



STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

Employment Equity Workforce Survey among Non-Union Staff: Response Rate and Representation Rate

Date:	September 30, 2009
To:	Employee and Labour Relations Committee
From:	Executive Director, Human Resources
Wards:	All
Reference Number:	

SUMMARY

On December 1, 2 and 3, 2008, City Council adopted a motion in response to the Audit Committee's November 4, 2008 Decision to request the following:

15. The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division provide a detailed report to Council by March 2009 on results of the 2007 workforce survey for non-union employees, including information on representation of designated groups and comparative results with census data.

This report is provided for information purposes regarding the results of the 2007 Workforce Survey among non-union staff working within the Toronto Public Service. It includes information on the representation of the four designated groups (women, visible minorities, People with Disabilities and Aboriginal Peoples) within non-union staff compared to census labour pool availability estimates, and outlines how the data presented is being used to help the Toronto Public Service (TPS) meet employment equity objectives. The 2007 workforce survey for the non-union workforce had a response rate of 75.4%.

Although the representation of non-union Aboriginal Peoples compares favourably to the 2006 Toronto Census Metropolitan Area (CMA) labour pool availability estimates, Aboriginal community advises that the representation of Aboriginal Peoples is higher than the Census arising from undercounting. The other three designated groups within the non-union workforce fall below the 2006 census labour pool availability for the Toronto CMA.

RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. the Workforce Survey among Non-Union Staff: Response Rate and Representation Rate be forwarded to City Council.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

There is no financial impact resulting from this report.

EMPLOYMENT EQUITY IMPACT

The workforce survey of non-union employees shows the designated group representation through the organization. The data is compared with external employment data to determine whether designated group members are “under-represented” or “over-represented” in the workforce. The results of the survey are being shared with City Council and all divisions to assist in the development of Employment Equity divisional action planning.

DECISION HISTORY

The Employment Equity Unit (Human Resources Division) implemented the first post-amalgamation Toronto Public Service (TPS) workforce survey between 2003 and 2005. The response rate to this survey at 33.1% fell far below the TPS benchmark of 80% rendering the interpretation of data unreliable. This benchmark was adopted by the TPS based on the response rate recommended by the Canadian Human Rights Commission. As a result, on August 21, 2006, the City Manager and Executive Director of Human Resources recommended that divisions/work units with return rates less than 50% be re-surveyed.

Completion of the inaugural TPS workforce survey took approximately 20 months due to ongoing efforts to improve a very low response to the initial rollout of the survey. To improve the response rate, the Employment Equity unit made numerous customized attempts to engage low response units. In addition, results were impacted by the following elements:

- Development of a communication and education campaign for Human Resources staff and managers. Divisions where the survey was well-communicated and supported by senior and middle management had the highest return rates.
- Union membership also had an impact on the return rate. Overall, non-union employees had a higher return rate than those who were union members. All unions were invited to support the survey by signing the introductory memo. Local 416 citing concerns, did not support or endorse the survey resulting in the lowest return rate among the unions.
- Departments/Divisions with multiple locations, shift work, seasonal workforce, and a higher concentration of part-time/unionized workforce generally had lower response rates.

ISSUE BACKGROUND

The City's Employment Equity Policy was established in 2000 to support appropriate representation of the four designated Employment Equity groups throughout the workforce. A key component of the policy is the requirement to conduct voluntary employment equity surveys to support the implementation of the policy with the overall goal of achieving a workforce that reflects the community that is served.

Workforce data provides a benchmark from which the City can track representation of designated group members over time. The data is used to develop and implement programs and activities to close gaps between representation in the workforce and the availability estimates.

The present document reports on the results of the first re-engagement among non-union employees since the 2003-2005 workforce survey. The survey was conducted through 2007 and is intended to assist the TPS in pursuing its Employment Equity Strategy. In 2008, the TPS People Plan 2008 – 2011 was developed and adopted. Goal # 3 of the People Plan is to "attract and retain a skilled, high performing and diverse workforce."

COMMENTS

Response Rate

Employment Equity data on the City's non-union workforce was collected in the second half of 2007. There were 3,951 non-unionized employees in the Toronto Public Service. Results indicate that three-quarters (75.4%) of the non-union staff responded to the Workforce Survey with divisional response rates varying from 41.3% to 96.0%.

Table 1 - Response Rate among Active non-union employees (as of December, 2007)

Service Area/Division/Office	Total # Non-Union	Response Rate Non-Union	
		#	%
Mayor's Office	16	13	81.3
City Council Staff	201	83	41.3
Special Reporting Relationships	268	183	68.3
City Manager's Office	395	379	96.0
Citizen Focused Services A	1,476	1,092	74.0
Citizen Focused Services B	990	762	77.0
Internal Focused Services	605	466	77.0
Response Rate for TPS	3,951	2,978	75.4

High Level Summary of Survey Results

Representation of active non-union employees in the four designated groups was measured and compared to the 2006 availability estimate for the Toronto CMA. A snapshot of overall

results was developed to support the development of employment equity and diversity strategies across the organization

The Workforce Survey indicates the following:

- **Women:** Women account for 45.0% of the non-union workforce compared to an availability estimate of 48.4%. To reflect the Toronto CMA estimate, an increase of 3.3% in female non-union representation is required.
- **Visible Minorities:** 17.3% of the non-union workforce self-identified as a member of a visible minority group compared to the availability estimate of 40.5%. To reflect the availability estimate for the Toronto CMA, the number of non-union visible minority employees needs to increase by 23.2%. According to Statistics Canada, the proportion of visible minorities in Toronto is expected to exceed 50.0% by the year 2017. With significant labour shortages projected by 2011, due to an aging workforce (retiring baby boomers) and declining birth rates, labour force growth in the Toronto area is expected to come from the immigrant population, many of whom are visible minorities. There will be a good opportunity for the City of Toronto to significantly increase its representation of non-union visible minorities and address future workforce demands by increasing its strategic recruitment efforts.
- **Aboriginal Peoples:** 0.6% of the City's non-union workforce identified as Aboriginal compared to the Toronto CMA availability estimate of 0.5%. Although representation within the City of Toronto compares favourably with Toronto CMA availability estimates, researchers have noted that there is a high level of under-reporting of Aboriginal people in urban areas in the Census. Due to the small sample size (n=22) relative to the workforce population of 3,816, caution should be exercised in interpreting the data. To maintain representation in this area, divisions are encouraged to continue focussing their outreach, Employment Equity program development and recruitment efforts on this population.
- **People with Disabilities:** The representation of non-union people with disabilities within the organization at 3.4% falls below the Toronto CMA availability estimate of 5.2% by 1.8%. With continued focus and outreach efforts on this population, the City should be able to increase its hiring and retention of a representative number of employees who self-identify as people with disabilities.

Table 2 - Representation of designated groups – Active Non-union employees Women, Visible Minorities, Aboriginal People and People with Disabilities (as of December, 2007)

Service Area / Division / Office	Total Active Non-Union Employees	Designated Group															
		Women				Visible Minorities				Aboriginal People				People with Disabilities			
		Active Non-Union		Avail Est.	Gap	Active Non-Union		Avail Est.	Gap	Active Non-Union		Avail Est.	Gap	Active Non-Union		Avail Est.	Gap
		#	%	%	%	#	%	%	%	#	%	%	%	#	%	%	%
Mayor's Office	16	9	56.3	48.4	7.9	2	12.5	40.5	-28	1	6.3	0.5	5.8	1	6.3	5.2	1.1
City Council Staff	201	109	54.2	48.4	5.8	14	7.2	40.5	-33.3	1	0.5	0.5	0	2	1	5.2	-4.2
Special Reporting Relationships	268	149	55.6	48.4	7.2	29	11.4	40.5	-29.1	0	0	0.5	-0.5	1	0.4	5.2	-4.8
City Manager's Office	399	270	67.7	48.4	19.3	101	27.2	40.5	-13.3	8	2.2	0.5	1.7	26	7.1	5.2	1.8
Citizen Focused Services A	1476	861	58.3	48.4	9.9	216	15.2	40.5	-25.3	7	0.5	0.5	0	52	3.7	5.2	-1.5
Citizen Focused Services B	990	204	20.6	48.4	-27.8	165	17.1	40.5	-23.4	4	0.4	0.5	-0.1	34	3.5	5.2	-1.7
Internal Focused Services	605	176	29.3	48.4	-19.1	134	22.7	40.5	-17.8	1	0.2	0.5	-0.3	14	2.4	5.2	-2.8
Total - City	3,951	1,778	45.0	48.4	-3.3	661	17.3	40.5	-23.2	22	0.6	0.5	0.1	130	3.4	5.2	-1.8

Programs and Initiatives Implemented to Support the Employment Equity Strategy

Survey data is shared broadly across the organization to ensure Division leaders, Human Resources professionals, Access and Equity Task Group Divisional representatives and others have the information they need to guide them in the implementation of initiatives to improve the representation of Designated Group Members in the TPS workforce.

The Employment Equity Unit supports and markets the programs highlighted below to assist the organization in meeting the goals and objectives of the TPS People Plan which includes diversity in hiring, attracting and retaining a high performing and diverse workforce:

- **Profession to Profession:** Mentoring Immigration Program – Over 217 mentoring matches between members of the Toronto Public Service and internationally trained professionals who are new to Canada and seek employment in their professions were made. The TPS won a silver award at the 2005 Public Sector Quality Fair for its 2004 Pilot.
- **Career Bridge Internship:** The TPS has provided employment internships to more than 300 internationally trained professionals who are new to Canada. Successes are celebrated in special recognition events where the employees and mentees are recognized for their contributions by the Mayor, senior managers and representatives of Council.
- **The Black African Canadian Employment Equity Pilot Project** is a pilot project established in 2007 to provide individual mentoring to Black/African Canadian employees. Following an evaluation by program participants, a new pilot to test a more sustainable group mentoring model is being developed for a second group of Black/African employees in 2010. If successful, the new model is intended to be made available for other equity-seeking groups.

- A 12-month **executive development pilot program** was launched in May 2008 as part of our commitment to succession management. The program is intended to support the development of employees who aspire to be division heads and includes a diverse group of employees including Employment Equity groups. There were 98 applicants and the first cohort has 28 individuals.
- The **Employment Accommodation policy and guidelines** were developed and broadly communicated with mandatory attendance at seminars by human resources staff. Accommodation is provided in all stages of the staffing processes from the interview process through to workplace accommodation upon request by the applicant.
- **Outreach Strategies** to a variety of audiences to educate the public on how to apply for the employment opportunities at the City, including youth in priority neighbourhoods. Outreach to designated communities (such as Aboriginal groups) through job fairs; job postings to agencies that serve the employment needs of specific diversity groups and ethnic community newspapers is also done.
- **Equity Lens:** The City of Toronto has developed Equity Lens as a tool to help ensure policies and services result in equitable outcomes. This tool helps staff to consider equitable treatment of Toronto's diverse communities and workforce when planning, developing and evaluating policies, programs and services. Training in the Equity Lens approach is provided to staff.

In addition to the specific corporate initiatives mentioned above, complementary initiatives are coordinated by the divisions to meet specific divisional staffing needs. Tools such as Workforce Strategy Index, Environmental Scans, and Succession Planning, have been developed to address staffing and equity needs and to identify opportunities for change. Together, these activities provide a solid foundation to support Employment Equity objectives.

Next Steps

- One 2009 initiative nearing final development is the TPS Diversity and Positive Workplace Strategy 2010 - 2012, which will provide a multi-year strategy and plan to enable the City to significantly advance its employment equity and diversity goals. The strategy is designed to support implementation of the TPS People Plan's goals and is anticipated to be submitted to the October meeting of the Employee and Labour Relations Committee with implementation scheduled to begin in early 2010.
- The launch of a workforce survey for union employees has been pushed back to late 2009/early 2010 due to the labour disruption. However, the City and TCEU Local 416 reached agreement on a Letter of Agreement – Employment Equity and Diversity as part of the new Collective Agreement that provides for a mutual commitment and a process to work together to create "a diverse workforce reflective of the diverse communities they serve."

CONTACT

Barbara Shulman
Director, Staffing, Compensation &
Employment Equity
Human Resources
Tel: 416 392-7987
Fax: 416 392-8565
Email: bshulman@toronto.ca

Eva Langer
Manager, Staffing, Workforce Transition &
Employment Equity
Human Resources
Tel: 416 392-5023
Fax: 416 392-4686
Email: elanger@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Bruce L. Anderson
Executive Director, Human Resources

ATTACHMENTS

Table A:- Response rate among Non-Union Employees (as of December, 2007);

Table B:- Representation of designated groups – Non-Union employees (as of December, 2007)

Table A: - Response rate among Non-Union Employees (as of December, 2007)

Service Area / Division / Office	Total Non-union Employees	Response Rate among NON-UNION Employees			
		Participated		Did NOT	
		(#)	(%)	(#)	(%)
Mayor's Office	16	13	81.25	3	18.75
City Council Staff	201	83	41.29	118	58.71
Special Reporting Relationships					
Auditor General's Office	29	20	68.97	9	31.03
City Clerk's Office	98	68	69.39	30	30.61
Legal Services	141	95	67.38	46	32.62
Total - SRR	268	183	68.28	85	31.72
City Manager's Office					
Human Resources	321	309	96.26	12	3.74
Internal Audit	6	6	100.00	0	0.00
Executive Management**	14	13	92.86	1	7.14
Strategic & Corporate Policy	40	38	95.00	2	5.00
Strategic Communications	14	13	92.86	1	7.14
Total - CMO	395	379	95.95	16	4.05
Citizen Focused Services A					
Social Development, Finance & Administration	65	42	64.62	23	35.38
Children's Services	121	111	91.74	10	8.26
Homes for the Aged	156	110	70.51	46	29.49
Court Services	20	18	90.00	2	10.00
Parks, Forestry & Recreation	238	178	74.79	60	25.21
Economic Development, Culture & Tourism	98	66	67.35	32	32.65
Shelter, Support & Housing Administration	155	131	84.52	24	15.48
Emergency Medical Services	115	70	60.87	45	39.13
Social Services	273	205	75.09	68	24.91
Public Health	225	152	67.56	73	32.44
Deputy City Manager A Office	10	9	90.00	1	10.00
Total - CFS - Area A	1,476	1,092	73.98	384	26.02
Citizen Focused Services B					
Technical Services	158	142	89.87	16	10.13
Policy, Planning, Finance & Administration	83	62	74.70	21	25.30
Building	71	63	88.73	8	11.27
Solid Waste Management	98	65	66.33	33	33.67
City Planning	63	53	84.13	10	15.87
Toronto Water	252	152	60.32	100	39.68
Transportation Services	156	132	84.62	24	15.38
Fire Services	51	44	86.27	7	13.73
Municipal Licensing & Standards	42	37	88.10	5	11.90
Deputy City Manager B Office	16	12	75.00	4	25.00
Total - CFS - Area B	990	762	76.97	228	23.03

Service Area / Division / Office	Total Non-union Employees	Response Rate among NON-UNION Employees			
		Participated		Did NOT	
		(#)	(%)	(#)	(%)
Internal Focused Services					
Corporate Finance	13	12	92.31	1	7.69
Financial Planning	40	35	87.50	5	12.50
Finance & Administration	18	16	88.89	2	11.11
Accounting Services	27	26	96.30	1	3.70
Pension, Payroll & Employee Benefits	27	25	92.59	2	7.41
Purchasing & Materials Management	16	16	100.00	0	0.00
Revenue Services	34	32	94.12	2	5.88
Facilities & Real Estate	253	165	65.22	88	34.78
Fleet Management	29	22	75.86	7	24.14
Information & Technology	118	90	76.27	28	23.73
Public Information, Creative Services	15	13	86.67	2	13.33
Other***	15	14	93.33	1	6.67
Total - IFS	605	466	77.02	139	22.98
TOTAL - CITY	3,951	2,978	75.4	973	24.6

** Including City Manager.

*** Includes: Special Projects, Office of the Treasurer, Office of the Chief Corporate Office, and Deputy City Manager CFO's Office.

**Table B: - Representation of designated groups – Non-Union employees
(as of December, 2007)**

Service Area / Division / Office	Total Number of Employees	Total Number of ACTIVE NON-UNION Employees	Distribution of Designated Group Membership among the ACTIVE NON-UNION Workforce (%)			
			Female - WS	Visible Minorities - WS	Aboriginal Peoples - WS	People with Disabilities - WS
Mayor's Office	17	16	56.25	12.50	6.25	6.25
City Council Staff	207	195	25.13	7.18	0.51	1.03
Special Reporting Relationships						
Auditor General's Office	30	28	46.43	32.14	0.00	0.00
City Clerk's Office	387	94	39.36	10.64	0.00	1.06
Legal Services	284	132	40.15	7.58	0.00	0.00
Total - SRR	701	254	40.55	11.42	0.00	0.39
City Manager's Office						
Human Resources	325	297	72.73	26.26	2.36	6.73
Internal Audit	6	6	50.00	66.67	0.00	0.00
Executive Management*	18	14	71.43	42.86	0.00	0.00
Strategic & Corporate Policy	40	36	61.11	27.78	2.78	11.11
Strategic Communications	27	14	57.14	7.14	0.00	14.29
Total - CMO	416	367	70.57	26.98	2.18	7.08
Citizen Focused Services A						
Social Development, Finance & Administration	183	64	35.94	20.31	0.00	3.13
Children's Services	1,301	113	77.88	15.04	0.88	1.77
Homes for the Aged	3,382	149	55.03	20.13	0.00	3.36
Court Services	244	19	52.63	21.05	0.00	0.00
Parks, Forestry & Recreation	10,867	230	25.65	8.26	1.30	3.04
Economic Development, Culture & Tourism	372	92	41.30	6.52	0.00	2.17
Shelter, Support & Housing Administration	817	148	45.27	26.35	0.00	4.73
Emergency Medical Services	1,250	113	12.39	3.54	0.88	10.62
Social Services	2,162	266	54.14	18.42	0.38	4.14
Public Health	2,015	220	50.91	15.45	0.45	1.82
Deputy City Manager A Office	27	8	25.00	12.50	0.00	0.00
Total - CFS - Area A	22,620	1,422	44.94	15.19	0.49	3.66
Citizen Focused Services B						
Technical Services	534	156	16.67	28.21	0.64	7.69
Policy, Planning, Finance & Administration	427	80	37.50	18.75	1.25	3.75
Building	370	70	17.14	41.43	0.00	1.43
Solid Waste Management	1,319	95	8.42	10.53	1.05	3.16
City Planning	326	62	32.26	3.23	0.00	4.84
Toronto Water	1,401	245	13.06	17.14	0.00	2.04
Transportation Services	1,224	152	7.89	9.21	0.66	1.97
Fire Services	3,115	50	30.00	4.00	0.00	6.00
Municipal Licensing & Standards	357	42	19.05	9.52	0.00	2.38

Service Area / Division / Office	Total Number of Employees	Total Number of ACTIVE NON-UNION Employees	Distribution of Designated Group Membership among the ACTIVE NON-UNION Workforce (%)			
			Female - WS	Visible Minorities - WS	Aboriginal Peoples - WS	People with Disabilities - WS
Deputy City Manager B Office	24	15	40.00	20.00	0.00	0.00
Total - CFS - Area B	9,097	967	17.48	17.06	0.41	3.52
Internal Focused Services						
Corporate Finance	30	13	23.08	23.08	0.00	0.00
Financial Planning	41	39	46.15	48.72	0.00	0.00
Finance & Administration	38	17	47.06	17.65	0.00	0.00
Accounting Services	130	27	44.44	48.15	0.00	3.70
Pension, Payroll & Employee Benefits	138	25	56.00	32.00	0.00	0.00
Purchasing & Materials Management	108	16	25.00	18.75	0.00	12.50
Revenue Services	315	34	47.06	8.82	0.00	0.00
Facilities & Real Estate	927	250	14.00	18.00	0.00	2.40
Fleet Management	201	29	10.34	17.24	3.45	3.45
Information & Technology	347	115	22.61	24.35	0.00	2.61
Public Information, Creative Services	64	15	53.33	0.00	0.00	0.00
Other**	15	15	53.33	40.00	0.00	6.67
Total - IFS	2,354	595	26.05	22.86	0.17	2.35
TOTAL - CITY	35,412	3,816	36.3	17.3	0.6	3.4

* Includes: City Manager.

** Includes: Special Projects, Office of the Treasurer, Office of the Chief Corporate Officer, and Deputy City Manager CFO's Office.