



STAFF REPORT INFORMATION ONLY

Results of Follow-up on Previous Audit Recommendations

Date:	April 6, 2009
To:	Toronto Public Library Board
From:	Auditor General
Wards:	All
Reference Number:	

SUMMARY

The Auditor General's Office conducts an annual follow-up review on the implementation of recommendations contained in audit reports issued since January 1, 1999. This report contains the follow-up results on the status of recommendations included in a report issued to the Toronto Public Library entitled "Fines and Income Review – Toronto Public Library."

Our review indicates that the Toronto Public Library has made progress in implementing outstanding audit recommendations. However, we noted that management is in the process of working through certain outstanding issues. We were advised that most of these will be resolved during 2009. Audit recommendations not fully implemented, as well as management's comments and action plan are included in Attachment 1 and will be carried forward to our next follow-up review.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

There is no financial impact resulting from receipt of this report.

BACKGROUND

The Auditor General conducts an annual follow-up process to ensure management has taken appropriate action to implement recommendations contained in audit reports.

In accordance with the Auditor General's Work Plan, we have reviewed the status of outstanding audit recommendations previously made by the Auditor General to the Toronto Public Library.

We conducted this follow-up audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient and appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

COMMENTS

The follow-up review process requires that management provide the Auditor General with a written response on the status of each recommendation contained in our audit reports. For those recommendations noted as implemented, audit work was conducted to ensure the accuracy of management assertions. Where management indicated that a recommendation was not implemented, audit work was not performed.

Table 1 represents the results of our current follow-up on audit recommendations for the Toronto Public Library.

TABLE 1: FOLLOW-UP RESULTS

Report Title and Date	Total No. of Recs.	Previously Reported		Results of Current Review		
		Fully Implemented	Not Applicable	Fully Implemented	Not Fully Implemented	Not Applicable
Fines and Income Review – Toronto Public Library dated May 29, 2006*	32	24	--	--	8	--
Total	32	24	--	--	8	--

*Website link for the above report: www.toronto.ca/audit/2006/fines_income_review_final_may2006.pdf

Recommendations not fully implemented, together with management's comments and action plan are listed in Attachment 1 and will be carried forward to the next follow-up review.

A report consolidating the results of our follow-up review of City Agencies, Boards and Commissions will be tabled at the June 22, 2009 Audit Committee meeting. The results of our follow-up review for the Toronto Public Library will be included in that report.

CONTACT

Jeff Griffiths, Auditor General

Tel: (416) 392-8461, Fax: (416) 392-3754, E-Mail: Jeff.Griffiths@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Jeffrey Griffiths, Auditor General

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1: Audit Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

ATTACHMENT 1

TORONTO PUBLIC LIBRARY AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS – NOT FULLY IMPLEMENTED

Report Title: Fines and Income Review – Toronto Public Library
Report Date: May 29, 2006

Recommendations:

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
(4)	<p>The City Librarian consider the implementation of the following features for the proposed Library circulation system:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - automated controls for limiting waivers and fine overrides in accordance with staff access levels; and - capability of generating more periodic reports related to collections and waivers including fine waivers over certain limits, cumulative fines waived by account, fine waivers by staff identification and the reasons for the waiver. 	<p>Management provided extensive training on fines collections and waiving to front line staff during 2006 and 2007. It also developed benchmarks to help monitor and control the level of waivers by branches. These benchmarks were achieved for the first time in 2007.</p> <p>Management also reviewed options for incorporating automated controls for limiting waivers and fine overrides. It determined that together with system limitations, it is not operationally feasible to incorporate automated controls on limiting waivers and fines overrides.</p> <p>The new integrated library management system (ILS) was implemented in February 2008 and staff training on fines collection and waiving in the new ILS took place in 2008. In addition, staff spent much of the year testing and validating the reporting capabilities of the new ILS. The cost of additional reports and monitoring will be evaluated against potential benefits in 2009.</p>
(6)	<p>The City Librarian develop and implement a process for more frequent review of fine waivers and the cost of lost materials by branch managers and Library management</p>	<p>As noted in recommendation #4, the Library uses benchmarks to monitor waivers and the benchmarks were achieved in 2007. Staff spent much of 2008 testing and validating the reporting capabilities and results of the new ILS. The streamlining of quarterly reporting and review of waivers will be explored in 2009.</p>
(13)	<p>The City Librarian should implement a process for verification of collection agency invoices ensuring variances are investigated, and incorrect entries are adjusted accordingly. Reported instances should be investigated and excess payments, if any, made to the collection agency in the past should be recovered.</p>	<p>After implementing the new ILS, staff spent much of the year testing and validating the reporting to the collection agency and verified all details on every invoice received from the collection agency in 2008. Errors were tracked to the source cause and corrected for future reports. Corrections were confirmed with the collection agency and payments made on the adjusted invoices; there were no instances of excess payments. The Library is confident that the reports and resulting invoices now generated are accurate, however, there are still certain outstanding system issues that are expected to be resolved during 2009. On a go-forward basis, spot checks</p>

		of invoices will be conducted to ensure accuracy. The recommendation will be fully implemented in second half of 2009.
(15)	The City Librarian should ensure that outstanding balances for room bookings are recorded in the accounting system and reported in the financial statements.	<p>In 2008, the upgraded version of the CLASS system was reviewed and new procedures developed and tested. These will be implemented in July 2009, following staff training and customer communication about the new room booking process.</p> <p>New meeting rooms were added in three branches which underwent renovation and reopened in 2008, and these were added to the CLASS system. Centralization is ongoing with 42 branches remaining to be centralized, with a planned completion in 2010.</p> <p>Once fully implemented, the CLASS system will provide information on outstanding balances.</p>
(16)	<p>The City Librarian should develop policies and procedures for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) collecting advance payment for room bookings; (b) ensuring timely follow-up on outstanding room rentals; and (c) maintaining complete records of room bookings and outstanding room rentals by branches not using the centralized room booking system (CLASS). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) Currently, most customers with credit cards pay for bookings at the time of the booking confirmation. With the implementation of the new booking procedures in 2009, all bookings will require payment before a booking is confirmed. (b) Procedures are currently in place to follow-up on outstanding accounts quarterly. Under the new procedures to be implemented in 2009, outstanding accounts will be followed up on a monthly basis. (c) Non-centralized branch staff maintain booking information files and routinely follow-up on customer payments for bookings. Finance follows up on outstanding and overdue accounts. <p>By the end of 2010, all library branches should be on the centralized booking system, CLASS.</p>
(17)	The City Librarian should maintain and monitor occupancy statistics for room rentals as a tool for planning.	<p>The Toronto Public Library Strategic Plan 2008 -2011 identifies an initiative to promote the use of library meeting rooms. The work will take place over 2009 to identify further strategies to maximize use.</p> <p>This will result in an overall improvement in the management of the inventory of the meeting rooms, and will lead to better planning and utilization, and possibly higher revenues.</p> <p>The centralization of room bookings is scheduled to be complete by the end of 2010.</p>
(18)	The City Librarian should ensure centralized branch use of the room booking system (CLASS) by the end of 2006.	Centralized booking is in place for 58% of the branches. The revised target is to complete centralization of all branches on CLASS by the end of 2010.

(25)	<p>The City Librarian should reduce the current charge card machine (“Mini-Till”) maximum value (currently \$999), and ensure charge card machines and library cards are maintained in a secure location where cards cannot be accessed and charged by persons other than library staff.</p>	<p>The mini-till activity is being reconciled to the cash register tapes and reviewed monthly by Finance. A reminder was sent out to all branches of the need to secure library cards and copy cards.</p> <p>The photocopy fleet is currently being replaced and as this proceeds the mini-tills are being reset with a \$200 limit. Currently, 40% of mini-tills have been reset and the goal is to have all mini-tills reset with a \$200 limit by mid-2009.</p>
------	--	--