

Toronto Preservation Board

Meeting No.	21	Contact	Colleen O'Neill, Committee Secretary
Meeting Date	Friday, February 20, 2009	Phone	416-392-5227
Start Time	2:00 PM	E-mail	coneill1@toronto.ca
Location	Committee Room 4, City Hall	Chair	Robert Saunders

Confirmation of Minutes

On motion by Patrice Dutil, the Toronto Preservation Board confirmed the Minutes of the meeting held on January 22, 2009.

PB21.1	Presentation	Received		Ward: 29
--------	--------------	----------	--	----------

Status Report on Todmorden Mills - 67 Pottery Road

Decision Advice and Other Information

The Toronto Preservation Board thanked Wendy Shearer and received the presentation for information.

Summary

Presentation from Wendy Shearer, Landscape Architect, on behalf of City of Toronto's Culture Division, on the Site Plan Application for a new roadway, larger parking lot and barrier free pathways.

Speakers

Wendy Shearer, Landscape Architect, a division of MHBC Planning Limited (Submission Filed)

Motions

Motion to Receive Item moved by Mary Louise Ashbourne (Carried)

That the item be received for information.

PB21.2	ACTION	Adopted		Ward: 14
--------	--------	---------	--	----------

2154 Dundas Street West - Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act

Committee Recommendations

The Toronto Preservation Board recommended to the Toronto and East York Community Council that:

1. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 2154 Dundas Street West under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
2. If there are no objections to the designation in accordance with Section 29(6) of the Ontario Heritage Act, the solicitor be authorized to introduce the Bills in Council designating the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
3. If there are objections in accordance with Section 29(7) of the Ontario Heritage Act, the Clerk be directed to refer the proposed designation to the Conservation Review Board.

Origin

(February 2, 2009) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Summary

The property at 2154 Dundas Street West is listed on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties. The owner has requested that the property be designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act as part of a redevelopment application. The property contains a former industrial building that is undergoing conversion to residential condominiums.

Background Information

Staff Report

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-18930.pdf>

2154 Dundas St. W. - Attachments 1 to 3

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-18931.pdf>

Speakers

Scott Weir, ERA Architects

Cynthia MacDougall, McCarthy-Tetrault

Motions

Motion to Adopt Item moved by Councillor Kyle Rae (Carried)

Declared Interests

The following member(s) declared an interest:

Adriana Balen - As she is employed by the firm consulting on the project.

PB21.3	ACTION	Adopted		Ward: 18
--------	--------	---------	--	----------

166 Beaconsfield Avenue - Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act

Committee Recommendations

The Toronto Preservation Board recommended to the Toronto and East York Community Council that:

1. City Council include the property at 166 Beaconsfield Avenue (George Barrett House) on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties.
2. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 166 Beaconsfield Avenue (George Barrett House) under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
3. If there are no objections to the designation in accordance with Section 29(6) of the Ontario Heritage Act, the solicitor be authorized to introduce the Bills in Council designating the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
4. If there are objections in accordance with Section 29(7) of the Ontario Heritage Act, the Clerk be directed to refer the proposed designation to the Conservation Review Board.

Origin

(February 4, 2009) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Summary

The owner of the property at 166 Beaconsfield Avenue has requested the designation of the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The property contains a late 19th century residential building that meets the criteria for municipal designation prescribed by the Province of Ontario.

The property owner has been restoring the heritage attributes of the property since 2001. The proposed designation of the site will enable the owner to qualify for the Toronto Heritage Grant Program, which funds restoration work.

Background Information

Staff Report

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-18934.pdf>

166 Beaconsfield Avenue - Attachments 1 to 3

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-18935.pdf>

Motions

Motion to Adopt Item moved by Mary Louise Ashbourne (Carried)

PB21.4	ACTION	Adopted		Ward: 20
--------	--------	---------	--	----------

38A and B Boswell Avenue, Demolition and Replacement of a Structure within the East Annex Heritage Conservation District

Committee Recommendations

The Toronto Preservation Board recommended to the Toronto and East York Community Council that:

1. City Council approve the issuance of a demolition permit for the designated “C” rated buildings at 38A and B Boswell Avenue.
2. City Council approve the proposed replacement building for the property at 38A & B Boswell Avenue, substantially in accordance with the plans and drawings prepared by Richard Wengle Architect Inc, dated December 11, 2008.

Origin

(January 28, 2009) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Summary

This report recommends approval of the demolition permit of the two storey building at 38A & B Boswell Avenue (which collapsed during renovation) and the approval of the replacement structure based on the submitted elevation.

Background Information

Staff Report

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-18936.pdf>)

38A and B Boswell Avenue - Attachments 1 to 8

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-18937.pdf>)

Motions

Motion to Adopt Item moved by Councillor Adam Vaughan (Carried)

PB21.5	ACTION	Amended		Ward: 20
--------	--------	---------	--	----------

327-333 Queen Street West, Demolition and Replacement of a Structure within the Queen Street West Heritage Conservation District

Committee Recommendations

The Toronto Preservation Board recommended to the Toronto and East York Community Council that:

1. City Council approve the issuance of a demolition permit for the buildings at 327-329-331-333 Queen Street West within the Queen Street West Heritage Conservation District.
2. Recommendation 2 be deferred to allow staff to bring the application more in line with Heritage Conservation District characteristics.

Origin

(January 28, 2009) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Summary

This report recommends approval of the demolition of the three storey contributory building at 331-333 Queen Street West (south side of the street) and the demolition of the two non-contributory one storey structures at 327-329 Queen Street West. The project would then consolidate the entire site to accommodate a new three storey replacement building.

The properties at 327-329-331-333 Queen Street West are included within the Queen Street West Heritage Conservation District, which extends from University Avenue to Bathurst Street.

The subject site is located on the south side of Queen Street West (Attachment No.1) between Peter Street (to the west) and John Street (to the east). The site has prominence as a termination of the view looking south down Beverley Street.

The recommendation to demolish the three storey contributing building at 331-333 Queen Street West is based on the lack of remaining character and the deteriorated condition of the original fabric. A replacement structure has been submitted that respects the traditional solid to void relationships and scale of the district as well as expressing an interesting sculptural treatment of the façade with regards to detailing and overall composition.

Background Information

Staff Report

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-18938.pdf>

327-333 Queen Street West - Attachments 1 to 8

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-18939.pdf>

Motions

Motion to Amend Item moved by Councillor Adam Vaughan (Carried)

PB21.6	ACTION	Amended		Ward: 21
---------------	---------------	---------	--	----------

106 Wychwood Park - Demolition and Replacement with Two New Structures within the Wychwood Park Heritage Conservation District

Committee Recommendations

The Toronto Preservation Board recommended to the Toronto and East York Community Council that:

1. City Council reject issuance of the demolition permit.
2. The existing building might be altered following Heritage Conservation District guidelines, subject to the following conditions:
 - tree protection regulation compliance;
 - density regulation compliance;
 - landscape plan for driveway and planting scheme in compliance with HCD guidelines.
3. Should a new heritage permit application be made, that the application come back to Heritage Preservation Services and the Toronto Preservation Board for consideration and that Heritage Preservation Services staff notify the local Councillor immediately.

Origin

(January 29, 2009) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Summary

This report recommends approval of the demolition of the two storey single family residential structure at 106 Wychwood Park (Attachment No.1) on the east side of the Park.

In conjunction with the demolition request, the project would construct two new residential structures on the site at 106 Wychwood Park (one structure at the “lot of record” adjacent to 106 Wychwood).

The property at 106 Wychwood Park is within the Wychwood Park Heritage Conservation District and the proposal meets the intent of the District Plan.

Although the Wychwood Park District Plan recommends that no demolitions should be permitted in the Park, the existing structure does not contribute to the character and importance of the district. In general, the period of greatest significance is defined within the guidelines as between the years 1905 and 1917, which represent the period in which development in the district was based upon the Canadian interpretation of the English Arts and Crafts movement. Houses constructed in the 1920s and 1930s are considered to be less important, but also may contribute to the district. The subject property has been identified as constructed between 1950 and 1962 and therefore is non-contributing within the district in terms of built form. It is also identified as being incompatible with its neighbours.

Background Information

Staff Report

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-18941.pdf>)

106 Wychwood Park - Attachments 1 to 7

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-18942.pdf>)

Communications

(February 18, 2009) fax from Sheldon J. Godfrey, Barrister and Solicitor (PB.New.PB21.6.1)

(February 18, 2009) e-mail from Marc P. Kemerer, White, Duncan, Linton

LLP (PB.New.PB21.6.2)

(February 18, 2009) e-mail from Mark Segal (PB.New.PB21.6.3)

(February 18, 2009) e-mail from Peter Ortved, Chair, Heritage Toronto (PB.New.PB21.6.4)

(February 19, 2009) e-mail from Dr. Richard Hall, Vice-President, Cabbagetown Heritage Conservation District Committee (PB.New.PB21.6.5)

(February 20, 2009) e-mail from Robert K. McDermott, Partner, McMillan

LLP (PB.New.PB21.6.6)

(February 20, 2009) e-mail from Christopher and Brigitte Theis (PB.New.PB21.6.7)

(February 20, 2009) fax from Julian Kitchen, Chair, Harbord Village Heritage Conservation District (PB.New.PB21.6.8)

(February 20, 2009) e-mail from William N. Greer, B.Arch, FRAIC, CAHP, Heritage Consultant (filed by Ian MacDonald) (PB.New.PB21.6.9)

(February 20, 2009) letter from Ian MacDonald Architect Inc. (PB.New.PB21.6.10)

(December 3, 2008) letter from Ian W. Bruce, ISA Certified Arborist (filed by Ian MacDonald) (PB.New.PB21.6.11)

(February 20, 2009) memo from Wychwood Park Ratepayers Association (PB.New.PB21.6.12)

(February 20, 2009) submission from Phillip H. Carter, Heritage Architect (PB.New.PB21.6.13)

Speakers

N. Jane Pepino, C.M., Q.C., LL.D., Aird & Berlis LLP, Barristers and Solicitors

Phillip H. Carter, Heritage Architect (Submission Filed)

Marc Kemerer, White, Duncan, Linton LLP

Carl Bray, Bray Heritage

Ian MacDonald, Ian MacDonald Architect Inc.

Sheldon J. Godfrey, Sheldon J. Godfrey, C.M., M.A., J.D., Barristers and Solicitors

John Blumenson, Preservation Consultant

Councillor Joe Mihevc, Ward 21 St. Paul's

Motions

Motion to Amend Item moved by Adriana Balen (Carried)

PB21.7	ACTION	Amended		Ward: 27
---------------	---------------	---------	--	----------

5 Highland Avenue, Demolition and Replacement of a Structure within the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District

Committee Recommendations

The Toronto Preservation Board recommended to the Toronto and East York Community Council that:

1. City Council approve the request to demolish 5 Highland Avenue, an “unrated” structure in the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District, in accordance with Section 42 (1) of the Ontario Heritage Act.
2. City Council approve plans for the replacement building in accordance with Section 42 (4) of the Ontario Heritage Act subject to the owner:
 - a. Revising the plans to set back the garage, adjust the fenestration of the front façade and remove the U-shaped drive to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - b. Prior to the issuance of any building permit for the replacement structure located at 5 Highland Ave, including a permit for the demolition, excavation, and/or shoring of the subject property, providing building permit drawings and landscape plan satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

Origin

(February 9, 2009) Report from Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division

Summary

This report recommends that City Council approve the demolition of an “unrated” house in the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD) and approve the design of the replacement structure, in accordance with Section 42 (1) of the Ontario Heritage Act, with a condition that the plans are revised to the approval of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services. The plans should be revised to set the integral double garage back from the front of the house and to eliminate the U-shaped driveway to maximize soft landscaping in the front yard, and preserve a mature City tree.

The existing structure does not contribute to the heritage character of the NRHCD and can be demolished.

The plans for the replacement structure need revision in order to be substantially in accordance with the NRHCD Plan Guidelines.

This consent under the Ontario Heritage Act is in addition to Site Plan approval under the Planning Act, the approval of variances to the existing zoning by-law by Committee of Adjustment and the securing of a demolition permit required under the Building Code Act.

In this proposal the classical proportions of the house façade are thrown off by the addition of an integral double garage set forward from the main façade of the house. The scale and massing of the principal façade with its integral garage appear to be too long and are visually intrusive to the heritage character of the streetscape. The proposal for a U-shaped driveway is not consistent with the zoning, results in too much paving on the front yard and is out of keeping with the landscape character of the NRHCD.

Background Information

Staff Report

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-18945.pdf>)

5 Highland Avenue - Attachments 1 to 9

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-18946.pdf>)

Speakers

Wayne Swadron, Wayne Swadron Architect Ltd.

Tina McMullen, Wayne Swadron Architect Limited

Motions

Motion to Amend Item moved by David Le Roy (Carried)

PB21.8	Information	Received		Ward: All
--------	-------------	----------	--	-----------

Minutes of the Community Preservation Panels

Decision Advice and Other Information

The Toronto Preservation Board received the Minutes of the Community Preservation Panels for information.

Origin

(February 11, 2009) Memo from Chairs, Community Preservation Panels

Summary

- a. North York Community Preservation Panel
 - i. Minutes of the meeting held on November 20, 2008.
- b. Scarborough Community Preservation Panel
 - i. Minutes of the meeting held on December 9, 2008

Background Information

Minutes of the North York Community Preservation Panel

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-18943.pdf>)

Minutes of Scarborough Community Heritage Preservation Panel

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-18944.pdf>)

Motions

Motion to Receive Item moved by Edith Geduld (Carried)

That the item be received for information.

PB21.9	ACTION	Adopted		
--------	--------	---------	--	--

Application for Funds to Hold a Special Heritage Community Event**Decision Advice and Other Information**

The Toronto Preservation Board approved the application submitted by the North York Community Preservation Panel for funds up to \$1,000.00 from the Special Heritage Community Event Fund, to be used for the North York Modernist Architecture Event to be held in North York and requested Edith Geduld to submit her receipts to Heritage Preservation Services for reimbursement.

Origin

(February 20, 2009) Member Motion from Edith Geduld, Chair, North York Community Preservation Panel

Summary

Requesting approval of an application submitted by the North York Community Preservation Panel for funds up to \$1,000.00 from the Special Heritage Community Event Fund.

Motions

Motion to Adopt Item moved by Edith Geduld (Carried)

Friday, February 20, 2009

Robert Saunders, Chair, Toronto Preservation Board

Meeting Sessions

Session Date	Session Type	Start Time	End Time	Public or Closed Session
2009-02-20	Afternoon	2:05 PM	6:05 PM	Public

Attendance

Date and Time	Quorum	Members
2009-02-20 2:05 PM - 6:05 PM (Public Session)	Present	<i>Present:</i> Ashbourne, Balen, Dudeck, Dutil, Geduld, Le Roy, Rae, Rieger, Saunders, Vaughan <i>Not Present:</i> Gogan, Jain, Leong, Thompson <i>Also present (non-members):</i> Mihevc