



Decision Document

Toronto Preservation Board

Meeting No.	22	Contact	Colleen O'Neill, Committee Secretary
Meeting Date	Friday, March 27, 2009	Phone	416-392-5227
Start Time	2:00 PM	E-mail	coneill1@toronto.ca
Location	Committee Room 4, City Hall	Chair	Robert Saunders

The Decision Document is for preliminary reference purposes only. Please refer to the Board's Minutes for the official record.

How to Read the Decision Document:

- *Recommendations of the Board to Community Council and City Council appear after the item heading.*
- *Other action taken by the Board on its own authority, which does not require Council's approval, is listed in the decision document under the heading "Decision Advice and Other Information".*
- *Declarations of Interest, if any, appear at the end of an item.*

Minutes Confirmed - February 20, 2009

PB22.1	Information	Received		
--------	-------------	----------	--	--

North York Community Preservation Panel - Election of New Chair

Decision Advice and Other Information

The Toronto Preservation Board welcomed Geoff Kettel to the Toronto Preservation Board and received the item for information.

Origin

(March 4, 2009) Letter from Edith Geduld, Past Chair

Summary

Advising that the North York Community Preservation Panel, on February 26, 2009, elected Geoff Kettel as Chair.

Background Information

North York Community Preservation Panel - Election of Chair

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-19573.pdf>

PB22.2	ACTION	Amended		Ward: 20
--------	--------	---------	--	----------

5 Eireann Quay - Intention to Designate under Part IV Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act

Committee Recommendations

The Toronto Preservation Board recommended to the Toronto and East York Community Council that:

1. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 5 Eireann Quay (Canada Malting Complex) under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
2. If there are no objections to the designation in accordance with Section 29(6) of the Ontario Heritage Act, the solicitor be authorized to introduce the Bills in Council designating the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
3. If there are objections in accordance with Section 29(7) of the Ontario Heritage Act, the Clerk be directed to refer the proposed designation to the Conservation Review Board.
4. Heritage Preservation Services staff work with the Community and other agencies to stabilize the structures and to explore options about the future of the site.

Origin

(February 25, 2009) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Summary

The property at 5 Eireann Quay (formerly known as 5 Bathurst Street) containing the Canada Malting Complex is included on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties. It was reviewed by the Federal Heritage Review Office (FHRO) and that report concluded that “the structures enjoy significant symbolic status and considerable public recognition profile.”

Facilities and Real Estate Division have applied to demolish the entire complex, save and except a small representative portion of the silos.

Four preservation options for the Canada Malting Complex, that were reviewed by an Industrial Heritage Consultant (Historica Research Ltd.) are described below. The consultant was retained specifically by Facilities and Real Estate Division to comment on the heritage impacts of the proposed conservation component.

Comment is provided by both Heritage Preservation Services and Community Planning staff regarding the importance in conserving the site for the citizens of Toronto.

Background Information

Staff Report

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-19569.pdf>)

Communications

(March 23, 2009) e-mail from Mark Warrack, Chair, Conservation Committee, Heritage Toronto (PB.New.PB22.2.1)

PB22.3	ACTION	Adopted		Ward: 2
--------	--------	---------	--	---------

Sharon Cemetery, Etobicoke - Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act

Committee Recommendations

The Toronto Preservation Board recommended to the Etobicoke York Community Council that:

1. City Council include Sharon Cemetery, Etobicoke, on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties;
2. City Council state its intention to designate Sharon Cemetery, Etobicoke, under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act;
3. If there are no objections to the designation in accordance with Section 29(6) of the Ontario Heritage Act, the solicitor be authorized to introduce the Bills in Council designating the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act; and
4. If there are objections in accordance with Section 29(7) of the Ontario Heritage Act, the Clerk be directed to refer the proposed designation to the Conservation Review Board.

Origin

(February 24, 2009) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Summary

The Board of Trustees of Sharon Cemetery, Etobicoke, have requested the designation of the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The cemetery is located on the north side of Rexdale Boulevard, west of Highway 27, in north Etobicoke.

Sharon Cemetery was founded in 1842 and contains approximately 160 burials and over 75 grave markers that are associated with the historical community of Highfield. The proposed designation would enable the cemetery trustees to apply to the Toronto Heritage Grant Program for funding to assist in the restoration of the historical grave markers.

Background Information

Staff Report

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-19570.pdf>)

PB22.4	ACTION	Adopted		Ward: 27
--------	--------	---------	--	----------

34-38 Hazelton Avenue, Alteration to a Designated Heritage Property

Committee Recommendations

The Toronto Preservation Board recommended to the Toronto and East York Community Council that:

1. City Council refuse the application to alter 34-38 Hazelton Avenue made by the applicant.
2. City Council authorize the City Solicitor and City Staff to attend the Ontario Municipal Board hearing, should Council refuse this application and the refusal be appealed to the Board.

Origin

(March 2, 2009) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Summary

This report recommends refusal of an application to alter an individually listed and Part V designated heritage property at 34-38 Hazelton Avenue. The subject property at 34 Hazelton Avenue is located on the west side of Hazelton Street between Yorkville and Webster Avenues. The site is occupied by a two story over ground level former educational facility (St. Basil's School), constructed in 1928 in a Gothic revival architectural style. The structure was designed by Toronto architect J.M. Cowen.

The property is within the Yorkville Hazelton Heritage Conservation District (HCD) and therefore is designated under the Ontario Heritage Act per By-law 622-2002. In designating the district, Council also endorsed a set of Guidelines with regards to alterations, demolitions and new construction within the district.

Additionally, the structure at 34 Hazelton Avenue is an individually listed structure (this listing predates the district designation) as adopted by Toronto City Council in February 2002. The property is specifically identified for its cultural heritage value.

The cultural value of the structure is related to its design or physical value as a representative example of Neo-Gothic style. This style is evident at the exterior walls and along the roofline, with particular attention to the principal (east) façade. Historic significance of the structure is reflected in the architectural practice of J.M. Cowen, who prepared plans for St. Basil's Separate School in his capacity as the official architect. Cultural value is also conveyed through

its contextual significance in supporting the character of the HCD. With its scale and setback, the school building complements the low-scale appearance of the area.

The project proposes to substantially alter the existing heritage structure by removing exterior walls and the internal structural system and constructing an eight storey condominium building with ground level commercial use. The front facade of the building would be retained and would be incorporated into the overall project. The new condominium building with ground storey retail would be seven stories over a commercial ground level (with an additional mechanical roof penthouse). The height of the new structure would rise five stories, excluding the rooftop penthouse, above the existing structure's height. These additional floors would be setback approximately seven meters from the most forward projecting (central) bay of the existing façade.

The design of the structure at the front elevation would also develop a sunken (below grade) forecourt to provide access to non-residential uses at that floor level.

This application does not meet the intent of the Official Plan in protecting heritage resources. The proposed alterations would damage the heritage character of the property and significantly alter the streetscape of Hazelton Avenue and does not meet the YHHCD Guidelines.

Background Information

Staff Report

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-19571.pdf>

Communications

(March 23, 2009) e-mail from Mark Warrack, Chair, Conservation Committee, Heritage Toronto (PB.New.PB22.4.1)

(March 25, 2009) fax from Roger W. Hutchinson (PB.New.PB22.4.2)

(March 25, 2009) fax from Miriam Shiell, Miriam Shiell Fine Art Ltd. (PB.New.PB22.4.3)

(March 25, 2009) fax from Phillip Gevik, Gallery Gevik (PB.New.PB22.4.4)

(March 25, 2009) fax from Yong Chang, Kimina Fashion and Diane Rosenthal, Hollander York Gallery (PB.New.PB22.4.5)

(March 25, 2009) fax from Business Owner, 22 Hazelton Avenue (PB.New.PB22.4.6)

(March 25, 2009) fax from Mira Godard, Owner, Mira Godard Gallery (PB.New.PB22.4.7)

(March 25, 2009) fax from Kieran Conroy (PB.New.PB22.4.8)

(March 25, 2009) fax from Seymour and Madeline York (PB.New.PB22.4.9)

(March 25, 2009) fax from H.A. Macmillan and Elizabeth C. Macmillan (PB.New.PB22.4.10)

(March 25, 2009) fax from Sarah Merry (PB.New.PB22.4.11)

(March 25, 2009) fax from Susan and George Fowle (PB.New.PB22.4.12)

(March 25, 2009) fax from Carl Patmore (PB.New.PB22.4.13)

(March 25, 2009) fax from Helen Moffett (PB.New.PB22.4.14)

(March 25, 2009) fax from Ian Wookey (PB.New.PB22.4.15)

(August 26, 2008) fax from Jane Beecroft, O.M.C., President (addressed to Toronto and East York Community Council) (PB.New.PB22.4.16)

(March 26, 2009) e-mail from Gee Chung, President, The Greater Yorkville Residents' Association (PB.New.PB22.4.17)

(March 26, 2009) e-mail from Owners of 62 and 64 Hazelton Avenue, 11 Lowther Avenue, 10 Bellair Street, 89 Bernard Avenue and 15 Bins-Carth Road (PB.New.PB22.4.18)
 (March 26, 2009) e-mail from Dianne Robinson (PB.New.PB22.4.19)
 (March 26, 2009) letter from Dr. Ira Ashcroft (PB.New.PB22.4.20)
 (March 27, 2009) letter from MTCC#576, 40 Hazelton Avenue (PB.New.PB22.4.21)
 (March 27, 2009) letter from Leon Sobkowski, Ph.D. (Arch) (PB.New.PB22.4.22)
 (March 27, 2009) submission from Stacie Marune (PB.New.PB22.4.23)
 (March 27, 2009) submission from Shirley Morriss, ABC Residents' Association (PB.New.PB22.4.24)

PB22.5	ACTION	Adopted		Ward: 27
--------	--------	---------	--	----------

98 Glen Road, Demolition and Replacement of a Structure in the South Rosedale Heritage Conservation District

Committee Recommendations

The Toronto Preservation Board recommended to the Toronto and East York Community Council that:

1. City Council approve the request to demolish 98 Glen Road, an “unrated” structure in the South Rosedale Heritage Conservation District, in accordance with Section 42 (1) of the Ontario Heritage Act.
2. City Council approve the plans for the proposed replacement building for the property at 98 Glen Road, substantially in accordance with plans and drawings submitted by the applicant, Andrew Deane, prepared by Richard Wengle Architect Inc, dated February 27, 2009, on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, subject to the owner:
 - a. Prior to the issuance of any building permit for the replacement structure located at 98 Glen Road, including a permit for the demolition, excavation, and/or shoring of the subject property, providing building permit drawings satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

Origin

(March 2, 2009) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Summary

This report recommends that City Council approve the demolition of an "unrated" house in the South Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (SRHCD) and approve the design of the replacement structure in accordance with Section 42 (1) of the Ontario Heritage Act. The existing structure does not contribute to the heritage character of the SRHCD and the

replacement structure is substantially in accordance with the SRHCD Plan Guidelines. This consent under the Ontario Heritage Act is in addition to demolition permits required under the Building Code Act and the Planning Act and the approval of variances to the existing zoning by-law.

Background Information

Staff Report

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-19572.pdf>)

PB22.6	Information	Received		
--------	-------------	----------	--	--

Minutes of the Community Preservation Panels

Decision Advice and Other Information

The Toronto Preservation Board received the Minutes of the Community Preservation Panels.

Origin

(February 23, 2009) Memo from Chairs, Community Preservation Panels

Summary

- a. Etobicoke York Community Preservation Panel
 - i. Minutes of the meeting held on February 2, 2009
- b. North York Community Preservation Panel
 - i. Minutes of the meeting held on January 12, 2009
- c. Scarborough Community Preservation Panel
 - i. Minutes of the meeting held on February 10, 2009

Background Information

Etobicoke York Community Preservation Panel - February 2, 2009

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-19316.pdf>)

North York Community Preservation Panel Minutes - January 12, 2009

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-19440.pdf>)

Scarborough Community Preservation Panel - February 10, 2009

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-19317.pdf>)

PB22.7	ACTION	Amended		Ward: 21
---------------	---------------	---------	--	----------

Demolition and Replacement with Two Structures within the Wychwood Park Heritage Conservation District - 106 Wychwood Park

Committee Recommendations

The Toronto Preservation Board, after further consideration of the revised application, recommended to City Council, at its meeting on April 6, 2009, that:

1. City Council reject issuance of the demolition permit pursuant to the Ontario Heritage Act for the property at 106 Wychwood Park.
2. City Council approve the alterations to the property at 106 Wychwood Park pursuant to the Ontario Heritage Act substantially as set forth in the application to alter dated and received by the City on March 27, 2009, subject to such conditions as the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning, may report on to the April 6, 2009 City Council meeting.

Origin

(March 26, 2009) Letter from Toronto and East York Community Council

Summary

Advising that the Toronto and East York Community Council on March 26, 2009 referred to the Toronto Preservation Board for further consideration of the revised application at its meeting on March 27, 2009, the report (January 29, 2009) from the Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division, and the letter (February 20, 2009) from the Toronto Preservation Board respecting the Demolition and Replacement with Two New Structures within the Wychwood Park Heritage Conservation District – 106 Wychwood Park, with a request that the Board report on this matter directly to City Council for its meeting on April 6, 2009.

Background Information

Letter from Toronto and East York Community Council

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-19901.pdf>)

Staff Report

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-19902.pdf>)

Letter from Toronto Preservation Board

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-19903.pdf>)

Letter from Michael S. Goldberg, Goldberg Group

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-19915.pdf>)

Letter from Michael S. Goldberg, Goldberg Group

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-19922.pdf>)

Communications

(March 26, 2009) e-mail from Michael S. Goldberg, Goldberg Group (PB.New.PB22.7.1)

(March 27, 2009) letter from Michael S. Goldberg, Goldberg Group (PB.New.PB22.7.2)

(March 27, 2009) letter from Ian MacDonald, Chair of Wychwood Park Heritage Advisory

Committee (filed by Marc Kemerer) (PB.New.PB22.7.3)

Meeting Sessions

Session Date	Session Type	Start Time	End Time	Public or Closed Session
2009-03-27	Afternoon	2:05 PM	3:55 PM	Public
2009-03-27	Afternoon	4:05 PM	4:30 PM	Public

Attendance

Date and Time	Quorum	Members
2009-03-27 2:05 PM - 3:55 PM (Public Session)	Present	<i>Present:</i> Ashbourne, Dudeck, Jain, Kettel, Leong, Rieger, Saunders, Vaughan <i>Not Present:</i> Balen, Dutil, Gogan, Le Roy, Rae, Thompson
2009-03-27 4:05 PM - 4:30 PM (Public Session)	Present	<i>Present:</i> Ashbourne, Dudeck, Jain, Kettel, Leong, Rieger, Saunders, Vaughan <i>Not Present:</i> Balen, Dutil, Gogan, Le Roy, Rae, Thompson <i>Also present (non-members):</i> Mihevc