
Toronto Preservation Board

Meeting No.	17	Contact	Colleen O'Neill, Committee Secretary
Meeting Date	Friday, September 19, 2008	Phone	416-392-5227
Start Time	2:00 PM	E-mail	coneill1@toronto.ca
Location	Committee Room 1, City Hall		

Confirmation of Minutes

On motion by Councillor Rae, the Toronto Preservation Board confirmed the Minutes of the meeting held on July 17, 2008.

PB17.1	ACTION	Adopted		Ward: 32
---------------	---------------	---------	--	----------

1091 Eastern Avenue – Inclusion on Heritage Inventory

(June 20, 2008) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Recommendations

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council include the property at 1091 Eastern Avenue (Ashbridge's Bay Treatment Plant Pumping Stations, 1911 and 1971) on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

Summary

This report recommends that City Council include the property at 1091 Eastern Avenue on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties.

Following research and evaluation, staff have determined that the property at 1091 Eastern Avenue, which contains two separate pumping stations designed in 1911 and 1971 for the Ashbridge's Bay Treatment Plant, has cultural heritage value and merits inclusion on the City's heritage inventory. The inclusion of the property on the heritage inventory would enable staff to monitor any applications affecting the site and encourage the retention of its heritage values and attributes.

Committee Recommendations

The Toronto Preservation Board recommended to the Toronto and East York Community Council that:

1. City Council include the property at 1091 Eastern Avenue (Ashbridge's Bay Treatment Plant Pumping Stations, 1911 and 1971) on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties.

Motions

Motion to Adopt Item moved by Councillor Kyle Rae (Carried)

Links to Background Information

Staff Report

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-14748.pdf>

Attachment 1

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-14749.pdf>

Attachment 2

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-14750.pdf>

Attachment 3

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-14751.pdf>

PB17.2	ACTION	Adopted		Ward: 27
--------	--------	---------	--	----------

45 Castle Frank Road, Demolition of a Structure within the South Rosedale Heritage Conservation District and Approval of Replacement Structure

(September 3, 2008) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Recommendations

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council approve the request to demolish 45 Castle Frank Road, an “unrated” structure in the South Rosedale Heritage Conservation District, in accordance with Section 42 (1) of the Ontario Heritage Act.
2. City Council approve the plans for the replacement building as shown in the plans submitted by the applicant, Saeed Kauser, prepared by Lorne Rose Architect, including; Existing Site Plan, A1 Proposed Site Plan, A2 Landscape Plan, A3 Site Statistics, A4 Basement Floor Plan & Ground Floor Plan, A5 Second Floor Plan & Third Floor Plan, A6 Garage Floor Plan & Elevations, A7 Front Elevation, A8 Rear Elevation, A9 North Elevation, A10 South Elevation, all dated, August 22, 2008, date stamped received by Heritage Preservation Services August 25, 2008, on file with the Manger, Heritage Preservation Services, and that the replacement structure be constructed substantially in

accordance with the submitted plans, subject to the owner:

- a. Prior to the issuance of any building permit for the replacement structure located at 45 Castle Frank Road, including a permit for the demolition, excavation, and/or shoring of the subject property, providing building permit drawings satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

Summary

This report recommends that City Council approve the demolition of an “unrated” house in the South Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (SRHCD) and approve the design of the replacement structures in accordance with Section 42 (1) of the Ontario Heritage Act, with a condition that the owner obtain approval from the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services for the final building permit plans.

The existing structure does not contribute to the heritage character of the SRHCD and the replacement structure is substantially in accordance with the SRHCD Plan Guidelines.

This consent under the Ontario Heritage Act is in addition to Demolition Permits required under the Building Code Act and the Planning Act and the approval of variances to the existing zoning by-law.

Committee Recommendations

The Toronto Preservation Board recommended to the Toronto and East York Community Council that:

1. City Council approve the request to demolish 45 Castle Frank Road, an “unrated” structure in the South Rosedale Heritage Conservation District, in accordance with Section 42 (1) of the Ontario Heritage Act.
2. City Council approve the plans for the replacement building as shown in the plans submitted by the applicant, Saeed Kauser, prepared by Lorne Rose Architect, including; Existing Site Plan, A1 Proposed Site Plan, A2 Landscape Plan, A3 Site Statistics, A4 Basement Floor Plan & Ground Floor Plan, A5 Second Floor Plan & Third Floor Plan, A6 Garage Floor Plan & Elevations, A7 Front Elevation, A8 Rear Elevation, A9 North Elevation, A10 South Elevation, all dated, August 22, 2008, date stamped received by Heritage Preservation Services August 25, 2008, on file with the Manger, Heritage Preservation Services, and that the replacement structure be constructed substantially in accordance with the submitted plans, subject to the owner:
 - a. Prior to the issuance of any building permit for the replacement structure located at 45 Castle Frank Road, including a permit for the demolition, excavation, and/or shoring of the subject property, providing building permit drawings satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

Motions

Motion to Adopt Item moved by Councillor Kyle Rae (Carried)

Links to Background Information

Staff Report

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15501.pdf>

Attachment 1

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15502.pdf>

Attachment 2

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15503.pdf>

Attachment 3

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15504.pdf>

Attachment 4

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15505.pdf>

Attachment 5

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15506.pdf>

Attachment 6

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15507.pdf>

Attachment 7

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15508.pdf>

Attachment 8

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15509.pdf>

PB17.3	ACTION	Amended		Ward: 27
--------	--------	---------	--	----------

3 Old George Place, Refusal of Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property

(September 3, 2008) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Recommendations

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council refuse the application to alter 3 Old George Place made August 18, 2008 by the applicant, Moriyama and Teshima Architects.
2. City Council authorize the City Solicitor and City Staff to attend the Ontario Municipal Board hearing, should Council refuse this application and the refusal be appealed to the Board.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

Summary

This report recommends refusal of an application to alter a property in the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD) at 3 Old George Place. The property was designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act, enacted by City Council on Sept. 30, 2004, and is identified as a “Category A” building. Category A buildings have the highest level of significance in the HCD, have been determined to be of national or provincial heritage significance, and contribute to the heritage character of the NRHCD.

No. 3 Old George Place was designed by prominent Canadian architect John B. Parkin and is an excellent example of the 1960s modernist movement in Canada. The property makes a significant contribution to the unique streetscape character of this part of the NRHCD ravine lands.

The applicant proposes to build additions on the front of the property that will block views to the existing front of the house and connect to the garage at the front of the property. The garage will also have a partial second storey addition.

This application does not meet the intent of the Official Plan in protecting heritage resources. The proposed alterations would damage the heritage character of the property and significantly alter the streetscape of Old George Place.

Speakers

Ajon Moriyama, Moriyama and Teshima Architects

Michael McClelland, ERA Architects

Jane Smith

Alex Younger and Sarah Richardson

Jan Ruby

Jason Phillippe, Moriyama and Teshima Architects

Gail and Morrie Tobin

Committee Recommendations

The Toronto Preservation Board recommended to the Toronto and East York Community Council that City Council:

1. Approve Option 1 wherein the applicant proposes to add a large, two storey addition joining the front of the house to the garage. The addition is divided into three spaces; a one storey “formal dining room” to the east of the existing main entrance; a two storey block joining the front façade of the house to the garage; and a two storey block on the west of the front façade which extends beyond it to create a new entrance area. The applicant also proposes the addition of a second, glazed storey to the garage, which will be connected to the new second floor of the house. More space will be added over the back of the house with an expanded second storey. The as-built cladding on the house will be removed and replaced with a different cladding material. The cladding on the garage will remain as is.
2. Receive the report (September 3, 2008) from the Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division, for information.

Motions

Motion to Amend Item moved by Prishram Jain (Carried)

Motion to Amend Item moved by Councillor Kyle Rae (Redundant)

That the Toronto Preservation Board recommend to the Toronto and East York Community Council that City Council approve Option 2 wherein the applicant proposes to add a large, two storey addition joining the front of the house to the garage. The addition is divided into three spaces; a one storey “formal dining room” to the east of the existing main entrance; a two storey block joining the front façade of the house to the garage; and a two storey block on the west of the front façade which extends beyond it to create a new entrance area.

Declared Interests

The following member(s) declared an interest:

Adriana Balen - Her employer is the Architect for the project.

Links to Background Information

Staff Report

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15510.pdf>

Attachment 1

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15511.pdf>

Attachment 2

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15512.pdf>

Attachment 3

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15513.pdf>

Attachment 4

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15514.pdf>

Attachment 5

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15515.pdf>

Attachment 6

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15516.pdf>

Attachment 7

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15517.pdf>

Attachment 8

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15518.pdf>

Attachment 9

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15519.pdf>

Attachment 10

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15520.pdf>

Attachment 11

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15521.pdf>

PB17.4	ACTION	Adopted		Ward: 22
--------	--------	---------	--	----------

129 St. Clair Avenue West – Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act

(September 3, 2008) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Recommendations

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 129 St. Clair Avenue West (Deer Park United Church) under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act;
2. If there are no objections to the proposed designation in accordance with Section 29(6) of the Ontario Heritage Act, the Solicitor be authorized to introduce the Bills in Council designating the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act;
3. If there are objections in accordance with Section 29(7) of the Ontario Heritage Act, the Clerk be directed to refer the proposed designation to the Conservation Review Board.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report. The public Notice of Intention to Designate will be advertised on the City's web site in accordance with the City of Toronto Act provisions.

Summary

This report recommends that City Council state its intention to designate the property at 129 St. Clair Avenue West under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The property, which contains Deer Park United Church, was listed on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties on January 29 and 30, 2008.

Representatives of the Trustees of Deer Park United Church have advised staff that they are in the process of selling the property. There are concerns in the community about the potential redevelopment of the site.

Speakers

Gerald McMaster, Chair, Deer Park Trustees, United Church of Canada
Eric Stevenson, Director, Foxbar Neighbourhood Association

Committee Recommendations

The Toronto Preservation Board recommends to the Toronto and East York Community Council that:

1. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 129 St. Clair Avenue West (Deer Park United Church) under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act;

2. If there are no objections to the proposed designation in accordance with Section 29(6) of the Ontario Heritage Act, the Solicitor be authorized to introduce the Bills in Council designating the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act;
3. If there are objections in accordance with Section 29(7) of the Ontario Heritage Act, the Clerk be directed to refer the proposed designation to the Conservation Review Board.

Motions

Motion to Adopt Item moved by Councillor Adam Vaughan (Carried)

Links to Background Information

Staff Report

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15522.pdf>

Attachment 1

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15523.pdf>

Attachment 2

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15524.pdf>

Attachment 3

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15525.pdf>

PB17.5	Presentation	Withdrawn		
--------	--------------	-----------	--	--

37 King Street East - King Edward Hotel - Restoration of the Crystal Ballroom

Summary

Presentation by ERA Architects.

No Written Material

Decision Advice and Other Information

The Toronto Preservation Board withdrew the Presentation by ERA Architects.

Motions

Motion to Withdraw an Item moved by Councillor Kyle Rae (Carried)

PB17.6	Information	Received		
--------	-------------	----------	--	--

Minutes of the Community Preservation Panels

(September 9, 2008) Memo from Chairs, Community Preservation Panels

Summary

- a. North York Community Preservation Panel
 - i. Minutes of the meeting held on June 9, 2008
- b. Etobicoke York Community Preservation Panel
 - i. Minutes of the meeting held on September 9, 2008
- c. Scarborough Community Preservation Panel
 - i. Minutes of the meeting held on September 9, 2008

Decision Advice and Other Information

The Toronto Preservation Board received the Minutes of the Community Preservation Panels for information.

Motions

Motion to Receive Item moved by Councillor Kyle Rae (Carried)

Links to Background Information

North York Community Preservation Panel - June 9, 2008

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15526.pdf>)

Etobicoke York Community Preservation Panel Minutes - September 6, 2008

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15560.pdf>)

Scarborough Community Preservation Panel Minutes - September 9, 2008

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-15650.pdf>)

Meeting Sessions

Session Date	Session Type	Start Time	End Time	Public or Closed Session
2008-09-19	Afternoon	2:00 PM	3:35 PM	Public

Attendance

Date and Time	Quorum	Members
2008-09-19 2:00 PM - 3:35 PM (Public Session)	Present	<i>Present:</i> Ashbourne, Balen, Gogan, Hlobil-Emmenegger, Jain, Rae, Saunders, Thompson, Vaughan <i>Not Present:</i> Dudeck, Dutil, Geduld, Leong, Rieger

Chair