

November 16, 2009

To: Parks and Environment Committee

From: Board of Health

Subject: Update on the Metrolinx Georgetown South Service Expansion and Union-Pearson Rail Link
Board of Health Item HL26.3

The Board of Health on November 16, 2009, amongst other things, forwarded the report (November 2, 2009) from the Medical Officer of Health, entitled "Update on the Metrolinx Georgetown South Service Expansion and Union-Pearson Rail Link" to the Parks and Environment Committee for information.

Decision Advice and Other Information:

The Toronto Board of Health on November 16, 2009, directed that:

1. The Ontario Minister of the Environment be requested to ask Metrolinx to defer purchasing diesel locomotives for any part of the proposed Georgetown South Expansion and Air-Rail Link until the following information is made available for public consideration and comment, and review by the Minister:
 - a. all additional studies, analyses and public consultation related to the development of a revised mitigation plan to address risks to human health, and an ambient air monitoring and reporting plan, as required by the Ontario Minister of the Environment in his October 5, 2009 "Notice to proceed with transit project subject to conditions";
 - b. a Health Impact Assessment as part of Condition 5 (to "conduct further studies and analyses in order to supplement the information contained in the Environmental Project Report (EPR) related to predicted human health risks"), conducted in consultation with the Medical Officer of Health, which examines the distribution in the community of risks and benefits from the proposed rail expansion, and takes into account pre-existing gradients in health status;
 - c. a monitoring program for ultrafine particulate matter (PM0.1) that characterizes baseline concentrations and concentration gradients; and
 - d. the results and any advice from the planned GO System Electrification Study.



2. Metrolinx be urged to strengthen the planned GO System Electrification Study by:
 - a. developing a risk analysis framework for integrating the environmental, health, social and economic impacts associated with each train technology option that is explicit, and open to public review;
 - b. broadening the assessment of health impacts associated with train technology options from the quantitative human health risk assessment (HHRA) approach used in the Georgetown South study to one that encompasses Health Impact Assessment (HIA) methods; and
 - c. comparing the total cost of train expansion options between investing in electrification now versus use of Tier 4 compliant diesel technology as an interim strategy, with electrification later.
3. The Ontario Minister of the Environment be requested to put the following information on the Environmental Registry in order to increase transparency and enforceability of the conditions specified in the Minister's October 5, 2009 Notice regarding Metrolinx' proposed train expansion:
 - a. the health assessment, air monitoring, air modelling studies and mitigation plans, required in conditions 5, 7, 8, 11, 13 and 16; and
 - b. the results of the GO System Electrification Study, given that condition 4 indicates that Metrolinx should make available to the public any consideration of the use of new technologies that become commercially available and that could reduce air emissions from the trains.
4. The Environmental Commissioner of Ontario (ECO) be requested to give consideration to making a special report to the Speaker of the Assembly on the public process employed by Metrolinx, and the environmental significance of technology choices such as diesel expansion versus electrification of the commuter rail system.
5. This report be forwarded to:
 - a. the Clean Train Coalition, the Environmental Health Association of Ontario, the Mount Dennis Community Association and the Weston Community Coalition;
 - b. the Medical Officers of Health for Halton and Peel Regions;
 - c. the Ontario Ministers of Health and Long-Term Care, and Transportation;
 - d. the Toronto District School Board and Toronto Catholic District School Board;
 - e. the Environmental Commissioner of Ontario;
 - f. the Premier of Ontario;
 - g. the Members of Parliament and Members of Provincial Parliament for the Metrolinx Study Area; and

- h. the Federal Ministers of the Environment and Transportation.
- 6. This report be forwarded to the Parks and Environment Committee for information.
- 7. The Medical Officer of Health be requested to prepare a response to the November 13, 2009, correspondence from Metrolinx and to identify the extent to which the Medical Officer of Health's recommendations are addressed, including how noise impacts could be dealt with in the electrification study, and to make this response available to members of the Board of Health, community groups and deputants.
- 8. The Chairs of the Board of Health and the Parks and Environment Committee be requested to consider holding a public forum to be held in the Council Chamber as soon as possible; and that they invite the Minister of the Environment or his designate, and the President and CEO of Metrolinx to attend this meeting and hear more speakers on this issue.

Background:

The Toronto Board of Health on November 16, 2009, considered a report (November 2, 2009) from the Medical Officer of Health, entitled "Update on the Metrolinx Georgetown South Service Expansion and Union-Pearson Rail Link".

Background Information:

hl26.3 - Update on the Metrolinx Georgetown South Service Expansion and Union-Pearson Rail Link - Staff Report

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-25065.pdf>)

hl26.3 - Attachment - Letter from the Ontario Minister of the Environment

(<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/hl/bgrd/backgroundfile-25066.pdf>)

Communications:

November 9, 2009) Letter from Professor Elizabeth Littlejohn, Communication, Culture and Information Technology, Sheridan Institute of Technology and Advanced Learning (HL.New.HL26.3.1)

(November 12, 2009) Letter from Councillor Frances Nunziata, Ward 11 - York South-Weston (HL.New.HL26.3.2)

(November 13, 2009) Letter from Karen Pitre, Project Director, Electrification Study, Metrolinx (HL.New.HL26.3.3)

(November 13, 2009) Letter from Alan Tonks, M.P., York South-Weston (HL.New.HL26.3.4)

(November 14, 2009) Submission from Susan Peschken (HL.New.HL26.3.5)

(November 16, 2009) Submission from Dr. Jeff Sole and Dr. Marissa Heisel, Vice-Chair, Fern Avenue Public School Council and Secretary, Ferncliff Daycare Board of Directors (HL.New.HL26.3.6)

(November 16, 2009) Submission from Glenn Sernyk, West Diamond Leaders Group (HL.New.HL26.3.7)

(October 30, 2009) Submission from The West Toronto Diamond Community Group (HL.New.HL26.3.8)

(October 22, 2009) Letter from Alissa Sugar, Special Project Officer, Environmental Assessment and Approvals Branch, Ministry of the Environment (HL.New.HL26.3.9)

(November 16, 2009) Letter from Professor Elizabeth Littlejohn, Communication, Culture and Information Technology, Sheridan Institute of Technology and Advanced

Learning (HL.Main.HL26.3.10)

(November 9, 2009) Submission from Reverend Lance Dixon, Incumbent and Minister, St. Anne's Anglican Church (HL.New.HL26.3.11)

(November 16, 2009) Submission from Scott Dobson (HL.New.HL26.3.12)

(November 16, 2009) Presentation from Medical Officer of Health (HL.New.HL26.3.13)

(November 16, 2009) Submission from Karl Junkin (HL.New.HL26.3.14)

Speakers:

Dr. David McKeown, Medical Officer of Health, gave a presentation

Suri Weinberg-Linsky, Weston Community Coalition and Clean Train Coalition

Professor Elizabeth Littlejohn, Communication, Culture and Information Technology, Sheridan Institute of Technology and Advanced Learning

Lin Grist, Environmental Health Association of Ontario and Clean Train Coalition

Scott Dobson

Catherine Kormendy, Co-Chair, Outreach, Clean Train Coalition

Karl Junkin, Clean Air Coalition

Rob Fairley

Rick Ciccarelli, Mount Dennis Community Association

Councillor Adam Vaughan, Ward 20 - Trinity-Spadina

Secretary,
Board of Health

C. Davidovits/gs

Item HL26.3
Attachment

c. Medical Officer of Health