
Toronto Preservation Board

Meeting No.	15	Contact	Colleen O'Neill, Committee Secretary
Meeting Date	Thursday, June 19, 2008	Phone	416-392-5227
Start Time	2:00 PM	E-mail	coneill1@toronto.ca
Location	Committee Room 1, City Hall		

Confirmation of Minutes

On motion by Edith Geduld, the Toronto Preservation Board confirmed the Minutes of the meeting held on May 22, 2008.

PB15.1	Information	Received		Ward: 30
--------	-------------	----------	--	----------

Toronto Preservation Board - Upcoming Reports

(June 2, 2008) Memo from Heritage Preservation Services

Summary

Advising that the following report will be considered at the July 17, 2008 meeting of the Toronto Preservation Board:

- a. 120 First Avenue (St. Ann's Rectory) Inclusion on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties.

Decision Advice and Other Information

On motion by Councillor Vaughan, the Toronto Preservation Board noted that the following report from the Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division, will be considered at the July 17, 2008 meeting of the Toronto Preservation Board:

- a. 120 First Avenue (St. Ann's Rectory) Inclusion on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties.

Motions

Motion to Receive Item moved by Councillor Adam Vaughan (Carried)

PB15.2	ACTION	Adopted		Ward: 30
--------	--------	---------	--	----------

Designation of the Riverdale Phase 1 Heritage Conservation District Under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act

(May 30, 2008) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Recommendations

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. In accordance with Section 41 of the Ontario Heritage Act, City Council designate by By-law the area shown on Attachment No. 1 as the Riverdale Phase 1 Heritage Conservation District.
2. City Council adopt by By-law the Riverdale Phase 1 Heritage Conservation District Plan, dated May 2008, as the District Plan for the Riverdale Phase 1 Heritage Conservation District, to act as a guide for property owners, City staff, advisory committees and City Council when making decisions regarding matters set out under Section 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
3. If there are any objections to the By-law under Section 41 of the Ontario Heritage Act, the City Solicitor be directed to appear before the Ontario Municipal Board to defend the By-law.
4. Until such time as the By-law designating the area as the Riverdale Phase 1 Heritage Conservation District comes into force or is repealed, all properties within the area, unless designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, be listed in the City's Inventory of Heritage Properties.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report. The public Notices of Intention to Designate will be advertised on the City's web site in accordance with the City of Toronto Act provisions. This proposed Heritage Conservation District will add almost 200 properties to the Inventory. It is also noted that adding properties to the Inventory by means of Heritage Conservation District designations dramatically increases the workload of Heritage Preservation Services, requiring staff to review all building permits, Committee of Adjustment, rezoning and Official Plan amendment applications within legislated timeframes. Overtime, this will create pressure to increase staff resources.

Summary

To recommend that City Council designate part of the Riverdale area, generally bounded by First Avenue, the Canadian National Railway Line, Dundas Street East, and Degrossi Street as the Riverdale Phase 1 Heritage Conservation District under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Speakers

Catherine Nasmith, Architect

Jonathan Mousley, Chairman, Phase 1 Riverdale Heritage Conservation District Committee

Committee Recommendations

On motion by Peggy Hlobil-Emmenegger, the Toronto Preservation Board recommended to the Toronto and East York Community Council that:

1. In accordance with Section 41 of the Ontario Heritage Act, City Council designate by By-law the area shown on Attachment No. 1 as the Riverdale Phase 1 Heritage Conservation District.
2. City Council adopt by By-law the Riverdale Phase 1 Heritage Conservation District Plan, dated May 2008, as the District Plan for the Riverdale Phase 1 Heritage Conservation District, to act as a guide for property owners, City staff, advisory committees and City Council when making decisions regarding matters set out under Section 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
3. If there are any objections to the By-law under Section 41 of the Ontario Heritage Act, the City Solicitor be directed to appear before the Ontario Municipal Board to defend the By-law.
4. Until such time as the By-law designating the area as the Riverdale Phase 1 Heritage Conservation District comes into force or is repealed, all properties within the area, unless designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, be listed in the City's Inventory of Heritage Properties.

Motions

Motion to Adopt Item moved by Peggy Hlobil-Emmenegger (Carried)

Links to Background Information

Staff Report

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13712.pdf>

Attachment 1

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13713.pdf>

Attachment 2

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13726.pdf>

PB15.3	ACTION	Adopted		Ward: 32
--------	--------	---------	--	----------

21 Swanwick Avenue, Emmanuel Presbyterian Church, Approval of Alterations to a Heritage Property

(May 30, 2008) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Recommendations

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council approve the alterations to the heritage property at 21 Swanwick Avenue substantially in accordance with the Heritage Impact Statement (Conservation Strategy) titled “21 Swanwick Avenue, Conversion from Church to Residential Condominium”, prepared by Bernard H. Watt Architects, revised January 25, 2008, date stamped received by the City Planning Division, February 25, 2008, on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, subject to the owner:
 - a. prior to final site plan approval;

providing a Detailed Conservation Plan, prepared by a qualified heritage consultant, detailing interventions and conservation work and including as-found photographs of the exterior and interior to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;

providing final development plans, a landscape plan and an exterior lighting plan satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - b. prior to the issuance of any building permit for the heritage property located at 21 Swanwick Avenue, including a permit for the demolition, excavation, and/or shoring of the subject property;

providing a Letter of Credit, in a form and an amount satisfactory to the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning Division, to secure all work included in the Conservation Plan;

providing building permit drawings satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - c. prior to release of the Letter of Credit;

completing the heritage conservation work, satisfactory to the Manager, Preservation Services; and

submitting final as-built photographs of the heritage property at 21 Swanwick Avenue satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

Summary

This report recommends that City Council approve alterations to 21 Swanwick Avenue, the former Emmanuel Presbyterian Church, a designated heritage property. The church is a local landmark in the East Toronto neighbourhood and provides a terminus for the view to the south end of Enderby Road. First established in 1888, the present church was built in 1893.

The applicant is proposing to convert the church to condominium use, providing 10 row houses within the existing building envelope with a small rear addition. New second and third floor levels will be added to the interior.

The proposed alterations are necessary to accommodate the new use for the church. The front, north façade of the building with its large square tower will be conserved and will remain essentially as it is now with some minor alterations. The side facades will retain their important characteristics while undergoing alteration to incorporate new windows and doors.

Speakers

Bernard Watt, Architect

Committee Recommendations

On motion by Jennifer Rieger, the Toronto Preservation Board recommended to the Toronto and East York Community Council that:

1. City Council approve the alterations to the heritage property at 21 Swanwick Avenue substantially in accordance with the Heritage Impact Statement (Conservation Strategy) titled “21 Swanwick Avenue, Conversion from Church to Residential Condominium”, prepared by Bernard H. Watt Architects, revised January 25, 2008, date stamped received by the City Planning Division, February 25, 2008, on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, subject to the owner:
 - a. prior to final site plan approval;

providing a Detailed Conservation Plan, prepared by a qualified heritage consultant, detailing interventions and conservation work and including as-found photographs of the exterior and interior to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;

providing final development plans, a landscape plan and an exterior lighting plan satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - b. prior to the issuance of any building permit for the heritage property located at 21 Swanwick Avenue, including a permit for the demolition, excavation, and/or shoring of the subject property;

providing a Letter of Credit, in a form and an amount satisfactory to the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning Division, to secure all work included in the Conservation Plan;

providing building permit drawings satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;

- c. prior to release of the Letter of Credit;

completing the heritage conservation work, satisfactory to the Manager, Preservation Services; and

submitting final as-built photographs of the heritage property at 21 Swanwick Avenue satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

Motions

Motion to Adopt Item moved by Jennifer Rieger (Carried)

Links to Background Information

Staff Report

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13714.pdf>

Attachment 1

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13715.pdf>

Attachment 2

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13716.pdf>

Attachment 3

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13717.pdf>

Attachment 4

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13718.pdf>

Attachment 5

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13719.pdf>

Attachment 6

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13720.pdf>

Attachment 7

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13721.pdf>

Attachment 8

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13722.pdf>

PB15.4	ACTION	Withdrawn		Ward: 27
--------	--------	-----------	--	----------

3 Old George Place, Refusal of Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property

(June 10, 2008) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Recommendations

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council refuse the application to alter 3 Old George Place made June 5, 2008 by the applicant, Moriyama and Teshima Architects.

2. City Council authorize the City Solicitor and City Staff to attend the Ontario Municipal Board hearing, should Council refuse this application and the refusal be appealed to the Board.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

Summary

This report recommends refusal of an application to alter a property in the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD) at 3 Old George Place. The property was designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act, enacted by City Council on Sept. 30, 2004, and is identified as a “Category A” building. Category A buildings have the highest level of significance in the HCD, have been determined to be of national or provincial heritage significance, and contribute to the heritage character of the NRHCD.

No. 3 Old George Place was designed by prominent Canadian architect John B. Parkin and is an excellent example of the 1960s modernist movement in Canada. The property makes a significant contribution to the unique streetscape character of this part of the NRHCD ravine lands.

The applicant proposes to build an addition that will cover the front of the house and connect to the garage at the front of the property. The garage will also have a one storey addition.

This application does not meet the intent of the Official Plan in protecting heritage resources. The proposed alterations would damage the heritage character of the property and significantly alter the streetscape of Old George Place.

Decision Advice and Other Information

On motion by Edith Geduld, the Toronto Preservation Board received the report noting that the application for alterations to 3 Old George Place had been withdrawn.

Motions

Motion to Withdraw an Item moved by Edith Geduld (Carried)

Links to Background Information

Staff Report

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13758.pdf>)

Attachment 1

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13759.pdf>)

Attachment 2

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13760.pdf>)

Attachment 3

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13761.pdf>)

Attachment 4

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13762.pdf>)

Attachment 5

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13763.pdf>)

Attachment 6

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13764.pdf>)

Attachment 7

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13765.pdf>)

Attachment 8

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13766.pdf>)

Attachment 9

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13767.pdf>)

Attachment 10

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13768.pdf>)

4a 3 Old George Place, Refusal of Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property

(June 9, 2008) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Summary

This is to advise that the staff report from the City Planning Division “3 Old George Place, Refusal of Alterations to a Designated Property” will be considered at the June 19, 2008 meeting of the Toronto Preservation Board.

Links to Background Information

Staff Report

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13723.pdf>)

4b 3 Old George Place - Request for Deferral

(June 17, 2008) Letter from Councillor Kyle Rae, Ward 27 Toronto Centre-Rosedale

Summary

Requesting that the item be deferred to a future meeting to allow for continued consultation between the Applicant and neighbours.

Links to Background Information

Request for Deferral

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13988.pdf>)

4c Request to Withdraw Application to Alter 3 Old George Place

(June 18, 2008) Letter from Ajon Moriyama, Partner, Moriyama & Teshima

Summary

Requesting on behalf of the owners that the application to alter 3 Old George Place be withdrawn.

Links to Background Information

Request for Deferral

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13993.pdf>

PB15.5	ACTION	Adopted		
--------	--------	---------	--	--

Application for Funds to Hold a Special Heritage Community Event

(May 26, 2008) Memo from the Etobicoke York Community Preservation Panel

Summary

Submitting an application for funds to hold a Special Heritage Community Event.

Decision Advice and Other Information

On motion by Mary Louise Ashbourne, the Toronto Preservation Board approved the application submitted by the Etobicoke York Community Preservation Panel for \$600.00 from the Special Heritage Community Event Fund to be used to fund a booth at the Montgomery's Inn Corn Roast and Heritage Fair on Thursday, September 4, 2008, at Montgomery's Inn, 4709 Dundas Street West, Etobicoke.

Motions

Motion to Adopt Item moved by Mary Louise Ashbourne (Carried)

Links to Background Information

Application

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13730.pdf>

PB15.6	Information	Received		
--------	-------------	----------	--	--

Minutes of the Community Preservation Panels

(June 9, 2008) Memo from Chairs, Community Preservation Panels

Summary

- a. Etobicoke York Community Preservation Panel
 - i. Minutes of the meeting held on June 2, 2008;

- b. North York Community Preservation Panel
 - i. Minutes of the meeting held on May 12, 2008

Decision Advice and Other Information

On motion by Edith Geduld, the Toronto Preservation Board received the Minutes of the Community Preservation Panels for information.

Motions

Motion to Receive Item moved by Edith Geduld (Carried)

Links to Background Information

Etobicoke York Community Preservation Panel - June 2, 2008

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13711.pdf>)

North York Community Preservation Board - May 12, 2008

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-13729.pdf>)

PB15.7	ACTION	Adopted		
--------	--------	---------	--	--

Condolences to Alan Dudeck and Family

(June 19, 2008) Member Motion from Robert Saunders, Chair, Toronto Preservation Board

Summary

Member motion offering condolences to Alan Dudeck and his family.

Decision Advice and Other Information

The Chair, on behalf of the Toronto Preservation Board members and Heritage Preservation Services staff, offered condolences to Alan Dudeck and his family on the terrible and senseless deaths of his stepson, Oliver Martin, and of Oliver's friend Dylan Ellis. Both young men had great promise and their shooting is a dreadful loss.

Motions

Motion to Adopt Item moved by Robert Saunders (Carried)

Meeting Sessions

Session Date	Session Type	Start Time	End Time	Public or Closed Session
2008-06-19	Afternoon	2:00 PM	3:10 PM	Public

Attendance

Date and Time	Quorum	Members
2008-06-19 2:00 PM - 3:10 PM (Public Session)	Present	<i>Present:</i> Ashbourne, Dutil, Geduld, Gogan, Hlobil-Emmenegger, Rieger, Saunders, Vaughan <i>Not Present:</i> Balen, Dudeck, Jain, Leong, Rae, Thompson

Chair