

**Management's Response to the Auditor General's Review of
Effectively Managing the Recruitment of Non-Union Employees in the Toronto Public Service**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	<u>Management Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
1.	The City Manager be required to fully address the recommendations relating to hiring contained in the Bellamy Report. The Executive Director of Human Resources also be required to ensure that the quality control of hiring files include a monitoring process to address the Bellamy recommendations.	X		<p>The current hiring and reference checking processes include questions that are behavioural-based and are intended to obtain information, for evaluation/selection purposes, on the ethics of applicants.</p> <p>Ethics training has been provided to almost two thirds (2/3) of management staff. In addition, the new employee orientation program, in place since 2008, incorporates an ethics component.</p>	Direction will be given to ensure that all assessments incorporate specific questions to elicit perspective on ethics of applicants. In addition, the hiring checklist and Quality Assurance process will be updated and include mandatory document completion prior to authority granted to make a successful candidate offer – by January 2010.
2.	The Executive Director of Human Resources take steps to implement the action plans related to employment equity contained in the Toronto Public Service People Plan 2008 - 2011. The action plans to provide specific deliverables as well as a time frame for such deliverables. Regular progress reports be provided to City Council. In developing its specific plans, the Executive Director of Human Resources consult with the Toronto Police Services as well as other appropriate employers in order to ensure that its action plans represent best practices.	X		The Toronto Public Service People Plan 2008 - 2011 was launched in September 2008 and initial activity was communication and dissemination of information regarding the plan to all division/management. The work of Human Resources in 2009 has been to widely consult and then develop a Diversity & Positive Workplace Strategy and a supporting three-year Employment Equity Action Plan.	<p>The development of a three-year Employment Equity (EE) Action Plan 2010- 2012 is near completion and will be an integral component of the implementation of the Toronto Public Service People Plan. It will also follow and be in support of the new Diversity & Positive Workplace Strategy that is being submitted to the November 26, 2009, Employee & Labour Relations Committee meeting.</p> <p>Development of EE Action Plan has included consultation with other large public and private sector employers, including Toronto Police Services, in order to identify best practices. The Plan will include on-going review</p>

**Management's Response to the Auditor General's Review of
Effectively Managing the Recruitment of Non-Union Employees in the Toronto Public Service**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	<u>Management Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
					and evaluation, to ensure that objectives and activities are in place to support current and emerging priorities.
3.	The Executive Director of Human Resources ensure the City's external recruitment strategy includes outreach to diverse community groups. Evidence of such activities be documented in the files.	X		Increased efforts by the City and the Human Resources Division have been undertaken to expand outreach to diverse community groups over the past couple of years.	The City's new Recruitment & Retention Strategy shall be finalized in January 2010. The strategy includes specific objectives to increase current activities including the broadening of outreach activities to the many diverse community groups.
4.	The City Manager in consultation with the City unions give priority to the development of a workplace survey for union staff. Such a survey be consistent with the non-union workforce survey. The results of the survey be reported to City Council and be used as a basis for addressing the City's employment equity hiring goals.	X		In the past, the workplace (equity) survey of unionized staff has not received full support from the unions. The issue of what information will be collected; the use of such information, the reporting of the information and the record keeping of the information has been a previously identified concern. Some concerns raised have been related to confidentiality of information held by the employer. The City of Toronto is not covered by the same legislation as the federal government or other public/private sector employers (e.g., banks) covered by the Federal Contractors Employment Equity legislation.	Human Resources shall consult with the unions to undertake a new/re-survey of the unionized workforce in the first quarter of 2010. Through the recent round of collective bargaining, a Letter of Agreement was reached with Local 416 to work together to develop and implement employment equity initiatives.

**Management's Response to the Auditor General's Review of
Effectively Managing the Recruitment of Non-Union Employees in the Toronto Public Service**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	<u>Management Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
5.	The Executive Director of Human Resources in consultation with the City Solicitor evaluate the feasibility, benefits and risks of adopting a City-wide Corporate hiring policy.	X		The City of Toronto, like many other large public and private sector organizations, has a number of individual policies (e.g., Employment Equity Policy, Employment Accommodation Policy, Human Rights and Anti-Harassment Policy), procedures, hiring guidelines or collective agreements in place that regulate the hiring processes.	Consultation and evaluation shall be undertaken in 2010.
6.	The Executive Director of Human Resources direct all staff to complete the appropriate screening documentation for all employee applicants. All such documentation be retained in hiring files.	X			The Executive Director, Human Resources to direct staff that this direction be carried out immediately - December 2009.
7.	The Executive Director of Human Resources direct all staff involved in the hiring process that documentation relating to conflict of interest declarations be completed and retained.	X			The Executive Director, Human Resources to direct staff that this direction be carried out immediately - December 2009.
8.	The Executive Director of Human Resources direct all staff involved in the hiring process to ensure that there is an adequate level of documentation in all hiring files to support hiring decisions. Such documentation is critical in any potential hiring dispute.	X			The Executive Director, Human Resources to direct staff to ensure that this direction be carried out immediately - December 2009.

**Management's Response to the Auditor General's Review of
Effectively Managing the Recruitment of Non-Union Employees in the Toronto Public Service**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	<u>Management Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
9.	The Executive Director of Human Resources direct all staff involved in the hiring process to follow and comply with the City policies on employment references.	X			The Executive Director, Human Resources shall direct all staff involved in the hiring process that the appropriate reference checking is to be undertaken and documented – December 2009.
10.	The Executive Director of Human Resources direct all staff to ensure that a fully executed copy of the current employment agreement is obtained and retained in the employee's Corporate human resources file.	X		The Corporate record for executed copies of the non-union employee employment agreement is maintained by the Payroll, Pension & Employee Benefits (PPEB) Division.	The Executive Director, Human Resources will follow up to ensure that the all staff involved in the hiring process are notified that a copy of a non-union employee's employment agreement must be forwarded to PPEB Division for appropriate filing – December 2009.
11.	The Executive Director of Human Resources develop Corporate standards which requires the written evaluation of newly hired non-union City employees during the six-month probationary period.	X		A structured performance review for newly hired non-unionized or management staff is a valuable human resources tool to assist in the development of the new employee; however, it should be noted that there is no legal employment added value or validity for the establishment of a formal structured probationary period in the employment of non-unionized or management employees.	The Executive Director, Human Resources will prepare such Corporate standards by April 30, 2010, for City divisions to implement.

**Management’s Response to the Auditor General’s Review of
Effectively Managing the Recruitment of Non-Union Employees in the Toronto Public Service**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	<u>Management Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
12.	<p>The Executive Director of Human Resources develop a hiring benchmark to measure the time required to complete the hiring process for non-union employees and monitor the performance of each hiring unit against the established benchmark. The Division evaluate the current hiring process to determine where “bottlenecks” in the process occur. Steps be taken to address these areas.</p>	X		<p>In 2005, after a review process and recommendations to the City Manager, the City established a hiring process timeline guideline benchmark of 75 days. As reported in the AG's report, the "internal" job competitions are concluded, on average, within 69 days.</p> <p>The City Manager, on October 9, 2009, announced a 'hiring slow down' process as a tool to help deal with current and future budget challenges. Therefore, until further notice, this direction will affect the hiring timeline for filling vacancies at the City.</p> <p>The time it takes to complete an "external" job competition can be greatly impacted by numerous internal variables and external influences and factors that have an indirect and/or direct impact on the hiring process timeline; some of these influences or factors are controllable and others are not.</p>	<p>The continuous improvement of human resources business processes is an invaluable process improvement activity. The Human Resources Division will review the recruitment timeline required for effective "external" job competitions. The hiring processes and timelines will be reviewed – May/June 2010.</p> <p>The Human Resources Division is in the process of developing a new online (web-based) job application process. The hiring timeline process and any related benchmarks will be reviewed and established as part of the implementation process for the new system.</p>

**Management's Response to the Auditor General's Review of
Effectively Managing the Recruitment of Non-Union Employees in the Toronto Public Service**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	<u>Management Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
13.	The Executive Director of Human Resources review the current extent and timing of quality reviews of hiring files. Consideration be given to conducting a certain number of such reviews on current open hiring files.	X			The Executive Director, Human Resources shall conduct the review, including consider the recommendations, by May 31, 2010.
14.	The Executive Director of Human Resources ensure all current and new divisional hiring supervisors and managers attend the “Basics of Staffing” training course.	X		This recommendation requires Division Head support and the financial and learning resources to effectively implement. The current training course is available for all current and new supervisors/managers to enroll and undertake.	Executive Director, Human Resources shall communicate to Division Heads regarding the AG's recommendation to schedule staff to ensure all current and new supervisors attend the offered training course.
15.	The Executive Director of Human Resources review acting assignments to ensure such assignments comply with Corporate policy. The Executive Director of Human Resources review the documentation requirements for acting assignments of non-union employees to ensure Corporate records include written documentation detailing the terms and conditions of acting assignments.	X			Since the end of 2008, all City divisions have been provided with quarterly reports identifying all acting assignments in their divisions for their review and accountability. The City divisions are responsible for managing their acting assignments. HR shall continue to provide City divisions with the regular reports so that they can ensure appropriate action to comply with Corporate policy.

**Management’s Response to the Auditor General’s Review of
Effectively Managing the Recruitment of Non-Union Employees in the Toronto Public Service**

<u>Rec No</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	<u>Management Comments:</u> <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	<u>Action Plan/ Time Frame</u>
16.	The City Manager forward this report to the City’s Agencies, Boards and Commissions. Further, the City Manager request that relevant recommendations contained in this report be implemented.	X			