

## **Fleet Review – Toronto Police Service**

<b>Date:</b>	January 5, 2009
<b>To:</b>	Audit Committee, City of Toronto
<b>From:</b>	Pam McConnell, Acting Chair, Toronto Police Services Board

### **SUMMARY**

---

The purpose of this report is to provide the Audit Committee with the Auditor General’s report entitled “Fleet Review – Toronto Police Service.”

#### **Financial Impact**

There are no financial implications with regard to the receipt of this report.

---

### **ISSUE BACKGROUND**

At its meeting held on November 20, 2008, the Toronto Police Services Board was in receipt of the following two reports:

- Fleet Review – Toronto Police Service from Jeff Griffiths, Auditor General, dated September 26, 2008; and
- Response to the City Auditor General’s Fleet Operations Review from William Blair, Chief of Police, dated October 29, 2008.

### **COMMENTS**

The Board received the foregoing reports and agreed to forward copies to the City of Toronto – Audit Committee for information.

A copy of Board Minute No. P305/08, in the form attached as Appendix “A”, regarding this matter is provided for information

**CONTACT**

Chief of Police William Blair  
Toronto Police Service  
Telephone No. 416-808-8000  
Fax No. 416-808-8002

**SIGNATURE**

---

Pam McConnell  
Acting Chair, Toronto Police Services Board

**ATTACHMENT**

Appendix A – Board Minute No. P305/08

A: city report fleet review.doc

## APPENDIX A

### THIS IS AN EXTRACT FROM THE MINUTES OF THE PUBLIC MEETING OF THE TORONTO POLICE SERVICES BOARD HELD ON NOVEMBER 20, 2008

#### #P305. FLEET REVIEW – TORONTO POLICE SERVICE

The Board was in receipt of the following report September 26, 2008 from Jeff Griffiths, Auditor General:

#### SUMMARY

---

Attached is the Auditor General's report entitled "Fleet Review - Toronto Police Service." This review was conducted as part of the Auditor General's 2008 Annual Work Plan.

The objectives of this review were to assess and determine the adequacy of internal controls over police fleet maintenance excluding fleet equipment maintained by the marine unit.

Our review identified that the Toronto Police Service has implemented a number of initiatives to enhance the cost-effective management of the police fleet and store operations. Police personnel interviewed indicated their current satisfaction with the number and location of fleet garages and stores. They also indicated that the service quality and response time offered by garage personnel normally meet and sometimes exceed expectations.

Our review found that the current governance structure and control framework provide reasonable assurance that the police fleet and fuelling sites are managed appropriately and related legislative requirements are met.

While the police fleet is managed appropriately, implementation of initiatives such as making better use of current information systems and new technology, and strengthened control over inventory recording will promote cost-effective use of police resources.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

---

##### **The Auditor General recommends that:**

1. Recommendations in the attached Auditor General's report entitled "Fleet Review - Toronto Police Service" be adopted; and
2. This report be forwarded to the City's Audit Committee for information.

## **FINANCIAL IMPACT**

The implementation of recommendations in this report will improve the operational efficiency of the fleet maintenance and store operations.

## **DECISION HISTORY**

The review was included in the Auditor General's 2008 Audit Work Plan in response to a request from the Toronto Police Chief and the Toronto Police Services Board, and in view of the potential impact of effective police fleet management in meeting the Toronto Police Service's mandate.

## **COMMENTS**

The report entitled "Fleet Review - Toronto Police Service" is attached as Appendix 1. The Toronto Police Service has prepared a response to the report and is attached as Appendix 2.

## **CONTACT**

Alan Ash, Director, Auditor General's Office

Tel: 416-392-8476, Fax: 416-392-3754, E-mail: [AAsh@toronto.ca](mailto:AAsh@toronto.ca)

Anne Cheung, Senior Audit Manager, Auditor General's Office

Tel: 416-392-8439, Fax: 416-392-3754, E-mail: [ACheung1@toronto.ca](mailto:ACheung1@toronto.ca)

**The Board was also in receipt of the following report October 29, 2008 from William Blair, Chief of Police:**

Subject: CITY AUDITOR GENERAL'S FLEET OPERATIONS REVIEW

### Recommendation:

It is recommended that the Board receive this report for information.

### Financial Implications:

There are no financial implications related to the recommendation contained within this report.

### Background/Purpose:

In November 2007, the Chief of Police requested the City Auditor General (AG) to conduct an audit of the Service's fleet operation to provide an independent assessment of how well this unit is being managed and to identify any areas for improvement. At its meeting on February 21, 2008, the Board approved the inclusion of this audit in the AG's 2008 Audit Work Plan (Min. No. P24/08 refers).

### Discussion:

Staff from the AG's Office started the audit in early 2008. The Service cooperated with the audit by meeting with AG staff as required and providing information requested.

Upon completion of their audit work, AG staff met with Service staff to discuss their findings and conclusions, and a draft report was provide to applicable Service staff for comment. The AG is providing his final report on this audit to the Board's November 2008 meeting.

### Conclusion:

I would like to thank the Auditor General for conducting this audit as it gives the Service and the Board independent assurance that the Service's fleet operation is being effectively managed, and identifies areas we need to take action on to further improve the effectiveness of this operation.

The audit report makes four recommendations which the Service agrees with, and is in the process of implementing. Our management response to each of the recommendations is included in the AG's report to the Board.

Mr. Tony Veneziano, Chief Administrative Officer will be in attendance to answer any questions from the Board.

**The Board received the foregoing reports and agreed to forward copies to the City of Toronto – Audit Committee for information.**

## **APPENDIX 1**

# **Fleet Review – Toronto Police Service**

**September 26, 2008**



**Auditor General's Office**

---

Jeffrey Griffiths, C.A., C.F.E.  
Auditor General  
City of Toronto

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>BACKGROUND .....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>AUDIT OBJECTIVES, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY.....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>AUDIT RESULTS.....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>A. CURRENT INFRASTRUCTURE AND PROCESSES SUPPORT COST-EFFECTIVE POLICE FLEET MANAGEMENT .....</b>	<b>6</b>
A.1. Governance Structure is Consistent With Industry Best Practice.....	6
A.2. Effective Controls Exist to Ensure Completion of Regular Vehicle Maintenance Inspections.....	7
A.3. Police Fuel Dispensing Sites Are Monitored Appropriately.....	7
<b>B. OPPORTUNITIES FOR ENHANCED FLEET AND FUEL MANAGEMENT .....</b>	<b>8</b>
B.1. Benefits to Be Gained From System Integration .....	8
B.2. Automating Fuel System Management .....	9
B.3. Strengthening Control Over Material Issuance.....	10
<b>CONCLUSION.....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>Exhibit 1: Terms of Reference – Fleet Review, Toronto Police Service.....</b>	<b>12</b>

---

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

---

### *Introduction*

The Toronto Police Service, with over 5,500 uniform officers and an annual budget of \$798 million in 2008, relies on a fleet of 1,600 vehicles for service delivery. Sound fleet management ensures the police fleet is constantly ready to support police officers in meeting their daily operational demands.

*The Chief of Police requested the review. The request was endorsed by the Toronto Police Services Board*

The review of the Toronto Police Service's fleet function was requested by the Toronto Police Chief and approved by the Toronto Police Services Board in February 2008. The request was one of the Service's initiatives to identify improvements in service delivery, support and management practices.

The Auditor General agreed to include this review in his 2008 Audit Work Plan.

The objectives of this review were to assess and determine the adequacy of internal controls over police fleet maintenance excluding fleet equipment maintained by the marine unit.

### **Conclusion**

*Initiatives implemented in the past have lowered costs*

The Toronto Police Service has implemented a number of initiatives, such as consolidating garage and store facilities and reducing staff, introducing a computerized fleet management system and a "Just in Time" inventory management system to enhance the cost-effective management of the police fleet and store operations.

*Current framework supports sound fleet management*

The current governance structure and control framework provide reasonable assurance that the police fleet and fuelling sites are managed appropriately and related legislative requirements are met.

*Customers are satisfied with service quality and response time*

Police personnel interviewed indicated their current satisfaction with the number and location of fleet garages and stores. They also indicated that the service quality and response time offered by garage personnel normally meet and sometimes exceed expectations.



*Improving operational efficiency through automation and strengthened control*

While the police fleet is managed appropriately, implementation of initiatives such as making better use of current information systems and new technology, and strengthened control over inventory recording will likely promote cost-effective use of police resources.

Our observations and audit recommendations are summarized in the following section.

---

## BACKGROUND

---

*The Toronto Police fleet size has remained fairly stable*

The Toronto Police Service operates 1,620 vehicles (including trailers and boats) and 247 bicycles as of March 19, 2008. As noted in Table 1 below, the police fleet inventory remains fairly constant from 2005 to 2008.

Table 1: Police Fleet Inventory, 2005 - 2008

	<b>2008 (March 2008)</b>	<b>2007</b>	<b>2006</b>	<b>2005</b>	
Cars	1371		1349	1344	1331
Motorcycles	92		92	97	104
Other	98		120	119	113
<b>Subtotal –Vehicles</b>			<b>1561</b>	<b>1561</b>	<b>1560</b>
	<b>1548</b>				
Boats	23		23	23	22
Trailers	36		37	37	33
<b>Total</b>	<b>1620</b>		<b>1621</b>	<b>1620</b>	<b>1603</b>
Bicycles	247		225	174	173
Horses	28		28	28	28

*New green fleet initiatives are underway*

In support of the City's Green Fleet Plan and the Toronto Police Service's Environmental Policy, a number of Smart cars, hybrid cars, bicycles and other environmentally friendly vehicles have been acquired for trial with a view to establish an environmentally responsible fleet. We were advised that other devices, equipment and practices will be reviewed and introduced (where operationally feasible) to reduce fuel consumption and pollutant emissions.

***The Toronto Police Services Board adopted a vehicle replacement policy in 2000 on the recommendation of the City Auditor***

In order to ensure sufficient fleet replacement funding, the then City Auditor reviewed and recommended a police vehicle replacement policy in 2000. Subsequently, the Toronto Police Services Board adopted a vehicle replacement policy and annual funding in the amount of \$5 million has since been assigned for replacing and acquiring an average of 200 new police vehicles each year.

The police fleet is serviced by three garage locations and a marine unit. Each garage location maintains an inventory of auto parts, supplies, uniform clothing and other miscellaneous items. Inventory purchases average approximately \$6.5 million each year.

***The Toronto Police Service manages its own fleet and the City manages the municipal fleet***

Like many police services in North America, the Toronto Police Service manages the police fleet and the City manages the municipal fleet. In some cities such as Edmonton and Chicago, city staff centrally maintain both the police and municipal fleet.

In the Toronto Police Service, police fleet management is the responsibility of Fleet and Materials Management, Finance and Administration Division of the Administrative Command. Divisional responsibilities include the following:

- supply, maintain and dispose of vehicles and all related equipment;
- purchase, warehouse and distribute vehicle parts and supplies, uniform clothing and equipment for police personnel;
- manage 22 police fuel dispensing sites; and
- provide other services such as towing, bus and barricades.

***Fleet and Materials Management administers 4 per cent of the Police Service's 2008 budget***

Fleet and Materials Management operates with 119 staff and administers about 4 per cent of the Toronto Police Service's \$798 million budget in 2008.

As indicated in Table 2 below, Fleet and Materials Management manages its own \$9 million budget and administers another \$20 million in budget expenditures accounted for in non-departmental accounts. Table 2 shows these costs from 2005 to 2008.

Table 2: Fleet and Stores Related Costs, 2005 to 2008

	<b>2008 Budget (\$Million)</b>	<b>2007 Actual (\$Million)</b>	<b>2006 Actual (\$Million)</b>	<b>2005 Actual (\$Million)</b>
Fleet and Materials Management, including fringe benefits	\$ 9.2	\$ 9.2	\$ 7.2	\$ 8.1
Non-Departmental Costs Administered by Fleet and Materials Management:				
Gasoline	7.0	6.3	5.8	5.0
Fleet Replacement	5.0	5.4	5.2	4.5
Vehicle Repairs & Maintenance	5.0	4.5	4.4	4.4
Uniform Clothing and Accessories for Police Personnel	3.2	3.9	3.4	3.1
Subtotal	\$ 20.2	\$ 20.1	\$ 18.8	\$ 17.0
<b>Total Expenditures Administered by Fleet and Materials Management</b>	<b>\$ 29.4</b>	<b>\$ 29.3</b>	<b>\$ 26.0</b>	<b>\$ 25.1</b>

---

## AUDIT OBJECTIVES, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

---

Cost-effective management of the police fleet potentially minimizes service disruptions caused by vehicle and officer downtime, enhances vehicle and officer safety, and reduces potential liability associated with vehicle accidents.

***Why we conducted this review?***

The review was included in the Auditor General's 2008 Audit Work Plan in response to a request from the Toronto Police Chief and the Toronto Police Services Board, and in view of the potential impact of effective police fleet management in meeting the Toronto Police Service's mandate.

The Terms of Reference for this review is included as Exhibit 1 to this report.

***What were the objectives of this review?***

Our review encompassed fleet management activities conducted by the Toronto Police Service during the period from January 2007 to June 2008 and focused on assessing and determining the adequacy of internal controls over police fleet maintenance, and excluding equipment maintained by the marine unit.

***This review did not examine vehicle deployment and utilization***

This review did not examine vehicle utilization and deployment as at the time of our review, an internal review of the utilization and allocation of police vehicles was underway. Also, police staff interviewed indicated general satisfaction with the number of police vehicles made available to them.

***How did we do the review?***

Our audit methodology included the following:

- review of relevant budgets, annual reports, policies, procedures, and legal and regulatory requirements significant within the context of the police fleet operation;
- discussions with a significant number of the Toronto Police Service personnel including the Chief of Police, Deputy Chiefs, Chief Administrative Officer and Unit Commanders;
- discussions with Toronto police fleet management personnel and mechanics;
- on-site visits at three Toronto police garages and six fuel dispensing sites to understand the operations and potential risks;
- review of processes and controls for managing the police fleet and fuel dispensing sites;
- discussions with senior management of the City's Fleet Services Division;
- review of the Auditor General's November 2003 report entitled "Fleet Services Review – Phase I" and the Toronto Police Service's September 2004 report to the Toronto Police Services Board entitled "Response to the City Auditor General's Report on Fleet Operations – Phase I"; and
- review of the March 2000 joint report of the Chairman, Toronto Police Service and the then Toronto City Auditor entitled "Vehicle Replacement Policy – Toronto Police Service".

*Our audit included a review of various studies*

Our audit included a review of audit reports from other local governments and police services in Canada and the U.S., and a wide range of studies and professional literature on fleet management.

*Compliance with generally accepted government auditing standards*

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence that provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

---

## **AUDIT RESULTS**

---

This section of the report contains our audit observations and specific recommendations.

### **A. CURRENT INFRASTRUCTURE AND PROCESSES SUPPORT COST-EFFECTIVE POLICE FLEET MANAGEMENT**

Results of our review indicate that the current governance structure and control framework provide reasonable assurance that the police fleet and fuelling sites are managed appropriately and operated in compliance with related legislative requirements.

The following is a summary of our findings.

#### **A.1. Governance Structure is Consistent With Industry Best Practice**

Effective fleet management requires centralized control of fleet operations under one organizational unit that has technical expertise and authority to make decisions on significant fleet-related matters.

*Current governance model is consistent with industry best practice*

Our review found that Fleet and Materials Management operates as a centralized control unit accountable for fleet management, including fleet acquisition, maintenance, disposal and fuel site operations. Organizationally, the Fleet Administrator reports to the Chief Administrative Officer through the Director of Finance and Administration. Our research indicated that the current centralized structure and reporting relationship are consistent with industry best practice.

#### **A.2. Effective Controls Exist to Ensure Completion of Regular Vehicle Maintenance Inspections**

Regular preventive maintenance avoids major mechanical failures, minimizes officer down time and extends vehicle useful life.

*Current inspection frequencies follow industry standards*

Fleet and Materials Management regularly inspects police vehicles based on job profile, pre-determined time intervals and kilometres travelled. Our research indicated that current inspection frequencies applied to Toronto police vehicles are comparable to manufacturers' recommended guidelines and standards followed by many police services in North America.

Our review found that data collected in the computerized fleet management system is reasonably complete, accurate and useful to ensure police vehicles are inspected at appropriate intervals, and support sound vehicle replacement decisions.

*Current control procedures ensure that required regular vehicle inspections are done*

Our review also found that current control procedures are reasonably effective in ensuring compliance with the Service's vehicle maintenance policy. Our sample review of 15 police vehicle files found that during the period of January 1, 2007 to June 30, 2008, 99 per cent of the required maintenance inspections were completed according to the Service's vehicle maintenance policy.

#### **A.3. Police Fuel Dispensing Sites Are Monitored Appropriately**

Fleet and Materials Management is also responsible for operating 22 police fuel dispensing sites, including fuel purchasing, delivery and ensuring legislative compliance. In 2007, total fuel cost exceeded \$6 million, even with cost savings achieved through the City's bulk purchasing arrangements.

*Fuel sites are adequately controlled and compliance with legislative requirements is monitored*

Fuel site operations are governed under the Technical Standards and Safety Act and associated regulations. Non-compliance with the Act could result in fines, penalties or site closure. We found that effective fuel site control procedures were carried out to ensure compliance with applicable regulatory requirements. In addition, control measures such as restricted access to police fuelling sites, daily measurement and reconciliation of fuel level and usage are used to detect possible unauthorized fuel usage and to monitor compliance with legislative requirements.

## **B. OPPORTUNITIES FOR ENHANCED FLEET AND FUEL MANAGEMENT**

While we noted that the police fleet is appropriately managed, implementation of the following initiatives will potentially enhance operational efficiency and strengthen internal control.

### **B.1. Benefits to Be Gained From System Integration**

The Toronto Police Services has joined the City in implementing SAP as its corporate financial information system. Investment returns from SAP would be maximized if available system functions are fully implemented to meet various administrative demands.

In managing the City fleet, the SAP system and the corporate M5 fleet management system are fully integrated, and the SAP inventory module is now used for materials management at City warehouses.

*Potential efficiency gains to be realized through integration of SAP and the fleet management system*

In the Toronto Police Service, the current fleet maintenance and inventory management system was purchased prior to adopting SAP as its financial information system. Our review found that because the fleet management system is a stand-alone system, duplicate data input is required to update other systems with financial information such as warranty parts credits, outsourced repair costs, and unit price of auto parts and supplies. Efficiency would also be gained by providing additional staff training and ensuring available system functions are used extensively.

Administrative efficiencies could be obtained by integrating the two systems and maximizing functionality of the fleet management system.

## **Recommendations:**

- 1. The Chief of Police consider the integration of the SAP financial information system and the fleet management system, taking into account administrative efficiencies to be gained from integrating the two systems.**
- 2. The Chief of Police ensure increased use of the fleet management information system functionality, and provide necessary system training to responsible staff.**

### **B.2. Automating Fuel System Management**

*Current control procedures are effective but operationally inefficient*

Current fuel site management procedures demand staff resources. Specifically, these procedures require daily manual dipstick readings and reconciliations, manual logging of fuel usage and kilometre readings for subsequent review and daily posting to the fleet management system. While these controls are necessary for ensuring compliance with the Gasoline Handling Act of Ontario, vehicle maintenance scheduling and detecting possible unauthorized fuel usage, automating certain recordkeeping procedures will make fuel site management more efficient.

*The 2008 cost estimate was incomplete*

Fleet and Materials Management has requested funding for an automated fuel system for a number of years. In 2008, a related capital funding request of \$700,000 was not approved by the Board in view of other competing funding demands. We were advised that the 2008 \$700,000 funding request only represents projected costs of installing a fuel control system, excluding the automated fuel gauging component. Our review also found that the supporting business case did not identify quantifiable staff savings to be realized from the project.

Our research indicated that many organizations, including the San Diego Police Department in the U.S. and the City of Toronto Fleet Services Division, use automated fuel systems to monitor fuel tank levels, fuel transactions and fuel efficiency.



*Built-in controls exist in automated fuel systems*

The City uses an automated fuel gauging system and a separate Profuel System for monitoring fuelling transactions. The two systems are linked to the City's M5 fleet management system and supported by in-house information technology staff. There are built-in controls to restrict fuel dispensed at each re-fuelling. Unusual transactions such as identical or erroneous odometer readings, fuel usage over specified limits and symptoms of potential abuse or equipment problems can be identified through various system reports.

Replacement of current manual controls through system automation will result in efficiency and potential cost savings.

*Using the City's fuel system may reduce implementation costs*

It makes good business sense to automate fuel site management processes. While capital funding may be an issue, making use of the City's existing price arrangement and drawing on City staff expertise may potentially reduce the implementation cost of this improvement initiative.

**Recommendation:**

- 3. The Chief of Police review projected costs of acquiring an automated fuel system. Factors such as staff related cost savings, the use of the City's existing pricing arrangements for installing fuel monitoring devices and the City's IT system support should be evaluated and included in the project's business case for review by senior management and the Toronto Police Services Board.**

**B.3. Strengthening Control Over Material Issuance**

*Current control procedures demand staff resources*

The Toronto Police Service spends approximately \$3 million on auto parts and supplies each year. Control procedures designed to ensure accurate tracking of inventory items include supervisory review of items charged to each work order, nightly cycle counts and follow-up reconciliations. These control procedures however demand significant staff resources.

Our review found that repair details and labour hours entered by duty supervisors in the system were, for the most part, accurate and complete.

*Errors could be minimized through careful data input and review procedures*

Our review of physical inventory counts conducted by the Police Service found that 27 per cent of the 74 sample items inventoried required follow-up reconciliations. While we were advised that most discrepancies were caused by input error, careful supervisory review of repair parts charged to each work order should have easily identified and corrected the discrepancies, instead of relying on error detection through nightly cycle counts and follow-up reconciliations.

Due care in recording store issuances and review of completed work orders would potentially minimize the need for extensive follow-up inventory reconciliations.

**Recommendation:**

- 4. The Chief of Police ensure internal controls be strengthened over material issuance and work order sign-off procedures.**

---

## **CONCLUSION**

---

Effective police fleet management helps to minimize officer downtime and support cost-effective delivery of police services.

A number of initiatives introduced in the past have enhanced the management of fleet maintenance and store operations. The police fleet function is managed appropriately, however addressing certain issues identified in this review will promote administrative efficiency and more cost-effective use of staff resources.

**AUDITOR GENERAL'S OFFICE  
TERMS OF REFERENCE**

Division/Board: Toronto Police Services Board  
Project Name: Fleet Review, Toronto Police Service  
Year of Audit: 2008  
Project Code: 08-TPS-01

---

**A. Introduction/Background**

The Toronto Police Chief requested the Auditor General to examine the Toronto Police Service's fleet in terms of vehicle deployment, utilization and maintenance. The Chief's request was approved by the Toronto Police Services Board at its February 2008 meeting. Consequently, the Auditor General's 2008 Audit Work Plan includes a review of the Toronto Police Service's fleet function.

**B. Financial/Operational Highlights**

The Toronto Police Service operates 1,620 vehicles (including 36 trailers and 23 boats) and 247 bicycles as of March 19, 2008. The police fleet is serviced by three garage locations and a marine unit managed by Fleet and Materials Management under the Toronto Police Service's Finance and Administration Unit, Administrative Command.

Fleet and Materials Management operates with 119 staff and an approved 2008 annual budget of \$8.4 million. Approved budget for other vehicle related expenditures, such as purchase of replacement vehicles, gasoline, vehicle parts and tires, total about \$16.5 million in 2008. These costs are captured in central corporate accounts and are not included in the Fleet and Material Management annual budget.

Key responsibilities of Fleet and Materials Management include the following:

- supply, maintain and dispose of vehicles and all related equipment;
- purchase, warehouse and distribute vehicle parts and supplies, uniform clothing and equipment for police personnel;
- manage 22 police fuel sites; and
- provide other services such as towing, bus and barricades.

### C. Key Financial/Operational Issues and Controls

Since 1990, the Toronto Police Service has implemented a number of improvement initiatives to enhance fleet management. The following are some examples:

- established a vehicle replacement policy as recommended by the then City Auditor in 2000;
- consolidated garage facilities from seven to three locations, closed four of seven stores and consolidated the remaining three stores within three garage facilities, introduced a “Just in Time” inventory system for vehicle part supplies, and reduced staff from 134 to 119;
- implemented a dealer status warranty network authorizing qualified police service mechanics to perform on site warranty work;
- installed a computerized fleet management information system to track operating and vehicle maintenance costs; and
- implemented fuel and site monitoring procedures for 22 fuelling stations including annual pressure testing, spill containment systems and established tank replacement and fuel management policies to ensure compliance with provincial legislation and other policies and regulations.

According to management, the Police Service is addressing the City of Toronto’s Green Fleet Plan 2008-2011, and green fleet initiatives are currently underway.

### D. Audit Objectives and Scope

The objectives of this review are to assess and determine the adequacy of internal controls over police fleet maintenance excluding boats maintained by the marine unit.

The objectives and scope noted above were selected based on a risk approach which identifies activities during the preliminary survey as having a significant impact on the police fleet’s state of readiness.

A review of vehicle utilization and deployment is not included in audit scope because at the time of our review, an internal review of the utilization and allocation of police vehicles was underway.

Our review will cover the period from January 1, 2007 to June 30, 2008.

Audit methodology will include a review of relevant legislation and policies, interviews with Toronto Police Service’s senior management, key staff personnel at local police stations, garages and stores, examination of documents and records, review of relevant audits and studies completed, analysis of data and any other procedures deemed appropriate. Benchmarking common practices of other jurisdictions will also be conducted.

**Management's Response to the Auditor General's  
Fleet Review – Toronto Police Service**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	<u>Management Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
1.	The Chief of Police consider the integration of the SAP financial information system and the fleet management system, taking into account administrative efficiencies to be gained from integrating the two systems.	X			Complete review by mid-2009. Based on the review results, a timeline will be established for the implementation of any integration opportunities.
2.	The Chief of Police ensure increased use of the fleet management information system functionality, and provide necessary system training to responsible staff.	X			Ongoing. The Service has already commenced a program to train more staff on the RTA system and its functionalities.

**Management's Response to the Auditor General's  
Fleet Review – Toronto Police Service**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	<u>Management Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
3.	The Chief of Police review projected costs of acquiring an automated fuel system. Factors such as staff related cost savings, the use of the City's existing pricing arrangements for installing fuel monitoring devices and the City's IT system support should be evaluated and included in the project's business case for review by senior management and the Toronto Police Services Board.	X			Due to City funding constraints and other priorities, the automated fuel system has been deferred in past programs and is being recommended for deferral in the 2009-2013 program. The current recommendation is to do the project in 2014. However, the Service supports this initiative and will review options (which will include discussions with City staff) to advance its implementation. The business case will take into account staff related cost savings and other factors, as appropriate.
4.	The Chief of Police ensure internal controls be strengthened over material issuance and work order sign-off procedures.	X			Current processes will be reviewed and any improvements will be implemented by end of Q1 2009.