



STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

Status Report – Update on the Implementation of Auditor General’s 2008 Recommendations on Access, Equity and Human Rights

Date:	September 21, 2009
To:	City Council
From:	City Manager
Wards:	All
Reference Number:	

SUMMARY

This report provides City Council with an update on the status of implementation of the recommendations made by the Auditor General in 2008 regarding the implementation of Access, Equity and Human Rights initiatives. Appendix A indicates that ten recommendations have been implemented and that progress is being made on the remaining recommendations, with updates to the Executive Committee on regular annual reports.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Manager recommends that:

1. the Executive Committee receive implementation updates on the Auditor General's recommendations as part of regular annual reports on Human Rights, Employment Equity and the implementation of Access, Equity and Human Rights Action Plans; and
2. the update on the implementation of recommendations made by the Auditor General in 2008 (Appendix A) be referred to the Audit Committee.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

There are no financial implications arising from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

In December 2008, City Council requested the City Manager to report to the Executive Committee on progress made towards implementing the Auditor General's recommendations regarding Access, Equity and Human Rights. The audit covered the period January 2004 to September 2008.

Audit of City Performance in Achieving Access, Equity and Human Rights Goals – report (October 14, 2008) from the Auditor General

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-16435.pdf>)

Appendix 1 - Audit of City Performance in Achieving Access, Equity and Human Rights Goals - Auditor General's Office, October 14, 2008

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-16436.pdf>)

Appendix 2 - Management's Response to the Auditor General's Audit

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-16459.pdf>)

COMMENTS

(a) Context of Auditor General's report

One of the 97 recommendations of the 1999 Report of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity recommended that City Council request the Auditor General report in each term of Council on the progress being made towards the City's Access, Equity and Human Rights goals.

The Auditor General's 2008 report observed:

“Since our last audit in 2003, the City has made progress in a number of areas and has undertaken numerous new initiatives. In particular, Council direction for City Divisions to develop access, equity and human rights plans has been implemented. This is a significant step in integrating access and equity into City service and operation.

However, a number of other areas can be further improved. To achieve its access, equity and human rights goals, the City needs to enhance its human rights complaint management process, develop a corporate civic engagement strategy, implement a workforce survey, and increase its level of diversity and human rights training”.

Over the past decade, the City Manager has also provided Council with a number of reports which:

- advised on the status of implementation of the recommendations of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity;
- submitted the Access, Equity and Human Rights Action Plans of City Divisions;
- reported on the annual activities of the Human Rights Office; and
- recommended policies and programs to achieve Council's Access, Equity and Human Rights goals.

At its August 2008 meeting, City Council approved the City Manager's report which advised Council on the status of the City's Access, Equity and Human Rights Achievements. The report had two components: (a) an update on the implementation of the 2008 Auditor General's recommendations regarding the implementation of Access, Equity and Human Rights in Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations (ABCCs); and (b) the indicators used for the first time to benchmark accomplishments by City Divisions and to measure progress towards City goals.

Status Report - 2008 Access, Equity and Human Rights (AEHR) Achievements

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/ex/bgrd/backgroundfile-21485.pdf>)

Appendix 1: Cover Page

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/ex/bgrd/backgroundfile-21486.pdf>)

Appendix 1 - Indicators - Summary of 2008 AEHR Achievements

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/ex/bgrd/backgroundfile-21487.pdf>)

Appendix 2 - Details of 2008 AEHR Achievements

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/ex/bgrd/backgroundfile-21488.pdf>)

(b) Scope of recommendations

As noted above, the Auditor General's report identified areas for future implementation and made 29 recommendations to address the following:

- Enhancement of a human rights complaint management process - Recommendations: 1, 4, 5, 6, 7;
- Development of civic engagement strategy – Recommendations: 9, 10, 11, 12, 13;
- Implementation of a workforce survey and employee engagement – Recommendations: 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19;
- Increasing the level of diversity and human rights training – Recommendations 21, 26;
- Implementation of Access, Equity and Human Rights activities by Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations (ABCCs) – Recommendations 2, 3, 8, 27 and 28;
- Establishment of a corporate fund for employee accommodation – Recommendation 20;
- Development of an Urban Aboriginal Strategy – Recommendation 22;
- Reporting on the implementation of the equity lens – Recommendation 23;

- Reporting cycles for Action Plans – Recommendations 24 and 25;
- Establishing accountability by managers for Access, Equity and Human Rights implementation – Recommendation 29;

(c) Status of implementation

- (i) Human Rights Complaint Management
Recommendations: 1, 4, 5, 6, 7

All recommendations proposed by the Auditor General have been addressed and where feasible are being incorporated into the operations of the Human Rights Office. The 2008 Annual Report from the Human Rights Office was presented to the Employee and Labour Relations Committee on June 11, 2009. The report provided information on human rights issues raised by City staff and service recipients and initiatives undertaken by the Human Rights Office to resolve complaints and promote respectful, discrimination-free employment practices and service provision.

The report noted that consultations with the Human Rights Office more than doubled from 424 in 2007 to 875 in 2008. Information on complaints filed with the Human Rights Tribunal of Ontario (HRTO) by employees and service recipients are included in all Annual Reports and future reports will include Human Rights Tribunal of Ontario complaint resolutions and associated costs. In 2008, 18 complaints were filed with the HRTO, similar to the 2007 level of 19 complaints.

The report further advised of the improvements and additions to the communications strategy and the enhancement of the website. City Council approved the addition of one new Human Rights Consultant position to assist with the workload of the Human Rights Office.

The impact of amendments to the Ontario Human Rights Code will be addressed in future Annual Reports of the Human Rights Office.

- (ii) Civic Engagement
Recommendations: 9, 10, 11, 12, 13

All recommendations proposed by the Auditor General have been addressed and are now complete. Civic Engagement is defined as “all of the ways in which a relationship is developed and supported between local government and the public including formal and informal mechanisms and the public in all of its forms in local decision-making and the development of public policy”.

Civic engagement is one of the cornerstones of good governance. The City is committed to ensuring that Toronto’s residents have a strong voice in helping to shape their neighbourhoods and build a liveable Toronto with opportunity for all.

Civic engagement is a shared responsibility – among elected representatives, divisions and at the corporate level. Civic engagement is embedded in both the administrative and political decision-making systems, and at every level and in every program of the City organization. For example:

- Many City divisions regularly seek public input and participation in program delivery and policymaking. City staff host forums and workshops, charrettes and consultations;
- Councillors head up local community discussions, taskforces and public committees;
- The City supports public appointments, election outreach and education, and formal presentations to Committees of Council;
- Place-based community development is a foundation of many of our neighbourhood based programs. Community development in Toronto aims at building the capacity of individuals and organizations to articulate their needs and aspirations and work cooperatively to achieve solutions. This is a deep and ongoing investment in the City’s neighbourhoods and is targeted and focused civic engagement.

Currently, many City activities and policies are designed to seek input and participation from diverse communities.

Examples of opportunities for participation in the City’s decision-making are:

- City-wide public consultation events such as “Listening to Toronto”;
- Public appointments to City boards, agencies, commissions, corporations, and advisory committees;
- Divisional surveys, open houses, forums, charrettes, focus groups, etc.;
- Elections;
- Public participation in local consultation meetings such as public meetings held under the Planning Act;
- Opportunities for public deputation to City Council and Committees, and contact with ward Councillors.

At the corporate level, responsibilities for civic engagement are housed in the Strategic and Corporate Policy Division within the City Manager’s Office. Civic engagement responsibilities include:

- Coordinating the appointment of public members to City agencies, boards, commissions, and corporations;
- Developing city-wide strategies and guidelines respecting civic engagement;
- Promoting engagement of specific population groups in City decision-making;
- Providing advice and assistance to staff and elected officials as requested;
- Housing the civic engagement office activities;
- Preparing civic literacy resources;

- Developing Toronto Civics 101 - a program offered to members of the public as an introduction to City government, including how Council makes decisions, the City's financial framework and planning process. The program incorporates opportunity for public discussion and input. The first offering has begun and will run through Fall 2009

- (iii) Workforce survey
Recommendations: 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19

A review of other large employer organizations' methodologies and their approaches to the survey of unionized staff on equity issues, has been undertaken by Human Resources staff. Planning for the workforce survey was initiated but was interrupted as a result of the collective bargaining process. Human Resources plans to work with the employee unions/groups to gain support for the new workforce survey. In February 2009, the City worked with Local 79 to hold an equity conference for shop stewards. The City will report out on detailed results of the non-union workforce survey and provide an update on the timeline for the survey of the unionized workforce to the October 2009 meeting of the Employee and Labour Relations Committee.

- (iv) Diversity and human rights training
Recommendations 21, 26

The City Manager's Status Report on the results of 2008 implementation of Access Equity and Human Rights activities includes details of participation in staff development, training and workshops, including participation by 1,256 staff in corporate and divisional programs related to diversity. The 2008 Annual Report of the Human Rights Office noted an increased level of training from 446 in 2007 to 2702 in 2008. The City Manager also advised Council that training for staff regarding the customer services under the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act (AODA) will be expedited.

Last September 2008, City Council was provided with a comprehensive strategy for training and development of the Toronto Public Service contained in the People Plan. Separate reports on the implementation of the People Plan will be submitted.

- (v) Implementation of Access Equity and Human Rights Activities by Agencies Boards, Commissions and Corporations (ABCCs)
Recommendations 2, 3, 8, 27, and 28

The City Manager has written to the Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations (ABCCs) advising of the recommendations of the Auditor General. Responses from the ABCCs on the status of implementing a Human Rights Policy were reported directly to the Audit Committee and will be on the October 2009 meeting agenda of the committee.

- (vi) Establishment of a corporate fund for employee accommodation – Recommendation 20

This recommendation will be addressed in the 2010 budget.

- (vii) Development of an Urban Aboriginal Strategy Recommendation 22

At its August 2009 meeting, City Council approved the City Manager's report on the development of the Toronto Urban Aboriginal Strategy.

- (viii) Implementation of the Equity Lens Recommendation 23

At the June 2009 meeting of the Executive Committee, the City Manager advised that future implementation of the equity lens would apply to all significant policy reports submitted to Council. An information report is being submitted to the October 2009 meeting of the Executive Committee.

- (ix) Consideration of reporting cycles for Action Plans Recommendations 24 and 25

City Council has approved the timeline and format for future reports on implementation of Access Equity and Human Rights initiatives undertaken by City Divisions. City Council has directed that all future reports use benchmarks and indicators. The next report will be submitted by September 2010.

- (x) Establishing accountability by managers for Access, Equity and Human Rights implementation Recommendation 29

The Human Resources Division is in the process of updating the performance planner template being used for non-union staff for implementation in 2010.

CONTACT

Ceta Ramkhalawansingh, Manager, Diversity Management and Community Engagement
Tel: 416-392-6824 E-mail: cramkhal@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Joseph P. Pennachetti
City Manager

ATTACHMENT: APPENDIX A

APPENDIX A: Updates on the implementation of recommendations made by the Auditor General in 2008 regarding the implementation of Access Equity and Human Rights Initiatives.

No.	Recommendation	Updates
1.	<p>The City Manager review the organizational placement of the Human Rights Office with a view to identifying opportunities for enhancing its level of independence and authority recognizing:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) The importance attached to the Human Rights Office; (b) The need for the independence of the Office; and (c) Recent changes to the Ontario Human Rights Code. <p>Further, the City Manager report to City Council by June 2010 on the impact of the changes to the Ontario Human Rights Code. Such information to include the number of complaints filed at the Human Rights Tribunal of Ontario involving the City, complaint resolutions and the associated costs.</p>	<p>UPDATE</p> <p>Research is underway on the organizational placement/models of human rights functions in external (best practice) organizations.</p> <p>The 2008 Annual Report from the Human Rights Office was presented to the Employee and Labour Relations Committee on June 11, 2009. The report provided information on human rights issues raised by City staff and service recipients and initiatives undertaken by the Human Rights Office to resolve complaints and promote respectful, discrimination-free employment practices and service provision.</p> <p>The report noted that consultations with the Human Rights Office more than doubled from 424 in 2007 to 875 in 2008. Information on complaints filed with the Human Rights Tribunal of Ontario (HRTO) by employees and service recipients are included in all Annual Reports and future reports will include Human Rights Tribunal of Ontario complaint resolutions and associated costs. In 2008, 18 complaints were filed with the HRTO, similar to the 2007 level of 19 complaints.</p> <p>The report further advised of the improvements and additions to the communications strategy and the enhancement of the website, City Council approved the addition of a new Human Rights Consultant position to assist with the workload of the Human Rights Office.</p> <p>The City Manager will address the impact of amendments to the Ontario Human Rights Code in the <i>2009 Human Rights Office Annual Report</i> to be submitted in June 2010. Confidentiality agreements and legal issues will need to be considered with regard to full reporting of the remedies and associated costs of resolved complaints.</p>

No.	Recommendation	Updates
2.	City Council request all Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations to report to Council by June 2009 whether they have developed a human rights policy and related complaint procedures, whether the policy and procedures are in keeping with provisions in the City's policy and procedures, and implementation of these policies and procedures.	UPDATE: COMPLETED In April 2009, the City Manager wrote to Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations (ABCCs) advising of the recommendations of the Auditor General. The responses from the ABCCs on the status of implementing a Human Rights Policy were reported directly to the Audit Committee. These submissions have been re-scheduled from June 22, 2009 to the October 2009 meeting of the Audit Committee.
3.	City Council request the major Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations to provide an annual human rights report to Council detailing the numbers and types of human rights complaints received by the Human Rights Tribunal of Ontario involving the respective Agency, Board, Commission and Corporation, and the complaint resolutions and associated costs.	UPDATE: COMPLETED: See #2.
4.	The City Manager, in consultation with the City Solicitor, review the existing complaint protocol of the Integrity Commissioner in order to ensure that Councillor related human rights and harassment complaints are dealt with in a manner consistent with other complaints and is in the best interest of the public.	UPDATE: The joint review and development of Human Rights and Anti-Harassment Complaint Procedures for Members of Toronto City Council is currently in progress by the City Manager's Office and City Solicitor's Office. A review of the applicability of human rights complaints and the Integrity Commissioner's function is part of this review
5.	The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division, in view of current changes to the Ontario Human Rights Code, review the current level of resources in the City's Human Rights Office to ensure that it is adequately resourced to carry out its responsibilities.	UPDATE: COMPLETED See update for Recommendation #1 which advises that a new position has been added to the Human Rights Office and that the impact of changes to the Human Rights Code will be addressed in the 2009 Report of the Human Rights Office.
6.	The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division consider adapting the Fraud and Waste Hotline complaint management system for use by the	UPDATE: The Executive Director of Human Resources will review the complaint intake and management functions

No.	Recommendation	Updates
	Human Rights Office to improve efficiency in complaint in-take and management functions.	within the Human Rights Office in 2010 and consider whether adapting the AG's Fraud and Waste Hotline Complaint management system would be beneficial to its effective operations.
7.	The City Manager increase the profile of the Human Rights Office in order to ensure the general public and City employees are aware of its role and mandate. The increased profile be accomplished by providing additional information on the Human Rights Office via the City's Web site. Consideration also be given to revising the Web page to accommodate a process whereby human rights complaints can be submitted online.	<p>UPDATE:</p> <p>The Human Rights public web page has been updated- http://www.toronto.ca/divisions/human_rights.htm The site includes an introduction to the Human Rights Office and its services and links to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • City of Toronto Human Rights and Anti-Harassment Policy • Complaint Procedures • Expectations of Members of the Public • Members of the Toronto Public Service • Human Rights Issues Related to non-City Services and Employment • Special Needs • Annual Reports • Contact us <p>There are multiple links to this page from elsewhere on the internet. Members of the public can make an enquiry or complaint via the confidential enquiry line or email.</p> <p>Human Rights staff are exploring the development of a complaint form in conjunction with recommendation 6. Further work on this recommendation will be undertaken as part of the 2010 budget process.</p>
8.	The City Manager, in consultation with City Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations, consider creating a consolidated Human Rights Office Web page for receiving human rights or harassment related complaints or enquiries concerning services and practices of City Divisions, Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations.	<p>UPDATE:</p> <p>Consultations will take place in 2010 with the ABCCs and in conjunction with further investigation of an on-line complaints system.</p>
9.	The City Manager report back to the Executive Committee as requested by City Council in 2006 on methods by which members of the community can be	<p>UPDATE: COMPLETED</p> <p>In 2005 the City's Governing Toronto Advisory Panel commissioned Dr. Pamela Robinson, Assistant</p>

No.	Recommendation	Updates
	<p>more actively engaged, and how Council can better interact with community groups that reflect the changing demographics across Toronto.</p>	<p>Professor, School of Urban and Regional Planning, Ryerson University, to conduct research on civic engagement in the City of Toronto. The research consisted of interviews with City staff, personal observations by the researcher, and a literature review.</p> <p>Dr. Robinson’s report to the Panel indicated that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Staff commitment to and enthusiasm for civic engagement activities at the City were deep and high. Staff at the City have a long-standing interest in civic engagement and strong in-house capacity to conduct civic engagement work. • Interviews revealed a strong level of staff commitment to engaging commonly disenfranchised populations including youth, the homeless, new Canadians and seniors. • There are a tremendous number and variety of opportunities already in place for citizen – local government interaction. <p>(a) Methods for active public civic engagement, and interaction with community groups</p> <p>The City Manager’s Office, in response to requests from the public, members of Council and City staff, has developed resources to support civic engagement methodologies and interaction. Included in these resources is a public website, an intranet for the City’s engagement practitioners, research and advice to divisions and elected officials on engagement best practices and considerations for supporting public participation in City decision-making.</p> <p>Research conducted by the City Manager’s Office (see recommendation 13) indicated that the public felt that their capacity to engage with the City would be enhanced if clear, introductory information on how the City government works, including governance systems, financing, role of elected officials and the public, was made available. The following actions have been taken to meet this need:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A public website has been launched (toronto.ca/civic-engagement). • A series of civic literacy resources is

No.	Recommendation	Updates
		<p>provided on the website including information on Council decision-making, City financing, elections, key roles in Toronto's governance system, City planning and the role of City, provincial and federal governments. Each topic is summarized for quick, informative reading and both an on-line and printable version is available. Links to additional information are provided in each guide. New topics will be added regularly.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In order to make it easier for the public to find information on consultations being conducted by the City, the new civic engagement website also includes a listing of current consultations and archived information on past consultations. By providing information on consultations that the City has completed the public will be able to learn what happened to their contribution if they participated, get a summary of input collected and track a project's next steps or outcomes. • The public website incorporates links to resources on local organizing and engagement. Local and international best practices are included as advice to communities and neighbourhoods in developing their priorities, visions or plans. • The public can also find information on volunteer opportunities, making a deputation, public appointments, Council highlights, public notices, polling, demographic information, and the City's agencies, boards and commissions. Two twitter feeds are provided on the site, one with information on Council agendas and minutes and one on heritage events and learning opportunities.

No.	Recommendation	Updates
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The City’s refreshed website provides access to an online translator which will ensure that the civic engagement resources are now available in 23 languages. • In September 2009 the City will offer the first Toronto Civics 101 learning series for members of the public. Toronto Civics 101 is an opportunity for members of the public to learn about the fundamentals of the City’s services, budget and governance processes. Participants will attend six evening sessions in 2009, with the goal of becoming better informed so that they are more prepared to become involved in their neighbourhoods and the city. Outreach focused on seeking involvement from previously unengaged participants representing diverse perspectives. The sessions will be uploaded so as to allow all Torontonians to learn along through the City’s website at home, school or at their public library. <p>(b) Civic engagement tools and resources for staff and Members of Council</p> <p>In addition to facilitating the public’s engagement with City government the Strategic and Corporate Policy Division has been working to build on staff skills and experience by creating an internal community of engagement practitioners. Members of Council and City staff from across the corporation now have access to a number of resources to support them in their civic engagement activities, learning and collaboration, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Civic Engagement Network, an intranet site set up to connect practitioners across City divisions provide news about workshops and training programs, resources and materials, collaborative on-line discussions and links to sites, networks and engagement best practices. • A quarterly newsletter provides reviews of resources, articles on current and emerging

No.	Recommendation	Updates
		<p>trends in civic engagement practice in Toronto and other jurisdictions, as well as links to case studies, conferences and workshops. The first five editions have been published each with a different focus: continuums of civic engagement, access and inclusion, communication and education, engagement toolkits and guides., and electronic and online engagement.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Resources and information on the wide range of engagement methodologies which should be considered as part of each division’s, community’s or Councillor’s engagement planning. Advice and information has also been provided to help select the most appropriate methodology. • Direct support and advice to the many engagement and consultation activities the City undertakes each year – to build the City’s overall engagement capacity. This support is available to Members of Council and to City staff and divisions and includes advice about best practices and engagement methodologies, and the exploration of new technology and community partnerships. • Half-day training sessions for City staff, building on workshops previously offered to staff involved in community engagement activities, the next session is scheduled for October 7. Training and workshops will be offered on an ongoing basis to City staff.
10.	<p>The City Manager complete the development of a City-wide civic engagement strategy as recommended by the Governing Toronto Advisory Panel in 2005. The civic engagement strategy should address issues including:</p> <p>(a) defining the term “civic engagement” in the context of City operation and service;</p> <p>(b) developing an inventory of civic</p>	<p>UPDATE: COMPLETED</p> <p>The City Manager has addressed the recommendations of the Governing Toronto Advisory Panel to enhance civic engagement as it is tied to the legislative system of the City of Toronto through the following:</p> <p>The civic engagement strategy has three interdependent components:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Provision of strategic coordination and advice within the organization

No.	Recommendation	Updates
	<p>engagement activities; and (c) developing performance indicators.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Development of participatory models of engagement ▪ Enhancement of outreach and inclusion activities. <p>Individual components of the strategy do not exist independently of the other components – each part depends on and supports the others.</p> <p>Building on a strong history of public participation, community development, consultation and involvement the civic engagement strategy supports:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An informed public that will want to help shape the future of their City • Decision-making informed by reliable data • The City’s goal to make its priorities, services and programs relevant to all Torontonians of all backgrounds, now and in the future • The building of trust through transparency, accountability and reliability. <p>The civic engagement strategy provides overall guidance to the City’s engagement activities. Civic engagement continues to be embedded at every level and in every program of the City organization, and in both the administrative and political decision-making systems. For example, in adopting the new governance model, Council established a Council-committee system that is intended to create opportunities for more meaningful deliberation and citizen involvement. Standing Committees have actively incorporated this concept into their meetings.</p> <p>The City’s civic engagement strategy includes the following components:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Civic literacy units developed to provide introductory and educational information to the public on City governance, programs and services; • A public webpage developed to provide the public a one-stop approach information, and to identify opportunities for providing input and participating in City governance; • Six public sessions developed for delivery Fall 2009 as an introduction to City governance,

No.	Recommendation	Updates
		<p>finance, planning, elections etc. will incorporate opportunity for public discussion and input (Toronto Civics 101);</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ongoing research on civic engagement best practices in other municipalities and jurisdictions; • Ongoing development of tools and resources to maximise engagement outcomes including ensuring appropriate approaches and application of methodologies to each initiative, enhanced outreach and inclusion strategies including innovative (on-line, Web 2.0) methods balanced with traditional approaches, customized opportunities to encouraging participation and address potential barriers and provision of quality information at all stages including communication about opportunities to engage, participant guides and interim and summary reports; • A resource centre established with civic engagement resources, toolkits, research, best practices, official reports and methodologies; • Working with inter-divisional committees on approaches that encourage increased engagement including inclusion of diverse and equity seeking publics e.g. web2.0 applications, City's web content and design; • A glossary of civic engagement terms and definitions developed, including the definition of civic engagement; • Civic Engagement Reference Group established in 2007 with membership of key program leads. The group meets twice a year; • Civic engagement practitioners identified – Staff who receive Engagement Practitioners newsletter, monthly e-alerts and access to on-line intranet site number 600 (April 2009); • Intranet site developed to connect and provide resources to practitioners, all City staff and Members of Council; • Quarterly newsletter launched for engagement staff; • Workshops and training provided to engagement practitioners;

No.	Recommendation	Updates
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● On-going advice to practitioners, Divisional staff, and Members of Council. <p>(a) The City Manager’s Office has completed the development of a civic engagement strategy, based on the following definition of civic engagement: <i>Civic Engagement: all of the ways in which a relationship is developed and supported between local government and the public (e.g. deliberative, adversarial, collaborative), including formal and informal mechanisms (e.g. legislative, electoral, consultation, educational, partnerships) and the public in all of its forms (individual, collective, sectoral) in local decision-making and the development of public policy.</i></p> <p>A complete glossary of civic engagement and related terms has been developed and posted on the City’s Intranet site as a resource to the City’s civic engagement practitioners.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">(b) Inventory</p> <p>In developing the strategy, staff from the City Manager’s office analysed data from several major public consultations including the Governing Toronto Advisory Panel meetings, conducted interviews with key staff, mapped the City’s engagement activities and made presentations and held discussions with members of Council, a wide range of corporate and divisional teams, committees and workgroups.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">(c) Performance indicators of outreach and inclusion activities</p> <p>The civic engagement strategy will be evaluated over time using the following indicators related to outreach and inclusion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Web analytics measuring web traffic, visits and downloads: ● Evaluations completed by session participants; ● Participant demographics: ● Range and diversity of engagement models used by the City

No.	Recommendation	Updates
11.	<p>The City Manager, in developing a corporate civic engagement strategy, explore the feasibility and cost-benefit of adding an annual public survey to the City’s civic engagement methods. The public survey should collect information relating to improving City services and decision-making. Survey results should be available to the public via the City Web site.</p>	<p>UPDATE: COMPLETED</p> <p>City staff, under the direction of the Chief Information Officer, are developing protocols on open data which will enhance public access to municipal information and will include a City website (toronto.ca/open).</p> <p>With respect to public surveys relating to City services and decision-making a Public Opinion Research Services - Request for Proposal 9145-07-7083 was at the Bid Committee on November 8, 2007 and outlines the blanket contract to facilitate public opinion research services to the Strategic Communications Division and other City Divisions.</p> <p>http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/2007/agendas/committees/bd/bd071114/bddd.pdf http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/2007/agendas/committees/bd/bd071114/agenda.pdf</p> <p>The City Manager’s Office currently commissions, collaborates or conducts research as part of Toronto’s Performance Measurement & Benchmarking Report; Ontario Municipal CAOs Benchmarking Initiative (OMBI); and World Bank – Global City Indicators Initiative.</p> <p>The City Manager's Office subscribes to Focus Ontario, which is published quarterly. The spring and fall surveys include oversamples of Toronto and GTA residents and a special section on the GTA. Focus Ontario provides a useful, ongoing environmental scan of public opinion on public policy issues and the performance of governments in Ontario and the GTA.</p> <p>The follow are examples of divisional or project based public surveys:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2008 and 2009 Street Needs Assessment Since 1983, Toronto's City Planning Division has monitored the City's employment by conducting an annual survey of businesses. The data collected are vital to monitor the City's economic health, as well as aiding in decision and policy making. It is essential background information for forecasting and planning the

No.	Recommendation	Updates
		<p>City's infrastructure and services for the citizens and businesses of Toronto. The Survey is a unique resource in Canada for the private and public sectors.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Walking Habits and Attitudes Report (Feb 2008). http://www.toronto.ca/transportation/walking/pdf/walking_study_report.pdf • On-line Survey on Poverty reduction strategies. http://wx.toronto.ca/inter/css/povreduce.nsf/Workbook?OpenForm. <p>Public Health is a member of the Rapid Risk Factor Surveillance System (RRFSS) which is an ongoing telephone survey used to gather surveillance data, monitor public opinion on key public health issues, and collect information on emerging issues of importance to public health in Ontario.</p>
12.	<p>The City Manager, in developing a corporate civic engagement strategy, identify and advise Council on the need for establishing formal civic engagement mechanisms connecting the City's diverse population groups with City government. Steps to be undertaken should include but not be limited to:</p> <p>(a) Review and address past operational issues encountered by the Community Advisory Committees, the Working Groups, and the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights;</p> <p>(b) Assess current needs for providing opportunities for specific population groups to advise City Council of issues specific to the groups; and</p> <p>(c) Periodically evaluate formal civic engagement structures to identify and address issues affecting their effectiveness.</p>	<p>UPDATE: COMPLETED</p> <p>Providing opportunities for participation for Torontonians regardless of age, experience, social or economic status, language or ability is a core value of the City Manager's Office, Strategic & Corporate Policy, Civic Engagement Office and the Diversity Management and Community Engagement Unit. Staff actively engage the public and design processes to draw the full diversity of the city.</p> <p>Council reviews all advisory bodies early in each term and makes decisions about their status, based on evaluation, needs and opportunities. In 2004 Council considered the bodies listed here and decided not to re-establish them.</p> <p>Governance reviews including formalized systems of public participation are conducted at the direction of City Council. The bodies listed in the recommendation were originally established by Council, not by staff. Roundtables, advisory committees and working groups are established if they are the appropriate mechanism to develop a specific policy direction or engage people with the City in its decision-making process.</p>

No.	Recommendation	Updates
		<p>Assess current needs for providing opportunities for specific population groups to advise City Council of issues specific to the groups;</p> <p>The City Manager’s Office, Strategic and Corporate Policy Division, provides support for enhanced outreach and inclusion strategies in all engagement and consultation activities through staff training; interdivisional coordination and collaboration on outreach, data management, and public education; use of new communications and web applications; community partnerships; and development of corporate engagement practices to ensure that it is easy for Torontonians:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • to learn about, discuss and participate in the decisions the City makes; • to feel they have a role and a contribution to make to their neighbourhood, community and city; and • are supported with information and have opportunities to share their experiences, voice and ideas, to help shape the future of Toronto. <p>Periodically evaluate formal civic engagement structures to identify and address issues affecting their effectiveness.</p> <p>The City Manager’s Office continues to work with staff across the corporation to assess and explore the ways in which the City can engage the public including but not limited to advisory groups, roundtables, public forums, charrettes, town halls, and on-line consultations.</p>
13.	<p>The City Manager undertake a review of public suggestions and expert advice from previous public consultations and commissioned research on civic engagement, and incorporate review results into the development of a corporate civic engagement strategy. Future public consultations should focus on obtaining public input related to City services, efforts and decision-making rather than how best to obtain public input.</p>	<p>UPDATE: COMPLETED</p> <p>A review of previous consultations and research was completed during 2007 and 2008 and included in the civic engagement strategy by the City Manager’s Office. The strategy has incorporated the themes that emerged from these sources as well as other data and research.</p> <p>In 2002 the City undertook extensive public consultation sessions to further the work of the Task</p>

No.	Recommendation	Updates
		<p>Force on Community Access and Equity. Toronto residents, community groups and organizations were invited to approximately 50 consultation sessions held across the City. One of the major discussion themes was civic participation, and consultation results were summarized in a report entitled ‘Just Do It’.</p> <p>In January 2004 the Mayor and City Council launched two sessions of “Listening to Toronto”. In a second Listening to Toronto session in November 2004 participants were asked three questions, one of which was “How can the City increase public involvement in civic affairs?” Participants provided many suggestions that were grouped into seven major themes.</p> <p>In 2005 the Governing Toronto Advisory Panel conducted a series of meetings and interviews, an on-line citizen survey, and hosted a public consultation session. The panel recommended that the City develop a shared, common civic engagement strategy.</p> <p>In March 2006 four public consultation sessions were held to provide the public an opportunity to discuss the recommendations in the Governing Toronto Advisory Panel’s final report. These consultations included collecting input on civic engagement.</p> <p>Wherever possible the focus of future consultations on civic engagement will be on new areas of discussion, however, the topic of public consultation depends on context and prevailing conditions. It is very important to ensure that any subject is relevant, topical and of real interest and benefit to Torontonians regardless of whether it was discussed in prior consultations. It is anticipated that the City will want to consult with the public periodically on the issue of engagement to monitor effectiveness and success in this area.</p> <p>The public provided the following comments about civic engagement in the City of Toronto noted in: <i>Listening to Toronto, Strong Toronto-Strong Ontario and Governing Toronto Advisory Panel consultation:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • People have an interest in civic affairs, but it needs nurturing. • Inform and educate the public about service and budget issues.

No.	Recommendation	Updates
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Create a public guide to local government with clear information on how and when people can get involved. • Communicate Council and City information using simple, clear language and disseminate it widely. • Make the City’s website more user-friendly and provide information on both neighbourhood and city-wide issues. • Tell people what happened to their input, what decisions were ultimately made and what the next steps will be. • Provide ways for the public to track issues as they go through consultations, departments, committees and Council. • Increase participation by working with multilingual organizations and community agencies, faith groups and ratepayer and neighbourhood associations to outreach to their members. • Provide the public with a description of what the city does and the roles of staff, councillors, committees and Council play in decision-making. • Use a wide range of methods for input – surveys, internet, town halls and democratic decision-making tools.
14.	<p>The City Manager consider establishing a formal process to seek employee input on a proactive and regular basis on equity and diversity issues related to the community and the workplace.</p>	<p>UPDATE:</p> <p>See #19 – Below.</p> <p>The Black African Canadian Employment Equity Pilot Project is one example of a formal process that gives employees the opportunity to provide input on equity and diversity issues. In place since 2007, this pilot project has resulted in the implementation of initiatives to address the under-representation of Black African Canadian employees in senior management positions in the TPS.</p> <p>An employee engagement survey, planned for 2010 is another example of a formal process that will provide the opportunity for employee input on equity and diversity issues.</p>

No.	Recommendation	Updates
		<p>The InterDivisional Staff Team on Access Equity and Human Rights includes representation from across all Divisions and meets quarterly to share information on access equity and human rights action planning.</p> <p>Regular community input is obtained through the Council established Disability Issues Committee and Aboriginal Affairs Committee.</p> <p>In addition, the City has established a joint staff/community consortium to share data and track research and issues of importance to the community.</p>
15.	<p>The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division provide a detailed report to Council by March 2009 on results of the 2007 workforce survey for non-union employees, including information on representation of designated groups and comparative results with census data.</p>	<p>UPDATE: COMPLETED</p> <p>Summary data on the non-union workforce survey were included in the City Manager’s Status Report to Council in August 2009. These data show the following representation of designated groups in the non-union workforce: Women – 36.25 %; Visible Minorities – 17.31 %; People with Disabilities – 3.4 %; and Aboriginal People - 0.58 %. A further report will be submitted to the October 2009 meeting of the Employee and Labour Relations Committee.</p> <p>Status Report - 2008 Access, Equity and Human Rights (AEHR) Achievements http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/ex/bgrd/backgroundfile-21485.pdf</p> <p>Appendix 1: Cover Page http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/ex/bgrd/backgroundfile-21486.pdf</p> <p>Appendix 1 - Indicators - Summary of 2008 AEHR Achievements http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/ex/bgrd/backgroundfile-21487.pdf</p> <p>Appendix 2 - Details of 2008 AEHR Achievements http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/ex/bgrd/backgroundfile-21488.pdf</p>
16.	<p>The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division review how other large organizations conduct workforce surveys and, where appropriate, adopt methods used by the other organizations</p>	<p>UPDATE:</p> <p>The proposal for a unionized workforce survey has been developed. Due to collective bargaining, the scheduling of consultations with bargaining agents has</p>

No.	Recommendation	Updates
	to improve the response rate of the City workforce survey of unionized employees.	been a challenge. Planning is underway to implement a workforce survey of unionized staff for the fall 2009. An update on this will be provided to the October meeting of the Employee and Labour Relations Committee.
17.	<p>The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division take steps to increase the workforce survey response rate among new City employees. Such steps should include, but not be limited to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) improving the survey distribution method; and (b) improving the communication of the purpose and benefit of the survey to new City employees. <p>Survey results should be analysed and periodically reported to City Council.</p>	<p>UPDATE: See #16</p>
18.	<p>The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division consider posting workforce survey results on the City Web site to demonstrate the City's commitment to creating an inclusive workforce.</p>	<p>UPDATE:</p> <p>Summary data on the non-union workforce was included in the City Manager's Report submitted to the Executive Committee in June 2009 on Access, Equity and Human Rights Achievements in 2008.</p> <p>Summary data on the unionized workforce will be posted subject to completion of the workforce survey.</p>
19.	<p>The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division take steps to develop a proactive employment equity plan. Such a plan should include but not be limited to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) establishing corporate objectives for equitable representation of diverse groups; (b) providing measures to remove barriers in achieving employment equity; and (c) including mechanisms for measuring and monitoring 	<p>UPDATE:</p> <p>This recommendation is addressed in the People Plan submitted to Council in September 2008. The Plan includes the Goals: "We will attract and retain a skilled, high performing and diverse workforce" and "We will build a positive workplace culture."</p> <p>The People Plan sets out a number of objectives, actions and measurements to be undertaken during the 2008-2011 period. Implementation of the Plan is underway which will effectively address recommendations provided herein.</p>

No.	Recommendation	Updates
	<p>progress.</p>	<p>HR staff are currently working on the development of a corporate Employment Equity Strategy, as well as a broader Diversity Strategy for the TPS. These strategies are targeted for completion by the end of 2009.</p>
20.	<p>The City Manager determine the feasibility and merit of establishing a corporate fund for employment accommodation. Where appropriate, divisional budgets be adjusted to reflect this change. Such a review take into account the practices of other organizations.</p>	<p>UPDATE:</p> <p>Research re accommodation funding practices in other public and private organizations is underway. The City Manager will make a determination of estimated corporate funding requirements, in conjunction with legislative requirements under the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act, 2005, (AODA) and report through the 2010 budget submission.</p>
21.	<p>The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division develop strategies, objectives and action plans to increase employees' awareness of human rights and diversity issues in the workplace. Further, the Executive Director ensure diversity and human rights training is considered a corporate priority in developing training strategies, goals and objectives under the City's Learning Strategy 2008-2011.</p>	<p>UPDATE:</p> <p>The TPS People Plan includes the Goal: <i>We will build a positive workplace culture.</i> In the People Plan, all divisions including the Human Resources Division, are challenged to develop and improve their workplace cultures.</p> <p>Funding has been approved in the 2009 budget to explore the development of an effective strategy to ensure workplace human rights and diversity awareness is promoted and to ensure availability and accessibility of a variety of educational formats for all TPS staff. Human Resources is currently exploring the development of technology-based human rights and diversity learning and continues to offer human rights training to employees and management on rights and responsibilities under the City's Human Rights and Anti-Harassment Policy and Ontario Human Rights Code.</p> <p>The City Manager's Status Report on the results of 2008 implementation of Access Equity and Human Rights activities includes details of participation in staff development, training and workshops. This included participation by 1,256 staff in corporate and divisional programs related to diversity.</p> <p>The 2008 Annual Report of the Human Rights Office showed that participation in the human rights training</p>

No.	Recommendation	Updates
		<p>program increased to 2702 in 2008 from 446 in 2007.</p> <p>The City Manager also advised Council that training for staff regarding customer services under the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act (AODA) will be expedited.</p> <p>In September 2008, City Council was provided with a comprehensive strategy for training and development of the Toronto Public Service. Separate reports on implementation will be submitted.</p>
22.	<p>The City Manager report to Council on the development of a Toronto Urban Aboriginal Strategy and an Aboriginal Office by June 2009.</p>	<p>UPDATE:</p> <p>The City Manager's June 2009 report was approved at the August 2009 meeting of City Council on the development of the Toronto Urban Aboriginal Strategy. City Council has approved the timeline for consultation with the Aboriginal community in early 2010 with a report on the strategy targeted for June 2010.</p> <p>Development of an Urban Aboriginal Strategy for Toronto(http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/ex/bgrd/backgroundfile-21490.pdf)</p>
23.	<p>The City Manager report to Council on the pilot test results of the application of the Equity Lens and the Equity Impact Statement as directed by Council in 2006. The report should also provide clear recommendations on the next implementation steps of this initiative.</p>	<p>UPDATE: COMPLETED</p> <p>The City Manager reported to the September 2008 council meeting on how the equity lens was being implemented. A report has been prepared for the October 2009 meeting of the Executive Committee.</p>
24.	<p>The City Manager direct all City divisions to develop their respective Access, Equity and Human Rights Action Plan in accordance with Council direction.</p>	<p>UPDATE: COMPLETED</p> <p>The City Manager's Office has requested all divisions which have not submitted AEHR action plans to assign staff to prepare action plans.</p>
25.	<p>The City Manager consider the following for further improving divisional action planning in relation to access, equity and human rights:</p>	<p>UPDATE: COMPLETED</p> <p>City Council approved the City Manager's report in August 2009 which outlined the 2008 achievements using indicators.</p>

No.	Recommendation	Updates
	<p>(a) Shortening the planning cycle from three to two years; and</p> <p>(b) Requesting divisions to link implementation status to planned activities on an annual basis.</p>	<p>The City Manager will be reporting on 2009 accomplishments in September 2010.</p>
26.	<p>The City Manager provide divisions with adequate staff training and corporate support to help improve the effectiveness of action plans including the development of task-specific activities and measurable performance indicators relevant to corporate direction and divisional objectives.</p>	<p>UPDATE:</p> <p>The CMO will work with the corporate training staff to develop specific workshops for staff involved in developing and evaluating Action Plans.</p> <p>Planning is already underway for the high level submission of 2009-2011 Action Plans.</p>
27.	<p>City Manager establish a formal process whereby access, equity and human rights initiatives and accomplishments by City major Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations is systematically tracked and reported to City Council on a periodic basis.</p>	<p>UPDATE:</p> <p>See Recommendation 28</p>
28.	<p>Corporations to complete an access, equity and human rights action plan consistent with divisional action plans by 2010. The City Manager should facilitate the planning process and report to City Council on implementation status.</p>	<p>UPDATE:</p> <p>At its July 2008 meeting, City Council requested Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations to advise Council in 2009 on their access, equity and human rights initiatives and accomplishments. The City Manager has communicated this directive to ABCCs and will be following up.</p>
29.	<p>The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division, in consultation with the City Manager, consider including specific access, equity and human rights performance indicators in the annual performance evaluation of management staff.</p>	<p>UPDATE:</p> <p>Given the current review of the performance management program for non-union staff, and the anticipated changes that will be required to the Performance Planner, the performance indicators will be added to the planners for 2010. This will allow for appropriate training on objective setting and development of performance indicators.</p>