



**STAFF REPORT
ACTION REQUIRED
with Confidential Attachment**

Councillor Protection at City Properties

Date:	September 2, 2009
To:	Government Management Committee
From:	Chief Corporate Officer
Wards:	All
Reason for Confidential Information:	This report involves the security of property belonging to the City or one of its agencies, boards, and commissions. The Confidential Attachments contain information, that if released, could negatively affect the security and safety of Councillors, City staff, and City property.
Reference Number:	P:\2009\Internal Services\F&re\Gm09060F&re – (AFS 10261)

SUMMARY

At its meeting of April 29 and 30, 2009, Toronto City Council approved Government Management Committee Item 22.4, entitled “City-Wide Security Plan”. This report responds to Council’s request that the Chief Corporate Officer report to the Government Management Committee in June 2009 on: a) a comprehensive plan and security measures to protect the Civic Centre Chambers and the second floor of City Hall; and b) a review of the security system utilized by the CBC at its building located opposite Metro Hall.

In order to provide a comprehensive review of Councillor Protection at City property, this plan not only includes the Civic Centre Chambers and second floor of City Hall, but also the Councillors offices and parking areas at each Civic Centre and City Hall. This review however did not encompass constituency offices, homes, public appearances, travel, and personal time.

This report highlights security measures already in place for the protection of Councillors, describes additional measures currently being implemented, and makes recommendations for further protections. These additional measures and recommendations evolved as a result of a Threat and Risk Assessment, benchmarking, and stakeholder involvement.

As it relates to the review and possible use of the type of barrier turnstile used at the CBC building, this system is not recommended for use for the 2nd floor reception areas of City Hall.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Chief Corporate Officer recommends that City Council:

1. Approve the Key Protection Concepts (Confidential Attachment 1).
2. Approve the Recommendations for Councillors Security (Confidential Attachment 2).
3. Authorize the public release of Recommendations Nos. 8, 9, 10, and 15 of Confidential Attachment 2 upon approval.

Financial Impact

There is no financial impact with this report.

The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

At its meeting of April 29 and 30, 2009, Toronto City Council adopted, as amended, Government Management Committee Item GM 22.4, entitled “City-Wide Security Plan”, and requested the Chief Corporate Officer report to the Government Management Committee in June 2009, on:

- (a) a comprehensive plan and security measures to protect the Civic Centre Chambers and the second floor of City Hall; and
- (b) a review of the security system utilized by the CBC at its building located opposite Metro Hall.

ISSUE BACKGROUND

Past Reports

In 1999, the physical security measures used on the second floor, Council Chamber, and parking areas at City Hall were reviewed prior to implementation by a “Relocation Sub-Committee” consisting of City Councillors as part of the relocation project of City Councillors to City Hall from Metro Hall and other Civic Centres.

After the unfortunate events of September 11, 2001, security at City Hall was once again reviewed and resulted in three staff reports to City Council in 2002. The first staff report, titled “Enhanced Emergency Management Activities (Protection from Terrorism) City Wide”, contained security capital and operating recommendations. The second report, titled “Improving Security at Toronto City Hall” (Clause No. 24 of Report No. 4 of the Administration Committee), was approved by Toronto City Council at its meeting of April 16, 17, & 18, 2002 and provided security procedural recommendations with input from the Toronto Police Service. The third report, titled “Status Report on Improving Security at Toronto City Hall” (Clause No. 33 (g) of Report No. 13 of the Administration Committee), was approved by Toronto City Council at its meeting of October 29, 30 & 31, 2002 and reported on the measures taken during the last six months regarding previously adopted procedural changes to improve security at Toronto City Hall.

Threat Assessment

In order to provide a comprehensive security plan and recommend additional security measures, a security threat and risk assessment was completed. Within the context of security risk management, a threat and risk assessment suggests where to avoid, reduce and accept risk, as well as how to diminish the impact of threatening events. Where security measures are found to be inadequate, recommendations are made that add or modify safeguards, provide for business continuity, and determine the implementation priorities.

Areas In and Out of The Review Scope

The following areas were reviewed as part of the scope of the threat and risk assessment:

- The Council Chambers, Council Reception Areas, Councillor Offices and Official Parking at Toronto City Hall, Scarborough Civic Centre, and North York Civic Centre; and
- The Council Chambers, Council Reception Areas, Councillor Offices and Councillor parking spaces at Etobicoke Civic Centre and East York Civic Centre.

The following areas were not reviewed as part of the scope of the threat and risk assessment: public areas at Civic Centres, Constituency Offices, and private residences.

Benchmarking

The security afforded to Councillors at the Cities of Ottawa and Vancouver was reviewed in comparison to the City of Toronto. From this benchmarking it is clear that the current safeguards afforded to Councillors at the City of Toronto City Hall is equal to and beyond the measures afforded to Councillors in the benchmarked cities.

There, however, exists additional protection measures afforded to Ontario Members of Provincial Parliament at the Legislative Assembly of Ontario as compared to City of Toronto Councillors at Toronto City Hall. Some enhanced protection measures at the Legislative Assembly of Ontario includes full visitor sign-in, a greater number of Security staff, additional powers for Security Staff (Special Constables), security wanding stations for entering the public galleries inside the Chamber, etc.

Considerations

The recommended level of physical and operational security at each of the areas reviewed is established based on a number of factors such as the results of a threat assessment, internal security best practices, external standards, benchmarking, stakeholder input, and cost-effectiveness.

There exists a challenge with securing public, municipal facilities where a delicate balance of security and accessibility must occur. Most of the areas reviewed were originally built with the principle of open access and were never originally designed to be protected against the security threats and issues faced today.

COMMENTS

Each individual has a different tolerance level for risk based on issues such as abilities, knowledge, past experiences, etc. This risk tolerance level affects the comfort level of each individual's personal safety and security measures. The difficulty in providing security measures to a large group is that not all individuals share the same risk tolerance level and therefore will not share the same comfort level for security measures. A key challenge is to set a baseline security level with the ability for augmentation of that level for individuals.

Measures in Place

In order to provide a level of security that is palatable to all Councillors it is important to establish a baseline level of security that can be increased on an individual level and a holistic level when warranted.

This baseline of security can best be determined through Key Protection Principles rather than through individual security physical and operating measures at each location. Confidential Attachment 1 provides a list and description of these Key Protection Principles.

There are currently many physical security measures in place for the protection of City Councillors while at City Hall and the Civic Centres. Typical physical measures involve access control, video surveillance, duress buttons, high security door locks, and emergency intercoms. There also exists enhanced measures such as the x-raying of mail.

While there exists high-quality physical security measures in place, there is an overall lack of response awareness to security or emergency situations. There are also some basic security protocol changes that can augment security.

General Additional Measures Being Implemented

Upon the physical inspection of physical security measures in Council areas, some deficiencies were noted and have either been rectified or are in the process of being rectified. Upon review of card access, additional reductions of access were made to Councillor areas.

Upon review of the Security Reception functions of the Clerk's staff it was found that additional security awareness and emergency response training was required. New security procedures are being drafted for the Security Receptionists and a security and emergency response training program is being developed for these staff.

Recommended Upgrades

There are two Confidential Attachments to this report that form the recommended upgrades to security for Councillors for City Hall and the Civic Centres. Confidential Attachment 1 "Key Protection Concepts" is a document which describes the overall physical, operational, and procedural security concepts that form the recommended protection program. Confidential Attachment 2, entitled "Recommendations for Councillor Protection at City Properties" are the actual security recommendations that stem from the Key Protection Concepts.

CBC Security System

The CBC on Front Street in Toronto uses a barrier turnstile to control access to its main employee-only areas. While there are advantages and disadvantages to the barrier turnstile system used at the CBC compared to the access controlled doors on the 2nd floor at City Hall, the barriers are meant to be used in conjunction with full-time 24/7 reception staffing which is not practical at City Hall. This system therefore is not recommended for use for the 2nd floor reception areas of City Hall as the current doors are more secure and can securely operate when the reception areas are not staffed.

Conclusion

Overall, City Councillors are provided with an adequate level of physical security upon benchmarking with other Canadian cities. There are however some security protocols and physical enhancements that should be made to further increase the level of security for City Councillors. It is expected that these enhancements, along with procedural compliance, will further upgrade the overall level of security afforded to Councillors while at City Hall and the Civic Centres.

CONTACT

Mike McCoy
Director, Facilities Operations
(Tel) 416-397-5270
(Fax) 416-392-4828
mmccoy@toronto.ca

Dwaine Nichol
Manager, Security & Life Safety
(Tel) 416-397-7129
(Fax) 416-397-5403
dnichol@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Bruce Bowes, P.Eng
Chief Corporate Officer

ATTACHMENTS

Confidential Attachment 1	Key Protection Concepts
Confidential Attachment 2	Recommendations for Councillor Protection at City Properties