

Year-Round Enclosed Sidewalk Cafés

Date:	May 6, 2011
To:	Licensing and Standards Committee
From:	Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards
Wards:	Toronto and East York (Wards 14, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, and 32)
Reference Number:	P:\2011\Cluster B\MLS\LS11008

SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to outline the advantages and disadvantages of permitting boulevard cafés (patios) located on the public right-of-way (ROW) to operate all year and to assess the feasibility of a pilot project to be undertaken in the area covered by the former City of Toronto.

(Former) Toronto Municipal Code, Chapter 313, Streets and Sidewalks governs the processing of applications and issuance of permits for boulevard cafés on public property. The Chapter applies only to the city wards within former City of Toronto. The bylaw includes a number of restrictions and requirements that apply to enclosed, partially enclosed, and unenclosed boulevard cafés. Permitting a year-round operation of the patios would require amending certain provisions of Chapter 313 and drafting and finalizing inter-divisional operational protocols to process applications, particularly for enclosed boulevard cafés.

Toronto and East York Business Improvement Areas (BIAs) were invited to participate in the consultations. Staff also consulted with Toronto Transportations Services; Toronto Building, Fire Services; Municipal Licensing and Standards, and Licensing Services and Enforcement (the Road Allowance Unit).

The City Solicitor was consulted in the preparation of this report.

Financial Impact

This report will have no financial impact beyond what has already been approved in the current year's budget.

DECISION HISTORY

At its meeting of January 21, 2011 the Licensing & Standards Committee requested the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to bring a report to the Licensing and Standards Committee which outlines the pros and cons of amending the City of Toronto Municipal Code 313-37.1(e)(1) to allow boulevard café enclosures year-round. <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2011.LS1.7>

ISSUE BACKGROUND

Chapter 313 includes provisions governing the processing of applications for boulevard café (patio) permits, and the operation of licensed boulevard cafés on the City's public right-of-way in the former City of Toronto. The categories of boulevard cafés include (see examples in the Appendix B):

1. **fully unenclosed** - no top and no side covering;
2. **unenclosed with an awning** - a removable or retractable structure affixed to the adjacent building, made of light material, having a light metal or reasonably equivalent frame covered by fire-proof canvas or similar sail goods material, plastic, fibreglass or light aluminum. An awning is erected over a licensed boulevard cafe area;
3. **partially enclosed** with a retractable or removable canvas-type awning (as above) over a boulevard café area , extending to two sides of the structure, with canvas or similar sail goods material screens (walls) between and affixed to the top and bottom rails of the fence. The structure must have entrances/exits which must remain free, open, and unobstructed at all times.
4. **fully enclosed** – similar to a partially enclosed structure, except that a full enclosure includes the material between and affixed to the top rail of the fence and the roof awning on all sides of the patio. The structure must have entrances/exits which must remain free, open, and unobstructed at all times.

Currently, Chapter 313 requires that the fence that delineates a licensed boulevard café area, along with erected enclosures, must be removed from within the street allowance during any period when the boulevard cafe operation is not in regular daily use. A full enclosure erected over a licensed patio area is only permitted from April 1 to May 30, and from September 15 to November 1 (shoulder seasons). While there may be some additional grace period granted to cafés with fences on the residential flankage, permit holders who have fenced-off licensed patio area on the commercial frontage must remove the café fence/enclosure by November 15 to ensure clearance for snow removal operations.

Accordingly, the existing Chapter 313 regulations effectively limit the operation of a patio on the City's right-of way to the warm-weather months. Patios operating on private property do not have such restrictions.

COMMENTS

The objective of this report is to provide a summary of the information regarding the pros and cons of a year-round operation of patios on the City property and to outline issues for consideration respecting a potential pilot project to allow patios to operate full year in the former City of Toronto (area covered by Chapter 313).

A survey mailed to the former City of Toronto area boulevard café permit holders who manage patios on the residential flankages revealed that a minimum of 17 (13.8%) out of 123 eligible patio operators would be interested in operating a patio year round.

Statistical Information - Permits

In the area covered by the former City of Toronto, there are currently 498 valid boulevard café permits issued to operate a patio on a public ROW. The number includes two (2) permits for partially enclosed patios, and two (2) permits for fully enclosed patios. The fully enclosed patios are located at 175 Eglinton Avenue East (The Unicorn) and 324 Lonsdale Road (Hope Street Café).

The total number of boulevard café permits issued to operate patios on the public right-of-way across the city of Toronto is 570.

Permit Fee Structure

Municipal Licensing and Standards, Licensing Services administers a two-tier boulevard café permitting fee scheme: an application processing fee is collected at the time of the submission of the application, and the permit fee is collected at the time of the permit issuance. The permit is issued annually from April 1 to March 31, and one fee is payable for the entire year, regardless if the patio is in daily use or it is not. The initial fees, however, are pro-rated to take into account the permit's issuance and expiry dates. For example, if the permit is issued on June 1, it will bear an expiry date of March 31, and, in such case, the applicant will pay a pro-rated fee covering ten months of the permit's validity.

Differences in the categories of the boulevard cafés are reflected in the fee structure. Enclosed and partially enclosed café operators pay higher fees for the installation of canopies/awnings and full/partial enclosures within the licensed patio area. These fees are also collected on an annual basis and are equally pro-rated for new permits, as above.

Issues to Consider– Full Enclosures

1. Winter operations - snow load on the roof of the boulevard café enclosure

The enclosure would have to be structurally adequate to bear a snow load and, accordingly, would have to comply with specifications under the Ontario Building

Code (also see point 3 below). The structures must have safe framing and roofing (e.g. solid plexiglass walls and roof), as opposed to the currently required light weight and canvass-type material (see definition of a full enclosure above), which are not suitable for potentially heavy snow loads. Such requirement may result in the construction of enclosures that would be difficult/cumbersome and costly to remove and replace, if they were required to be dismantled for the summer months.

2. Cold weather operations - heating element

Average winter temperatures in Toronto range from low of -10°C (14° F) in January and February to high of 0°C (32°F) in December.

The enclosures should be allowed to have an approved heating element installed in order to be operational in the winter. Currently, Chapter 313 prohibits installation of a heating element in full patio enclosures. Hence, it must be determined how the boulevard cafés will be heated, what by-law amendments will need to be made, and whether the boulevard cafés will have to conform to the insulation values required by the Ontario Building Code.

Current application rules require the applicants for unenclosed and partially enclosed boulevard café permits who plan to use heating elements to submit a valid certificate of such heating element approval issued by the Electrical Safety Authority (electric heaters) or a valid Propane Handler's Certificate (propane heaters). ROW bylaw inspectors verify on site if the installed heaters comply with all applicable regulations under Chapter 313.

3. The structures may require a building permit and compliance with the Ontario Building Code

Existing provisions of Chapter 313 stipulate that the permit holder is not permitted to "increase the area of the related restaurant operation on private property so that the temporary full cafe enclosure area plus the area of the related restaurant operation is more than the maximum gross floor area permitted for a restaurant or take-out restaurant use under the applicable zoning by-law."

ROW staff approve applications for patio permits on a public boulevard prior to an applicant being granted a zoning clearance. Toronto Building staff consider the proposed use of the structure/patio to determine compliance with the zoning by-law and any other applicable law. The use permitted on the patio and or in the patio enclosure must comply with the uses and regulatory standards permitted in the applicable zone under the zoning by-laws. Before a building permit can be issued, there must be compliance with "applicable law" under section 8 of the Building Code Act, including the zoning by-law. The new zoning by-law No. 1156-2010 was passed on August 27, 2010, and currently both the existing zoning by-laws and the new zoning by-law apply for the purpose of obtaining a building permit. Accordingly, the structure must conform to the zoning permitted uses and setbacks, as well as the Building Code requirements.

A new "Construction On Street Allowance" protocol is being developed by the Toronto Building Permit Delivery Team. The purpose of the protocol is to stipulate that construction and demolition on street allowance is NOT exempt from the requirements of the Ontario Building Code Act and Regulations. For the zoning by-law purposes, staff will assess the private property portion within the lot lines, and then review the boulevard portion separately. However, for the Building Code purposes, in most cases, staff will combine the two portions/structures as one and determine compliance. As a result, the existing patios that are permitted to operate on the road allowance might not comply with the new regulations for the purpose of a building permit application.

Furthermore, given that such enclosures would remain erect year round and the they may be constructed in a manner that makes them difficult to dismantle, there is some question as to whether Toronto Building may deem these fixed full patio enclosures to be a permanent structures. Accordingly, an outdoor patio and its construction may be considered an addition to the main building structure (a restaurant). In such case, it may be necessary to extend the existing building fire and life safety systems. It must be noted, however, that the terms *temporary* or *permanent* are not defined in either the Toronto zoning by-law or the Ontario Building Code.

There are no Building Code requirements for awnings or roll-up sides; hence, no building permit is required for unenclosed and partially enclosed boulevard cafés.

4. Potential income for the City subject to tax

Fully enclosed structure on the City's property year round could be considered and treated by the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation (MPAC) as a tenancy on the right-of-way. This could have tax implications for the City.

5. The definition of a full enclosure

Although permitting full (or partial) enclosures to remain on the city property year round might require a redefinition of the term from "*temporary* full café enclosure" to simply "full café enclosures", it remains critical to ensure that such structures remain retractable or removable.

Chapter 313 requires the permit holders, at their own expense, to remove temporary café enclosures from the boulevard upon thirty (30) days' notice in writing from the City. In the case of an emergency, the cafe enclosure may be removed with or without notice from the City. Accordingly, the enclosure must be built of the material and in such a fashion as to not render them permanently fixed and attached to the main building or to the boulevard or sidewalk.

6. Access to utilities and municipal services

The provisions under Chapter 313 mandate that access to carry out construction, re-construction, maintenance or repairs to underground utilities and municipal services located beneath the cafe enclosure be available twenty-four hours per

day. However, the permit holder may request that the existing utility or municipal service be relocated to accommodate the construction of the cafe enclosure, and he/she must accept responsibility for the cost of such relocation.

To facilitate access, the café enclosure must have entrances/exits which must remain free, open, and unobstructed at all times.

7. Tree planting

Applications for permits to construct a boulevard café on the residential flankage are circulated to the Urban Forestry Branch of the Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division, who may require that the applicant plant a tree within the patio area. In such a case, a \$3,000 fee is paid by the applicant to the City to plant the tree. The circulation of the application applies to both new patio locations and the existing ones where a business is transferred or sold to a new owner. Café operators who wish to install solid café enclosures or who will be purchasing restaurants with such installations need to be aware that they might be required to allow for planting of a tree within the licensed café space.

Issues to Consider– All Boulevard Cafés

1. Winter operations - snow accumulation

Unenclosed and partially enclosed cafes with awnings would have to have the awning retracted when the snow accumulation is expected or is occurring. The construction of these enclosures is not structurally adequate to support snow accumulation; hence, they should not be in use during the snow season.

2. Year-round operations - regular daily use of a boulevard café

Regulations under Chapter 313 require that fences and structures that demarcate a licensed boulevard café area must be removed from within the street allowance during any period when the boulevard cafe operation is not in regular daily use. Permitting a boulevard café to remain open during cold weather will require an amendment to this provision to allow the operators the flexibility to keep the patio closed during severe weather.

3. Year-round operations - boulevard cafés on the commercial frontages to be excluded

The year-round boulevard café operation can only be permitted on a residential flankage to ensure that main city arteries remain clear and unobstructed for snow removal operations. Accordingly, café owners who operate patios on commercial frontages will continue to be required to remove café fences and structures by November 1, as per Chapter 313.

4. Permit fee structure

Permitting year-round operation of boulevard cafés on the City's boulevards will result in allowing a patio or enclosure structure to remain on the public right-of-way during the additional months. An increase to permit fees or the creation of a

new type of fee (which will require notice) and changes to the current fee structure will be required to account for this additional use of public space during winter (all boulevard cafés), as well as summer months (cafés with full enclosures only).

The majority (80.8%) of the survey respondents (see above under Comments) preferred a separate winter fee for those permit holders who will choose to operate a patio from November 1 to March 31.

Other Jurisdictions

Research into the regulations governing the use of street allowance for outdoor patios revealed that many Canadian and American jurisdictions permit year-round outdoor café operations (see Appendix A). However, most cities allow only partially enclosed cafés to operate year round. The concerns associated with year-round full enclosures range from a conclusion that such structures would be, in essence, permanent, to finding that full enclosures do, in fact, become permanent and that many operators do not follow the regulations after they erect the enclosures.

City of New York, USA

New York City (NYC) has a total of approximately 900 outdoor cafés operating legally. It has two categories of sidewalk cafés: *enclosed sidewalk café* and *unenclosed sidewalk café* (which includes a sub-category of *small unenclosed café*). It permits all outdoor cafés to operate all year; however, the cafés are not permitted in certain areas of the city. The application process and enforcement are administered by the Department of Consumer Affairs. The City inspectors have the authority to close (padlock) a café for 30 days after the third violation or if it is caught operating without a license.

Average winter temperatures range from low of -3°C (26° F) in January to high of 6°C (43°F) in December.

Enclosed sidewalk café

An enclosed sidewalk café is defined as a space adjacent to an eating or drinking establishment, with a tangible structure requiring heating and air conditioning. Prior to issuing of a license for an enclosed café, an application must be reviewed by the NYC Department of Buildings and an applicable alteration permit or any other required permit must be obtained by the applicant.

An enclosure around the café must be removable and constructed predominantly of light materials, such as glass, slow-burning plastic or lightweight metal. It may be constructed with a base wall of opaque (non-transparent) material up to a maximum height of 12 inches from the finished floor level. All enclosing walls, doors and windows, except for the structural members, must be of colourless, un-tinted, non-reflective transparent material. At least 50 percent of the walls must consist of operable transparent windows. The awning shall be of incombustible materials, including coloured or colorless safety glass or fire-resistant fabric.

The furnishing of the interior of a sidewalk café must consist solely of movable tables, chairs and decorative accessories. No objects (except lighting fixtures and heating, ventilating, and air conditioning installations) may be permanently affixed into any portion of the sidewalk café wall.

All enclosed sidewalk cafes may remain open for business until 4 a.m.

Unenclosed sidewalk café

An unenclosed sidewalk café is defined as a space on the sidewalk which contains readily removable tables and chairs. The unenclosed space can contain only tables, chairs, railings/fences/planters, and an awning. Prior to 2007, no portable or permanent heating units were allowed in the unenclosed cafés. However, in 2007, the City amended its bylaw to allow an installation of approved portable natural gas heaters within the area occupied by a sidewalk cafe to facilitate the café operation during the winter. To install approved portable natural gas heaters and its accompanying hardware, restaurants must first have a license to operate a sidewalk café from the City, and then must receive a clearance from the NYC Department of Building and a valid open flame permit from and the Fire Department. The City is encouraging the café operators to utilize an innovative technology to keep their cafés open for business during the cold months.

Audit report on sidewalk cafés

In June 2005, the City of New York Office of Comptroller released a report on its findings with respect to the procedures and enforcement efforts undertaken by the Department of Consumer related to sidewalk cafés regulations. It concluded that, although generally the process was efficient and well managed, the enforcement procedures and follow-up inspections with respect to the cafés (both enclosed and unenclosed) that violated the regulations were inadequate. An improvement was recommended to the current processes and measures to ensure that the conditions that led to violations are corrected.

City of Vancouver

Vancouver has two categories of sidewalk cafés: *a large sidewalk patio* and *a small sidewalk patio*. The application process is administered by the City's Engineering Services. The patios are unenclosed.

In October 1995, the City conducted a 12-month pilot project (partially in response to the Smoke Free Indoor Air By-Law) allowing all unenclosed large sidewalk cafés to operate year round (small sidewalk cafés were already allowed to do so). Fifty-four large sidewalk cafe operators (44% of all sidewalk cafés) chose to leave their sidewalk cafes on City sidewalk .

Active use was most prevalent for smaller, more casual restaurants. Although all cafés in the program were entitled to have a small sidewalk cafés (with no railings) in the winter at no added expense, few operators used this option (note: similarly to Ontario laws, provincial liquor regulations only permit liquor service within a fenced-off patio area).

In 1996, the City of Vancouver concluded that the trial was successful for many patio operators and recommended that an ongoing winter season for sidewalk cafes be approved with an additional 50% fee increase (the pro-rated charge for the four months additional use). Prior to this project, a large sidewalk café operated from March 1 to October 31 but was permitted to continue to operate as a small sidewalk café for the balance of the year at no additional charge.

Average winter temperatures range from low of 5°C (41° F) in December and January to high of 7°C (44°F) in February.

Large sidewalk patios

A large sidewalk patio includes railings around the licensed patio area and may include canopies or awnings. Although the area may be fenced by means of planters or railings, it must have an 'open' appearance, and planters may not form a continuous solid barrier. The patio must be constructed so that it can be completely removed within twenty-four hours, if required. Decks, platforms and structures are not permitted. Portable heaters are permitted.

A large sidewalk café may operate year round during two terms: Summer Term (April 1 – October 31) and/or Winter Term (November 1 – March 31). The permit holder must, by October 31st of each year either a) pay the winter term fee, if any railings or structures are to remain on City property, or b) obtain a Small Sidewalk Patio Permit, or c) remove all tables, chairs, railings, structures, and all other items from the City property. The permit is renewable on April 1.

Small sidewalk patios

A small sidewalk patio cannot be enclosed by any means of planters or railings. Up to three tables and six seats can be placed within the patio area, adjacent to the building, provided that the total amount of seats on the patio and in the restaurant does not exceed the number of seats permitted on the occupancy permit. All patio furniture must be removed by 11:00 p.m. each day. Serving of alcohol is not permitted.

A small sidewalk café may operate year round on a one-term basis: from May 1st to April 30. The permit fee based on the number of chairs and tables placed on the sidewalk.

Washington D.C., USA

There are two categories of sidewalk cafés in Washington D.C.: *enclosed* and *unenclosed*. Enclosed sidewalk cafés are permitted year-round and are governed by the District of Columbia Municipal Regulations.

Average winter temperatures range from low of -3°C (26° F) in January to high of 8°C (46.5°F) in December and February.

General requirements:

All furnishings of the sidewalk cafe including, but not limited to, tables, chairs, and decorative accessories, must be readily moveable. The fixtures of a sidewalk cafe are not permitted to be bolted or permanently affixed to public space.

Enclosed sidewalk café

It is defined as an enclosure of public space in a form of a temporary, removable structure adjacent to a restaurant and constructed primarily of light, incombustible, or fire-resistant materials. The enclosure cannot restrict egress from the properties abutting the restaurant adjacent to the sidewalk café.

The law stipulates that all structural materials used in the construction of enclosed sidewalk cafés must be easily dismountable and capable of being removed within twenty-four hours. All exits in an enclosed sidewalk cafe are required to be marked and lighted in accordance with the D.C. Building Code and the D.C. Electrical Code. The walls and other materials, as well as the flooring of an enclosed sidewalk cafe must be of incombustible or fire-resistant materials. Approved plastic materials can be used in construction of the enclosure. The District of Columbia law requires that the supporting structure must be able to sustain a thirty pounds per square foot (30 lbs./ft.2) live load.

Unenclosed sidewalk café

It is defined as an authorized use of public space adjacent to a restaurant that is open to the sky and has no side walls, and contains tables, chairs, railing, or planters. An unenclosed sidewalk café can have an awning, canopy, or umbrellas, which must be adequately secured, retractable, or removable within twenty-four hours. Framing must be made or constructed of incombustible or fire-resistant materials, and the material used to cover the framing must be flame-retardant, as approved by the Fire Chief.

Potential Advantages of Year-Pound Boulevard Cafés

1. Extension of the café season will provide for an increase in outdoor-café social activity year-round, including during the cooler weather. The presence of outdoor patios year-round will promote public space use and will serve as an encouragement to pedestrian activity.
2. Economic benefit for many patio operators, as they will be permitted to utilize space that would otherwise be shut down during the cold months. Increase to business sales may lead to an increase in profits and may result as well in an increase to employment during the winter.
3. Potential positive impact on tourism through positive contribution to the vitality of neighbourhoods, the vibrancy of the city streets, and to the city's overall character. Tourists (and residents) will have an opportunity to participate in an outdoor café experience all year.
4. Eliminated cost and nuisance of frequent dismantling and re-assembling of the enclosure structures, and encouragement of creative winter design.

Potential Disadvantages of Year-round Boulevard Cafés

1. Year-round occupation of the public right-of-way, which results in reduced control of public space by the City.
2. Higher cost of construction of the (full) enclosures to meet the Ontario Building Code requirements with respect to snow load, heating, fire prevention regulations, and the like. If the enclosures prove to be cost-prohibitive, it may be more difficult to encourage certain patio operators to participate in the pilot project. To encourage the participation, it may be necessary to administer the pilot for a period of a minimum of two years. Elimination of the requirement to remove the enclosures not only during the winter but also during the summer months needs to be considered as well to promote the year-round operation of the patios.
3. Potential transformation of fully enclosed boulevard cafés into permanent attachments to the main building (not permitted). Periodic inspections of the premises with full enclosures would have to be conducted to ensure that structures remain removable.
4. Potential increase to permit fees to off-set the cost to enforcement and application processing (increased in a number of year-round inspections, approvals by Toronto Building, etc.). The additional use of the public right-of-way will also need to be considered (see point 4 above under Issues to Consider – All Boulevard Cafés) as will any associated fees thereto.
5. Boulevard café enclosure design options must be compatible with other structures and uses in the surrounding area. It is important that each patio enclosure contributes to neighbourhood beautification and vitality and does not become an eyesore with respect to its design and physical appearance.

Issues to Consider– Pilot Project

1. An examination of Chapter 313 will need to be undertaken to ascertain what amendments would be needed.
2. The development of the Construction on Street Allowance protocol (currently underway) with respect to a review and approval of applications for the boulevard cafés between the ML&S Licensing Services and Toronto Building.
3. Communication to the existing boulevard café permit holders and to new applicants with respect to the requirements under the Ontario Building Code and Chapter 313 concerning operation of fully enclosed patios on the City's right-of-way.
4. The review by Toronto Building of the information (usually an engineer's report provided by the patio operator) on the structural adequacy of the existing licensed fully enclosed boulevard cafés in the (former) City of Toronto to ensure

- compliance with the City of Toronto zoning by-laws and the Ontario Building Code prior to granting permission for winter operation.
5. Preparation of a written agreement between the City and the boulevard café permit holders who will participate in the project. Similar agreements are currently required under Chapter 313 with respect to the use of the public right-of-way to operate boulevard cafés.
 6. Permission to operate unenclosed, partially enclosed and fully enclosed patios year round only on **residential flankages**. Patio constructions remaining through the winter on commercial frontages will adversely impact snow operations and the sidewalk clearance on main arteries due to accumulation of snow at the curb.
 7. Assessment of an impact on the City's resources with respect to application processing and enforcement services.
 8. Examination of possible tax implications, examination of the Building Code and zoning by-law requirements may be required.
 9. Research and development of other policies and protocols, as required.

CONTACT

Olga Kuztelska
Sr. Policy and Research Officer
Municipal Licensing and Standards Division
16th Floor, West Tower
Phone 416-392-0856
Fax 416-392-0797
okuszte@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Jim Hart
Executive Director
Municipal Licensing and Standards

ATTACHMENTS

- Appendix A: Table 1 - Other Jurisdictions
Appendix B: Examples of Boulevard Cafés (enclosed, unenclosed, and partially enclosed)

APPENDIX A
Table 1 – OTHER JURISDICTIONS

CITY	YEAR-ROUND OPERATION	ENCLOSURE (PUBLIC RIGHT-OF-WAY)	COMMENTS
Halifax	NO	Partial	Permitting fully enclosed year-round cafés on the public ROW is being considered.
Chicago, USA	NO	Partial	
Ottawa	NO	Partial	
Quebec City		Partial	Design restrictions in the historic district
Calgary	Depending on the zoning bylaw	Partial	Subject to approval by licence issuing manager
New York, USA	YES	Full	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Two-year licence - Removable - Building permit required - Portable heaters (unenclosed)
Vancouver	YES	Partial/unenclosed	Portable heaters (unenclosed cafés)
London	YES	Partial	All equipment must be removed on a daily basis Nov 15 to March 15
Edmonton	YES	Partial	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Five-year licence - Winter use (Nov 1 to March 31): only tables and chairs are allowed (removed daily) - Gas heaters are not permitted
Victoria	YES	Full	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Temporary/removable - Glass or plexiglass roof /walls - Building permit required (removed daily) - Portable heaters are permitted (unenclosed and partially enclosed)
Washington D.C. USA	YES	Full	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Removable - Transparent walls - Heating, AC, ventilation, and electrical lighting

APPENDIX B

EXAMPLES OF BOULEVARD CAFÉS (ENCLOSED, UNENCLOSED, AND PARTIALLY ENCLOSED)



New York – unenclosed sidewalk café with an awning and overhead electric heaters



New York – fully enclosed sidewalk café (exterior)



New York – fully enclosed sidewalk cafés (interior)



Vancouver – unenclosed sidewalk café



Washington D.C. – fully enclosed sidewalk cafés (permanent structures)



Toronto – fully enclosed boulevard café



Toronto – partially enclosed boulevard café with an awning retractable side walls



Toronto – partially enclosed boulevard café with overhead heaters



Toronto – unenclosed boulevard café with an awning and a portable propane heater



Toronto – fully unenclosed boulevard café



Toronto – partially enclosed boulevard café with an awning retractable side walls (convertible to a full enclosure)



Toronto – partially enclosed boulevard café