
Board of Health

Meeting No. 18 **Contact** Candy Davidovits, Committee Administrator
Meeting Date Wednesday, October 22, 2008 **Phone** 416-392-8032
Start Time 1:00 PM **E-mail** boh@toronto.ca
Location Committee Room 1, City Hall

Attendance

Members of the Board of Health were present for some or all of the time periods indicated under the section “Meeting Sessions”, which appears at the end of the Minutes.

Councillor John Filion, Chair	X
Councillor Raymond Cho	X
Councillor Janet Davis, Vice-Chair	X
Councillor Paula Fletcher	X
Councillor Chin Lee	X
Councillor Gord Perks	X
Trustee Soo Wong	X
Alejandra Bravo	X
Vaijyanthi Chari	X
Wangari Muriuki	X
Fiona Nelson	X
Lisa O'Brien	X
Valerie Sterling	X

Confirmation of Minutes

On motion by Valerie Sterling, the Minutes of the meeting of the Board of Health held on September 18, 2008, were confirmed.

HL18.1	ACTION	Amended		Ward: All
--------	--------	---------	--	-----------

The Unequal City: Income and Health Inequalities in Toronto 2008

Decision Advice and Other Information

The Board of Health:

1. requested the Medical Officer of Health to:
 - a. report regularly to the Board of Health on key health inequality indicators for the City of Toronto;
 - b. consult with community partners and the Board of Health to incorporate appropriate strategies to reduce health inequalities in the next Toronto Public Health Strategic Plan (2010-2014) and annual service plans, including measures to monitor progress on reducing health inequalities;
 - c. review Toronto Public Health data collection practices and collaborate with partners to strengthen the monitoring of the impact of social determinants on health, including racialization, immigration and settlement status, education and income;
 - d. measure the impact of housing on health, including a comparison of the health and economic costs of different approaches to social housing; and
 - e. measure health trends in the 13 priority neighbourhoods and other at risk neighbourhoods in relation to City investments in the communities;
2. established a working group together with Toronto Public Health staff to collaborate with key community partners to identify and implement a variety of effective research approaches, including participatory health research, and initiatives in order to take strategic action to address health inequalities in relation to income, race and health, and appointed the following Board of Health members to the working group:
 - Alejandra Bravo;
 - Vaijyanthi Chari;
 - Wangari Muriuki;
 - Fiona Nelson;
 - Lisa O'Brien;
 - Councillor Perks;
 - Valerie Sterling; and
 - Trustee Soo Wong;
3. forwarded this report and the presentation from the Medical Officer of Health to the Premier of Ontario, the Minister of Children and Youth Services and all Toronto MPs and MPPs, and strongly urged that the government maintain its stated commitment to poverty reduction in Ontario as a public health measure;

4. referred the following motion to the General Manager, Social Services, for consideration:

Moved by Trustee Wong:

“That the Board of Health recommend to City Council that:

1. City Council endorse the report (October 16, 2008) from the Medical Officer of Health on “The Unequal City: Income and Health Inequalities in Toronto 2008”; and
 2. City Council require every department to review their current policy and service delivery in light of the findings of “The Unequal City” report and to modify any policy and decision-making so that they do not contribute to the health inequality gap.”;
5. referred the following motion to the Medical Officer of Health for consideration:

Moved by Councillor Cho:

“The Toronto Board of Health take leadership in tackling the problem of the Unequal City and that Dr. McKeown, Medical Officer of Health, be requested to organize an action oriented strategy meeting together with the City Manager and other City directors, and ensure that the appropriate federal and provincial ministers, their staff, community activists and other appropriate stakeholders are invited.”; and

6. expressed its thanks to the staff of Toronto Public Health on this excellent report.

Origin

(October 16, 2008) Report from Medical Officer of Health

Summary

Toronto Public Health’s mission is to improve the health of the whole population and to reduce health inequalities. The attached report “The Unequal City: Income and Health Inequalities in Toronto 2008” measures health inequalities using Toronto data to describe a number of health indicators by income groups.

The report demonstrates that within Canada’s largest city there are significant health inequalities. Areas of Toronto which have a greater proportion of people living with low income experience greater risk factors for illness, higher rates of disease, and death at an earlier age. For most of the health indicators, the data show that as low income is reduced, health improves. If everyone in Toronto was as healthy as those with the highest income and best health, there would be a significant improvement in the City’s health overall.

Reduction of health inequalities will require inter-sectoral leadership within the City, engagement with community partners and advocacy for provincial and federal action. The information in this report will support efforts to better understand the relationship between income and health and to identify strategies that address inequalities and improve health for all in Toronto.

Background Information

The Unequal City - Income and Health Inequalities in Toronto 2008 - Staff Report

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16291.pdf>)

Attachment 1

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16293.pdf>)

Speakers

Dr. David McKeown, Medical Officer of Health, gave a presentation (Submission Filed)

Councillor Joe Mihevc, Ward 21 - St. Paul's

Councillor Adam Vaughan, Ward 20 - Trinity-Spadina

Rahul Bhadwaji, L.L.B., President and CEO, Toronto Community Foundation

Motions

Motion to Amend Item (Additional) moved by Soo Wong (Redundant)

That the Board of Health recommend to City Council that:

1. City Council endorse the report (October 16, 2008) from the Medical Officer of Health on “The Unequal City: Income and Health Inequalities in Toronto 2008”; and
2. City Council require every department to review their current policy and service delivery in light of the findings of “The Unequal City” report and to modify any policy and decision-making so that they do not contribute to the health inequality gap.

Motion to Amend Item (Additional) moved by Soo Wong (Redundant)

That the Board of Health establish the Health Inequality Working Group composed of Board members and staff to identify the key health inequality indicators for the purpose of monitoring and to mobilize City Council and departments to address the underlining factors that caused the health inequalities in the City.

Motion to Amend Item moved by Councillor Janet Davis (Carried)

That the Board of Health refer motion 1 by Trustee Soo Wong to the General Manager, Social Services, for consideration.

Motion to Amend Item (Additional) moved by Councillor Janet Davis (Carried)

That Recommendation 3 be amended to read as follows:

- “3. The Board of Health forward this report and the presentation from the Medical Officer of Health to the Premier of Ontario, the Minister of Children and Youth Services and all Toronto MP’s and MPP’s, and strongly urge the government maintain its stated commitment to poverty reduction in Ontario as a public health measure.”

Motion to Amend Item (Additional) moved by Councillor Raymond Cho (Redundant)

The Toronto Board of Health take leadership in tackling the problem of the Unequal City and that Dr. McKeown, Medical Officer of Health, be requested to organize an action oriented strategy meeting together with the City Manager and other City directors, and ensure that the appropriate federal and provincial ministers, their staff, community activists and other appropriate stakeholders are invited.

Motion to Amend Item (Additional) moved by Valerie Sterling (Carried)

That the Medical Officer of Health requested to:

1. measure the impact of housing on health, including a comparison of the health and economic costs of different approaches to social housing; and
2. measure health trends in the 13 priority neighbourhoods and other at risk neighbourhoods in relation to City investments in the communities.

Motion to Amend Item (Additional) moved by Wangari Muriuki (Carried)

That the Board of Health establish a working group together with Toronto Public Health staff to collaborate with key community partners to identify and implement a variety of effective research approaches, including participatory health research, and initiatives in order to take strategic action to address health inequalities in relation to income, race and health.

Motion to Amend Item (Additional) moved by Councillor John Filion (Carried)

That the motion by Councillor Raymond Cho be referred to the Medical Officer of Health for consideration.

Motion to Amend Item (Additional) moved by Valerie Sterling (Carried Unanimously)

That the Board of Health express its thanks to the staff of Toronto Public Health on this excellent report.

Motion to Adopt Item as Amended moved by Valerie Sterling (Carried Unanimously)

The motion by Valerie Sterling to adopt the item, as amended, carried unanimously.

*Motion to Re-open Item moved by Councillor Gord Perks (Carried)**Motion to Amend Item (Additional) moved by Councillor Gord Perks (Carried)*

That the motion by Wangara Muriuki be amended by appointing the following Board of Health members to the working group:

- Alejandra Bravo;
- Vaijyanthi Chari;
- Wangari Muriuki;
- Fiona Nelson;
- Lisa O'Brien;
- Councillor Perks;
- Valerie Sterling; and
- Trustee Soo Wong.

HL18.2	ACTION	Amended		
--------	--------	---------	--	--

Cost of the Nutritious Food Basket - Toronto 2008

Decision Advice and Other Information

The Board of Health:

1. requested that the provincial and federal governments implement income support benefits and minimum wage rates based on the real cost of healthy living, including nutritious food, and indexed annually to reflect inflation;
2. requested that the Chair of the Board of Health and the Medical Officer of Health together with the Association of Local Public Health Agencies and representatives of community organizations that serve low-income families, meet with the Chair of the Cabinet Committee on Poverty Reduction, the Minister of Health Promotion, and the Minister of Community and Social Services, to discuss the results of the Nutritious Food Basket survey across Ontario, and ensure that the findings inform the provincial poverty reduction strategy; and
3. forwarded this report for support and action to the following key stakeholders: the City of Toronto's Community Development and Recreation Committee; the General Managers of Shelter, Support and Housing Administration, Children's Services, Long-term Care Homes and Services, and Parks, Forestry and Recreation; the Ontario Ministers of Health Promotion, Community and Social Services, Children and Youth Services and Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs, Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada; the Office of Nutrition Policy and Promotion at Health Canada; the Association of Local Public Health Agencies; the Ontario Public Health Association's Community Food Security Workgroup; Ontario Boards of Health; the Association of Ontario Health Centres; the Ontario Society of Nutrition Professionals in Public Health, the Dietitians of Canada and all local MPs and MPPs.

Origin

(October 7, 2008) Report from the Medical Officer of Health

Summary

This report provides information on the cost of the Nutritious Food Basket (NFB) in Toronto for 2008 and recommends measures to improve health through increased access to nutritious food for individuals and families living on low incomes in Toronto. The Nutritious Food Basket is a food costing tool used to measure the cost of a basic level of healthy eating in each Board of Health jurisdiction in Ontario.

The average weekly cost of basic nutritious food for a family of four in Toronto in 2008 is \$136.28 (\$590.09 per month). This is an increase of 2.4% over 2007. Over the last two years, the cost of the NFB has increased by approximately 9.4%.

The impact of rising food prices is more significant for low income people since they must allocate a greater portion of their income to purchase food. A family on social assistance or earning minimum wage requires approximately 30% of their income to purchase nutritious food, while a household that earns the median income for Ontario requires approximately 10% of their income to purchase nutritious food.

The provincial government has committed to developing a poverty reduction plan. Although the provincial government has taken several positive steps to help reduce poverty including the Ontario Child Benefit (OCB), announcing a 2% increase in social assistance rates in 2008, and increasing minimum wage to \$8.75/hour in March 2008, individuals and families living on social assistance or working at minimum wage still cannot afford shelter, nutritious food and other necessities required for good health.

The absence of effective action to correct this situation leaves the clear implication that malnutrition and poor health are acceptable consequences of official government policy.

Background Information

Cost of the Nutritious Food Basket - Toronto 2008 - Staff Report

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16110.pdf>)

Attachment 1 - Weekly Cost of Nutritious Food Basket in Toronto (May 2008)

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16111.pdf>)

Attachment 2 - Affordability Case Scenarios (September 2008)

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16112.pdf>)

Speakers

Rene Adams

Jonah Schein, Stop Community Food Centre

Motions

Motion to Amend Item moved by Valerie Sterling (Carried)

That the first line in Recommendation 3 be amended by adding the words “for support and action” after the word “report”.

Motion to Amend Item moved by Councillor Janet Davis (Carried)

That Recommendation 3 be further amended by adding all local MP's and MPP's.

HL18.3	Information	Received		
--------	-------------	----------	--	--

Participatory Health Research in Toronto's Racialized Communities

Decision Advice and Other Information

The Board of Health received, for information, the report (October 7, 2008) from the Medical Officer of Health.

Origin

(October 7, 2008) Report from the Medical Officer of Health

Summary

Toronto Public Health undertook an environmental scan to gain a better understanding of the community-based participatory research projects that have been completed, are currently underway or are being planned in Toronto examining the health of racialized groups (including the impact of poverty). The purpose of this report is to provide a broad overview of the scan results to form the basis for a dialogue regarding further opportunities for collaboration and support in this area.

Community-based participatory research represents a rich and growing source of information, which has the potential to inform the development of programs and policies by community-based organizations, Toronto Public Health, other city services, and different levels of government. It can identify the needs of community residents that have not been elucidated through other means. It is particularly useful when combined with other types of research as it provides a context for other data that are being generated.

Background Information

Participatory Health Research in Toronto's Racialized Communities - Staff Report
<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16113.pdf>

HL18.4	Information	Received		
--------	-------------	----------	--	--

Pandemic Influenza Preparedness Update**Decision Advice and Other Information**

The Board of Health received, for information, the report (October 7, 2008) from the Medical Officer of Health.

Origin

(October 7, 2008) Report from the Medical Officer of Health

Summary

The report provides updated information on the epidemiology of influenza and outlines the progress Toronto Public Health (TPH) has made in its pandemic influenza preparedness activities since the last report to the Board of Health. A new version of the Ontario Health Plan for an Influenza Pandemic (OHPIP) has recently been released and highlights are reported here. This report also summarizes the recommendations recently issued by the Pan-Canadian Public Health Network Council on the use of antivirals for prevention during an influenza pandemic.

Background Information

Pandemic Influenza Preparedness Update - Staff Report
<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16108.pdf>
 Attachment 1 - Highlights from Ontario Health Plan for an Influenza Pandemic 2008
<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16109.pdf>

HL18.5	ACTION	Adopted		
--------	--------	---------	--	--

Toronto Public Health 2008 Operating Budget Adjustment

Decision Advice and Other Information

The Board of Health recommended to the Budget Committee that:

1. the Toronto Public Health 2008 base Operating Budget be increased by \$115.0 thousand gross and \$0.0 net, and a staff increase of 1.0 permanent position, to reflect confirmed funding from the Ministry of Health Promotion.

Origin

(October 1, 2008) Report from the Medical Officer of Health

Summary

The purpose of this report is to request a budget adjustment to Toronto Public Health's (TPH) 2008 Operating Budget due to confirmation of additional base funding from the Ministry of Health Promotion.

Background Information

Toronto Public Health 2008 Operating Budget Adjustment - Staff Report
<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16114.pdf>

HL18.6	ACTION	Amended		Ward: All
--------	--------	---------	--	-----------

Toronto Street Food Pilot

Decision Advice and Other Information

The Board of Health recommended to the Budget Committee and the Executive Committee that:

1. Toronto Public Health, in consultation with Legal Services and Municipal Licensing and Standards Division, implement a one year pilot project with eligible existing street food vendors to expand their menu selection to include healthier food choices, as described in Attachment A of this report;
2. Toronto Public Health, in consultation with Legal Services and Municipal Licensing and Standards Divisions, implement a three year "Toronto a la Cart" pilot project as described in Attachment B of this report;
3. new fees for the processing of applications, issuance of endorsements and annual license fees for the use of Toronto a la Cart vending locations be approved as set out in Attachment C of this report;

4. the “Toronto a la Cart” logo shown on Attachment D be approved as the official mark for the Pilot and any subsequent “Toronto a la Cart” program and staff be authorized to take the necessary actions to secure the exclusive rights for the City to protect and use this logo;
5. City Council accept the proposal from Crown Verity, originally submitted in response to the Request for Expressions of Interest No. 0616-08-7021 and authorize the agreement with Crown Verity on the terms described in the body of this report and Attachment E, and other terms as may be satisfactory to the Medical Officer of Health and the City Solicitor;
6. Toronto Public Health oversee the implementation and administration of the pilot projects and, in consultation with the City Manager’s Office, provide future governance recommendations as part of the project evaluation;
7. all revenues associated with the pilot projects be directed to Toronto Public Health to offset costs;
8. the Toronto Public Health 2009 Operating Budget request be increased by \$86,000 gross and \$0.0 net, and a staff increase of 1.0 temporary position, to reflect required funding for the implementation of the Toronto Street Food pilot projects;
9. any year-end deficit resulting from the implementation of the Toronto a la Cart program be reported to the Budget Committee and funded from within Toronto Public Health's 2009 Operating Budget;
10. The Medical Officer of Health be delegated the authority for the term of the pilot project to make final decisions with respect to:
 - a. the processing of applications and issuance of endorsements to eligible existing street food vendors; and
 - b. the issuance of a request for applications document and award of agreements to selected Toronto a la Cart vendors,and City Council retain no authority to act with respect to such matters;
11. City Council adopt the Terms of Reference as set out in Attachment F to this report, as amended by the Board of Health, and establish a Street Food Pilot Appeal Committee and delegate the authority to consider staff recommendations and make final decisions respecting the revocation of healthier food endorsements issued to existing vendors or termination of licence agreements with a Toronto a la Cart vendor for the term of the pilot project to the Board, and City Council retain no authority to act with respect to such matters;

12. Toronto Public Health be directed to further explore opportunities with food-related non-governmental organizations to test the feasibility of using street food vending to enhance their ability to achieve common goals and objectives and be directed to provide further pilot program details to the Board of Health at a later date;
13. the Medical Officer of Health, in consultation with the City Solicitor be authorized to report to the next Executive Committee respecting any necessary amendments to City by-laws and the Municipal Code as required to implement and regulate the operation of the pilot projects as proposed in this report; and
14. the Medical Officer of Health provide recommendations on an annual basis, beginning in the fall of 2009, with respect to the status of the Toronto a la Cart pilot project.

Origin

(October 17, 2008) Report from Medical Officer of Health and the Acting Director, Purchasing and Materials Management

Summary

Changes to Regulation 562 of the Health Protection and Promotion Act in 2007 enable street food vendors to sell a wider variety of food items from street food vending carts. This report outlines a three stream approach to testing the impact of broadening healthier food choices available in the City from street food vendors to maximize the potential benefits from this regulatory change. The report requests authority to implement a 2009 pilot project to expand the menus of the existing street food vendors. It requests a spring 2009 pilot launch of the Toronto a la Cart program for new vendors at selected locations on City property to offer culturally diverse, nutritious menus. This report requests authority to enter into an agreement with the respondent of the previously released Request for Expressions of Interest for the production of food carts. It further outlines a future third opportunity to engage in partnerships with external food-related Non-Governmental Organizations to explore the use of street food vending to achieve common goals.

To ensure sufficient lead time for cart manufacturing and spring 2009 launch, City Council approval must be given by December 2008.

Background Information

Toronto Street Food Pilot - Staff Report

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16298.pdf>)

Attachment A

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16299.pdf>)

Attachment B

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16300.pdf>)

Attachment C

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16301.pdf>)

Attachment D

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16302.pdf>)

Attachment E

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16303.pdf>)

Attachment F

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16304.pdf>)

Attachment G

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16305.pdf>)

Speakers

Marianne Moroney, Executive Director, Street Food Vendors Association
Marvin Greenberg, Ontario Restaurant Hotel and Motel Association

Motions

Motion to Amend Item moved by Councillor Janet Davis (Carried)

That Recommendation 11. in the staff report be amended by replacing the words “Oversight Board” with “Appeal Committee”, so that it reads as follows:

- “11. City Council adopt the Terms of Reference as set out in Attachment F to this report and establish a Street Food Pilot Appeal Committee and delegate the authority to consider staff recommendations and make final decisions respecting the revocation of healthier food endorsements issued to existing vendors or termination of licence agreements with a Toronto a la Cart vendor for the term of the pilot project to the Board, and City Council retain no authority to act with respect to such matters;”.

Motion to Amend Item moved by Councillor Gord Perks (Lost)

That the Board of Health:

1. request the Medical Officer of Health to forward to the Executive Committee for consideration the recommendations in the report (October 17, 2008) respecting the Toronto Street Food Pilot endorsements program for existing vendors; and
2. refer the remainder of the recommendations in the report respecting the Toronto a la Cart and Not-for-Profit programs to the City Manager for a report to the December 1, 2008, Council meeting.

Motion to Adopt Item as Amended moved by Councillor John Filion (Carried)

HL18.7	Information	Received		
--------	-------------	----------	--	--

2008 Public Health Champion Awards

Confidential Attachment - Personal matters about an identifiable individual, including municipal or local board employees

Decision Advice and Other Information

The Board of Health received, for information, the presentation by Vaijyanthi Chari and Wangari Muriuki, Co-Chairs, the Public Health Champion Awards Selection Committee, and the material submitted on this matter.

Origin

(September 26, 2008) Letter from Public Health Champion Selection Committee

Summary

Advising that the Public Health Champion Selection Committee on September 26, 2008:

1. decided to present the Public Health Champion Awards for 2008 to the following individual and group/organization:
 - Wendy Babcock, Harm Reduction Worker, Street Health, in the individual category; and
 - Scarborough Urban Health Outreach Centre Volunteer Physicians and Dentists, in the group/organization category;
2. requested the Board of Health to make the names of the award recipients public at its meeting on October 22, 2008; and
3. directed that the documents submitted on behalf of the nominees remain confidential as they contain personal information about identifiable individuals.

Background Information

Public Health Champion Awards Selection Committee Letter
<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16466.pdf>

Communications

(October 22, 2008) submission from Toronto Public Health (HL.New.HL18.7.1)
<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/comm/communicationfile-9033.pdf>

Speakers

Vaijyanthi Chari, Co-Chair, Public Health Champion Awards Selection Committee
 Wangari Muriuki, Co-Chair, Public Health Champion Awards Selection Committee

Declared Interests

The following member(s) declared an interest:

Wangari Muriuki - as it relates to the nominations in the individual category as she knows one of the nominees in that category.

HL18.8	Information	Received		
--------	-------------	----------	--	--

2009 Approved Schedule of Meetings

Decision Advice and Other Information

The Board of Health received, for information, the 2009 approved Schedule of Meetings.

Summary

City Council, on September 24 and 25, 2008, approved the 2009 Schedule of Meetings listing the following Board of Health meetings for 2009:

Monday, January 19, 2009;
 Tuesday, February 10 2009;
 Monday, April 20, 2009;
 Tuesday, May 19, 2009;
 Monday, June 15, 2009;
 Monday, September 21, 2009;
 Monday, October 19, 2009; and
 Monday, November 16, 2009.

Background Information

2009 Schedule of Meetings

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-16127.pdf>)

Meeting Sessions

Session Date	Session Type	Start Time	End Time	Public or Closed Session
2008-10-22	Afternoon	1:10 PM	4:55 PM	Public

Attendance

Date and Time	Quorum	Members
2008-10-22 1:10 PM - 4:55 PM (Public Session)	Present	<i>Present:</i> Bravo, Chari, Cho, Davis, Filion, Fletcher, Lee, Muriuki, Nelson, O'Brien, Perks, Sterling, Wong

Chair