



STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

21 Swanwick Avenue, Emmanuel Presbyterian Church, Approval of Alterations to a Heritage Property

Date:	May 30, 2008
To:	Toronto Preservation Board Toronto and East York Community Council
From:	Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division
Wards:	Beaches - East York - Ward 32
Reference Number:	

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council approve alterations to 21 Swanwick Avenue, the former Emmanuel Presbyterian Church, a designated heritage property. The church is a local landmark in the East Toronto neighbourhood and provides a terminus for the view to the south end of Enderby Road. First established in 1888, the present church was built in 1893.

The applicant is proposing to convert the church to condominium use, providing 10 row houses within the existing building envelope with a small rear addition. New second and third floor levels will be added to the interior.

The proposed alterations are necessary to accommodate the new use for the church. The front, north façade of the building with its large square tower will be conserved and will remain essentially as it is now with some minor alterations. The side facades will retain their important characteristics while undergoing alteration to incorporate new windows and doors.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council approve the alterations to the heritage property at 21 Swanwick Avenue substantially in accordance with the Heritage Impact Statement (Conservation Strategy) titled “21 Swanwick Avenue, Conversion from Church to Residential Condominium”, prepared by Bernard H. Watt Architects, revised 25 January 2008, date stamped received by the City Planning Division, 25 February 2008, on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, subject to the owner:
 - a. prior to final site plan approval;

providing a Detailed Conservation Plan, prepared by a qualified heritage consultant, detailing interventions and conservation work and including as-found photographs of the exterior and interior to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;

providing final development plans, a landscape plan and an exterior lighting plan satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - b. prior to the issuance of any building permit for the heritage property located at 21 Swanwick Avenue, including a permit for the demolition, excavation, and/or shoring of the subject property;

providing a Letter of Credit, in a form and an amount satisfactory to the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning Division, to secure all work included in the Conservation Plan;

providing building permit drawings satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - c. prior to release of the Letter of Credit;

completing the heritage conservation work, satisfactory to the Manager, Preservation Services; and

submitting final as-built photographs of the heritage property at 21 Swanwick Avenue satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

The Emmanuel Presbyterian Church, at 21 Swanwick Avenue, was listed on the City of Toronto's Inventory of Heritage Properties on May 28, 1984. The property was designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act: enacted by City Council on April 24, 2007 (by-law # 383-2007).

In October 2007 Toronto and East York Community Council directed Planning staff to schedule a community consultation.

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2007/te/decisions/2007-10-30-te10-dd.pdf>

ISSUE BACKGROUND

The listed Emmanuel Presbyterian Church was designated in April 2007, following an application to demolish. The applicant first met with City Planning staff early in July 2007 to discuss this application for zoning by-law amendment and site plan approval to convert the church into a 10 unit condominium.

The applicant proposes to renovate the interior of the church to incorporate 10 new town houses in the existing envelope, with a small addition at the rear. The formal planning application was submitted in September 2007. A Heritage Impact Statement was received by Heritage Preservation Services in October 2007, and was revised in February 2007, following comments from staff. Application plans were revised and submitted in March 2008.

HPS has been working with the applicant since October 2007 to ensure that the heritage building will be conserved and enhanced by the proposed development.

COMMENTS

Reasons for Designation

The church is a local landmark in the East Toronto neighbourhood and provides a terminus for the view to the south end of Enderby Road. First established in 1888, the present church was built in 1893 with alterations in 1901 and 1914. Heritage attributes of the church include:

- front façade with the steeply pitched gable end facing the street
- square tower on the front northwest corner, with tourelles and louvered pointed arch windows
- open porch at the main entrance
- 3 pointed arch windows, surmounted by one narrow lancet window on the front façade
- buttresses, gabled wall dormers, window openings on the side facades,
- west side covered porch
- addition at the southwest end of the church
- original materials; red brick, stone, wood and metal trim

(See Attachment No.s 1, 2 & 3 for complete designation report.)

Proposal

The applicant proposes to convert the church to condominium use by adding a small addition at the back and converting the building into 10 residential units, each with their own entry and small yard. Much of the alteration will take place within the existing envelope of the church.

Alterations to the front, north façade of the church are minor and will include: two new narrow windows on the main façade; narrowed width of front stairway; and small windows inserted at the bottom of the large pointed arch louvered windows on the square tower (Attachment No. 5).

The covered porch on the west façade will be converted into an open portico with a walk through to unit entrances on the side (Attachment No. 6).

The main physical intervention to the church will be seen on the east and west side facades. The main floor will be replaced and new second and third floor levels inserted, with consequent alterations to the existing window openings and the addition of front and rear doors on the ground floor and new dormer windows and skylights on the roof of the side facades. A rear addition of about 15 feet will not be visible from the street (Attachment Nos. 6 & 7).

Conservation work will include:

- masonry re-pointing and repair
- restoration of the three pointed arch windows on the front, north façade
- conservation of the front doors
- conservation of the louvered windows, east side stained glass window, pyramidal roof and tourelles on the square tower
- conservation of single dormer window on south west addition
- retention of windows on the west side with replacement of central panels
- on the east side façade three windows will be kept and three reused in the new addition and the basement windows will be retained

On the interior, the applicant is also considering the retention of one or two sets of decorative hammer beams in units one and two.

Heritage Comments

The proposed alterations are acceptable in order to accommodate the new use for the church. The front façade of the building and the large square tower will be conserved and will remain essentially as it is now with minor alterations. The side facades will retain their important characteristics including the buttresses, bay divisions, steeply pitched roof and many of the windows and window openings.

CONTACT

Mary L. MacDonald
Acting Manager, Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1079
Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: mmacdon7@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Barbara Leonhardt
Director Policy and Research
City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment No.1 – Designation Report
Attachment No. 2 – Location Plan
Attachment No. 3 - Photographs
Attachment No. 4 – Site Plan
Attachment No. 5 – North Elevation
Attachment No. 6 – West Elevation
Attachment No. 7 – East Elevation
Attachment No. 8 – South Elevation