

21 Elm Avenue, Demolition of a Structure Within the South Rosedale Heritage Conservation District and Approval of Replacement Structures

Date:	December 20, 2007
To:	Toronto Preservation Board Toronto and East York Community Council
From:	Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division
Wards:	Toronto Centre – Rosedale - Ward 27
Reference Number:	

SUMMARY

This report recommends that Council approve the demolition of a coach house/garage in the South Rosedale Heritage Conservation District, (SRHCD) and approve the design of the replacement structures, with a condition that the owner obtain approval from the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services for the final building permit plans.

The existing coach house structure does not contribute to the heritage character of the SRHCD and the replacement structures are substantially in accordance with the SRHCD Study Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. Council approve the request to demolish the coach house/garage at the rear of 21 Elm Avenue in the South Rosedale Heritage Conservation District, in accordance with Section 42 (1) of the Ontario Heritage Act; and
2. The plans for the replacement buildings, a pair of semi-detached houses located on the rear portion of the property, severed off and fronting on to Rachael Street as shown in the plans submitted by the applicant, John Agnidis, Drawing Room

Architects Inc. including; Landscape Plan 20F dated Dec. 13/ 07, Plans A0 to A4 dated Dec. 12/ 07, A5 dated Dec 11/ 07 and A6 dated Oct. 17/ 07, all date stamped received by Heritage Preservation Services Dec 17/ 07, on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, be approved, and that the replacement structure be constructed substantially in accordance with the submitted plans, subject to the owner providing;

- a. prior to the issuance of any building permit for the replacement building fronting on to Rachael Street, including a permit for the demolition, excavation, and/or shoring of the subject property, building permit drawings satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services; and
- b. prior to the issuance of any building permit for a new garage at 21 Elm Avenue, including a permit for the demolition, excavation, and/or shoring of the subject property, building permit drawings and landscape plans for the garage, driveway and landscaping satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

The owner consulted with Heritage Preservation Services regarding demolition of the coach house, severing off the back half of the property at 21 Elm Avenue and constructing a pair of semi-detached houses fronting on to Rachael Street. The applicant received approval from the Toronto and East York Committee of Adjustment October 24, 2007 for applications A0607/07TEY, A0608/07TEY, A0814/07TEY, and B0077/07TEY for the new semi-detached houses located at the back of 21 Elm Avenue, and fronting on to Rachael Street. The Committee of Adjustment approval was given on condition that the applicant;

1. receive approval from City Council for the demolition of the coach house;
2. obtain approval from the Manager of Heritage Preservation Services for the plans for the new garage and driveway at 21 Elm Avenue; and
3. obtain approval from the Manager of Heritage Preservation Services for the plans for the new semi-detached houses and garages fronting on to Rachael Street.

A complete application for demolition was received by HPS on December 16, 2007. The applicant has not yet applied for a building permit.

ISSUE BACKGROUND

The subject property is located at the back half of 21 Elm Avenue, now fronting on to Rachael Street, and is within the SRHCD which was approved by Council on February 7, 2003 and upheld by the Ontario Municipal Board December 17, 2003. In designating the SRHCD, Council adopted an evaluation of all buildings within the district and endorsed guidelines for managing change. The heritage evaluation classified buildings in the district as “A”, “B”, “C”, or “unrated.”

The existing house located at 21 Elm Avenue (Attachment No. 2) is classified as a Category B building (of citywide heritage significance) and will not be adversely affected by the demolition of the coach house/garage at the rear of the property or by the construction of the new garages and semi-detached houses. The coach house/garage is only visible from Rachael Street and does not contribute to the heritage character of 21 Elm Avenue (Attachment No. 3). Rachael Street is a short dead-end street near the south border of the SRHCD, and has no houses which contribute to the character of the SRHCD. The closest contributing buildings are a Category B house located on the north west corner of Rachael and Sherbourne Streets, and two apartment buildings which run down from 5 Elm Street to Rachel Street (Category C). The new lot on the north side of Rachael Street has “un-rated ” buildings on either side.

The SRHCD guidelines permit the demolition of buildings that do not contribute to the character of the district provided that the replacement building, as shown in the building permit application, conforms to the guidelines and the zoning by-law.

Section 42(1) of the Ontario Heritage Act requires that no owner of a property situated in a heritage conservation district that has been designated by a municipality shall erect, demolish or remove any building or structure on the property or permit the erection, demolition or removal of such a building or structure unless the owner obtains a permit from the municipality. Under Article IV of Section 103-22 of the Municipal Code, Council permission is required for any person to demolish a building within a heritage conservation district.

COMMENTS

The applicant is proposing to demolish the existing one storey coach house/garage at the back of 21 Elm Avenue, sever the property, and construct a pair of semi-detached houses on the new property fronting on to Rachael Street (Attachment No. 5).

The proposed replacement buildings consist of a pair of semi-detached houses that look like one larger house (Attachment No. 4). The houses will have a GFA of 2010 and 2007 sq. feet. Parking is provided at the rear of the property within a shared driveway on the east side and double detached garage.

The property at 21 Elm Avenue will be altered slightly by the addition of a driveway on Elm Street and a new garage at the rear of the property, however these alterations should not affect the heritage character of the property. HPS has reviewed the plans for both and they are in-keeping with the heritage character of the HCD.

Section 5.5.3 of the SRHCD study sets out the guidelines for new buildings. New buildings should (1) contribute to the heritage character of the district, (2) be compatible in terms of scale, height, setback and entry level, and (3) exhibit a roof profile and eaves lines of a height compatible with that of its neighbours. It is staff's opinion that the proposed replacement buildings on Rachael Street comply with the guidelines for new buildings contained within section 5.5.3 of the SRHCD study (Attachments 4,6,7).

CONTACT

Denise Gendron, Manager, Heritage Preservation Services

Tel: 416-338 1075

Fax: 416-392-1973

E-mail: dgendron@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Barbara Leonhardt
Director, Policy and Research
City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 – Location Map, 21 Elm Ave.

Attachment 2 – Photo of 21 Elm Ave.

Attachment 3 – Photos of Coach House/Garage, Rachael St.

Attachment 4 – Perspective Drawing of Replacement Houses, Rachael St.

Attachment 5 – Site Plan

Attachment 6 – Front Elevations

Attachment 7 – Side Elevations