees.

The City collects this information to enable it to make informed decisions on the relevant issue(s). If you are submitting letters, faxes, e-mails, presentations or other communications to the City, you should be aware that your name and the fact that you communicated with the City will become part of the public record and will appear on the City's website. The City will also make your communication and any personal information in it – such as your postal address, telephone number or e-mail address – available to the public, unless you expressly request the City to remove it.

The City videotapes committee and community council meetings. If you make a presentation to a committee or community council, the City will be videotaping you and City staff may make the video tapes available to the public.

If you want to learn more about why and how the City collects your information, write to the City Clerk's Office, City Hall, 100 Queen Street West, Toronto ON M5H 2N2 or by calling 416-392-8021.

Declarations of Interest under the Municipal Conflict of Interest Act.**Confirmation of Minutes – February 22, 2008****Communications/Reports**

AU7.1	Information			
--------------	-------------	--	--	--

External Audit of the City’s Auditor General’s Office

(March 26, 2008) Report from Robert Gore & Associates, Chartered Accountants

Summary

To advise the Audit Committee of the results of the external audit of the Auditor General’s Office, noting that they are satisfied that the Auditor General’s Office is in compliance with the applicable City of Toronto policies.

Background Information

Report from Robert Gore & Associates (March 26, 2008) Auditor General’s Office - Special Purpose Audit to Determine Compliance with Section 169-30.5 of the City of Toronto’s Municipal Code

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-11817.pdf>

AU7.2	Information			
--------------	-------------	--	--	--

Toronto Transit Commission - Information Technology Projects, Opportunities for Improvements

(February 28, 2008) Letter from the General Secretary, Toronto Transit Commission

Summary

The Toronto Transit Commission considered a report (January 14, 2008) from the City’s Auditor General, entitled “The Management of Information Technology Projects - Opportunities for Improvement, Toronto Transit Commission”. The Commission received the report for information, and directed staff to forward the report to the City Audit Committee for information.

In 2006, as part of the City Auditor General’s schedule of audits, the TTC Information Technology Services (ITS) Department was identified as an area for review. I.T. related projects are traditionally considered to be very complex and difficult to manage. Therefore, the City Auditor wished to examine the activities at the TTC. As the report outlines, the audit reviewed projects that commenced in 2001 and auditors tracked activities through December 31, 2006.

The Audit report identifies 15 areas with opportunities for improvements. As a result of previous TTC Internal Audit report findings, many of these opportunities had been identified and I.T.S. staff had already put in place corrective actions. As a result, 9 of the 15 identified areas have already been addressed and are therefore marked ‘complete’. The remaining items have been acknowledged by staff and activities and timelines to address the issues have been laid out, as reflected in the Management Responses Section of the report.

Background Information

Cover Letter (February 28, 2008) from the General Secretary, TTC

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-11799.pdf>)

TTC Report No. 19 (February 27, 2008) Subject: City Auditor General’s Report “Information Technology Projects - Opportunities for Improvements”

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-11800.pdf>)

Report (January 14, 2008) from the Auditor General

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-11801.pdf>)

Appendix 1 to the Auditor General’s Report

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-11802.pdf>)

Appendix 2 - Management’s Response

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-11803.pdf>)

AU7.3	ACTION			Ward: All
-------	--------	--	--	-----------

Disaster Recovery Planning for City Computer Facilities

(April 3, 2008) Report from the Auditor General

Recommendations

The Auditor General recommends that:

1. The City Manager develop a formal disaster recovery planning and preparedness protocol with the Agencies, Boards and Commissions. The protocol should ensure coordination, collaboration and communication related to computer facility disaster recovery planning and preparedness.
2. The City Manager implement a disaster recovery and business continuity program that includes divisional roles and responsibilities, resource and training requirements, and simulation and plan maintenance schedules.
3. The Chief Information Officer to report to the Business Advisory Panel on a periodic basis. Such reporting to include updates on disaster recovery planning and preparedness for information technology systems.
4. The Chief Information Officer take action to ensure management responsible for maintaining City computer systems receive timely direction, guidance and training on preparing consistent City-wide disaster recovery plans.

5. The Chief Information Officer review the backup and storage procedures of City information technology units for:
 - a. compliance with acceptable standards and practices for data backup and storage requirements; and
 - b. provide divisions with the opportunity to participate in existing data storage arrangements within the City or with the outside service provider.
6. The City Manager, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, direct divisions to test information technology disaster recovery plans on a regular basis.
7. The Chief Information Officer develop disaster recovery testing guidelines and provide training necessary to ensure cross-divisional consistency.

Financial Impact

The implementation of recommendations in this report will improve management controls over disaster recovery planning for City computer facilities. The extent of any resources required or potential cost savings resulting from implementing the recommendations in this report is not determinable at this time.

Summary

The objective of our audit was to review the working relationship between the City and its Agencies, Boards and Commissions in relation to information technology disaster recovery planning, City disaster recovery planning policies and procedures and the role of the Information and Technology Division in the creating, coordinating and overseeing disaster recovery planning initiatives for City computer facilities.

Certain additional work is needed in order to protect and maintain critical City information technology resources in the event of an extended service disruption or disaster. As the City's Information Technology Governance and Transformation Project unfolds, management should place a high priority on addressing the challenges and gaps identified in this report in disaster recovery planning and preparedness.

The implementation of the recommendations in the report will improve the City's approach to disaster recovery planning for City computer facilities to minimize the negative effects of extended computer service interruptions and maintain critical public services in the event of a disaster.

Background Information

Disaster Recovery Planning for City Computer Facilities - report (April 3, 2008) from the Auditor General

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-12053.pdf>

Appendix 1

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-12054.pdf>

Appendix 2 Management's Response

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-12055.pdf>

AU7.4	ACTION		Ward: All
--------------	--------	--	-----------

Request for Proposal 9171-08-7025, External Audit Services for Arenas, Community Centres and Miscellaneous Entities

(April 4, 2008) Report from the Auditor General and the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management

Recommendations

The Auditor General and the Director of Purchasing and Materials Management recommend that:

1. authority be granted to enter into an agreement in the amount of \$646,095.00 net of GST to Grant Thornton LLP having submitted the highest scoring proposal meeting the requirements of the RFP for external audit services to perform the financial statement audits for City Arenas, Community Centres and Miscellaneous Entities for the years 2008 to 2012 inclusive; and

2. the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

Financial Impact

The total contract award identified in this report is \$678,399.75, including all applicable taxes and charges. The cost to the City net of GST is \$646,095.00. The total annual audit fees for the three categories of entities (Arenas, Community Centres and Miscellaneous Entities) listed in Attachment 1 for the years 2008 to 2012 inclusive are shown in the table below. The cost of audit fees (excluding 2008 fees for the Clean Air Partnership and the Toronto Atmospheric Fund) for 2008 is \$108,100.00, representing a 55% increase over 2007 audit fees. Audit fees will increase by \$190 per year per entity for the years 2009-2012, representing annual increases of approximately 3-4%.

Arenas (net of GST)	Community Centres (net of GST)	Miscellaneous Entities (net of GST)	Total (net of GST)
\$219,450.00	\$307,895.00	\$118,750.00	\$646,095.00

Each entity is responsible for providing for these fees in their respective budgets.

The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and concurs with the financial impact statement.

Summary

The purpose of this report is to advise on the results of Request for Proposal (RFP) 9171-08-7025 for external audit services to perform the financial statement audits for City Arenas, Community Centres and Miscellaneous Entities (Heritage Toronto, Yonge-Dundas Square, the

Toronto Atmospheric Fund and the Clean Air Partnership) for the years 2008 to 2012 inclusive and to request authority to enter into an agreement with the recommended proponent.

Background Information

Request for Proposals 9171-08-7025 - External Audit Services for Arenas, Community Centres and Misc. Entities - staff report (April 4/08)

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-12051.pdf>)

AU7.5	Information			Ward: All
-------	-------------	--	--	-----------

Status on Various Audit Projects

(April 2, 2008) Report from the Auditor General

Summary

The purpose of this report is to provide Audit Committee with a status report on various audit projects.

Background Information

Status on Various Audit Projects - report (April 2, 2008) from the Auditor General

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-12050.pdf>)

(Deferred from February 22, 2008 - 2008.AU6.9)

AU7.6	Information			Ward: All
-------	-------------	--	--	-----------

Review of City of Toronto Pandemic Planning and Preparedness

(February 8, 2008) Report from the Auditor General

Summary

The Auditor General presented the findings, conclusions and recommendations from his report to the Toronto Board of Health in December 2007.

Because the City's pandemic planning is still in progress, the purpose of the audit was to provide a snapshot of what the City has accomplished and what work remains to be completed in preparing for a pandemic emergency. The overall audit question is: "To the extent possible, how prepared is the City for a potentially severe pandemic?" We are cognizant that this should only be answered within the context of what the City can realistically achieve as a municipal government in pandemic planning, in particular considering the City's current fiscal constraints and the need for provincial and federal guidance and coordination. In addition, the substantial degree of uncertainty surrounding a possible pandemic influenza makes planning for a pandemic emergency a complex and difficult task.

The City has undertaken a number of planning activities, and is working towards implementing key actions such as stockpiling personal protective equipment and essential operational supplies. Certain important pandemic public health measures remain to be completed, some of which are dependent upon federal or provincial guidance. The City has established a framework for pandemic planning and preparedness in which public health related planning is led by Toronto Public Health, and corporate planning for continuity of operations is led by the Pandemic Influenza Steering Committee. Our audit noted certain challenges and gaps in the pandemic planning and preparedness process, and as a result our report includes a number of recommendations to help strengthen the existing accountability framework and corporate coordination, as well as enhancing the completion of pandemic public health planning.

Background Information

Review of City of Toronto Pandemic Planning and Preparedness - report (February 8, 2008) from the Auditor General

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-11798.pdf>

AU7.7	ACTION			
-------	--------	--	--	--

Financial Statements for the year ended December 31, 2007 - The North York Performing Arts Centre Corporation

Recommendations

That City Council receive for information, the 2007 Financial Statements of The North York Performing Arts Centre Corporation [operating as “The Toronto Centre for the Arts”].

Summary

The North York Performing Arts Centre Corporation [operating as ‘The Toronto Centre for the Arts’] has submitted 2007 Financial Statements to the Audit Committee for consideration.

Background Information

Financial Statements for the year ended December 31, 2007 - The North York Performing Arts Centre Corporation

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-12031.pdf>