

STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

Commercial Dog Walkers Permit Policy Annual Review and Appeal Process

Date:	January 7, 2009
То:	Parks and Environment Committee
From:	Brenda Patterson, General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation
Wards:	All
Reference Number:	

SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to recommend the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy be amended as part of the annual review and include revised criteria for permit suspension and an appeal process, as requested by City Council. (See Attachment No.1)

The report also recommends that City Council establish a Commercial Dog Walker Permit Appeal Committee, composed of three senior City staff, to hear appeals with respect to the suspension of commercial dog walker permits. The criteria for the permit suspension and the proposed appeal process require amendments to *Municipal Code Chapters 608, Parks* and *Chapter 441, Fees and Charges*.

Overall compliance with the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy since its implementation in November, 2007, has been very high. Our experience indicates that permitted commercial dog walkers comprehend and have been complying with this policy. However, in the event of a suspension of a commercial dog walker's permit under the revised policy, the establishment of an appeal process is being recommended.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The General Manager of Parks, Forestry and Recreation recommends that:

1. City Council approve amendments to the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy outlined in bold print in Attachment 1, subject to any necessary minor, substantive, or stylistic refinements as may be identified by the General Manager and City Solicitor, and including the following:

- (a) Replacement of the former "Revoked Permit" section in the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy with the "Permit Suspension" section;
- (b) the establishment of an Appeal Process for Commercial Dog Walkers who have been notified that their permit will be suspended; and
- (c) the establishment of a three-member Commercial Dog Walker Permit Appeal Committee composed of the Managers of Animal Services, and Policy and Planning Services, both of Municipal Licensing and Standards; and the Project Manager of the Clean and Beautiful City Secretariat of Transportation Services.
- 2. City Council approve the corresponding amendments to Municipal Code Chapter 608, Parks to implement the revisions to the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy, as outlined in Attachment 2, subject to any necessary minor, substantive or stylistic refinements as may be identified by the General Manager and the City Solicitor;
- 3. Council approve the terms of reference for the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Appeal Committee, and that *Municipal Code Chapter 608, Parks*, be amended accordingly, substantially as outlined in Attachment 3 of this report, subject to any necessary minor substantive or stylistic refinements as may be identified by the General Manager and the City Solicitor;
- 4. Council approve a \$200 non-refundable application fee to appeal the suspension of a commercial dog walker permit and that *Municipal Code Chapter 441, Fees and Charges*, be amended to include the new fee; and
- 5. The City Solicitor be authorized to introduce the necessary bills to give effect to these recommendations.

Financial Impact

Although the Division has had no prior experience to base an estimate of volume or associated cost to conduct a commercial dog walker permit suspension appeal process, it is anticipated that the hearings would not have a significant expenditure impact and would be off-set by the \$200 non-refundable fee which must accompany the request for hearing.

The Division does not anticipate many hearing requests. To date, permitted commercial dog walkers have demonstrated compliance with the policy. This appeal process is, therefore, not expected to have an impact on the Parks, Forestry and Recreation Operating Budget and no budget adjustment is recommended at this time.

The Acting Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

At its meeting of July 4, 2007, the Parks and Environment Committee in considering Item PE7.4 – Commercial Dog Walkers Permit Policy, directed the General Manager of Parks, Forestry and Recreation (the "General Manager") to report on the feasibility of introducing an appeal process to be heard by the Parks and Environment Committee and conduct a review of the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy in one year's time and report back to the Parks and Environment Committee on its effectiveness. http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2007/pe/decisions/2007-07-04-pe07-dd.pdf

ISSUE BACKGROUND

The Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy was developed to help ensure accountability by limiting the number of dogs allowed under the control of a Commercial Dog Walker while using City parks, greens spaces and waterfront areas ("City Parks"). All Commercial Dog Walkers who walk from four to a maximum of six dogs at any one time in City Parks must obtain a Commercial Dog Walker Permit.

Commercial Dog Walkers with permits, while using City Parks, agree to:

- visibly display their commercial dog walker permit;
- present their permit upon request to a Provincial Offences Officer or Parks, Forestry and Recreation staff member;
- ensure that all dogs under their care and control are wearing a valid City of Toronto dog license tag;
- dispose of dog waste in bins provided;
- abide by existing designated off-leash areas, area boundaries, hours of operation and other regulated regulations;
- keep their dog on-leash at all times, unless they are in a designated off-leash area; and
- comply with applicable laws, by-laws, regulations or Council-approved policies, including but not limited to: Toronto *Municipal Code Chapter 608, Parks*, and *Chapter 349, Animals*.

The original Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy had permit suspension criteria but did not include an appeal process.

This report reviews the policy and proposes amendments including the addition of the appeal process and revisions to the permit suspension criteria.

COMMENTS

1) Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy Annual Review

Since the implementation of the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy in November 2007, Parks, Forestry and Recreation has sold approximately 215 commercial dog walker permits, and the By-law Enforcement Unit has issued two verbal warnings and two tickets for contraventions under *Municipal Code Chapter 608, Parks*. This represents a non-compliance rate of less than one percent. Thus, our experience indicates that permitted commercial dog walkers comprehend and have been complying with the policy.

As part of the one year review staff are recommending amendments to the Application Process, Conditions of Use, and Enforcement and Fines sections of the Policy.

Application Process

Since October of 2008, commercial dog walkers have been required to have their photo taken as part of the permit application process at the time of purchase. The photo is recorded on the client's account to enable staff to identify the permit holder and deter permit sharing. This requirement has been included in the revised policy.

Conditions for Use of City Parks – Insurance Requirements

Renewal of a commercial dog walker permit does not always coincide with the term of their Commercial General Liability Insurance coverage period. Should the insurance coverage expire prior to the permit term, the onus is on the commercial dog walker to maintain valid liability coverage for the duration of their permit. The revised policy requires "Maintenance of Commercial Liability Insurance" coverage be added in the "Conditions of Use" section of the policy.

Enforcement and Fines

Violations of the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy and non-compliance with *Municipal Code Chapters 608, Parks* and *349 Animals*, are recorded and tracked by Parks, Forestry and Recreation for further action as required, including permit suspension. The revised policy ensures that commercial dog walkers are aware of the tracking mechanism.

2) Appeal Process for Suspending Commercial Dog Walker Permits

As directed by City Council, staff reviewed the feasibility of having the Parks and Environment Committee hear appeals related to the suspension of commercial dog walker permits and are not recommending the Committee hear appeals related to this matter. Hearing individual appeals with regard to the suspension of a commercial dog walker permit is not consistent with the role and mandate of a Standing Policy Committee. Additionally, the City's procedural by-law that governs City Council and its committees, including the Parks and Environment Committee, does not lend itself to hearing appeals of this nature as they may include the introduction of evidence, questioning witnesses and hearing all facts of a case before a decision is rendered.

In consultation with the City Managers Office, City Clerks Office and Legal Services, it is recommended that a Commercial Dog Walker Permit Appeal Committee be established solely for the purpose of holding hearings in relation to proposed suspensions of commercial dog walker permits. A Committee panel comprised of three senior level staff, independent of Parks, Forestry and Recreation is recommended. The panel would consist of the Managers of Animal Services and of Policy and Planning Services, both of Municipal Licensing and Standards and the Project Manager of the Clean and Beautiful Secretariat of Transportation Services. The Committee will be delegated final decisionmaking authority to hear appeals of a notice to suspend a commercial dog walker permit and make final binding decisions with respect to the decision of the permit.

The terms of reference for the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Appeals Committee outlining composition, term, quorum, delegation of responsibilities, procedures etc. are attached as Attachment 3 to this report. It is recommended that the terms of reference for the Committee be included in Chapter 608, Parks and that the by-law be amended accordingly.

3) Suspension of Commercial Dog Walker Permits

The approved Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy contains a section on "Revoked Permits" for "repeat offenders," who have violated either one or more of the provisions under Municipal Codes 349, Animals and/or 608, Parks. Subsequent to the implementation of the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy, it was determined that this section is cumbersome to administer and there was no appeal process.

Staff are proposing to delete this section and replace it with a new section entitled "Permit Suspension". Under the revised policy, it is proposed that a commercial dog walker permit be suspended for a period of ninety (90) days if the permit holder is convicted of an offence under Toronto *Municipal Code Chapter 608, Parks* or *Chapter 349, Animals*, on any two (2) separate occasions within a six month period, and for a period of one (1) year if convicted of an offence on any three (3) separate occasions within a one (1) year period.

Written notice of the suspension shall be sent to the permit holder, who will have thirty (30) days to appeal their suspension. If no appeal is received by the General Manager of Parks, Forestry and Recreation within the thirty (30) day appeal period, the suspension will be deemed to be in effect, as per the provisions outlined in the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy and the Municipal Code Chapter 608, Parks (See Attachments 1

and 2). The expiry date of a commercial dog walker permit shall not be extended if their permit is suspended.

Parks, Forestry and Recreation has a three-pronged approach to by-law enforcement, which includes community engagement, public education and enforcement. Given this approach, current enforcement statistics and compliance of Commercial Dog Walkers, it is anticipated that permit suspensions will be infrequent. It currently takes approximately six months for a certified conviction to cycle through the court system.

Since the implementation of the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy in November 2007, Parks, Forestry and Recreation has sold approximately 215 commercial dog walker permits, and the By-law Enforcement Unit has issued two verbal warnings and two tickets for contraventions of *Chapter 608, Parks*. Our experience indicates that permitted commercial dog walkers have been complying with the policy.

4) Appeals

A permit holder who has been advised that the commercial dog walker permit is being suspended may appeal the decision of the General Manager and request to be heard by the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Appeal Committee (the "Committee"), by filing with the General Manager, within 30 days of the General Manager's notice, a request for hearing and including the permit holder's contact information, grounds for appeal and related submissions.

It is proposed that the City charge \$200 to appeal a commercial dog walker permit suspension to assist with the administration costs of processing the appeals. Municipal Licensing and Standards also charges a \$200 application fee for fence exemptions to cover the administrative costs of preparing the accompanying staff report. The \$200 non-refundable application fee must accompany the request for a hearing. The proposed application fee has been advertised on the City of Toronto web-site at least five working days prior to the Parks and Environment Committee meeting, as required by the *City of Toronto Act, 2006*.

Upon receipt of a request for hearing the General Manager shall prepare and forward a report to the Committee that includes:

- (a) the General Manager's decision, reasons for the suspension of the permit and any recommendations to the Committee; and
- (b) a copy of the request for hearing.

Following receipt of the report prepared by the General Manager, the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Appeal Committee shall provide the permit holder with the opportunity to be heard in public, after which time the panel shall either:

- (a) confirm the original decision made by the General Manager, on such terms and conditions as the Committee may determine;
- (b) refer the matter back to the General Manager and direct the General Manager to reconsider the matter having regard to such considerations or directions as the Committee may recommend; or
- (c) direct the General Manager not to suspend the commercial dog walker permit.

The commercial dog walker permit shall remain valid until the Committee has heard the appeal. The hearings before the Committee shall be open to the public, except where section 190 of the *City of Toronto Act, 2006* allows meetings to be closed.

If a commercial dog walker permit expires before an appeal is heard, and the Committee suspends the permit, the suspension shall apply to a new commercial dog walker permit, if one has been issued.

It is recommended that the process for suspending commercial dog walker permits, the criteria for suspension of commercial dog walker permits and the appeal process be added to the Commercial Dog walker Permit Policy to replace the Revoked Permit and Appeal Process Sections of the original policy, and that the amendments to *Municipal Code Chapter 608, Parks* and *Chapter 441, Fees and Charges*, be adopted.

As a result of the one year review, staff are recommending amendments to the Application Process, Conditions of Use and Enforcement and Fines sections of the Policy, as noted in bold in Attachment 1.

CONTACT

Paul Ronan, Director, Parks, Tel: 416-396-4490, Fax: 416-396-4957, Email: pronan@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Brenda Patterson, General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 - Amendments to Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy Attachment 2 - Amendments to Municipal Code Chapter 608, Parks – Suspension of Commercial Dog Walker Permits Attachment 3 - Amendments to Municipal Code Chapter 608, Parks – Commercial Dog Walker Permit Appeal Committee

Attachment #1

Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy	Approved By: Toronto City Council Approval Date: July 4, 2007 Revision Date:		
Policy Statement	To help ensure accountability by limiting the number of dogs allowed under the control of a Commercial Dog Walker to a maximum of six (6) at any one time, while using City parks, greenspaces or waterfront areas. ("City Parks")		
Application for Commercial Dog Walker Permit	All Commercial Dog Walkers who walk from four (4) to a maximum of six (6) dogs, at any one time in City parks, greenspaces or waterfront areas must obtain a Commercial Dog Walker Permit.		
	To obtain a Commercial Dog Walker Permit, an individual Commercial Dog Walker is required to:		
	 Apply for the permit in person at any one of the three (3) Civic Centres (Etobicoke, North York, Scarborough), and Toronto City Hall; 		
	 2) Provide: i) personal identification; ii) completed Application for Commercial Dog Walker Permit 		
	 Provide evidence of Commercial General Liability insurance coverage in the amount of \$1,000,000 for bodily injury, property damage and personal injury liability, and including the City as an additional insured; and 		
	 Ensure that all dogs under their care and control are licensed in accordance with Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 349, Animals. 		
	 Pay the established fee of \$200.00 per Commercial Dog Walker. 		
	6) Photo of Commercial Dog Walker will be taken at the time of permit purchase and recorded on the clients account		

Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy	Approved By: Toronto City Council Approval Date: July 4, 2007 Revision Date:	
Conditions for use of City parks, greenspaces, and waterfront areas	Council Approval Date: July 4, 2007 Parks, Forestry & Recreation	

Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy	Approved By: Toronto City Council Approval Date: July 4, 2007 Revision Date: such insurance coverage if required by the "General Manager".
Prohibitions for use of City parks, greenspaces, and waterfront areas	 Commercial Dog Walkers are prohibited from bringing dogs into the following areas: Natural or environmentally sensitive areas including: designated ravines, wooded or savannah areas, sites of natural and/or scientific interest, areas which have undergone significant habitat restoration, wetlands or their buffer zones Playgrounds, splash pads and wading pools Horticultural display areas or ornamental gardens Skateboard bowls, tennis courts and other sports pads Sports fields and stadiums Artificial or natural ice rinks, toboggan hills Animal display areas Blue Flag designated beaches Campgrounds Parks designated as unsuitable for commercial dog walkers Areas posted prohibiting dogs
Enforcement and Fines	Dog walkers with unlicensed dogs or an invalid licence or tag will be guilty of an offence under Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 349 and will be subject to appropriate fines. http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/municode/1184_349.pdf Dogs walkers who fail to comply with any of the conditions stipulated within Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 608-34 and any of the conditions set out in this Policy will be guilty of an offence and will be subject to appropriate fines in accordance with Municipal Code Chapter 608. http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/municode/1184_608.pdf Violations of the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy and non-compliance with Municipal Code Chapters 608, Parks and 349 Animals, will be recorded and tracked by Parks, Forestry and Recreation for further action if necessary, including permit suspension.

Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy	Approved By: Toronto City Council Approval Date: July 4, 2007 Revision Date:		
Permit Suspension	1. A Commercial Dog Walker Permit shall be suspended:		
	(a) for a period of ninety (90) days if the permit holder is convicted of an offence under Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 608, Parks or Chapter 349, Animals, on any two separate occasions within a six month period; and		
	(b) for a period of one year if convicted of an offence on any three separate occasions within a one (1) year period.		
	2. The General Manager shall provide 30 days written notice to the permit holder before suspending the permit holder's commercial dog walker permit.		
	3. Written notice under Subsection B(2) shall be delivered to the permit holder by means of registered mail and shall be deemed to be received by the permit holder on the third business day, following the date of mailing.		
	4. The expiry date of a commercial dog walker permit shall not be extended if a permit holder's commercial dog walker permit is suspended; and		
	5. A permit holder cannot apply for a new commercial dog walker permit during a period of suspension.		
Appeals Process Request for Hearing	A permit holder who has been advised that their commercial dog walker permit will be suspended may appeal the decision of the General Manager of Parks, Forestry and Recreation (the "General Manager") and request to be heard by the Commercial Dog Walker Permit Appeal Committee (the "Committee"), by filing with the General Manager, within 30 days of the General Manager's notice, a request for hearing and including the permit holder's contact information, grounds for appeal and related submissions.		
Composition	The appeal committee shall consist of three (3) members, comprised of :		
	(a) the Manager of Animal Services, Municipal Licensing and Standards;		
	(b) the Manager of Policy and Planning Services,		

Commercial Dog Walker Permit Policy	Approved By: Toronto City Council Approval Date: July 4, 2007 Revision Date:	Parks, Forestry & Recreation	
	Municipal Licensing and Standards; and		
	(c) the Project Manager of the Clean and Beautiful Secretariat, Transportation Services.		
	The Manager of Policy and Planning Services, Municipal Licensing and Standards, shall be the Chair of the Committee.		
Hearing Fee	The permit holder shall pay a non-refundable fee of \$200.00 to process the request for hearing, which fee must accompany the request for hearing.		
Additional Information	-	ng to the suspension of mits and the appeal process Municipal Code Chapter 608,	
Indemnity	and save harmless the City of liability, damage or costs it may	y incur arising out of or related r Permit holders' activities or the	

Attachment #2

Suspension of Commercial Dog Walker Permits Amendments to Municipal Code Chapter 608, Parks

The following shall be added to Chapter 608, Parks after Section 608-34.1:

608-34.2. Suspension of Commercial Dog Walker Permit.

A. Definitions.

As used in this Article, the following terms shall have the meanings indicated:

APPEAL COMMITTEE – The Commercial Dog Walker Permit Appeal Committee established by Council to hold hearings in relation to the proposed suspension of commercial dog walker permits.

CONVICTED – To have been issued one or more certificates of offence or summonses and to have 1) made a voluntary payment; 2) disputed the charge and been found guilty of the offence in a court proceeding; or 3) been sentenced in absentia.

PERMIT HOLDER – A person who has been issued a commercial dog walker permit under this Chapter 608, Parks.

- B. Suspension of Commercial Dog Walker Permit.
 - (1) A permit holder's commercial dog walker permit shall be:
 - (a) Suspended for a period of ninety days if the permit holder has been convicted of contravening this Chapter 608, Parks or Municipal Code Chapter 349, Animals, on any two separate occasions within a six month period; and
 - (b) Suspended for a period of one year if the permit holder has been convicted of contravening this Chapter 608, Parks or Municipal Code Chapter 349, Animals, on any three separate occasions within a one year period.
 - (2) The General Manager shall provide 30 days written notice to the permit holder before suspending the permit holder's commercial dog walker permit.
 - (3) Written notice under Subsection B(2) shall be delivered to the permit holder by means of registered mail. Notice shall be deemed to be received

by the permit holder on the third business day following the date of mailing.

- (4) The expiry date of a commercial dog walker permit shall not be extended if a permit holder's commercial dog walker permit is suspended.
- (5) A permit holder cannot apply for a new commercial dog walker permit during a period of suspension.
- C. Appeals.
 - (1) A permit holder who has been advised that the commercial dog walker permit is being suspended may appeal the decision of the General Manager and request to be heard by the appeal committee, by filing with the General Manager, within 30 days of the General Manager's notice, a request for hearing and including the permit holder's contact information, grounds for the appeal and any related submissions.
 - (2) Upon receipt of a request for hearing as set out in Subsection (1), the General Manager shall prepare and forward a report to the appeal committee that shall include:
 - (a) The General Manager's decision, reasons for the suspension of the permit and any recommendations to the appeal committee; and
 - (b) The request for hearing.
 - (3) Following receipt of the report prepared by the General Manager, the appeal committee shall provide the permit holder with the opportunity to be heard, after which time the appeal committee shall either:
 - (a) Confirm the original decision made by the General Manager, on such terms and conditions as the appeal committee may determine;
 - (b) Refer the matter back to the General Manager and direct the General Manager to reconsider the matter having regard to such considerations or directions as the appeal committee may recommend; or
 - (c) Direct the General Manager not to suspend the commercial dog walker permit.
 - (4) The commercial dog walker permit shall remain valid until a hearing is held.

- (5) If a commercial dog walker permit expires before an appeal is heard, and the appeal committee suspends the permit, the suspension shall apply to any new commercial dog walker permit that has been issued.
- D. Public Record of Notices and Suspensions.
 - (1) The City shall collect and maintain the following documents, including any personal information contained therein, specifically for the purpose of creating and maintaining a record available to the general public:
 - (a) Written notices of pending suspensions;
 - (b) Requests for hearing, including grounds of appeal and appellant's contact information;
 - (c) All submissions filed with respect to hearings before the appeal committee;
 - (d) The General Manager's report to the appeal committee, including:
 - [1] The General Manager's decision;
 - [2] Reasons for the suspension of the permit; and
 - [3] Any recommendations to the appeal committee.
 - (e) Decisions of the appeal committee;
 - (f) Suspended permits;
 - (g) Hearing lists; and
 - (h) Schedules of hearings.
 - (2) The City shall provide access to the notices of suspension issued and suspended permits, through publishing a record of this information on its website.
- E. Fees.

A person requesting a hearing before the appeal committee shall pay the non-refundable fee set out in Chapter 441, Fees and Charges, payable in advance, for the processing of the request for hearing.

Attachment #3

Commercial Dog Walker Permit Appeal Committee Amendments to Municipal Code Chapter 608, Parks.

The following shall be added to Chapter 608, Parks after Section 608-34.2:

608-34.3 Commercial Dog Walker Permit Appeal Committee.

A. Creation of a Committee.

A Commercial Dog Walker Permit Appeal Committee is constituted for the City of Toronto for the purpose of holding hearings with respect to the proposed suspension of a commercial dog walker permit.

- B. Composition.
 - (1) The appeal committee shall consist of three members composed of:
 - (a) The Manager of Animal Services, Municipal Licensing & Standards;
 - (b) The Manager of Policy & Planning Services, Municipal Licensing & Standards; and
 - (c) The Project Manager of the Clean & Beautiful Secretariat, Transportation Services.
 - (2) The Manager of Policy & Planning Services, Municipal Licensing & Standards, shall be the chair of the Committee.
- C. Quorum.

The majority of appeal committee members constitute a quorum.

- D. Delegation of Responsibilities.
 - (1) The responsibilities of the appeal committee shall be solely to:
 - (a) Consider staff recommendations and hear submissions by commercial dog walker permit holders with respect to any appeal of a notice to suspend a commercial dog walker permit under Article VI; and
 - (b) Make final binding decisions with respect to the suspension of commercial dog walker permits.

- (2) The authority to make final decisions with respect to the matters in Subsection (1) is delegated to the appeal committee.
- E. Procedures.

The appeal committee is a quasi-judicial body that conducts itself in accordance with the *Statutory Powers Procedure Act*.

F. Open hearings.

The hearings before the appeal committee shall be held as hearings open to the public, except that where meetings may be closed to the public under the *City of Toronto Act, 2006*, the hearings before the appeal committee may also be closed.