

## STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

# 17 Dundonald Street – Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act

Date:	April 1, 2010	
То:	Toronto Preservation Board Toronto and East York Community Council	
From:	Acting Director, Policy & Research, City Planning Division	
Wards:	Toronto Centre-Rosedale – Ward 27	
Reference Number:		

## SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council include the property at 17 Dundonald Street (Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building) on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties and state its intention to designate the site under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

In a letter dated January 29, 2010, Councillor Kyle Rae requested that Heritage Preservation Services assess the heritage merits of the property at 17 Dundonald Street. Following research and evaluation, staff have determined that the property meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the criteria prescribed by the Province of Ontario for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

## The City Planning Division recommends that:

- 1. City Council include the property at 17 Dundonald Street (Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building) on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties.
- 2. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 17 Dundonald Street (Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building) under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

- 3. If there are no objections to the designation in accordance with Section 29(6) of the Ontario Heritage Act, City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce the bills in Council designating the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
- 4. If there are objections in accordance with Section 29(7) of the Ontario Heritage Act, City Council direct the City Clerk to refer the proposed designation to the Conservation Review Board.
- 5. If the proposed designation is referred to the Conservation Review Board, City Council authorize the City Solicitor and any appropriate staff to attend any hearing held by the Conservation Review Board in support of Council's decision on the proposed designation of the property.

## **Financial Impact**

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report. The public Notice of Intention to Designate will be advertised on the City's web site in accordance with the City of Toronto Act provisions.

## **ISSUE BACKGROUND**

In a letter dated January 29, 2010 (Attachment No. 5) Councillor Kyle Rae requested Heritage Preservation Services to assess the potential cultural heritage value of the property at 17 Dundonald Street, and to complete the assessment prior to the May 2010 meeting of the Toronto Preservation Board.

## COMMENTS

Staff have completed the attached Heritage Property Research and Evaluation Report (Attachment No. 4) for the property at 17 Dundonald Street. As a result of this assessment, staff have determined that the property meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the criteria prescribed for municipal designation, for its design and contextual value. The property at 17 Dundonald Street contains a 2½ storey office building that was completed in 1956 for the Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada.

The Reasons for Designation (Statement of Significance) are found in Attachment No. 3. The property at 17 Dundonald Street is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value, and meets the criteria prescribed by the Province of Ontario for municipal designation under the categories of design and contextual value. As a small-scaled office building, the Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building (1956) is an early and representative example of the Modern style with design merit that through its scale supports and maintains the prevailing character of Dundonald Street as the location of low-rise buildings. A location map (Attachment No. 1) and photographs (Attachment No. 2) are attached. The Reasons for Designation (Statement of Significance) are intended to be posted on the City of Toronto's web site and served on the owners of 17 Dundonald Street and on the Ontario Heritage Trust according to the provisions of the Ontario Heritage Act. The Reasons for Designation (Statement of Significance) include a statement of the cultural heritage value of the property with a description of its heritage attributes.

## CONTACT

Mary L. MacDonald, Acting Manager Heritage Preservation Services Tel: 416-338-1079 Fax: 416-392-1973 E-mail: <u>mmacdon7@toronto.ca</u>

## SIGNATURE

Kerri A. Voumvakis, Acting Director Policy and Research City Planning Division

## **ATTACHMENTS**

Attachment No. 1 – Location Map Attachment No. 2 – Photographs Attachment No. 3 – Reasons for Designation (Statement of Significance) Attachment No. 4 – Heritage Property Research and Evaluation Report

[P:\2010\Cluster B\PLN\HPS\TEYCC\te 05 25 10\teHPS07]



The **arrow** marks the location of the site.

This location map is for information purposes only; the exact boundaries of the property are <u>not</u> shown.

## PHOTOGRAPHS: 17 DUNDONALD STREET

## ATTACHMENT NO. 2



Principal (north) façade (left) and west elevation (right)



East elevation (left) and principal (north) façade (right)

## REASONS FOR DESIGNATION: 17 DUNDONALD STREET ATTACHMENT NO. 3 (STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE) Page 1 of 2

## **Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building**

## Description

The property at 17 Dundonald Street is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value, and meets the criteria for municipal designation prescribed by the Province of Ontario under the categories of design and contextual value. The Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building (1956) is a 2½-storey office building that was designed by the Toronto architectural firm of Weir, Cripps and Associates.

#### Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

The Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building is an early and representative example of a small-scaled and well-designed office building that displays Modern styling from the period after World War II when the Modern Movement in architecture was gaining popularity in Toronto. Its design is distinguished by the gridlike pattern of solids and voids where the application of concrete, glazed brick, aluminum, travertine with expanses of glass are characteristic of early Modern architecture.

Contextually, the Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building through its scale supports and maintains the dominant character of Dundonald Street where low-rise buildings make up the balance of the streetscape. The Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building was carefully-designed to respect the scale and integrity of Dundonald Street, which retains much of its early 20<sup>th</sup> century appearance as a residential subdivision northeast of Yonge and Wellesley streets.

#### Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes of the property at 17 Dundonald Street are:

- The 2<sup>1</sup>/<sub>2</sub>-storey office building
- The scale, form and massing
- The near-square plan under a flat roof, where the basement half-storey is set back on the east, north and west sides
- The cladding, employing concrete, turquoise-hued glazed brick, travertine, aluminium and glass
- On the principal (north) façade, the organization of the wall into four bays where concrete piers divide tiers of strip windows with travertine spandrels and panels
- The placement of the main entrance on the north façade in the recessed and glazed west (right) bay, where double doors are protected by a projecting and angled canopy

#### 17 Dundonald Street

- The side elevations (east and west), which are divided into five bays, with the outer bays filled with glazed brick and the centre bays repeating the fenestration from the north façade
- The rear (south) wall, where one of the four bays is brick-clad, and a secondary entrance is found
- The placement of the building on the south side of Dundonald Street where a small landscaped forecourt separates it from the street

#### ATTACHMENT NO. 4

## HERITAGE PROPERTY RESEARCH AND EVALUATION REPORT



## **COMMERCIAL TRAVELERS ASSOCIATION OF CANADA BUILDING** 17 DUNDONALD STREET, TORONTO

Prepared by:

Heritage Preservation Services City Planning Division City of Toronto

March 2010

#### 1. DESCRIPTION



Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building, west elevation, c. 1960 (Source: <u>Fashioned by Clay, Hardened by Fire</u>)

17 Dundonald Street: Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building				
ADDRESS	17 Dundonald Street (south side, east of Yonge Street)			
WARD	27 (Toronto Centre-Rosedale)			
LEGAL DESCRIPTION	Plan 250, Part Lot 7 and Lot 8			
NEIGHBOURHOOD/COMMUNITY	Not applicable			
HISTORICAL NAME	Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building			
CONSTRUCTION DATE	1956 (completed)			
ORIGINAL OWNER	Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada			
ORIGINAL USE	Commercial (office building)			
CURRENT USE*	Commercial (office building)			
	* This does not refer to permitted use(s) as defined by the			
	Zoning By-law			
ARCHITECT/BUILDER/DESIGNER	Weir, Cripps and Associates, architects			
DESIGN/CONSTRUCTION	Steel and concrete construction with glazed brick,			
	travertine, aluminum and glass details			
ARCHITECTURAL STYLE	Modern			
ADDITIONS/ALTERATIONS	Signage replaced			
CRITERIA	Design/Physical & Contextual			
HERITAGE STATUS	cultural heritage evaluation			
RECORDER	Heritage Preservation Services: Kathryn Anderson			
REPORT DATE	March 2010			

#### 2. BACKGROUND

This research and evaluation report describes the history, architecture and context of the Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building at 17 Dundonald Street, and applies evaluation criteria to determine whether the property has cultural heritage value. The conclusions of the research and evaluation are found in section 4 (Summary).

## i. HISTORICAL TIMELINE

Key Date	Historical Event
1955 July-Aug	Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada (CTAC) purchases the
	properties at 17-21 Dundonald Street
1955 Sept 6	Standard Wrecking Company files an application to demolish two detached
_	buildings at 17 and 19 Dundonald Street <sup>1</sup>
1955 Sept 21	Specifications are prepared by Weir, Cripps and Associates, architects, for the
_	CTAC Building, followed by a building application in October 1955
1955 Nov	Application is made to excavate the foundations at 17 Dundonald Street
1956 Nov	CTAC Building is first recorded in the tax assessment rolls

#### ii. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

#### **Dundonald Street**

The property at 17 Dundonald Street is located in the area northeast of Yonge Street and Wellesley Street East, which originated in the late 18<sup>th</sup> century as Park Lot 8, one of the series of allotments extending between present-day Queen and Bloor Streets and the Don and Humber Rivers that were awarded to supporters of the provincial government. In the 1840s, Bank of Upper Canada president William Proudfoot acquired part of the lot east of Yonge Street as the location of his country residence named "Kearnsey House." Donald McKay purchased the site in 1869, renaming the house "Dundonald." The building was razed in 1904 when developer Frank McMahon registered a residential subdivision bounded by Yonge, Wellesley, Church and Gloucester streets. Dundonald Street was extended through the tract and the lots abutting it were built up with detached, semi-detached and row houses.

After World War II, the neighbourhoods adjoining Yonge Street north of the Financial District were gradually transformed as commercial buildings, formerly relegated to the main thoroughfare, began to migrate along the side streets. The area was also impacted by the Yonge Street Subway, which was under construction between Union Station and Eglinton Avenue prior to its official opening in 1954. In the section north of Wellesley Street East, the subway tunnel ran east of and parallel to Yonge, with the Wellesley Station completed above grade.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> According to the tax assessment rolls, the Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada initially retained and rented out #21 Dundonald

## Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building

The building at 17 Dundonald Street was commissioned by the Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada, which was incorporated in 1874 as a benevolent society supporting commercial Travellers'. In the late 19<sup>th</sup> century, a commercial traveller was defined as "a man, whether employer or employee, who travels statedly as a salesman for a wholesale business to take orders from dealers or manufacturers for goods which shall be sent afterward."<sup>2</sup> In seeking the "moral, intellectual and financial improvement and advancement and welfare of its members,"<sup>3</sup> the organization sought concessions from railway companies for fares and baggage, and established a mutual benefit society for life insurance and support for widows and orphans. Membership in the association declined in the 1960s, with 25,000 enrolled twenty years later. In 1991, it was renamed the Canadian Professional Sales Association (CPSA) to reflect its evolution as an organization representing sales and marketing professionals, including entrepreneurs, sales managers and sales representatives.

The headquarters of the Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada was established in Toronto, where the organization had offices at 51 Yonge Street. In 1955, the association purchased property on Dundonald Street as the location of its boardroom and tenanted offices, filing a series of building applications to begin construction that fall. The building was occupied by November 1956 when the tax assessment rolls were compiled. The original tenants included Farlinger Development Limited and Farlinger and Langer Limited, headed by realtors A. W. Farlinger and Peter Langer. During the period the company was based at 17 Dundonald Street, Farlinger headed a cooperative of five firms in the development of Bayview Village, the planned community located on the former Eglinton Hunt Club lands northeast of Bayview Avenue and Sheppard Ave East.

#### Weir, Cripps and Associates, Architects

The Toronto architectural practice of Weir, Cripps and Associates designed the Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building at 17 Dundonald Street according to specifications dated September 1955. The firm was founded in 1952 by John Weir, who trained at the University of Toronto's School of Architecture, and Robert G. Cripps, a graduate of Montreal's McGill University. While many architects of the Modern Movement gained recognition for the skyscrapers that began to dominate Toronto's skyline, Weir and Cripps specialized in small-scaled, carefully-crafted Modern designs that utilized the building technologies and contemporary materials of the era.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Mackenzie, H. F., and Anna Fredericks, <u>From Early Commercial Travellers' to Professional Salespeople,</u> ASAC 2004, unpaged

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> ibid

The commission from the Commercial Travellers' Association coincided with the partnership's expansion in 1955 when it moved to new quarters and increased its staff.<sup>4</sup> During the 1950s and 1960s, Weir, Cripps and Associates prepared plans for all types of buildings, including factories, churches, hospitals, schools and offices, which were built in communities throughout Ontario. One of the firm's later commissions was for the expansion of Forest Grove United Church in Bayview Village, the development overseen by one of the original occupants of the Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building. The Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building, along with another of the architects' designs on Woodlawn Avenue East, was featured in the Toronto Brick Company's publication, Fashioned from Clay, Hardened by Fire.<sup>5</sup>

#### ii. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

The Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building is designed in the Modern style "that reached Canada tentatively in the 1930s and became firmly entrenched in the 1950s."<sup>6</sup> The Modern Movement in architecture represented a break with historical styles, rejecting the applied ornament associated with the past and embracing contemporary building technology, engineering and construction materials. Modern designs were identified by their angular edges and plain surfaces where large expanses of glass were expressed in skeletons of steel or reinforced concrete. The style's appearance and gradual acceptance in Canada coincided with this country's building boom after World War II.

Rising two stories above a partially exposed basement that is recessed on the east, north and west elevations, the Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building features a concrete structural frame with glazed brick panels and a curtain walls with travertine, aluminum and glass details. The carefully executed design features a grid of solids and voids beneath a flat roof. On the principal (north) façade on Dundonald Street, the wall is arranged in four bays. The right (west) section is inset and fully glazed, with the main entrance to the building placed at ground level. A pair of double aluminum and glass doors is set in a glazed surround beneath a projecting and angled canopy. East (left) of the entry, the remaining three bays step forward between piers that extend from the ground to the roofline. The vertical emphasis of the concrete frame is countered by the banks of strip window openings, where travertine is applied for the spandrels beneath the first and second floors and the panels above the upper storey.

The east and west elevations are arranged in five bays, with the outer sections composed of solid sections of turquoise-hued glazed brick that are outlined in concrete. In the centre three bays, concrete piers organize the tiers of strip window openings and travertine spandrels and panels. The rear (south) wall is viewed from the passageway

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> "Real Estate," <u>Toronto Daily Star</u> (30 Apr 1955), 14

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The publication is undated, but a copy in the collection of the Toronto Reference Library is datestamped October 1960. A photograph from that publication is reproduced on page two of this Heritage Property Research and Evaluation Report and, in a larger image, in Section 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Kalman, 779

that extends along the east side of the Wellesley (Subway) Station from Wellesley Street East to Dundonald Street. It reverses the design of the north façade by featuring a solid brick wall in the left (west) bay beside the three glazed bays, and incorporates a rear entrance at grade.

## iii. CONTEXT

The Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building is located on the south side of Dundonald Street, east of Yonge Street, where a shallow landscaped courtyard separates it from the street. While there has been infill development along both sides of Dundonald Street between Yonge and Church streets, the majority of the structures remain low-rise house form buildings dating to the early 20<sup>th</sup> century when the area was registered as a subdivision. The Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building fits into the streetscape with its scale and massing that reflects the residential heights in the area. Directly southwest of the subject property, the Wellesley Station at 16 Wellesley Street East is recognized on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties as one of the few above-ground stations built on the Yonge Street Subway line.<sup>7</sup>

## 3. EVALUATION CHECKLIST

The following evaluation applies <u>Ontario Regulation 9/06 made under the Ontario</u> <u>Heritage Act: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest</u>. While the criteria are prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, the City of Toronto uses it when assessing properties for inclusion on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties. The evaluation table is marked "N/A" if the criterion is "not applicable" to the property or X if it is applicable, with explanatory text below.

Design or Physical Value	
i. rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method	X
ii. displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	Х
iii. demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement	N/A

**Representative and Early Example** – The Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building is an early and representative example of a small-scaled office building designed during the era when Modern-styled buildings were new to Toronto. Its diminutive design is distinguished by the grid-like pattern of solids and voids, using glazed brick, travertine and other materials that are characteristic of the Modern Movement in architecture.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The Rosedale Station, set in a park-like setting on Crescent Road where the building straddles the opencut line, is designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act

Historical or Associative Value	
i. direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or	
institution that is significant to a community	
ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an	N/A
understanding of a community or culture	
iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder,	N/A
designer or theorist who is significant to a community	

Contextual Value	
i. important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area	X
ii. physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings	N/A
iii. landmark	N/A

**Area Character** – Through its scale, the Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada Building maintains and supports the prevailing character of Dundonald as the setting of low-rise buildings, including the series of surviving house forms dating from the early 20<sup>th</sup> century that remain on both sides of the street. The subject property anchors the west end of a group of low-scale buildings that contribute to Dundonald Street's appearance as part of a primarily low-rise residential neighbourhood northeast of Yonge and Wellesley streets.

## 4. SUMMARY

Following research and evaluation according to Regulation 9/06, it has been determined that the property at 17 Dundonald Street has cultural heritage value for its design and contextual significance as a well-designed example of Modern styling applied to a 1950s office building that was commissioned by the Commercial Travellers' Association of Canada. Located on the south side of Dundonald Street, east of Yonge, through its scale the building assists in maintaining the character of the street as one of primarily low-rise structures, many of which date to the early 20<sup>th</sup> century when the area was established as a residential subdivision.

## 5. SOURCES

## Archival Sources

Abstract Indices of Deeds, Plan 250E, Lot 41, Part Lot 42 and Lot 43
Assessment Rolls, City of Toronto, Ward 3, Division 7B, 1955-5
Building Application #35102, October 6, 1955, Commercial Travellers' Association Building, 17 Dundonald Street
Building Applications #35853 and #35854, November 24, 1955, steel stairs and foundation, 17 Dundonald Street
Building Specifications #35404, September 21, 1955, Weir, Cripps and Associates, 17 Dundonald Street
City of Toronto Directories, 1950-1960 Demolition application #34480, September 6, 1955, 17-19 Dundonald Street Goad's Atlases, 1880 ff. Panda Photographs, Canadian Architectural Archives Plan 250E, June 21, 1904

**Books and Periodicals** 

Boyd, C. Adams, ed., <u>Fashioned from Clay, Hardened by Fire</u>, c.1960
"Carling Breweries," <u>The Canadian Architect</u> (June 1959), 42-49
"Commercial Travellers' Building," <u>Journal</u>, Royal Architectural Institute of Canada (June 1956), illustration, 235
Lundell, Liz, <u>The Estates of Old Toronto</u>, 1997
MacKenzie, H. F., and Anna Fredericks, <u>From Early Commercial Travellers' to</u> <u>Professional Salespeople,</u>" ASAC, 2004
McHugh, Patricia, <u>Toronto Architecture: a city guide</u>, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed., 1989

#### Internet

"About Bayview Village", <u>www.thegerbergroup.com</u>

"Canadian Professional Sales Association,"

<u>www.linkedin.com/companies/canadian-professional-sales-association</u> "Forest Grove United Church, 50<sup>th</sup> Anniversary," <u>www.forestgroveuc.com</u>

#### Newspapers

"Chimney Bill for Architects," Toronto Daily Star (27 May 1960), 8

"Delay Tax Changes Until Details Known," <u>Toronto Star</u> (7 January 1982), A7

"\$54 Million Bayview Town to House 10,000," Toronto Daily Star (18 May 1954), 1

"Legal" (notices), <u>The Evening Star</u> (10 February 1894)

"Offers Rich a Monument If They'll Buy Up Power," <u>Toronto Daily Star</u> (19 December 1936), 3

"One-time President of Travellers' Dead," <u>Toronto Daily Star</u> (4 April 1931), 1 "Real Estate," <u>Toronto Daily Star</u> (30 April 1955),14

#### 6. IMAGES



Extract, <u>Goad's Atlas</u>, Plate 26, 1890, showing the "Dundonald" estate prior to subdivision



"Dundonald", which was demolished in the early 1900s when a residential subdivision was registered on the estate and Dundonald Street was laid out (source: Lundell, <u>The Estates of Old Toronto</u>, 1998, 53



Source: Fashioned from Clay, Hardened by Fire, c.1960



View of the principal (north) façade (right) and the east elevation (left)



Detailed view of the north entrance bay, March 2010

#### ATTACHMENT NO. 5



Dear Scott,

#### Re: 17 Dundonald St.

I am writing to request that Heritage Preservation Services assess the heritage merits of the building located at 17 Dundonald St. The building is reflective of when modernism arrived in culturally conservative Toronto in the 1950s and 60s. With its detailed geometry, lack of ornament, and glass-and-concrete facade, the structure is a fantastic example of mid-century modernism.

As such, I would like HPS to determine whether the building merits being listed on the City's heritage inventory.

I also request that the assessment be completed prior to the May meeting of the Heritage Preservation Board.

I remain,

9

Kyle Rae City Councillor