

## February 29, 2012

## City of Toronto, Request for Proposal No. 9117-11-3074

Acquisition of Engineering Services for the Green Lane Landfill for an 8-year Term Commencing March 1, 2013

Knowles Consulting Services Inc. (Knowles) was engaged by the City of Toronto as Fairness Advisor to provide independent oversight throughout the procurement process to select a Supplier for the Provision of Engineering Services at the Green Lane Landfill site for an 8-year term. Knowles participated in the validation of the procurement process and provided oversight throughout the process.

The following chart provides a summary of Knowles' involvement and findings:

Stage	Task	Fair (Yes/No)
1	Review of Request for Proposal (RFP) documentation	Yes
2	Attend mandatory site meeting to confirm proper conduct	Yes
3	Review draft Addenda and Q & A responses and confirm publication	Yes
4	Ensure that the procurement process , communication with the City and basis for selection were clearly stated in the RFP	Yes
5	Review draft Evaluation Document	Yes
6	Attend evaluation consensus meeting and monitor process	Yes
7	Confirm that the procurement process and basis for selection stated in the RFP were respected	Yes
8	Attend debriefing of Proponent as required	Pending

The City of Toronto's Technical Services and Purchasing and Materials Management Division (PMMD) staff managed the RFP process. Golder and Associates (Golder) were engaged to assist Technical Services, PMMD and Solid Waste Division staff to prepare the draft and final RFP documentation, addenda , and responses to Proponent questions via addenda. The mandatory site information meeting was attended by City of Toronto Technical Services, PMMD, and Solid Waste Division staff as well as Golder staff and the Fairness Advisor. No Proponent attended the non mandatory site meeting. Throughout the process Knowles, as Fairness Advisor, was consulted for potential and actual fairness issues. Knowles provided Evaluator training/orientation and recommendations for process improvements.

In accordance with the RFP, all communications with the City during the open period were conducted in writing by email with a designated buyer in the Purchasing and Materials Management Division (PMMD) and a deadline for questions was established. Responses were provided by way of addenda to the RFP. Revisions and clarifications were also included in addenda to the RFP.

To the best of our knowledge, there was no issue with respect to Conflict of Interest and Confidentiality. Evaluators were required to sign City of Toronto Non Disclosure and Conflict of Interest Declaration documents. Also, to the best of our knowledge, confidential information was properly safeguarded throughout the process.

## **Observations and Findings**

RFP document preparation as well as the subsequent evaluation were conducted in a diligent, consistent and fair manner. Proponents had adequate time to prepare Proposals. Two Proposals were received in response to the RFP. The Proposals submitted met mandatory submission requirements. The two Proposals were ranked in accordance with the scoring criteria outlined in the RFP document.

## **Conclusion**

As the Fairness Advisors for Request for Proposal No. 9117-11-3074, we certify that the RFP procurement process was, in our opinion, fair, open and transparent and that Proponents received consistent treatment. Furthermore, we are not aware of any issues that would impair the fairness of this procurement.

Yours truly,

Knowles Consultancy Services Inc.

John J. Palulje

John Pahulje