



STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

Outcome of St. Lawrence Market North Design Competition

Date:	June 10, 2010
To:	Executive Committee
From:	Chief Corporate Officer
Wards:	Ward 28 Toronto-Centre Rosedale
Reference Number:	P:\2010\Internal Services\RE\Ec10040re – (AFS #12024)

SUMMARY

This report recommends that Council endorse the winning design, as selected by the Competition Jury, for the St. Lawrence Market North design competition and that Council award a contract to the winning design team to provide professional architectural services for the detailed design and construction of a new North Market building.

The “Red Team” design, by the firm of Adamson Associates Architects and Rogers Stirk Harbour + Partners, was selected by the Competition Jury as the winner.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Chief Corporate Officer recommends that:

1. City Council endorse the decision of the St. Lawrence Market North Building Design Competition Jury, which unanimously selected the “Red Team” design proposed by the firm of Adamson Associates Architects and Rogers Stirk Harbour + Partners as the winner of the St. Lawrence Market North Design Competition.

2. City Council authorize the Chief Corporate Officer to enter into and execute an agreement with Adamson Associates Architects and Rogers Stirk Harbour + Partners, to provide professional architectural services, based on a proposed fee not to exceed \$5.26 million (excluding applicable taxes) for the new St. Lawrence Market North building, which is accommodated in the 2010 Capital Budget and 2011-2019 Capital Plan, on terms and conditions satisfactory to the Chief Corporate Officer and in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor.

3. The appropriate City Officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

Financial Impact

Project Costs

At its meeting of December 8, 2009, City Council approved the 2010 Capital Budget and 2011-2019 Capital Plan, which included funding for the redevelopment of the St. Lawrence Market North property with the following cash flows:

	2010 \$ million	2011 \$ million	2012 \$ million	2013 \$ million	2014 \$ million	Total \$ million
2010 Capital Budget and 2011-2019 Capital Plan	1.0	13.254	23.409	23.984	13.243	74.89

As stated in the Competition Brief, the estimated construction cost of the new North Market building was \$58.1 million (in 2009 dollars). The overall project cost contained in the 2011-2019 Capital Plan was \$74.89 million (in 2009 dollars). Short listed competitors in Stage II were required to make submissions within the estimated construction budget limitations, and to provide detailed construction cost estimates prepared by independent cost consultants. Adamson Associates Architects and Rogers Stirk Harbour + Partners have verified a construction cost of \$59.0 million in 2010 dollars.

The proposed fee for professional architectural services is up to 8.25% of the construction cost estimate for the new St. Lawrence Market North building, which is accommodated in the 2010 Capital Budget and 2011-2019 Capital Plan. This fee excludes applicable taxes. The fee is based on a scope of work that includes detail design development and construction documents. The fee does not include specialist consultants typically retained by an owner such as cost consultants, heritage consultants and geotechnical engineers.

The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

At its meeting of December 10, 2008, City Council endorsed the strategy to redevelop the St. Lawrence Market North property with a new multi-storey building, and it authorized the Chief Corporate Officer to conduct a Two Stage design competition.

ISSUE BACKGROUND

The redevelopment strategy for the St. Lawrence Market North property consists of a new building with three components:

- a) A Ground Floor Market Hall and Mezzanine;
- b) Court Services court rooms and administrative offices on the second, third and fourth floors; and
- c) a multi-level underground parking garage under the jurisdiction of the Toronto Parking Authority (TPA).

City staff and the St. Lawrence Market North Working Committee (which consists of representatives from key community stakeholders) considered a number of ideas for ensuring architectural design excellence for the new building and recommended a Two Stage design competition that would be administered by a Professional Advisor.

COMMENTS

Design Competition

In March 2009, the City retained a Professional Advisor, architect Peter Berton, OAA, of the Ventin Group, under a Request for Proposals process. Mr. Berton and City staff jointly administered the Design Competition, and Mr. Berton was the sole official contact with the Jury and competitors.

On November 12, 2009, the City launched the design competition with a Competition Brief that contained a formal set of submission requirements as well as site and design criteria. In Stage I of the Competition, eligible architects were invited to submit an Expression of Interest. The City received 30 Expressions of Interest from architectural firms across Canada, the United States and Europe.

From these Stage I Expressions of Interest, a qualified selection committee consisting of City staff and the Professional Advisor selected a short-list of five firms to proceed to Stage II of the competition to prepare schematic designs to be evaluated by the jury.

On February 3, 2010 the City announced the following short-listed firms/partnerships:

- Adamson Associates Architects and Rogers Stirk Harbour + Partners
- Cohos Evamy + Hotson Bakker Boniface Haden Architects + Urbanistes
- Kuwabara Payne McKenna Blumberg Architects
- NORR Limited Architects Engineers Planners
- Taylor Hazell Architects and Montgomery Sisam Architects

Immediately after announcing the short-listed firms/partnerships, the City also announced the names of the Competition Jury. The Jury consisted of seven members with experience and knowledge of issues relating to architecture, heritage, sustainability and energy efficiency, fresh food markets and the arts:

- Christine Couvelier, Culinary Concierge, Victoria, British Columbia
- Dr. Ron Dembo, zerofootprint, Toronto, Ontario
- William Greer, heritage consultant and architect, Toronto, Ontario
- Andrea Leers, Leers Weinzapfel Associates Architects, Boston, Massachusetts
- Peter Ortved, CS&P Architects Inc., Toronto, Ontario
- Russell Smith, author, Toronto, Ontario
- Claire Weisz, WXY Architecture, New York, New York

On the closing date for Stage II of the competition, April 28, 2010, the City received submissions from all five short-listed teams. The Stage II submissions were then reviewed by a Technical Advisory Committee consisting of City staff, supported by a building programming consultant and a cost consultant.

On May 7-9, 2010, the City held a public exhibit of the five Stage II design submissions in the Great Hall of St. Lawrence Hall. The five submissions were also posted on the City's web site. Both the live and on-line exhibits were well received and visited by thousands, and in both venues, the City encouraged the general public to provide its comments, observations and suggestions. More than 1,200 individual responses were received, all demonstrating a high level of engagement and care on the part of the community. A summary of all comments was submitted to the Competition Jury for its review and consideration.

The five designs were all colour coded (red, orange, yellow, green and blue) for anonymity. A double-blind system was utilized to ensure City staff, the Professional Advisor, the Competition Jury and the general public did not know the authorship of any of the designs.

On May 18 and 19, 2010, the Professional Advisor and Competition Jury met to review and examine all five Stage II submissions. The Competition Jury were assisted in their review by the comments of the Technical Advisory Committee, and City staff were available to answer any questions or provide requested information. The members discussed, debated and evaluated the five submissions in accordance with the submission requirements and the site and design criteria set out in the Competition Brief.

The Professional Advisor's Jury Report (issued on June 7, 2010), describes the jury's findings with respect to each of the submissions

The Winning Design

The Competition Jury unanimously selected the Red design as the winning design, for the following reasons:

- Of all the schemes, this scheme was the most successful at solving the struggles between “Civic Architecture” and “Market Architecture” and identified this building as a Market Building that engages the street with a Courthouse above it.
- The structure of the building modulates a large space and encourages visitors to the building to travel through the length of the building to the north end to connect to the St. Lawrence Hall. It also creates flexible spaces on both the main level and the mezzanine level for use as a performance space or for smaller gatherings. The market floor is also divisible using the column grid and screening systems.
- This scheme had the clearest and most effective urban design solutions successfully linking all three buildings. The plan opens the market to the streets and public spaces on three sides which was an important element for the users of the building. This effectively creates an indoor street through a Market.
- The façade is broken into manageable proportions and has a simple structural grid. The scale, texture and context are in keeping with the Architecture of the district, including the historical precedents. The original market building on this site had similar proportions to this building making this scheme better suited to the area and to a market building.

The Jury's full set of comments is contained in its report dated June 7, 2010, attached to this report as Attachment 1.

The Jury Report contains the following recommendations for developing the winning design:

- The new market building should engage the south façade of St. Lawrence Hall and bring it into the building.
- A much larger arrival space will be required on the ground floor for the courts and perhaps a public stair. Court entry on the Market Lane Park side would allow for queuing.
- Courtroom planning should be revised to avoid side entry to the courtrooms.

- Roof structure is overly complicated, and the green roof is inaccessible and should be simplified to integrate the green roof for serviceability and accessibility, but the high sloped ceilings and access to natural light in the courtrooms was seen to be a very positive aspect and should be maintained.
- Private Corridor access for the Justice of Peace requires further development.
- The corner staircase acts as a gateway to the city, and requires more space.
- The materials of the building should be reconsidered to be a little less polished in this urban fabric.
- Security screening systems, circulation and queuing areas need to be carefully developed, and likely enlarged. The architects will need to work closely with City staff to improve all of the functionality
- The louvre system should be re-thought and developed to overcome the maintenance and service aspects, as well as the opportunity for bird roosting.
- The loading for the building needs to be revised to meet the Zoning by-law and the technical requirements of Transportation Services.
- The scale of the building appeared to be somewhat monumental. The architects should work with the City to look at ways to reduce the scale along Jarvis Street.

The Winning Design Team

Adamson Associates Architects

With 75 years in practice, Adamson Associates Architects has a history of good management, excellent design and innovative teamwork since 1934. The firm is a fully integrated architectural operation with offices in Toronto, New York, Los Angeles, London, the UK and Abu Dhabi.

Adamson has received numerous design awards and recognitions of the years including the Governor General's Medal for Architecture, Massey Medals, Urban Design and OAA awards. Adamson's experience in sustainable design includes 9 completed LEED certified projects with others soon on the way to be certified.

Rogers Stirk Harbour + Partners

Based in London, Rogers Stirk Harbour + Partners (RSHP) was established in 1977 and over three decades has attracted critical acclaim and won dozens of awards including the Stirling Prize 2009 for Maggie's London, the Stirling Prize 2006 for Terminal 5, Madrid Barajas Airport and the Manser Medal in 2008 for the Oxley Woods energy efficient housing scheme in Milton Keynes, UK.

CONCLUSION

Upon Council approval and an executed agreement with Adamson Associates Architects and Rogers Stirk Harbour + Partners, project costs will be reviewed with affected City Divisions and the Toronto Parking Authority. City staff and internal stakeholders will participate in the design development.

CONTACT

Anne Milchberg, Manager
Real Estate Services
Tel: (416) 397-4437
Fax: (416) 392-4828

SoMei Quan, Project Manager
Real Estate Services
(416) 397-5812
(416) 392-4828

SIGNATURE

Bruce Bowes, P. Eng
Chief Corporate Officer

Attachment 1 – Jury Report (June 7, 2010), prepared by Ventin Group Architects