

Toronto Preservation Board

Meeting No. 28 Contact Margaret Sexton, Committee

Secretary

Meeting Date Thursday, October 22, 2009 Phone 416-392-6316

Start Time 2:00 PM E-mail msexton@toronto.ca
Location Committee Room 3, City Hall Chair Robert Saunders

Toronto Preservation Board				
Robert Saunders, Chair Adriana Balen, Vice-Chair Mary Louise Ashbourne Alan Dudeck Patrice A. Dutil	Paul Gogan Prishram Jain Geoff Kettel Yew-Thong Leong David Le Roy	Councillor Kyle Rae Jennifer Rieger Councillor Michael Thompson Councillor Adam Vaughan		

Members of Council and Staff: Please keep this agenda and the accompanying material until the City Council meeting dealing with these matters has ended. **The City Clerk's Office will not provide additional copies.**

Special Assistance for Members of the Public: City staff can arrange for special assistance with some advance notice. If you need special assistance, please call 416-392-0552, TTY 416-392-338-0889 or e-mail salfano@toronto.ca.

Closed Meeting Requirements: If the Toronto Preservation Board wants to meet in closed session (privately), a member of the Board must make a motion to do so and give the reason why the Board has to meet privately. (City of Toronto Act, 2006)

Notice to people writing or making presentations to the Toronto Preservation Board: The City of Toronto Act, 2006 and the City of Toronto Municipal Code authorize the City of Toronto to collect any personal information in your communication or presentation to City Council or its committees.

The City collects this information to enable it to make informed decisions on the relevant issue(s). If you are submitting letters, faxes, e-mails, presentations or other communications to the City, you should be aware that your name and the fact that you communicated with the City will become part of the public record and will appear on the City's website. The City will also make your communication and any personal information in it – such as your postal address, telephone number or e-mail address – available to the public, unless you expressly request the City to remove it.

The City videotapes committee and community council meetings. If you make a presentation to a committee or community council, the City will be videotaping you and City staff may make the video tapes available to the public.

If you want to learn more about why and how the City collects your information, write to the City Clerk's Office, City Hall,100 Queen Street West, Toronto ON M5H 2N2 or by calling 416-392-6316.

Declarations of Interest under the Municipal Conflict of Interest Act

Speakers/Presentations:

A complete list will be distributed at the meeting

Confirmation of Minutes - September 24, 2009

Communications/Reports

PB28.1	ACTION			Ward: 20
--------	--------	--	--	----------

Designation of the Harbord Village Heritage Conservation District Phase 2 under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act

Origin

(October 6, 2009) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Recommendations

The City Planning Division recommends that:

- 1. City Council designate by by-law the area shown on Attachment No. 1 as the Harbord Village Heritage Conservation District Phase 2, in accordance with Section 41 of the Ontario Heritage Act;
- 2. City Council adopt by by-law the Harbord Village Heritage Conservation District Phase 2 Plan, dated August 2009, as the district plan for the Harbord Village Heritage Conservation District Phase 2;
- 3. If there are any objections to the by-law under Section 41 of the Ontario Heritage Act, the City Solicitor be directed to appear before the Ontario Municipal Board to defend the by-law;
- 4. Until such time as the by-law designating the area as the Harbord Village Heritage Conservation District Phase 2 comes into force or is repealed, all properties within the area, unless designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, be listed in the City's Inventory of Heritage Properties.

Summary

The purpose of this report is to recommend the designation of the Harbord Village Heritage Conservation District (HCD) Phase 2, and to adopt the associated HCD Plan by by-law under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act (OHA). The district analysis and plan were led by the Harbord Village Residents Association and completed by Catherine Nasmith Architect.

Heritage Preservation Services Staff have reviewed the proposed designation and the district plan and believe they merit designation and adoption under the OHA.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report. The public Notices of Intention to Designate will be advertised on the City's web site in accordance with the City of Toronto Act provisions. This proposed Heritage Conservation District will add approximately 230 properties to the Inventory. It is also noted that adding properties to the Inventory by means of Heritage Conservation District designations dramatically increases the workload of Heritage Preservation Services, requiring staff to review all building permits, Committee of Adjustment, rezoning and Official Plan amendment applications within legislated timeframes. Over time, this will create pressure to increase staff resources.

Background Information

Staff Report - (October 6, 2009) Designation of the Harbord Village Heritage Conservation District Phase 2 under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act (http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-24207.pdf)

PB28.2	ACTION			Ward: 8
--------	--------	--	--	---------

4700 Keele Street – Inclusion on Heritage Inventory and Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act

Origin

(October 1, 2009) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Recommendations

The City Planning Division recommends that:

- 1. City Council include the following 14 buildings or building complexes on York University's Keele Campus at 4700 Keele Street on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties:
 - a. Atkinson College, Phases I and II
 - b. Behavioural Science Building
 - c. Farquharson Life Sciences Building
 - d. Founders College and Residence
 - e. McLaughlin College and Tatham Hall
 - f. Osgoode Hall Law School
 - g. Petrie Science and Engineering Building
 - h. Ross Building
 - i. Scott Library
 - j. Steacie Science and Engineering Building
 - k. Stedman Lecture Halls
 - 1. Tait McKenzie Centre, Phase I

- m. Vanier College and Residence
- n. Winters College and Residence
- 2. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 4700 Keele Street, specifically the portion of the site containing the Abraham Hoover House, under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
- 3. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 4700 Keele Street, specifically the portion of the site containing the Jacob Stong House and Barn, under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
- 4. If there are no objections to the designations in accordance with Section 29(6) of the Ontario Heritage Act, the solicitor be authorized to introduce the Bills in Council designating the properties under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
- 5. If there are objections in accordance with Section 29(7) of the Ontario Heritage Act, the Clerk be directed to refer the proposed designations to the Conservation Review Board.

Summary

This report recommends that City Council include on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties the 14 buildings or building complexes on York University's Keele Campus at 4700 Keele Street that are listed in Recommendation No. 1 below. This report also recommends that City Council state its intention to designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act three of the historic structures located on the property at 4700 Keele Street and identified in Recommendation Nos. 2 and 3 below, which are currently listed on the City's heritage inventory.

Staff have been consulting with the York University Development Corporation about the proposed listings and designations as part of the ongoing discussions concerning the updates to the York University Secondary Plan. The proposed listings and designations of buildings on the Keele Campus of York University will enable Council to protect the site's heritage attributes and values while allowing the university to move forward with its future planning objectives.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report. The public Notices of Intention to Designate will be advertised on the City's web site in accordance with the City of Toronto Act provisions.

Background Information

Staff Report (October 1, 2009) 4700 Keele Street - Inclusion on Heritage Inventory and Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act (http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-24265.pdf)

PB28.3	ACTION			Ward: 27
--------	--------	--	--	----------

606 - 618 Yonge Street, 5 - 9 St. Joseph Street, and 15 - 25 St. Nicholas Street - Alteration to a Heritage Property and Intention to Designate, Part IV, Section 29, Ontario Heritage Act

Origin

(October 1, 2009) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Recommendations

The City Planning Division recommends that:

- 1. City Council approve the alterations to the heritage properties at 606-618 Yonge Street, 5 9 St. Joseph Street and 15 25 St. Nicholas Street, substantially in accordance with the plans and drawings prepared by ERA Architects dated September 15, 2009, and on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services subject to the following conditions:
 - a. prior to Zoning By-Law Amendment approval, the owner shall:

submit a Conservation Plan to include drawings, to the satisfaction of the Manager of Heritage Preservation Services that provide "blow-up" elevations and sections of all heritage building façades at 1:50 scale including, but not limited, to the following: (1) storefront design; (2) window specifications for all heritage facade elevations; (3) reconstruction plan for roof dormer/parapet/cornice details; (4) return side wall details; etc.

b. prior to Site Plan approval, the owner shall:

provide additional information to be submitted, based on the proposed Conservation Strategy, to include documentation substantially in accordance with that outlined within Section 8.0 (page 44) of the submitted Heritage Impact Statement. Specifically, a detailed plan shall also be submitted to outline mitigations measures that address construction impacts relative to the on-site heritage structures.

enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement for the properties at 606 - 618 Yonge Street with the City.

amend the existing Heritage Easement Agreement registered on the site, Instrument No. E171218 dated June 1, 1998, at 5 St. Joseph Street and 9 – 15 St Nicholas Streets, to address the proposed construction and permitted alterations;

Toronto Preservation Board - Month #, 2009 Agenda

c. prior to the issuance of any building permit, including a permit for the demolition, excavation, and/or shoring on the subject property, the owner shall:

provide a Letter of Credit in a form and in an amount satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services to secure all work included in the Conservation Plan;

provide final plans satisfactory to the Manager of Heritage Preservation Services;

d. prior to the release of the Letter of Credit the applicant shall:

provide evidence and documentation that the project scheme has been implemented, per approved Conservation Plan, satisfactory to the Manager of Heritage Preservation Services.

- 2. City Council include the following properties on the City of Toronto's Inventory of Heritage Properties:
 - a. 606 Yonge Street
 - b. 608 Yonge Street
 - c. 614 Yonge Street
 - d. 616 Yonge Street
 - e. 618 Yonge Street
- 3. City Council state its intention to designate the following properties under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. (Please note 610 and 612 Yonge Street are listed on the City of Toronto's Inventory of Heritage Properties)
 - a. 606 Yonge Street
 - b. 608 Yonge Street
 - c. 610 Yonge Street
 - d. 612 Yonge Street
 - e. 614 Yonge Street
 - f. 616 Yonge Street
 - g. 618 Yonge Street
- 4. If there are no objections to the designations in accordance with Section 29(6) of the Ontario Heritage Act, the solicitor be authorized to introduce the Bills in Council designating the properties under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.
- 5. If there are any objections in accordance with Section 29(7) of the Ontario Heritage Act, the Clerk be directed to refer the proposed designations to the Conservation Review Board.
- 6. City Council grant authority for the execution of a Heritage Easement Agreement under Section 37 of the Ontario Heritage Act with the owners of the following properties:

- a. 606 Yonge Street
- b. 608 Yonge Street
- c. 610 Yonge Street
- d. 612 Yonge Street
- e. 614 Yonge Street
- f. 616 Yonge Street
- g. 618 Yonge Street
- 7. The City Solicitor be authorized to introduce the necessary bill in Council authorizing the entering into a Heritage Easement Agreement.

Summary

This report addresses an application to permit a 45 storey mixed use development containing approximately 38,775 square metres of residential gross floor area and approximately 2,800 square metres of non-residential gross floor area on a 0.267 hectare site located on the south side of St. Joseph Street between Yonge Street and St. Nicholas Street. The site is municipally known as 606 - 618 Yonge Street, 5 - 9 St. Joseph Street, and 15 - 25 St. Nicholas Street.

This report recommends that City Council approve the proposed alterations to the heritage properties at 606 - 618 Yonge Street, 5 - 9 St. Joseph Street; and 15 - 25 St. Nicholas Street and designate seven properties at 606, 608, 610, 612, 614, 616 and 618 Yonge Street under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for their cultural heritage value as contributing to a historic and contextual streetscape that has defined Toronto's primary commercial street since the late 19th century.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report. The public Notice of Intention to Designate will be advertised on the City's web site in accordance with the City of Toronto Act provisions.

Background Information

Staff Report - (October 1, 2009) 606 - 618 Yonge Street, 5 - 9 St. Joseph Street, and 15 - 25 St. Nicholas Street - Alteration to a Heritage Property and Intention to Designate, Part IV, Section 29, Ontario Heritage Act

(http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-24223.pdf)

PB28.4	ACTION			Ward: 27
--------	--------	--	--	----------

84 Crescent Road, Alteration of a Structure in the South Rosedale Heritage Conservation District

Origin

(September 29, 2009) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Recommendations

The City Planning Division recommends that:

- 1. City Council refuse the application to alter 84 Crescent Road received September 15, 2009 by the applicant Kelly Buffey of AKB Atelier Kastelic Buffey;
- 2. City Council authorize the City Solicitor and City staff to attend the Ontario Municipal Board hearing, should Council refuse this application and the refusal be appealed to the Board.

Summary

This report recommends that City Council refuse the application to alter an "A" rated house in the South Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (SRHCD) in accordance with Section 42(1) of the Ontario Heritage Act.

This application requests the removal and replacement of the existing sun room. Staff recommends the refusal of this application as it would result in the removal of a heritage attribute of a significant heritage house in South Rosedale. This attribute is visible from the street, in good condition and contributes to the heritage character of the neighbourhood.

The consent under the Ontario Heritage Act is in addition to a demolition permit required under the Building Code Act and the approval of any variances to the existing zoning by-law.

Financial Impact

There is no financial impact resulting from the approval of this report.

Background Information

Staff Report - (September 29, 2009) 84 Crescent Road, Alteration of a Structure in the South Rosedale Heritage Conservation District

(http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-24224.pdf)

PB28.5	ACTION			Ward: 28
--------	--------	--	--	----------

251 King Street East (The National Hotel) – Demolition of a Designated Heritage Property

Origin

(October 5, 2009) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Recommendations

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council refuse the demolition of the designated property at 251 King Street East

under s. 34(1) of the Ontario Heritage Act as proposed in the rezoning application No. 08 186000 STE 28 OZ for the development of lands at 251-255 King Street East and 37 Sherbourne Street, in accordance with plans and drawings prepared by TACT Design Inc., dated July 21, 2008 with final revisions dated May 20, 2009;

- 2. Should City Council approve the proposed rezoning application No. 08 186000 STE 28 OZ for the development of lands at 251-255 King Street East and 37 Sherbourne Street, including the demolition of the entire heritage structure at 251 King Street East and the reconstruction of the north and west facades, the following conditions be required prior to the submission of the Bill to City Council for enactment:
 - a. the applicant shall retain a consultant archaeologist, licensed by the Ministry of Culture under the provisions of the Ontario Heritage Act (R.S.O 1990 as amended) to carry out a Stage 1 archaeological assessment of the entire development property and follow through on recommendations to mitigate, through preservation or resource removal and documentation, adverse impacts to any significant archaeological resources found. The assessment is to be completed in accordance with the Final Draft Standards and Guidelines for Consulting Archaeologists, September 2006, Ministry of Culture;
 - b. should the archaeological assessment process continue beyond a Stage 1 assessment, any recommendations for Stages 2 4 mitigation strategies must be reviewed and approved by Heritage Preservation Services prior to commencement of the site mitigation;
 - c. the consultant archaeologist shall submit a copy of the relevant assessment report(s) to the Heritage Preservation Services Unit in both hard copy format and as an Acrobat PDF file on compact disk;
 - d. no demolition, construction, grading or other soil disturbances shall take place on the subject property prior to the City's Planning Division (Heritage Preservation Services Unit) and the Ministry of Culture (Heritage Operations Unit) confirming in writing that all archaeological licensing and technical review requirements have been satisfied.

Summary

This report recommends that City Council refuse the proposed demolition of the designated heritage property at 251 King Street East.

The rezoning application for this property seeks permission for a 17-storey residential building to be constructed on the lands know municipally as 251-255 King Street East and 37 Sherbourne Street. The proposal includes the demolition through disassembly of the entire heritage building, and the reconstruction using salvaged materials of the north and west elevations of the heritage building, for incorporation as part of the new development. In accordance with the Parks Canada document "Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada" endorsed by City Council, staff do not consider this approach to be a legitimate conservation strategy given the extent of alteration proposed and the potential for rehabilitation of the resource. As such, staff cannot support the proposed demolition.

Located within the original 10 blocks of the Town of York, Toronto's birthplace, the further impact of a 17 storey tower on this site and on the broader heritage context of the Old Town neighbourhood, is a significant issue of concern that staff has raised throughout their review of this application. Staff advise that further development intensification that proposes height significantly above that which is historically characteristic of this neighbourhood, should reasonably be assessed in the context of a Heritage Conservation District Study for this area.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

Background Information

Staff Report - (October 5, 2009) 251 King Street East (The National Hotel) Demolition of a Designated Heritage Property

(http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-24225.pdf)

PB28.6	Information			
--------	-------------	--	--	--

Minutes of the Community Preservation Panels

Origin

(October 9, 2009) Memo from Chairs, Community Preservation Panels

Summary

- a. Etobicoke York Community Preservation Panel
 - i. Minutes of the meeting held on October 5, 2009
- b. North York Community Preservation Panel
 - i. Minutes of the meeting held on July 20, 2009

Background Information

EYCC Minutes dated October 5, 2009

(http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-24244.pdf)

NYCC Minutes dated July 20, 2009

(http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-24245.pdf)