

## Appendix A

### References

Belser, Patrick, Michaëlle de Cock, and & Farhad Mehran (2005). "International Labour Organization Minimum Estimate of Forced Labour in the World." Retrieved December 12, 2012 from [http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed\\_norm/@declaration/documents/publication/wcms\\_081913.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed_norm/@declaration/documents/publication/wcms_081913.pdf)

Canadian Women's Foundation. "National Task Force on Human Trafficking of Women and Girls in Canada." Retrieved January 11, 2013 from <http://www.canadianwomen.org/taskforce>

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (2012). "Annual Report to Parliamentary on Immigration." Retrieved December 12, 2012 from <http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/pdf/pub/annual-report-2012.pdf>

Public Safety Canada (2012). "National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking." Retrieved December 12, 2012 from <http://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/prg/le/fl/cmbt-trffkng-eng.pdf>

Royal Canadian Mounted Police. Human Trafficking National Coordination Centre. Retrieved December 12, 2012 from [http://publications.gc.ca/collections/collection\\_2011/grc-rcmp/PS64-78-2010-eng.pdf](http://publications.gc.ca/collections/collection_2011/grc-rcmp/PS64-78-2010-eng.pdf)

Statistics Canada. Retrieved December 12, 2012 from <http://www23.statcan.gc.ca/imdb/p2SV.pl?Function=getSurvey&SDDS=3302&lang=en&db=imdb&adm=8&dis=2>

Status of Women Canada. Retrieved December 12, 2012 from <http://www.swc-cfc.gc.ca/index-eng.html#tab2>

Touzenis, Kristina (2010). "Trafficking in Human Beings - Human rights and trans-national criminal law, developments in law and practices." United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization. Retrieved December 12, 2012 from <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0018/001883/188397e.pdf>

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. Retrieved December 12, 2012 from <http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/index.html?ref=menuaside>

## **Appendix B**

**Angus Grant, Independent Research and Development Consultant**

Angus Grant, Research and Development Consultant

1) What are the possible causes of human trafficking in Toronto?

I mentioned to you that culture was a major cause of human trafficking. Much of this can be related to gender issues where the value of girls is less than that of boys. In international situations this can be manifested into the refusal of education, nutrition or healthcare for girls, thereby making them more susceptible to being trafficked. They may also be sold off by family members as they can be perceived as economic drains on the family (one less mouth to feed, the dowry system, etc.). At many times, as there is no form of economic opportunity for them in the rural areas where many of them come from, their family may consent to them travelling or being taken to urban areas in order to find work, only to be trafficked later on.

Other issues regarding culture may be based on the societal culture of the trafficked person. Entire families may be indentured servants or labourers (this is found to happen a lot in South and South East Asia). Born into a culture where they have always been the so-called property of someone else, the person may not find anything wrong with being brought to Canada to enter into the underground economy or into hidden positions within legitimate business. Or they may not think that they have a choice.

Other concerns are regarding ignorance or cultural beliefs regarding medicine. The culture of ignorance, mixed with traditionalism can be dangerous when faced with the terrifying world of sexually transmitted infections (STIs), especially HIV/AIDS. Some men will believe that to have sex with virgins that they can either avoid STIs, or that they may act as a cure. At times the younger the more potent the prevention/cure is. Throw in the lack of education regarding contraception, as well as cultural issues of machismo that forces men to believe that they are not men if they use condoms, and you have an increased demand for children in the sex industry. With more and more immigration into Canada, this demand is not going to stay in other countries.

There are also issues regarding homosexuality. In many cultures homosexuality is considered a sin and/or a crime. In many other countries, the culture and or local beliefs, prevent people from even knowing what homosexuality is. Men that are gay have no socially acceptable means of exploring their sexuality and therefore use alternative means, at times human trafficking. For example in Afghanistan, many rich or affluent Afghan men, as well as many soldiers/warlords/nomads will take on a dancing boy or bachi bazi<sup>1</sup>. These men are sexually attracted to other men, but either through ignorance or fear of being found out, buy or kidnap local boys. These boys are then dressed in feminine clothing, dance in provocative manner, and can be sexually assaulted by the man. This is a defence mechanism in a society that amongst the educated, looks down at or is even downright disgusted by, homosexuality, and for the poor that lack a basic education in sexuality, can perceive it as sinful or unnatural.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Please refer to "Afghanistan sees rise in 'dancing boys' exploitation" in the April 4, 2012 edition of the Washington Post. [http://www.washingtonpost.com/world/asia\\_pacific/afghanistans-dancing-boys-are-invisible-victims/2012/04/04/gIQAyreSwS\\_story.html](http://www.washingtonpost.com/world/asia_pacific/afghanistans-dancing-boys-are-invisible-victims/2012/04/04/gIQAyreSwS_story.html)

<sup>2</sup> This is not to say that the Afghan overall attitude to homosexuality is negative, but there is homophobia and ignorance regarding gay issues.

I'm willing to bet that most of these causes are not the main cause for human trafficking in Toronto (which is pretty well based on demands in the sex industry (both legal and illegal versions) as well as the manufacturing, agricultural and domestic worker industries), but with Toronto becoming an increasingly international city, they may soon become causes (forced marriages and honor killings are on the rise in Canada for instance) and should be reflected in education packages for new comers and greater awareness raising.

## 2) What can the City do to reduce human trafficking?

Two issues that were not addressed during the meeting is networking and research.

- 1) Toronto is not a closed city. There are people that come and go from it all of the time. This is important to remember when thinking of addressing human trafficking, because human trafficking is not just happening in Toronto. Toronto is a destination, source and place of transit. The City needs to make real efforts to network with other Canadian municipalities to share in both information and resources to address human trafficking issues throughout Canada. In addition, Toronto needs to be making the provincial and federal government partners in their work against human trafficking; without their support, whatever Toronto does is not going to be very useful. I would also argue that Toronto, through the Federation of Canadian Municipalities, should advocate for a nationwide network against human trafficking, as well as to advocate for anti-human trafficking legislation, policy and funding at the federal and provincial levels. There should also be plans to at least in the long term, to make this network have a voice in Canada's role/impact in anti-human trafficking on a global scale. If the Canadian government is trying to sell a Toronto-based industry to a country with a poor human trafficking record, Toronto should have a say against such practices. This network will also be useful for information and resource exchange so that the practices that are put into use in Vancouver are immediately known about in Toronto, where can they can be adapted to Toronto's needs.
- 2) The above issue of information exchange ties into the issue of research. The amount of research that is done into human trafficking is comparably small to other forms of social research. This is due to a lack of research funding, lack of proper data gathering, and the fact that this is an illegal activity, which makes information that much harder to obtain.

With this lack of data, there is greater need to stress the collection, analysis, storing and dissemination of as much data as possible, in a uniform and well-designed manner. There is an absolute necessity for generating data that can be useful for both City Hall, the police, lawyers, the provincial and federal governments, and service providers. Each of their information needs has to be examined, and then a data gathering mechanisms have to be put into place to ensure that as Toronto's anti-human trafficking policies go forward, more information is gathered, which can then be used to adjust the policies and/or practices. The more demographic information that is gathered about trafficked persons, the traffickers and those that benefit from trafficking, the more robust a profile of each can be created, which will then assist the city in developing responses. In addition, to assist the prosecution of traffickers, to assist the mental

healing of survivors, and to help raise awareness of human trafficking, as many individual narrative reports must be collected from the survivors, with as much detail as possible (dictated by circumstances). This information is invaluable.

There are a lot of theories and methods being used to address human trafficking in the world, but there are very few efforts to assess the effect that these they have had on human trafficking. When conducting my grad school research in 2009 I was able to obtain only 8 anti-human trafficking program evaluations from programs that were implemented between 2002 and 2008. These evaluations were from various projects from around the world. However, there are hundreds if not thousands of projects being implemented but there is no information as to whether or not what they are doing is actually working. There have been no long term impact assessments for any anti-human trafficking program or policy. This is not to say that the current programs or strategies being proposed don't work, but there is no long term information to say one way or another, therefore it can be difficult to figure out a guaranteed method, and cost effective and efficient method. This also makes it that much harder to gather best practices and lessons learned (though some international organizations are beginning to make these available).

Without proper data gathering mechanisms and the active use of evaluations and impact assessments on Toronto's anti-human trafficking programs/policies, there will be no way to properly address human trafficking in Toronto. They may seem a boring aspect of human trafficking, but they are a worldwide problem of the anti-human trafficking sector. Research, and the sharing of that research, is fundamental to ensuring that human trafficking is ended in the long-term.

3) Do you have any general comments regarding advertising in publications that may be perceived that the publication is contributing to human trafficking?

This can be a tricky issue especially because it can take control over the discussion of human trafficking in Toronto very quickly. But it is not nearly the most important issue that needs to be initially addressed. However, if everything else is addressed and agreed upon beforehand, I would say that the City should not advertise in publications that contribute to human trafficking.

The issue is not about publications that promote sex. If a publication advertises for The Everything You Need to Know About Sex convention, that is not promoting human trafficking. However, if they are advertising prostitution or other forms of sexual services, there is too high a risk of human trafficking. For instance, NOW magazine. Other publications such as The Grid, voluntarily removed that type of advertising specifically because of the threat of human trafficking involvement, not because they opposed the actually services being provided. There is no reason why NOW magazine or other publications can't do the same.

What needs to be thought of is pretty simple in my opinion. City Hall does not condone any activities that are counter to the laws of Canada, with special focus on the Charter and the Criminal Code. Which means that any publication that breaks or abets crime are not advertised in. If a magazine were to publish hate or racist material, the City would, or at least should not (I don't know what the City Hall lawyers say), advertise in them. If human trafficking is illegal, which it is, then any

publication that either breaks or abets that crime should not be used. There is no way to really prove that any of services are actual fronts for human trafficking, or the persons involved have been trafficked, but it is also very hard to believe that at least some of them aren't. The only way to know for sure is to have the police form a Vice squad and investigate each one, which is unrealistic. Seeing as there are other readily available publications that the City can advertise in, and that I'm sure that the publications that do advertise questionable material do not rely on the City's business, I'd err on the side of caution.

**Appendix C**  
**Free-Them**  
**Grey Cup 2012 Grassroots Traffic Report**



## **Grey Cup 2012 – Grass Roots Traffic Study**

**Prepared by [free-them] - December 2012**

During the weeks of November 15, 22 and 29, data was collected demonstrating a marked increase in traffic to strip clubs as well as sex-for-sale advertisements. While some publications such as NOW Magazine maintained a consistent number of ads in their sex and massage categories, others saw a shift in these back page ads. Included in this report is a study of The Toronto Sun back page ads count.

Our study also includes a traffic count of patrons to strip club establishments. Zanzibar was our chosen establishment for this study, as it heavily promoted 'The Grey Cup.' Many of the patrons, who entered the bar on the week of Grey Cup, were sporting team jerseys, and roaming the downtown core randomly. Included in this study is the data for traffic into Zanzibar for the 3-week term. It is important to note, that all counts were conducted between the hours of 8pm-11pm.

Recommendation: An awareness campaign must be created to ensure that patrons are educated on how sex workers/dancers, may possibly be working under duress. We also recommend that MLS carefully monitor all establishments that promote sexual services. This includes strip clubs, and massage parlors.

Online back page ad alternatives such as duttlist.com were also followed. Included in this study is content from duttlist.com's 'Erotic Services' pages. As you will see, the content is graphic, but also shows clearly that those selling sex, are from places other than Toronto, and are in town for short periods of time. It may also be noted that several photos are taken in hotel rooms. These are good indications that Human Trafficking is likely present.

Recommendation: A training campaign must be created to educate hotel/motel staff on signs of Human Trafficking. This support is needed to protect victims in the most vulnerable situations. Also recommended is ad material created by the City Of Toronto, and/or The Ministry of Tourism & Sport, for tourists and guests staying in the hotels/motels. The more education they have when they first arrive, the least likely they are to be a part of Human Trafficking, and most likely to report it if witnessed.

**HELPING FREE 27 MILLION PEOPLE IN SLAVERY TODAY**  
[free-them] | [contact@free-them.net](mailto:contact@free-them.net) | [free-them.net](http://free-them.net)



## **Appendix D**

### **PROS (Providing Resources, Offering Support) at All Saints Church-Community Centre**

**Submission for Consultation on Human Trafficking for the City of Toronto**  
**By PROS at All Saints Church-Community Centre**

### **Mission**

All Saints operates a drop-in that provides services to homeless and street-involved people in the Moss Park/Regent Park community within a framework that respects their rights, agency and choices, while upholding harm reduction and human rights approaches. PROS (Providing Resources Offering Support), an initiative at All Saints, is the first program in Ontario to combine social services, public health, legal support, and peer-led initiatives to meet the needs of women and girls who have experienced domestic human trafficking.

### **PROS' Work**

Trafficking of women and girls in Canada is viewed as the most under-reported and severe form of child sexual victimization facing youth today (Estes and Weiner 2001, 2005; Hanna 2002; Hughes 2005, Reid 2010). Stopping trafficking of children for the purposes of commercial sexual exploitation has become an important objective of the Canadian Government and part of the new Canadian Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking, released in 2012.

In September 2011, a core group of local service providers met to discuss the development of a program for victims of human trafficking. With years of experience and knowledge, the group identified core integrated services that must exist to meet the needs of trafficked women and girls. With this knowledge and a commitment to developing comprehensive, empowering services, the PROS model was developed at All Saints. PROS currently receives referrals for domestically trafficked women and girls from the Special Victims Section, Sex Crimes Unit of the Toronto Police Service, and other Toronto agencies.

Children and youth in priority communities face dramatically increased rates of domestic sex trafficking due to their exposure to poverty, violence, and marginalization. Due to the clandestine nature of trafficking and the many barriers to reporting it, research has identified educators as critical entry point into the prevention and early intervention of exploitation. As such, PROS has designed a set of curricula, and has begun delivering presentations to teachers, school administrators and grade 8 students in Toronto's priority schools to enhance their knowledge of domestic trafficking; PROS provides them with accessible resources for reporting, reducing the vulnerability of youth, and contributing to their ability to work as agents of social change in their community.



Choice. Empowerment. Personal voice. © PROS at All Saints Church-Community Centre, 2012.

---

## Our stance

### *Anti-oppression approach*

- to recognize how systemic barriers and social injustice increase risk
- to integrate an understanding of marginalization, poverty, housing insecurity, immigration, involvement in the child welfare system etc. in understanding risk and vulnerability factors
- to be critically attuned to factors of gender and race, both in considering risk factors, and in how information is delivered to students in an appropriate and sensitive manner

## Our Information

All of PROS' material has been prepared in consultation with various experts who are informed by years, and in some cases decades, of first-hand experience working with people who have been domestically sex trafficked. We have drawn on the knowledge and experience of police officers, school administrators and social workers who are committed to assisting those who are commercially exploited. We are also immensely grateful to a group of youth who have conveyed their lived experiences of being trafficked with us specifically to inform our work.

### Clarifying misconceptions of what domestic human trafficking is

Human trafficking, domestic human trafficking, and sex work are often mistaken from each other, or referred to interchangeably. Human trafficking is defined broadly by the United Nations as the recruitment, transport, transfer or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or coercion for the purpose of exploitation. Therefore, the act, means and purpose comprise what constitutes human trafficking. Domestic human trafficking is also the recruitment of persons by force or coercion for the purpose of exploitation; it does not, however, have to involve movement from one place to another.

Sex trafficking or commercial exploitation are terms used interchangeably. The key element in understanding this phenomenon is that it relies on coercion for the purpose of exploitation. There are many forms of trafficking besides trafficking for sexual slavery, with the most common form of trafficking being for other types of forced labour, such as garment factories or on farms. Trafficking can include migration into different countries, but it need not. It also occurs in intimate partner relationships and within Canadian borders between Canadian citizens.

Sex work is different from sex trafficking in that sex workers voluntarily consent to engage in this field of work by their own choice or a decision made due to circumstance. Sex work can involve sexual intercourse, but is also a wider concept that includes escort services, pornography, phone sex and other forms of labour. When a person is coerced into sex work, it becomes an instance of trafficking.

Although domestic human trafficking has only come to the attention of policy makers, law enforcement and social services in recent years, those trafficked domestically have comprised a significant number of all those trafficked in Canada. Data shows that of all 36 cases of human trafficking brought before the courts by the end of 2010, 34 were domestic cases. Although trafficking may appear to be a recent trend, and one that focuses on the movement across



Choice. Empowerment. Personal voice. © PROS at All Saints Church-Community Centre, 2012.



international borders, we know that it is much more common locally than previously thought (Sexual Assault Rape Crisis Centre of Peel, 2012).

### Stages of commercial exploitation

The extent to which trafficking can consume a person cannot be overstated; the influence of this exploitation can be conceptualized as a full fence around one's brain. Every aspect of a trafficked person's life may be affected, and often times there are real threats to the person's safety and that of their family. Pimps and traffickers, which are terms used interchangeably, typically pose as boyfriends, thus are able to infiltrate almost every aspect of the young person's life. "Pimps are skilled at building trust while simultaneously isolating youth and making them emotionally dependent" (Justice Institute of British Columbia, 2002).

### Luring and grooming tactics

The most common technique of luring victims is through emotional manipulation. Vulnerable young people are deceived into believing that they are loved, often perceiving their pimp as their "boyfriend". By probing into the details of the victim's life, the pimp will come to learn more about her (her family, what she values and loves, etc.), determining how she is the most vulnerable. By listening attentively to her, the pimp will make her feel valued; she will believe that the attention is genuine and that he cares for her. Later, he will draw on her insecurities, hopes and dreams to coerce her into obeying his demands.

During the honeymoon stage, everything may appear fine to the victim, who believes that the pimp loves her and will follow through on his promises to give her a better life. Within a short period of time (days or weeks), the emotional manipulation will begin. If she tries to leave him, he will use information he has gleaned about her family, etc., threatening to harm or kill those who are most important to her. He will also work to humiliate her, making her feel shame for her actions and leading her to feel that she would be socially ostracized if she disclosed the situation to anyone. By inciting feelings of shame and blame within her, he is ensuring that she remains socially isolated from those she loves and those who care about her. He will play mind games with her, withdrawing from her sporadically. This behaviour will serve to heighten her insecurities, and cause her to work for the pimp's attention, affection and acceptance, thereby allowing him to further controlling her mind and thoughts.

We asked youth who have been commercially exploited to tell us what kinds of things kids should look out for or be suspicious of in terms of possible recruitment. They said,

*Being offered anything you want, example, clothes, drugs, jewelry, fast money.*

*Quick money, being offered protection, being forced – told that if you don't work I will hurt you or your loved ones.*

*Young people should look out for people who prey on their vulnerability and honesty. Men who pretend to be nurturing but have no concern for their emotional health.*



Choice. Empowerment. Personal voice. © PROS at All Saints Church-Community Centre, 2012.

## Risk and vulnerability factors

Pimps and traffickers are attuned to those who appear vulnerable, often with low self-esteem. These might be young people who do not receive unconditional love, face issues in their family lives, have been bullied, or for a variety of other reasons have a compromised sense of self-worth. Those looking to recruit such youth are highly aware of signs indicating these vulnerabilities, and may test out a young person's limits. In a public space, they might yell out passing comments or subtly make statements to gauge how the youth might react. Where a person with higher self-esteem might be repulsed and disregard the comment, a more insecure individual or one seeking attention and affection might be willing to listen or engage.

There are also a wide variety of social factors that can contribute to a person's vulnerability and risk of being recruited. For instance, social inequalities that exist for numerous groups of Canadians can serve to compound the challenges that people are already facing. For instance, we know that racism continues to operate in our society. Experiences of discrimination on the basis of race or ethnicity can contribute to a decreased sense of self-worth. Or perhaps, as a newcomer to Canada, someone may face barriers accessing services and supports they need to reach out to because they are unaware of what is available, because they are not familiar enough with the language to express their needs, and so on.

Individuals in impoverished areas are also at an increased risk of being trafficked due to heightened social marginalization, possible proximity to crime, fewer economic opportunities, as so on. LGBT youth face increased social exclusion, and trans youth in particular may find themselves unable to access support services that are designated by gender. Finally, we also know that girls especially are vulnerable to trafficking, which is unsurprising given that women and girls continue to have less control over resources, fewer opportunities for advancement, and less formal participation in society as compared to men and boys. Aboriginal women in particular, on account of their communities' experiences of historical trauma and ongoing colonization, lack access to institutional and community support. This deficit in supporting Aboriginal women has both increased their vulnerability, contributing to staggeringly high rates of trafficking, as well as led to hesitancy to report exploitation to authorities.

This list of social factors contributing to vulnerability is in no way exhaustive, but is intended to suggest some of the ways that social inequities can contribute to individual characteristics when considering a person's vulnerability to trafficking.

## Common luring sites

Traffickers may attempt to recruit victims from a variety of places, and there is really no location that is off limits for potential luring. More frequently, it is becoming known that youth are being



Choice. Empowerment. Personal voice. © PROS at All Saints Church-Community Centre, 2012.

recruited online, through websites and social media sites. Common locations for luring and recruitment also include:

- Bus terminals
- Shelters
- Group homes
- Malls
- Outside of schools
- Amusement parks/arcades

Despite common perceptions of sex work happening “on the streets”, much of it actually transpires in locations that are much less visible. People may be engaged in sex work by being taken to places such as brothels, massage parlours, strip clubs, hotel rooms and so on. While these are not necessarily the locations that victims are recruited at the first point of contact, it is worth maintaining an awareness about where trafficked individuals become involved in the trade.

### Closing thoughts

PROS has relied heavily on the invaluable insights shared with us by youth who have been commercially sexually exploited. As a testament to their dedication in working with us, we would like to share some of the questions we had for them and the answers they provided us.

PROS asked: What do you think are some of the myths or stereotypes about sex trafficking that are unfair or untrue?

*Some myths or stereotypes about sex trafficking is that we are dirty and filthy without any moral fiber. When actually the opposite is true. Much of those trafficked have a great deal of morality and inner strength, we just are in tight situations and used our bodies to create economy despite the cost to some of our inner values.*

PROS asked: People want to learn more about sex trafficking to keep kids away from exploitative situations – what would you like to tell them?

*Be aware of surrounding situations. If something sounds too good to be true, it is.*

*It's in the most unlikely places.*

*Listen to your children, counselling even. Try to keep a healthy relationship with your kids as to not have them put in these situations.*

*I would tell them to be patient with kids who are in the midst of it and to be a friend first to a kid in need. Never judge because it's a critical learning that must occur. Spend time listening and being supportive.*



Choice. Empowerment. Personal voice. © PROS at All Saints Church-Community Centre, 2012.



## Recommendations

PROS supports the notion of creating a City of Toronto task force or committee to research and implement best practices around human trafficking and provide support to those social service organizations in the city who are already working to address this phenomenon.

Based on its support from the Toronto Police Service and the Toronto District School Board, PROS' new training curricula for teachers and students has been recognized as a successful model for preventing and intervening into domestic human trafficking cases amongst youth. As such, the City of Toronto could assist with the promotion and dissemination of these curricula, to ensure that it is widely implemented.

It is imperative that Toronto's law enforcement rely on human trafficking laws as opposed to prostitution related laws when considering cases of human trafficking, to ensure that punitive measures are not carried out against those who have been coerced into exploitative situations. The intent of law enforcement should not be to criminalize survivors of trafficking, but rather should be focused on providing protection and support to them.

Training on human trafficking must be implemented widely amongst various sectors in the city to ensure that those who have the potential to come into contact with individuals being trafficked are able to recognize exploitative situations and respond appropriately. This training must critically include educating people to understand the difference between sex work and human trafficking to ensure that the two phenomena are not conflated. Police and health care professionals should especially be trained to identify and respond to trafficking cases, and must become skilled in competently and sensitively responding to this population. PROS also recognizes the importance of a practice carried out in the Niagara region, whereby hotel managers are trained to identify common indicators of trafficking in order to alert police of potentially exploitative situations. PROS supports a similar initiative being implemented in Toronto.

Finally, PROS works tirelessly to promote the recognition of trafficking survivors and sex workers' dignity and potential contribution to our communities. We perceive a tremendous need for the city, policy makers, law enforcement and others to recognize that trafficking survivors and sex workers possess a unique and uncoupled ability to identify exploitation through their own eyes, and are the greatest tool and resource we have into understanding exploitation, even if they are not being exploited themselves. By destigmatizing people's experiences of trafficking and the profession of sex work, we can create a system to respond to those who are being exploited or are at risk of these horrific experiences.

## Conclusion

Human trafficking is increasingly being recognized as an issue of paramount concern in Canada and within the City of Toronto. Not-for-profit organizations are already working to generate and implement best practices for working with survivors of human trafficking; support from our municipality to continue and expand our initiatives will ensure greater ease in the provision of services, holistic approaches that minimize duplication and ensure cohesion, and collaboration between all the services and sectors that come into contact with survivors of human trafficking.



Choice. Empowerment. Personal voice. © PROS at All Saints Church-Community Centre, 2012.

## Introduction

As service providers for people who have been domestically trafficked, we support efforts to raise awareness about and end human trafficking. It has come to our attention that the City of Toronto is presently considering a proposal to discontinue its advertising in online and print publications that are perceived to contribute to human trafficking. As such, we would like to put forth a statement that asserts the inefficacy on “end demand” strategies to human trafficking such as this one. The following document presents amended excerpts from a similar position paper written by the Sex Workers Project in New York.

## Public Advertising and Sex Work

We recognize a common public perception exists that online and print publications may contribute to human trafficking based on advertisements for escort services included in these media. However, we must counter this perspective by highlighting information that suggests increased censorship of such publications not only does not decrease trafficking, but it restricts safe practices in sex work that contribute to sex workers’ protection.

Many sex workers work through the internet and print media to increase their safety and avoid street-based sex work, where they are more vulnerable to violence at the hands of clients, community members, and the police. If use of the internet and print ads for the purposes of engaging in sex work is further penalized, sex workers will have fewer avenues to work more safely. Although prohibiting contributions to these media is intended to minimize avenues for traffickers to advertise, this action would place many sex workers at risk by reducing their venues for safe advertising of their work. The government should pursue justice against those who commit violence against sex workers under existing laws against trafficking, abuse of minors, assault, and rape, rather than increase potential penalties for sex workers trying to work more safely.

Efforts to shut down adult services advertisements are misguided approaches to combat human trafficking. In fact, we are very concerned that these actions will fuel the growth of human trafficking. We work with survivors of human trafficking, and can assure you that traffickers will not be dissuaded by the absence of a few print forums or websites. Human traffickers will scatter to other sites, which are less structured and harder to monitor, or go offline altogether.<sup>1</sup> Trafficking that occurs in hidden locations with no public profile is much harder to find, investigate, and stop.

It has been documented by American local and federal law enforcement agencies that the existence of escort advertising actually makes it easier to investigate and combat human trafficking. Traffickers and other perpetrators of violence leave “virtual footprints” when they utilize Internet forums, and this information is available to law enforcement through subpoena.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Online prostitution advertising stunted by Craigslist’s departure, AIM Group, September 6, 2011, available at <http://aimgroup.com/blog/2011/09/06/online-prostitution-advertising-stunted-by-craigslist’s-departure/>.

<sup>2</sup> See Mark Latonero, Ph.D., The Role of Social Networking Sites on Online Classifieds, Human Trafficking Online,





Law enforcement investigations in Canada and the U.S. that have utilized online sex advertisements may have resulted in arrests and prosecutions that would not otherwise have been possible.<sup>3</sup>

In the year since Craigslist.org removed escort ads from their website, it is estimated that the amount spent on online prostitution has fallen by more than 50%. While this could erroneously be hailed as a victory, it is illogical to assume that a decrease in online ads equates to less sexual trafficking. Sadly it only implies that portions of this illegal activity have moved to less visible areas.

## End Demand Policies

Although end demand style policies have a simplistic appeal, a more nuanced investigation into the complexities of human trafficking and child sexual exploitation reveals that trafficking is not demand-driven. Instead, trafficking is driven by a variety of economic, social and other factors. Therefore, in order to reduce human trafficking and child sexual exploitation, the focus should be on prosecuting traffickers and abusers and supporting programs to reduce the conditions that make trafficking and child sexual exploitation possible. Energy and resources will be wasted by trying to arrest more clients of adult sex workers who are not trafficked.<sup>4</sup>

More troubling, increased prosecutions of clients may decrease reliable reporting of human trafficking, child sexual exploitation and abuses against adult sex workers. Human trafficking organizations and law enforcement have learned from working intently on this issue, that many trafficking victims are directly helped by one of their customers who help them escape or report their situation to law enforcement. Purchasers of commercial sex who feel increasingly targeted by law enforcement are in greater fear of being arrested and thus are less likely to report trafficking-like situations or act as witnesses.

## Conclusion

Governments and organizations compelled to address human trafficking should support policies that have been shown to work, such as supporting cooperation with organizations that work with trafficking victims and adult sex workers, training law enforcement on trafficking and prostitution, and providing accurate information about trafficking. End-demand policies, such as prohibiting advertising in forums that are perceived as promoting human trafficking, are not only ineffective ways to address trafficking, but may threaten the existence of venues for sex workers to advertise their services safely.

---

Sept. 2011, at 14, available at

[https://technologyandtrafficking.usc.edu/files/2011/09/HumanTrafficking\\_FINAL.pdf](https://technologyandtrafficking.usc.edu/files/2011/09/HumanTrafficking_FINAL.pdf).

<sup>3</sup> See Katia Hetter, Fighting sex trafficking in hotels, one room at a time, CNN, Feb. 29, 2012, <http://www.cnn.com/2012/02/29/travel/hotel-sex-trafficking/index.html>.

<sup>4</sup> See Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women, Moving Beyond 'Supply and Demand' Catchphrases: Assessing the Uses and Limitations of Demand-Based Approaches in Anti-trafficking 28-35 (2011), available at [http://www.gaatw.org/publications/MovingBeyond\\_SupplyandDemand\\_GAATW2011.pdf](http://www.gaatw.org/publications/MovingBeyond_SupplyandDemand_GAATW2011.pdf) (providing examples of the ineffectiveness of End Demand policies in ending trafficking).



Choice. Empowerment. Personal voice. © PROS at All Saints Church-Community Centre, 2012.

**Appendix E**  
**Streetlight Support Services**

## STREELIGHT SUPPORT SERVICES

---

### BACKGROUND

#### **Human Trafficking: Protecting the most vulnerable members of our society**

According to the dictionary – human trafficking is a form of organized crime, including acts that are coercive, threatening, fraudulent or abusing a person's vulnerability and done for the purposes of sexual exploitation, in particular of women and children, or labour exploitation.

Human trafficking is a blanket term that can encompass many types of exploitation, including but not limited to: sexual exploitation, forced labour, organ removal, child begging, and forced marriage.

Human Trafficking is the second largest organized crime world-wide. A \$32 billion annual black market industry, which is more than Google, Nike and Starbucks combined.

The extent of human trafficking, either in Canada or internationally, is difficult to assess due to the hidden nature of these offences, the reluctance of victims and witnesses to come forward to law enforcement and the difficulty of identifying victims in practice. Moreover, these cases often go unnoticed and unreported due to manipulation, fear, threats from traffickers, shame, language barriers or mistrust of authorities.

*Source: Public Safety Canada, web site.*

“Trafficking survivors are usually reluctant to speak to authorities and many don’t even realize they’re being targeted. The earlier we can reach kids with messages about how to recognize this crime, the less likely they are to fall prey to it. They’ll also be better able to identify human trafficking when they see someone they know being targeted,” said *Deputy Commissioner Cabana*.

Human trafficking, the use or trade of humans for forced labour or prostitution, is a disheartening concern in Canada. The United States State Department estimates that 800 people are trafficked to Canada per year and 1,500 to 2,200 are smuggled through the country on the way to the U.S, according to a recent article; " Human trafficking: an uncomfortable truth in Canada", The Interim, October 4, 2010.

## STREELIGHT SUPPORT SERVICES

---

The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime reports that sexual exploitation is by far the most common form of trafficking, at 79% of reported cases.

In the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, February 2009, study of trafficking in 61 countries found, women make up 66% of trafficking victims, followed by girls at 13%, men at 12% and boys at 9%. These numbers underline the need for women and girls to be protected from human trafficking, especially in the form of sexual exploitation.

Although accurate statistics on human trafficking are hard to obtain:

The U.S. State Department estimates that 600,000 to 800,000 people are trafficked across international borders every year. Of these, 80% are women and girls, and up to 50% are minors.

The International Labour Organization estimates that there are 12.3 million victims of forced labour (including sexual servitude) at any given time; other estimates range from 4 million to 27 million.

The RCMP estimates that 600-800 victims are trafficked into Canada each year, and another 1,500 to 2,200 persons are trafficked through Canada to the United States annually.

Similar to many countries, Canada is regarded as a source, transit and destination for victims of trafficking. Primarily, international victims of trafficking are trafficked to Canada for the purposes of commercial sexual exploitation.

While countries around the world have been tackling the issue for over a decade, Canada's response has been weary. According to Benjamin Perrin, Canadian expert on Human Trafficking and author of: *"Invisible Chains: Canada's Underground World of Human Trafficking"*, this is largely out of a lack of widespread awareness about the extent of the problem and insufficient political will to make it a priority. As a result, Canada has been recognized as a destination country for human trafficking involving sexual exploitation and forced labour, as well as a transit country for perpetrators to transport their victims into the United States.

## STREELIGHT SUPPORT SERVICES

---

Even more alarmingly, Canada has recently been identified as a source country for sex trafficking victims. In fact, our own citizens have become targeted by traffickers who richly profit from the young women and underage girls under their control.

An accurate picture of domestic human trafficking in Canada that reflects this trend can be found in the recent Strategic Intelligence Brief by the Criminal Intelligence Service of Canada (CISC), *Organized Crime and Domestic Trafficking in Persons in Canada*.

The Briefing noted a couple of key findings:

- ✓ A number of organized crime syndicates and family based networks recruit girls and traffick them inter and intra-provincially
- ✓ Middle-class females between the ages 12-25 are recruited by male peers
- ✓ Victims are controlled through direct (rape, assaults) and indirect (threatening family members) forms of coercion; and
- ✓ The daily earnings off of a victim can range from \$300 to \$1500.

Sex trafficking is highly lucrative. The Criminal Intelligence Service Canada estimates that domestic sex traffickers earn an average of \$280,000 annually from every victim under their control. The total number of females exploited in Canada, by domestic traffickers, is unknown, but individual traffickers may exploit between one to four victims at a time, whereas larger criminal networks may exploit dozens of victims at one time. Source: Criminal Intelligence Service of Canada, Strategic Intelligence Brief, "Organized Crime and Domestic Trafficking in Persons in Canada." (Ottawa, ON) August 2008.

Released in June 2010, "*Hidden Abuse – Hidden Crime*", an extensive study on domestic trafficking of children and youth in Canada commissioned by the RCMP revealed that a number of groups of Canadian youth including runaway children, unwanted children, youth living independently, and youth soliciting clients through the Internet were most susceptible to human trafficking and exploitation. Among these groups, it found that First Nations youth who had left reserves and peer support and moved to urban areas were especially vulnerable to sex trafficking.

## STREELIGHT SUPPORT SERVICES

---

Ontario is home to the largest number of foreign human trafficking victims identified by government records, as well as to the most prosecutions of domestic sex trafficking. Victims are sold via a number of outlets: strip clubs, massage parlors, escort agencies, internet bulletin board services, street level prostitution, hotels, motels, house parties and truck stops.

Since 1997, Streetlight Support Services has helped individuals who have wanted to exit the sex trade industry. From our work, over the years, and most recently, we have found an increase in victims of human trafficking coming through our doors AND here is what we found, as it relates to Human Trafficking:

Hundreds of Canadian women and children are being lured and trafficked into prostitution every day.

- ✓ They are being trafficked across Canada.
- ✓ The average age of a person that enters into prostitution, in Canada, is 14 years old. But, according to Benjamin Perrin, Canadian expert on Human Trafficking and author of *"Invisible Chains: Canada's Underground World of Human Trafficking"*, can be as young as 12 – the more extreme the poverty that surrounds them, the younger the girls can be recruited.
- ✓ Many of the young girls and women that are trafficked and forced into prostitution in Canada and are taken from one place/province to the next. It's not uncommon, for example, for a pimp to cart his girls from Calgary to Toronto, stopping in Winnipeg on route;

And, we found DOMESTIC TRAFFICKERS target the most vulnerable: homeless, sexually exploited youth, children in protective care or from dysfunctional homes/families, group homes, and others.

RCMP criminal intelligence indicates that, across the country, organized crime networks and individuals are actively trafficking Canadian-born women and under-age girls within Canada, and in some instances to the United States. These girls and women are often destined for the sex trade.

## STREELIGHT SUPPORT SERVICES

---

According to Benjamin Perrin, Sex traffickers use a range of tactics to make contact with vulnerable Canadian girls and young women. They patrol group homes and shelters for at-risk youth and approach girls on their way home from schools, shopping malls, bus stations, or parks. Traffickers frequently prey on vulnerable, economically disadvantaged, socially dislocated individuals, as well as those with personal problems or low self-esteem.

“Without education, about the systematic targeting of young girls, these young girls are signaled out by recruiters like lambs before lions”. ~ Benjamin Perrin

Perrin believes prevention strategies are key to stopping human trafficking in Canada.

## **Appendix F**

### **Toronto Counter Human Trafficking Network**



## Toronto Counter Human Trafficking Network

### Vision

The Toronto Counter Human Trafficking Network (TCHTN) is committed to working towards the elimination of human trafficking in Canada and abroad, and to address the plight of trafficked persons through a holistic, human rights-based approach, focused on the needs of trafficked persons.

### Mission/Mandate

The mandate of the Toronto Counter Human Trafficking Network is to provide a comprehensive response to human trafficking in the Toronto area. The response is to be provided in a collaborative manner with governmental and non-governmental organizations, agencies and individuals. These partners shall be committed to work towards the elimination of the crime of human trafficking, while facilitating services and protection to trafficked persons through a holistic approach based on human rights and the needs of each individual.

While acknowledging the experiences and needs of domestically-trafficked persons, we focus our efforts to address the protection and service needs of non-citizens trafficked in or through Canada, given the lack of a comprehensive response to their plight. However, in collaboration and partnership with organizations serving domestically-trafficked persons, the network will accommodate the needs of those populations to the best extent possible.

**Our mandate is fulfilled through meeting the following objectives:**

- awareness-raising aimed at educating Toronto communities, businesses and governing agencies about the extent of human trafficking in our city, Canada and worldwide;
- facilitate assistance to trafficked persons in a coordinated human rights based approach through an anti-racist, anti-oppressive and participatory framework;
- capacity-building among stakeholders, including training to organizations providing social, health and protection services who are likely to interact with trafficked persons;
- collaboration with key stakeholders and networks in Ontario and other provinces to enhance the partnerships and advocacy on behalf of trafficked persons;
- fundraising to continue the efforts of the network.

### **Introduction**

Human trafficking is now considered to be the fastest growing form of modern day slavery, comprising the second largest sector of organized crime in the world. Despite the increased attention it has recently received in the media, the general lack of public awareness around this

issue, combined with a lack of coordinated service provision have only served to perpetuate this crime. Women, men, girls and boys are trafficked into a wide range of economic sectors such as sex and entertainment industries, agricultural work, construction, domestic work, and other areas where the demand for cheap and disposable labour is high. Human trafficking is largely driven by supply and demand factors, and this phenomenon will continue to flourish if these factors are not addressed by government policy in a coherent and strategic way.

Traffickers prey on vulnerable people. While vulnerability is in itself not a cause, it does often serve as a catalyst for situations of human trafficking. Such vulnerability is the consequence of exclusive social, economic or political policies that fail to address the needs of society members in an equal manner.<sup>1</sup> Poverty, globalization, war, and the increasing demand for low cost labour, among other factors, contribute to people being more vulnerable to human trafficking. Human trafficking is also overarchingly an issue of gender inequality. Gender inequalities and stereotypes disproportionately impact women and girls, particularly racialized women, rendering them more susceptible to the vulnerability-inducing factors listed above, and thus to being lured into this crime, both in Canada and globally.

Toronto is a destination city for many immigrants and migrants due to the vibrancy of the city and diversity of the population. As such, it is also a location for human trafficking as people are moved in, around and out of the city for the purposes of exploitation. It is crucially important that the city address this issue in all its facets, including both international and domestic forms of trafficking; for the purposes of labour and/or sexual exploitation. When human trafficking cases are identified, there is a lack of knowledge of how to provide victim-centered services beneficial to the trafficked persons. In addition, collaboration between law enforcement and the non-governmental sector, which is essential for victim support, is also lacking.

It is proposed that counter human trafficking efforts be informed by the following assumptions:

- i. Human Trafficking is recognized as a Human Rights issue.
- ii. The recognition that the vulnerability to Human Trafficking is:
  - Different for men, women, girls, boys and transgendered persons;
  - Higher for women and girls generally;
  - Differently experienced based on race, class, age, ability and other intersecting identities that are simultaneously experienced - for example Aboriginal women and racialized women (Women of Colour) experience a higher risk and vulnerability.

---

<sup>1</sup> UNODC, (2008). *An Introduction to Human Trafficking: Vulnerability, Impact and Action*. United Nations, New York. <<http://tiny.cc/gr833>>

## Canada & International Sex Trafficking

Trafficking for sexual exploitation mainly affects women and girls, though men and boys are also affected. Persistent gender inequalities perpetuate the lack of opportunities which make many women easy prey for the traffickers. Women who are marginalized by intersecting oppressions based on race, class and sexuality are particularly vulnerable. Hence, Aboriginal women and women of colour are more vulnerable to human trafficking.

According to the recent RCMP report, Project SECLUSION “Human Trafficking in Canada”, the victims of international sex trafficking in Canada originate mainly from *Eastern Europe* and *Asia*. However, many service providers assert that women from other parts of the world, such as *Latin America*, the *Caribbean* and *Africa*, are also among the victims of sexual exploitation. Yet the numbers are still difficult to define.

Young Canadian women are also subjected to sexual exploitation across the country, and may be trafficked internationally. The RCMP reports that Canadian women from Niagara, Montreal, Calgary and Vancouver have been trafficked to the USA for sexual exploitation in strip clubs and escort agencies in Miami, New York and Las Vegas.<sup>2</sup>

Physical force, along with false pretexts and promises from “boyfriends”, family members, gangs, etc. are the most common methods for recruitment. Acquaintances offer women and girls validation in order to exercise control over them. Traffickers often oblige victims to use drugs until addiction is reached, which facilitates control and dependency.

The traumatic experiences faced by Aboriginal Peoples as a result of ongoing colonization and racialization have had devastating effects on individuals, families and communities. The long term impacts have manifested in widespread poverty, low educational attainment, high rates of community and interpersonal violence, substance abuse and low self-esteem. Aboriginal women and girls bear the brunt of the past and continuing oppression, as traditional spiritual and intellectual values accorded to Aboriginal women have been replaced with patriarchal notions of moral inferiority and sexual availability.<sup>3</sup>

Aboriginal women’s experiences with trafficking are therefore unique. In the context of domestic trafficking, many service providing organizations and researchers believe that Aboriginal women and girls are the majority of sexually exploited victims. However, official numbers of trafficked Aboriginal women and girls are nonexistent.

---

<sup>2</sup> RCMP, (March 2010). Project SECLUSION “Human Trafficking in Canada”, Report.

<sup>3</sup> Anette Sikka (2009). Trafficking of Aboriginal Women and Girls, Research for the University of Ottawa’s Institute on Governance: p.7. < <http://tinyurl.com/6xnhoxb>>



### Trafficking for Labour Exploitation

Although labour trafficking is less documented than sexual exploitation, it is in no way less widespread. It is believed that this particular type of exploitation is on the rise, and Ontario and Alberta have been identified as the two provinces where labour exploitation is most prominent.<sup>4</sup> The constant race for cheap goods nurtures the exploitation of the labour of human beings. People are forced to work in deplorable conditions with little or no pay, often without any days off.

Industries where labour trafficking can occur include:

- Agriculture
- Construction
- Domestic work
- Garment industry
- Hospitality

#### Canada & Labour Exploitation

- The Temporary Foreign Workers Program (TFWP) has been identified as high risk for exploitation for the following reasons:
  - New migrants may not be fully aware of their labour rights, leaving them more susceptible to exploitation.
  - Immigration requirements which issue temporary foreign workers work permits for one particular employer make people extremely vulnerable, depriving them of the possibility to change employer in case of exploitation.
  - Workers are often recruited through false job offers in their countries of residence. Once in Canada, their papers are often taken, and they are consistently threatened with deportation by the employer in order to maintain the exploitation.
- The Live-in Caregiver Program also offers many possibilities for the exploitation of workers due to the hidden nature of their work: private homes.
  - Workers may be subjected to long hours of labour, little or no pay, denial of health benefits, restricted movements, physical and/or psychological abuse, etc.
  - In Canada, women (many from the Philippines) are brought to work as caregivers. However, third party recruiters may attract workers with false promises of employment, charging large fees without providing legitimate employment.
  - Workers may also be recruited by family, friends or other people known to them to work in their own homes, leaving them with even fewer mechanisms for protection.
  - According to a statement made by the RCMP, given the fact that labour exploitation is a new issue for law enforcement, there are no official protocols or guidelines establishing the proper steps when dealing with labour trafficking.

---

<sup>4</sup> Public Safety Canada. (2012) *National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking*. <<http://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/prg/le/cmbt-trafficng-eng.aspx#toc-01.2>>

Moreover, there are no guidelines as to which factors should be taken into consideration.<sup>5</sup>

Workers have also been trafficked into Canada to work in industries ranging from food processing to technology to the service industry.<sup>6</sup> Therefore, it has been particularly difficult to target specific industries for prevention or prosecution.

### International Human Trafficking

There are many challenges related to the identification of non-Canadian trafficked persons, some of which include:

- language barriers,
- Distrust of authorities
- Fear of criminal charges
- Loyalty towards the trafficker (“Stockholm Syndrome”)
- Not self-identifying as victims or trafficked
- Fear for safety, or the safety of their families
- Traffickers might have taken away their ID, visa, passport
- Unfamiliarity with Canadian legislation and their rights as victims of a crime
- Immigration status –identified as a primary reasons why foreigners do not report being victims of human trafficking. Fear of immigration authorities, detention and deportation keep people from coming forward. These fears are not unfounded, as unwritten agreements require the Police contact Canadian Border Service Agency (CBSA) in cases of non-Canadian victims of trafficking in order to establish their status in the country.

In the City of Toronto there are currently no services available specifically for people who have been trafficked internationally. People who have been trafficked internationally may need:

- legal assistance to deal with law enforcement around their trafficking case, as well as immigration authorities
- Crisis Intervention
- Housing: both in temporary safe houses and long-term accommodation
- Medical services for: food and sleep deprivation, physical injuries (bruises, broken bones or teeth, cuts, burns), sexually transmitted diseases/infections and/or unwanted pregnancies, anxiety, post-traumatic stress, psychological conditions, depression and suicide attempts
- Counseling: to address the mental health impacts of exploitation and forced labour
- Interpretation services
- Skills development and employment: to ensure trafficking survivors are self sufficient and are less vulnerable to re-trafficking

---

<sup>5</sup> RCMP. (March 2010). Project SECLUSION, “Human Trafficking in Canada”, Report: p.31

<sup>6</sup> Ibid.

## Submission for: Consultation on Human Trafficking in Toronto

The lack of safe housing options creates a significant challenge in preventing people from being re-trafficked. As does the lack of employment support, since most people who have been trafficked are ineligible for government funded programs and initiatives, even if they have legal immigration status.

Moreover, the ambiguity regarding immigration options for people who have been trafficked are difficult to navigate. Applying for a Temporary Residence Permit (TRP) as a trafficking victim is a complicated process in which people must prove they are victims of human trafficking. TRPs are often only issued in what is considered extreme circumstances, or if there is an ongoing criminal investigation. Yet, that decision is left to the complete discretion of a Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC) officer. Moreover, automatic consultation with the Canadian Border Services Agency (CBSA) or the RCMP makes people vulnerable to detention and deportation if the TRP is not issued. The lack of affordable access to legal representation for this process increases the precariousness of the situation for people who have been trafficked and may make them more reluctant to come forward.

### Case Studies

All names and defining characteristics have been changed to protect the identity of the survivors.

#### **MARIA**

“Maria”, who is from a Latin American country, is a woman in her twenties with a university education. Her experience of human trafficking began when she was approached by her best friend’s husband, who offered her a well paid job in Canada. He promised that she would work for a nice family where she would be employed as a caretaker for an elderly person. The friend’s husband asked Maria for letters of recommendation, and for an employment contract, as well as other information - everything to make the job offer seem legitimate. At the time Maria had a professional career, but the job offer in Canada was a good opportunity for her to improve her financial situation. She was given all the travel documents necessary, as well as instructions on how to be recognized by the person who would pick her up from the airport in Canada.

When Maria arrived at the Canadian airport, the person waiting for her introduced himself as “John.” For one week John drove Maria around to different cottages to disorient her, and to abuse her verbally and sexually. After a week, he brought Maria to a house in Toronto, where she stayed for approximately one month with other workers from Latin America. When she did go out, she was under John’s constant surveillance.

One day, at the bus stop near the house where she was living, Maria was approached by two men. They asked her where she was living and told her that they knew what she was going through because they had lived in the house and managed to escape. They offered to help Maria



## Submission for: Consultation on Human Trafficking in Toronto

and invited her to stay in their house. Left with no choice, Maria put her life in the hands of strangers. They advised her to claim asylum, since her visa was expired and she was staying in Canada irregularly. Maria submitted her refugee claim. She also approached an immigration officer and revealed her story, at which point she was advised to seek trauma counselling. The immigration officer did not consider her situation human trafficking, and the RCMP did not take Maria's case either. They concluded that because she was under the control of "the employer" for a short period, it did not constitute a human trafficking offence. Maria's refugee claim was denied, but she was able to stay on Humanitarian & Compassionate grounds.

**NOTE:** Maria's experience is not a "typical" human trafficking case. Her experience took place a number of years ago when few institutions or organizations had any knowledge of human trafficking. The international definition of human trafficking does not provide any reference to a time period that a person should be under the control of the trafficker in order for the case to be considered a human trafficking case.

### SOPHIA

"Sophia" is a woman in her twenties from Eastern Europe. In her hometown she worked as a fashion and hand model. Her experience of human trafficking began when she answered an advertisement in the newspaper for a modeling job in Canada. She was immediately contacted by the recruiters who convinced her that the job offer was legitimate. Sophia was provided with two passports: one from an EU country and one from another country. With the EU passport she was instructed to travel to a specific EU country and then to use the other passport to go to Canada. She arrived in Montreal where two men waited for her and took her to Toronto. She was brought to a house and was assigned a basement room to sleep in. Once in the house, Sophia was told to hand over her passports and IDs. At that point it was explained to her that she would work as an escort. Every night she would be taken to a client's house by the company's driver, who would wait for her while she was with the client and then bring her back.

Sophia was devastated and scared. She was told that if she refused to obey she would be badly hurt. She worked for approximately two months. During that time she managed to develop a close friendship with her driver. He was moved by her story and promised to help her. One day the driver came to collect Sophia, but instead of taking her to a client's house, he took her to a lawyer's office. When the lawyer heard her story he told her that the police would be the best authority to help with her case. The driver then took her to the closest police station. She gave the police information about her employers and was offered protection under the witness protection program. Sophia's employers were arrested, but only charged with minor offences.

Sophia was placed in an immigration detention centre to be deported. She stayed in detention for two days, after which time someone from Toronto's bail program helped to have her released.

Sophia was subsequently helped by a Toronto-based service provider to find housing and legal assistance. She claimed asylum and was accepted in Canada as a Convention Refugee.

## **PUTI**

“Puti” is a woman in her forties from South East Asia. She was recruited in the small city where she lived to fill a position as a domestic worker in Canada. She accepted the position to improve her economic situation. Puti then travelled to Canada where she was greeted by her employer and moved to a small town. Her passport and identity documents were taken from her immediately and she was informed that she would work as a caretaker in the family home five days a week and additionally work in the family business two days a week. She was forced to work very long hours without pay and was obliged to sleep on the floor in the family home.

Unable to speak English or French, Puti could not communicate with anyone other than her “employers,” or “master” as she called them. Moreover, her family in South East Asia was threatened in order to ensure her continued servitude. She remained in this situation for two years until she learned about 911 and felt enough anger at her situation to overcome her fear.

The police moved her from the small town, but she then had to seek help to regularize her immigration status and bring charges against her trafficker.

## **Key Challenges**

Stemming from a nation-wide consultation on human trafficking organized by the Canadian Council for Refugees, many challenges were identified by service providers. Some of these challenges that have specifically been experienced in Toronto include:

- An ongoing need for training for social service agencies, law enforcement and relevant members of the private sector.
- Housing/shelter options: There is a lack of suitable, safe emergency and transitional housing to refer and transfer victims. Women/men, international/domestic cases have different needs and require specific attention.
- Legal representation: There is a lack of access to legal representation for survivors of human trafficking when dealing with immigration issues, labour rights or other legal aspects aside from the criminal hearing related to the trafficking situation.
- Employment support services: There is a lack of access to employment support services for survivors of human trafficking who are not eligible for most provincial or federal programs. Finding secure employment is very important to keep people self-sufficient and out of their trafficking situation.
- Appropriate care and after-care services: From identification to independence, it is necessary to help survivors deal with various and complex issues and support them to prevent re-victimization.



## Submission for: Consultation on Human Trafficking in Toronto

- **Stigma:** There is frequent stigmatization of clients by health providers, law enforcement and immigration officials leading to limited, inappropriate or a complete lack of services.

### Recommendations

Based on the Four Ps (Prevention, Protection, Promotion and Partnership) identified in the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children (Palermo Protocol) we recommend that the city take a multi-stakeholder approach to the issue.<sup>7</sup>

In terms of protection and prevention, the city should promote widespread training through by-laws, and other municipal policies, on the issue of human trafficking (domestic and international, for labour and sexual exploitation) for city officials, law enforcement, relevant private sector businesses (including taxi companies, hotel and nightclub workers, among others), health care professions and social service agencies.

With regards to promotion and partnership, the city should strive to work in close collaboration with service providing organizations, as well as other stakeholders, to maintain a current and holistic understanding of the principle issues and challenges. The city should also work with other municipalities and the province to address the root causes of human trafficking and develop best practices in dealing with the issues related to human trafficking.

### In Conclusion

There are many issues that urgently need to be addressed to combat human trafficking in Toronto. Consideration must be given to the specific and unique needs of people who have been trafficked both internationally as well as domestically, for labour or sexual exploitation. Systematic collaboration is needed between the City, law enforcement and NGOs to establish protocols to work towards the protection, prevention and punishment elements of the Palermo protocol and provide the most appropriate services and support for the survivors of these crimes.

---

<sup>7</sup> The Palermo Protocol, which has been signed by 117 countries (including Canada), proposes the first internationally agreed definition of trafficking in persons. According to Article 3: "Trafficking in persons shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation.