
Audit Committee

Meeting No.	10	Contact	Rosemary MacKenzie, Council Administrator
Meeting Date	Monday, March 2, 2009	Phone	416-392-8021
Start Time	9:30 AM	E-mail	rmacken@toronto.ca
Location	Committee Room 1, City Hall		

Audit Committee		
Councillor Mike Del Grande Councillor Rob Ford	Councillor Doug Holyday Councillor Chin Lee	Councillor John Parker Councillor Anthony Perruzza

Members of Council and Staff: Please keep this agenda and the accompanying material until the City Council meeting dealing with these matters has ended. **The City Clerk's Office will not provide additional copies.**

Special Assistance for Members of the Public: City staff can arrange for special assistance with some advance notice. If you need special assistance, please call (416-392-8021), TTY 416-338-0889 or e-mail rmacken@toronto.ca.

Closed Meeting Requirements: If the Audit Committee wants to meet in closed session (privately), a member of the committee must make a motion to do so and give the reason why the Committee has to meet privately. (City of Toronto Act, 2006)

Notice to people writing or making presentations to the Audit Committee: The City of Toronto Act, 2006 and the City of Toronto Municipal Code authorize the City of Toronto to collect any personal information in your communication or presentation to City Council or its committees.

The City collects this information to enable it to make informed decisions on the relevant issue(s). If you are submitting letters, faxes, e-mails, presentations or other communications to the City, you should be aware that your name and the fact that you communicated with the City will become part of the public record and will appear on the City's website. The City will also make your communication and any personal information in it – such as your postal address, telephone number or e-mail address – available to the public, unless you expressly request the City to remove it.

The City videotapes committee and community council meetings. If you make a presentation to a committee or community council, the City will be videotaping you and City staff may make the video tapes available to the public.

If you want to learn more about why and how the City collects your information, write to the City Clerk's Office, City Hall, 100 Queen Street West, Toronto ON M5H 2N2 or by calling 416-392-8021.

Declarations of Interest under the Municipal Conflict of Interest Act.

Confirmation of Minutes – November 4, 2008**Communications/Reports**

AU10.1	ACTION			Ward: All
--------	--------	--	--	-----------

Election of Chair and Vice-Chair, Audit Committee**Origin**

(January 30, 2009) Letter from the City Clerk

Summary

City Council on January 27 and 28, 2009, appointed the following members-at-large to the Audit Committee for a term of office starting on January 28, 2009, and ending on November 30, 2010, and until successors are appointed:

Councillor Mike Del Grande
 Councillor Rob Ford
 Councillor Doug Holyday
 Councillor Chin Lee
 Councillor John Parker
 Councillor Anthony Perruzza

(The Audit Committee elects its Chair from its Members)

Background Information

Letter (January 30, 2009) from the City Clerk regarding the Audit Committee membership (<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-18954.pdf>)

AU10.2	ACTION			Ward: All
--------	--------	--	--	-----------

2008 Annual Report – Fraud and Waste Hotline**Origin**

(January 15, 2009) Report from the Auditor General

Recommendations

The Auditor General recommends that:

1. The City Manager direct management staff to regularly review and evaluate the adequacy of internal controls within their area of responsibility. Where appropriate, action be taken to strengthen controls, with a view to preventing and detecting instances of fraud and other wrongdoing.

Summary

In June 2000, Audit Committee requested that the Auditor General submit an annual report on the status of fraud and related matters. This report represents the Auditor General's eighth annual report on the activities of the Fraud and Waste Hotline Program for the period of January 1, 2008 to December 31, 2008.

Managing the risk of fraud or other wrongdoing must be a continuous and collective effort involving all levels of staff. The primary responsibility for maintaining appropriate internal controls to prevent and detect wrongdoing remains with divisional management.

The risk of fraud and wrongdoing is an inherent part of conducting business in all organizations including the public sector.

Often fundamental and basic internal controls that help reduce the risk of wrongdoing are overlooked when controls are not regularly reviewed. Inadequate internal controls are a primary contributing factor to the occurrence of fraud while the lack of management review and the override of existing controls are also factors.

Corrective controls, such as improved policies and procedures, are key to remedying problems that are discovered ensuring that future wrongdoing is better prevented and detected, especially in areas subject to greater levels of risk.

In 2008, based on our review of complaints, a number of substantiated complaints may have been mitigated through the active application of internal controls, policies and procedures. In these cases, basic controls were disregarded and their effectiveness not actively monitored. The recommendation made in this report will re-emphasize management's responsibility to regularly review and re-evaluate internal controls.

Financial Impact

There are no direct financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

Investigations or reviews conducted by both Management and the Auditor General's Office as a result of various communications to the Fraud and Waste Hotline have resulted, in certain cases, in the recovery of funds to the City. More importantly these investigations or reviews have resulted in improved internal controls which will likely mitigate the loss of future funds.

Background Information

2008 Annual Report - Fraud and Waste Hotline - staff report (January 15, 2009) from the Auditor General

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19077.pdf>

Appendix 1 - 2008 Annual Report - Fraud and Waste Hotline, Auditor General's Office

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19078.pdf>

AU10.3	ACTION			Ward: All
--------	--------	--	--	-----------

Auditor General's Office – Benefits to the City of Toronto - Annual Report

Origin

(January 19, 2009) Report from the Auditor General

Recommendations

The Auditor General recommends that:

1. the Audit Committee receive this report for information.

Summary

This report responds to a request from the Audit Committee that the Auditor General “provide the value added of his department by identifying:

1. actual dollar savings to the City;
2. potential savings to the City of Toronto;
3. at risk dollars to the City of Toronto; and
4. for non-identifiable dollar activities, the impact of the audit review on those items.”

At the request of the Audit Committee, attempts have been made to identify the extent of the quantifiable financial benefits which have resulted from the work conducted by the Auditor General's Office.

While certain reports have resulted in tangible cost savings, the more important benefits provided relate to the avoidance of future costs, as well as the protection of City assets. Nevertheless, tangible annual cost savings have occurred, or will occur, as a result of the work conducted by the Auditor General. Over the five-year period commencing January 1, 2004, the estimated potential savings to the City are in the range of \$91 million compared to a cumulative audit expenditure of \$16 million. In simple terms, for every \$1 invested in the audit process the return on this investment has been \$5.60. Many of the estimated cost savings are ongoing and occur on an annual basis.

Financial Impact

The recommendation in this report has no direct financial implication resulting from the adoption of this report.

Background Information

Auditor General's Office - Benefits to the City of Toronto, Annual Report - staff report (January 19, 2009) from the Auditor General

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19086.pdf>)

Appendix 1 - Auditor General's Office - Benefits to the City of Toronto

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19087.pdf>)

AU10.4	ACTION			Ward: All
--------	--------	--	--	-----------

Review of Management and Oversight of the Integrated Business Management System (IBMS)

Origin

(January 16, 2009) Report from the Auditor General

Recommendations

The Auditor General recommends that:

1. The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer give consideration to the establishment of an IBMS governance model which provides for senior management approval and prioritization of all IBMS related projects. The governance model follow the process recently established in relation to the development of SAP projects.
2. The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer require that divisions identify business risks relating to the IBMS Information Technology System. The Chief Information Officer review all such risks and ensure strategies and processes are in place to address all such risks.
3. The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer and divisions develop IBMS performance measures. Such measures be used to monitor ongoing performance. Where performance does not meet such measures, corrective action be taken.
4. The City Manager and Chief Information Officer as part of the IBMS governance process give priority to the development of IBMS business continuity plans. Such plans should include disaster and recovery planning.
5. The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer develop and formalize service level agreements for information technology services provided to City Divisions by the Information and Technology Division.
6. The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer review current levels of training available to IBMS users, and solicit input from divisional users in relation to training effectiveness. Deficiencies in regard to training identified by users be appropriately addressed.
7. The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer develop and implement a change management protocol for IBMS. Such a protocol take into account the SAP change management protocol.
8. The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer develop security plans, standards and related staff responsibilities for managing and overseeing IBMS

security.

9. The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer be required to conduct periodic reviews of current IBMS user security to ensure access is compatible with user roles. Such review should also include an analysis of the last date of use. Dormant users should be eliminated from system access.
10. The Chief Information Officer develop formal written procedures for granting, changing or removing IBMS user access.
11. The City Manager and Chief Information Officer develop as a priority an electronic interface between IBMS and the City's SAP Financial System. Such an interface would reduce the requirement for manual analysis and processing.
12. The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer and City Clerk review the record retention policy for all IBMS related records. Such a review include the establishment of policies and procedures for archiving IBMS records.
13. The Chief Information Officer obtain a copy of the System source code for the current release of the System software and ensure future releases are accompanied with System software under the terms of the agreement.
14. The City Manager conduct a review of related System users in the City and its Agencies, Boards and Commissions and update the existing software maintenance contract as required.
15. The City Manager ensure staff from business units perform the procedure for revising service fees maintained in IBMS and that the process be appropriately documented.

Summary

The objective of this audit was to determine whether the City's management and oversight of the Integrated Business Management System (IBMS) ensures the reliability, integrity and confidentiality of information produced and maintained by the system.

For IBMS to serve the City efficiently and effectively improvements in management and oversight are required. The establishment of an IBMS information technology governance structure will go along way in helping to coordinate IBMS related decision-making and change management.

Implementation of a long range strategic plan, performance measures and a business continuity plan will also ensure coordinated growth and development for system users and ensure reliable service to IBMS user divisions. There are also opportunities for improvement relating to user training, process for making changes to the system, security management and administration of software licences.

Although recommendations in this report focus on improving existing controls and administration of IBMS related resources the recommendations may be relevant to information technology systems throughout the City and its Agencies, Boards, Commissions and

Corporations and should be reviewed, evaluated and implemented as deemed appropriate.

Financial Impact

The implementation of recommendations in this report will improve management controls over the delivery of IBMS technology services. The extent of any resources required or potential cost savings resulting from implementing the recommendations in this report is not determinable at this time.

Background Information

Review of Management and Oversight of the Integrated Business Management System (IBMS), staff report (January 16, 2009) from the Auditor General

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19132.pdf>)

Appendix 1- Review of Management and Oversight of the Integrated Business Management System (IBMS)

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19133.pdf>)

Appendix 2 - Management's Response to the Auditor General's Review (IBMS)

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19134.pdf>)

AU10.5	Information			
--------	-------------	--	--	--

Fleet Review – Toronto Police Service

Origin

(January 5, 2009) Report from the Acting Chair, Toronto Police Services Board

Summary

The purpose of this report is to provide the Audit Committee with the Auditor General's report entitled "Fleet Review – Toronto Police Service."

Background Information

Report (January 5, 2009) from the Acting Chair, TPSB, including Appendix A - Extract from TPSB Minutes Nov 20/08 meeting; Appendix 1 - "Fleet Review - Toronto Police Service"

(Sept 26/08) by Auditor General's Office; and Appendix 2 - Mgmt Response

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-18242.pdf>)

AU10.6	Information			Ward: All
--------	-------------	--	--	-----------

Implementation of Recommendations Re: 2007 Ernst & Young's Investment Compliance Audit and the Auditor General's Treasury Management Review

Origin

(February 16, 2009) Report from the Acting Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer

Summary

The purpose of this report is to outline the changes in the City's revised Investment Policy that respond to recommendations contained in the annual Investment Policy Compliance Report 2007 from Ernst & Young LLP and the Treasury Management Report issued by the Auditor General.

Background Information

Implementation of Recommendations, 2007 Ernst & Young's Investment Compliance Audit and the Auditor General's Treasury Management Review, report (February 16/09) from the Acting DCM and CFO, and Appendix A - "Implementation of Audit Recommendations" (<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19120.pdf>)

AU10.7	Information			Ward: All
--------	-------------	--	--	-----------

Audits for Toronto Police Services Board Included in the Auditor General's 2009 Work Plan

Origin

(February 5, 2009) Report from the Auditor General

Summary

The purpose of this report is to advise Audit Committee of the audit work to be conducted at Toronto Police Services by the Auditor General in 2009. In accordance with the *City of Toronto Act*, the Auditor General's mandate does not extend to the Toronto Police Services. The Auditor General is able to conduct audit work at the Toronto Police Service only at the request of the Toronto Police Services Board. This work has been requested by the Toronto Police Services Board.

The two projects relate to a follow-up of previously issued reports on:

- "The Auditor General's Follow-up Review on the October 1999 Report Entitled Review of the Investigation of Sexual Assaults – Toronto Police Service" submitted to the Toronto Police Services Board in February 2005.
- "Review of Police Training – Opportunities for Improvement" submitted to the Toronto Police Services Board in January 2007.

The Auditor General advised the Toronto Police Services Board at the meeting held on December 18, 2008 that these particular audits are included in the Auditor General's 2009 Audit Work Plan.

Background Information

Audits for Toronto Police Services Board included in the Auditor General's 2009 Work Plan - staff report (February 5, 2009) from the Auditor General (<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19048.pdf>)

AU10.8	ACTION			Ward: All
--------	--------	--	--	-----------

Leaside Memorial Community Gardens Arena – 2007 Audited Financial Statements and Management Letter

Origin

(February 6, 2009) Report from the Auditor General

Recommendations

The Auditor General recommends that:

1. City Council receive the 2007 audited financial statements and management letter of Leaside Memorial Community Gardens Arena.

Summary

The purpose of this report is to provide the Audit Committee and City Council with the 2007 audited financial statements and management letter of Leaside Memorial Community Gardens Arena. The audited financial statements and management letters for all other Arenas were previously submitted to Audit Committee.

Financial Impact

The recommendation in this report has no financial impact.

Background Information

Leaside Memorial Community Gardens Arena - 2007 Audited Financial Statements and Management Letter, staff report (February 6, 2009) from the Auditor General

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19079.pdf>)

Appendix 1 - Financial Statements, Board of Management for the Leaside Memorial Community Gardens, December 31, 2007

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19080.pdf>)

Appendix 2 - Management Letter (May 5, 2008) from Grant Thornton

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19081.pdf>)

AU10.9	ACTION			Ward: All
--------	--------	--	--	-----------

Business Improvement Areas (BIAs) - 2007 Audited Financial Statements - Report No. 3

Origin

(January 19, 2009) Report from the Acting Treasurer and the Director, Business Services, Economic Development, Culture and Tourism

Recommendations

The Acting Treasurer and the Director, Business Services, Economic Development, Culture and Tourism recommend that:

1. The Audit Committee approve the 2007 audited financial statements and management letters of the three Business Improvement Areas attached as Appendices A-1 to C-2 of this report, and forward these to City Council for its approval.

Summary

The purpose of this report is to present the 2007 audited financial statements and management letters of three Business Improvement Areas (BIAs) to City Council for approval.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from this report.

The Acting Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

Background Information

Business Improvement Areas (BIAs) - 2007 Audited Financial Statements - Report No. 3, staff report (January 19, 2009)

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19041.pdf>)

Appendix A-1 - Church-Wellesley Business Improvement Area - 2007 Audited Financial Statements

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19042.pdf>)

Appendix A-2 - Church-Wellesley BIA - Management Letter

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19043.pdf>)

Appendix B-1 - Kingsway Business Improvement Area - 2007 Audited Financial Statements

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19044.pdf>)

Appendix B-2 - Kingsway BIA - Management Letter

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19045.pdf>)

Appendix C-1 - Mount Dennis Business Improvement Area - 2007 Audited Financial Statements

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19046.pdf>)

Appendix C-2 - Mount Dennis BIA - Management Letter

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-19047.pdf>)

(Deferred from November 4, 2008 - 2008.AU9.13)

AU10.10	Information			Ward: All
---------	-------------	--	--	-----------

Property Tax and Water Credit Balances

Origin

(October 17, 2008) Report from the Acting Treasurer

Summary

This report provides information on credit balances in the City's property tax and water accounts.

Background Information

Property Tax and Water Credit Balances - staff report (October 17, 2008) from the Acting Treasurer

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-18200.pdf>

(Deferred from November 4, 2008 - 2008.AU9.15)

AU10.11	Information			Ward: All
---------	-------------	--	--	-----------

City of Toronto Pension Plans - Audited Financial Statements for Year Ending December 31, 2007

Origin

(October 17, 2008) Report from the Acting Treasurer

Summary

This report will present the financial statements for the City of Toronto Pension Plans for the year ending December 31, 2007.

Background Information

City of Toronto Pension Plans, Audited Financial Statements for Year Ending December 31, 2007 - staff report (October 17, 2008) from the Acting Treasurer

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-18207.pdf>

The Pension Fund of the Corporation of the City of York Employee Pension Plan - Financial Statements, December 31, 2007

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-18202.pdf>

The Fund of the Metropolitan Toronto Pension Plan - Financial Statements, December 31, 2007

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-18203.pdf>

The Fund of the Metropolitan Toronto Police Benefit Fund - Financial Statements, December 31, 2007

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-18204.pdf>

The Fund of the Toronto Civic Employees' Pension and Benefit Fund - Financial Statements, December 31, 2007

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-18205.pdf>

The Fund of the Toronto Fire Department Superannuation and Benefit Fund - Financial Statements, December 31, 2007

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-18206.pdf>

(Deferred from November 4, 2008 - 2008.AU9.16)

AU10.12	Information			Ward: All
---------	-------------	--	--	-----------

Toronto Community Housing Corporation - 2007 Audited Consolidated Annual Financial Statements

Origin

(July 22, 2008) Letter from City Council

Summary

City Council on July 15, 16 and 17, 2008, adopted Executive Committee Item EX22.10, headed "Toronto Community Housing Corporation - Annual Report to Shareholder, 2007 Audited Consolidated Annual Financial Statements and Annual General Meeting", without amendment, and in so doing, referred the Toronto Community Housing Corporation's 2007 audited annual consolidated financial statements and the auditor's report dated March 28, 2008, to the City Audit Committee for its information.

Background Information

Letter (July 22, 2008) from City Council - Toronto Community Housing Corp. 2007 Financial Statements

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-18213.pdf>

Consolidated Financial Statements - Toronto Community Housing Corp. December 31, 2007, including the Auditor's report (March 28, 2008)

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-18214.pdf>

Executive Committee Item EX22.10, adopted by City Council on July 15, 16 and 17, 2008

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-18215.pdf>