

Parking Ticket Activity – 2012

Date:	March 27, 2013
To:	Government Management Committee
From:	Treasurer
Wards:	All
Reference Number:	P:\2013\Internal Services\rev\gm13007rev (AFS15626)

SUMMARY

This report provides information on the total number and type of parking infraction notices (i.e., parking tickets) issued in 2012, as well as information on cancellation activity, trial requests, court conviction activity, and collection rates. This year's Parking Ticket Activity Report is being submitted together with the "Annual Report – 2012 Parking Enforcement Unit Estimated Tag Issuance Report" considered by the Toronto Police Service Board on February 19, 2013, which identifies enforcement related activity for 2012. In future years, both reports will continue to be submitted together.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Treasurer recommends that:

1. Government Management Committee receive this report for information.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications arising from this report.

The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

Staff report annually on parking ticket issuance, collection and cancellation activity. The 2011 Parking Ticket Activity report received by Government Management Committee at its meeting held on March 28, 2012 is available at:

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2012.GM12.2>

At its meeting of June 8 and 9, 2010, City Council, in its consideration of Audit Committee report AU16.1 "*Issues Respecting Parking Tag Issuance and Cancellation*", requested the Treasurer to report annually to Government Management Committee on the number of tickets cancelled in each category with a view to using the data to evaluate the City's parking ticket cancellation protocol. The link to the Council decision and staff report is:

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2010/au/reports/2010-05-14-au16-cr.htm#AU16.1>

The City continues to use the Council approved "Parking Ticket Cancellation Guidelines" when considering cancellation of parking tickets. These Guidelines were approved at City Council on June 8 and 9, 2010, and subsequently revised by Council on July 11, 12 and 13, 2012. Council's approval is available at:

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2012.GM15.8>

The City's current Parking Ticket Cancellation Guidelines are available at:

http://www.toronto.ca/pay-toronto-tickets/pdf/cancellation_guidelines.pdf

ISSUE BACKGROUND

The purpose of the City's various parking by-laws is to regulate the movement of traffic on City streets and to help ensure smooth traffic flow and safe City streets. Fines that have been established for parking related offences serve as a deterrent to illegal parking.

The Toronto Police Service (TPS), through its Parking Enforcement Unit, is responsible for parking enforcement and enforcement practices. The TPS issues the majority of the City's parking tickets each year. However, approximately 9% of all tickets are issued by trained Municipal Law Enforcement Officers (MLEOs). MLEOs are independent private agencies whose staff are trained and certified by the TPS to issue parking tickets on private or municipal property throughout the City of Toronto. MLEO agencies are required to obtain a license from the City's Municipal Licensing and Standards Division in order to operate in the City. Some of the City's agencies, such as the TTC and Toronto Parking Authority, employ MLEOs to enforce off-street parking in their respective areas. Currently, there are approximately 2,500 MLEOs working for 115 different agencies.

Revenue Services Division is responsible for processing and collecting fines for all parking tickets issued in the City of Toronto.

COMMENTS

In 2012, the City of Toronto issued 2,761,802 parking tickets. Approximately 2.5 million tickets were issued by the TPS and the balance of the tickets were issued by MLEOs. Of all the 2,761,802 tickets issued in 2012, approximately 35.6% or 984,011 were issued to vehicles registered outside of Toronto, and 4.7% or 131,562 were issued to vehicles registered outside of Ontario. The remaining 59.6% or 1,646,229 tickets were issued to vehicles where the vehicle ownership is listed as a Toronto address.

Table 1 below provides a breakdown of the number of tickets issued in 2012 (with a comparison to 2011) by issuing officer/unit.

Table 1: Number of Parking Tickets Issued by Unit

	2011	2012	Increase / (Decrease)	% change
Toronto Police Services: Parking Enforcement Officers	2,556,422	2,507,251	(49,171)	-1.9%
Toronto Police Services: Police Officers/Cadets	8,874	10,051	1,177	13.3%
Subtotal: Toronto Police Services	2,565,296	2,517,302	(47,994)	-1.9%
Municipal Law Enforcement Officers (MLEO's)	256,993	243,447	(13,546)	-5.3%
Other (Tickets issued where the unit code or officer and company identifier was missing or unknown)	11,498	1,053	(10,445)	-90.8%
TOTAL	2,833,787	2,761,802	(71,985)	-2.5%

The overall number of parking tickets issued in 2012 is fewer than the number issued in 2011 by approximately 2.5 per cent (there were 71,985 fewer parking tickets issued in 2012). The Toronto Police Service Parking Enforcement Unit have advised that contributing factors to this decrease in issuance are an increase in the number of "calls for service" received, whereby Parking Enforcement Officers are required to attend private property or other areas, and an increase in the number of "relocates," whereby Parking Enforcement Officers are tasked with re-locating vehicles due to weather, community events, construction or other investigations. Both of these events result in a reduction in the number of hours actually spent by Parking Enforcement Officers issuing tickets on assigned routes.

Parking Ticket Issuance by Offence Type

Attachment 1 to this report provides a detailed breakdown of parking tickets issued in 2012 by offence type, sorted in order of ticket issuance (i.e., highest number of tickets issued to lowest), with a comparison to 2011.

In 2012, the largest category of tickets were issued under "Expired Meter" offences (i.e., offences related to failing to deposit the fee in parking meters or Pay and Display machines) and "No Parking" (i.e., offences related to prohibited parking areas such as major arterial roadways and transit routes). These two categories represented approximately 42 per cent of all parking tickets issued in 2012.

The next highest category of offences was "No Valid Permit" (i.e., offences where vehicles are ticketed for failing to display a valid residential parking permit) which represented approximately 16% of all tickets issued in 2012.

Collection Activity for Tickets Issued in 2012 & Prior Years

Attachment 2 to this report provides information on tickets issued each year since 1989, and the number of tickets that have been paid as at December 31, 2012. Staff continue to

report out on collection activity back to 1989 since the City continues to receive parking ticket fine payments in 2012 for tickets issued in 1989.

Attachment 3 to this report focuses on 2012, providing information on the number and dollar value of tickets issued in 2012 and how many of those tickets have been paid as at December 31, 2012. Attachment 3 identifies that the just over 50% of tickets issued in 2012 were paid as at December 31, 2012 (the collection rate is 51% based on number of tickets issued and paid, and 55% based on dollar value of tickets issued and paid). However, based on an analysis of prior years' collections experience, and given that offenders will continue to pay 2012 parking tickets in 2013 and later years (when renewing their license plates at the Ministry of Transportation), staff project a long-term average collection rate of approximately 80 per cent for all tickets issued for all years from 1989 – 2012, in line with the long term historical average collection rate.

As noted above and demonstrated in Attachment 2, the City continues to collect on parking tickets issued in prior years. In 2012, payments were received for tickets issued in 2011, as well as tickets issued between 1989 and 2010. For example, 269 parking tickets issued in 1989 were paid in 2012. Although staff are unable to determine exactly why these payments continue to be received for tickets that were issued as far back as twenty-four (24) years ago, it is believed that some of these payments are generated when drivers re-activate a dormant license plate.

Trial Requests and Court Conviction Activity

In 2012, 357,351 parking ticket recipients requested a trial. This total represents approximately 13 per cent of all tickets issued in 2012.

Of the 283,563 tickets that went to trial in 2012, a total of 182,064 (or 64 percent) received a conviction by the Justice of the Peace at trial. While roughly 357,000 trial requests were submitted in 2012, the total number of parking tickets scheduled into court for trial in 2012 was 283,563. The reason that the number of tickets heard in court (total on docket) is less than the number of tickets for which trial requests were filed is indicative of the fact that court hearings scheduled in 2012 reflect available court capacity, and would have included trials for tickets issued in 2011 and prior years. Additionally, a certain percentage of tickets for which trial requests are made are subsequently paid before the trial date, or are withdrawn by the prosecutor before coming to trial.

Attachment 4 to this report provides a breakdown of trial requests and court conviction activity for tickets issued in 2012 and other years where court activity was required or requested by the offender.

Cancellations and Withdrawals

In 2012, of the 2,761,802 tickets issued, 633,108 or 22.91 per cent of the total tickets issued were cancelled for a variety of reasons. The reasons for cancellations include tickets cancelled by staff at the City's First Appearance Facilities (parking ticket counters) under the Council-approved Parking Ticket Cancellation guidelines, tickets

issued to out-of-province vehicles for which ownership information cannot be obtained, tickets that were cancelled because the offender drove away prior to the ticket being served, and tickets cancelled in court by Prosecutors or the Judiciary.

Table 2, below, outlines and categorizes all tickets cancelled in 2012.

Table 2: Breakdown of Parking Tickets Cancelled – 2012

Parking Tickets Cancelled in 2011		Parking Tickets Cancelled in 2012		Reason for Cancellation
#	%	#	%	
45,361	1.60%	199,215	7.21%	Cancelled/Non-Conviction by Justice of the Peace at Trial
138,315	4.88%	143,812	5.21%	Cancelled by Revenue Services' Parking Ticket staff for various reasons, including utility or roadwork, by-law exemptions, missing signs, time allowances, etc.
124,193	4.38%	131,562	4.76%	Out-of-Province – tickets issued to out-of-province vehicles where license plate and owner information is unavailable.
109,350	3.86%	97,356	3.53%	Drove Away – offender drives away before officer can serve the tag.
56,808	2.00%	50,113	1.81%	Plate errors – plate does not exist, plate is unattached
9,708	0.34%	5,622	0.20%	Error on parking tag.
8,407	0.30%	4,914	0.18%	Incomplete – information is missing.
1,043	0.04%	514	0.02%	Illegible – processing staff are unable to read the tag.
493,185	17.40%	633,108	22.92%	

The total number of parking tickets cancelled in 2012 increased significantly by 139,923 over 2011 cancellations (5.52% more tickets were cancelled than the previous year). This increase is likely attributable to two reasons:

1. The change in the time allowance provision from 5-minutes to 10-minutes (approved by Council in July of 2012) which allowed cancellation of tickets for time-limited parking offences (e.g. pay-and-display tickets), where offenders overstayed their allotted parking time by 10 minutes instead of 5 minutes.
2. As the existence of the City's Parking Ticket Cancellation Guidelines becomes better known among the public, it is expected that the number of cancellations would increase. The release of the Ombudsman's Report in November 2012 related to Parking Ticket Disputes also highlighted the City's adoption of published Cancellation Guidelines, which has resulted in more customers seeking to have their parking tickets cancelled under provisions within the Cancellation Guidelines.

While the statistics provided in Table 2 of this report provide a summary of parking ticket cancellations by type, the categories listed under Table 2 do not exactly match the cancellation categories in the City's Parking Ticket Cancellation Guidelines. This is due to the fact that the current Parking Ticket Management System (PTMS) database contains multiple codes for cancellations that do not align with the cancellation criteria in the guidelines. However, effective January 1, 2013, Revenue Services has modified the

cancellation "Reason Codes" to better align these codes with the categories in the cancellation guidelines. This change will enhance reporting in future years and will enable better analysis of cancellation trends.

CONTACT

Casey Brendon
Director, Revenue Services
416-392-8065
cbrendo@toronto.ca

Anthony Fabrizi
Manager, Utility Billing and Parking
Tickets, Revenue Services
416-392-5880
afabriz@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Giuliana Carbone
Treasurer

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1: Breakdown of Parking Offences – 2011 and 2012

Attachment 2: Collection Activity for Parking Tickets Issued in 2012 & Prior Years
(1989-2011)

Attachment 3: Collection Activity, by month, for Parking Tickets Issued in 2012.

Attachment 4: Summary of Trial Requests and Court Conviction Activity – 2012

Attachment 1
Breakdown of Parking Offences – 2011 and 2012

Bylaw / Offence	Set Fine Amount	Tickets Issued 2011		Tickets Issued 2012	
		#	%	#	%
Expired Meter Offences – “Park at Expired Meter, Fail to deposit fee/display receipt”	\$30.00	609,812	21.88%	594,355	21.52%
No Parking – “Park Signed Highway during Prohibited Times/Days”	\$40.00	582,277	20.55%	569,783	20.63%
No Valid Permit - “Park (Prohibited area/location) without a Permit”	\$30.00	452,958	15.98%	428,462	15.51%
Private Property - “Park Vehicle on Private Property without Consent”	\$30.00	336,907	11.89%	333,040	12.06%
No Stopping - “Stop Vehicle signed Highway Prohibited Time/Day”	\$60.00	191,625	6.76%	184,223	6.67%
Parking – 3 Hour Limit - “Park Longer than 3 Hours”	\$30.00	118,828	4.19%	114,813	4.16%
No Standing – “Stand Vehicle signed Highway Prohibited Time/Day”	\$60.00	113,468	4.00%	110,473	4.00%
Parking Excess Time – “Park Signed Highway in excess of Permitted Time”	\$30.00	98,338	3.47%	102,710	3.72%
Fire Hydrant – “Park – 3M of Fire Hydrant”	\$100.00	42,626	1.50%	39,710	1.44%
No Parking 2:00am – 6:00am in North York from Dec 1 to Mar 31	\$30.00	32,361	1.14%	34,721	1.26%
Other Offences – Parking in Parks, Park facing wrong direction, etc.	\$15-\$150*	49,843	1.76%	47,571	1.72%
Stop Sidewalk/Footpath - “Stop - on/over sidewalk/footpath”	\$60.00	26,870	0.95%	25,447	0.92%
Parking – Public Lane - “Park in Public Lane”	\$30.00	22,735	0.80%	24,246	0.87%
Fire Route – “Park Vehicle in Designated Fire Routes”	\$250.00	24,788	0.87%	21,428	0.78%
Parking – Transit Zone - “Stand Vehicle - Signed Highway – Transit Zone”	\$60.00	18,850	0.67%	18,418	0.67%
Unauthorized Parking on Boulevard	\$50.00	13,921	0.49%	16,371	0.59%
Park Passenger/Freight Loading Zones contrary to Permitted times	\$40.00	15,676	0.55%	16,358	0.59%
Parking – 9M Intersection - “Park - 9M of Intersecting Highway”	\$60.00	18,594	0.66%	16,032	0.58%
Disabled Parking - “Park Vehicle in Designated Disable Parking Space”	\$60.00-\$450	12,420	0.44%	12,257	0.44%
Municipal Offences - “Park Vehicle on Municipal Property without Consent”	\$30.00	8,146	0.29%	10,621	0.38%
Stand Signed Taxi Cab Stand	\$30.00	6,393	0.23%	6,073	0.22%
Park in Park Not in Designated Area	\$105.00	4,949	0.17%	5,999	0.22%
Parking – Parallel to Curb – “Fail to Park/Stop Parallel to curb”	\$20.00	7,042	0.25%	5,738	0.21%
Park not within period permitted	\$30.00	6,124	0.22%	4,940	0.18%
Parking - “Park/Obstruct Driveway/Laneway”	\$40.00	4,741	0.17%	4,479	0.16%
Fail to Park/Stop Parallel to Right Hand Side of Highway	\$15.00	4,368	0.15%	4,376	0.16%
Park Contrary to Posted Condition	\$105.00	2,744	0.10%	3,222	0.12%
Stop Roadway Side of any Stopped or Parked Vehicle	\$60.00	2,725	0.10%	2,607	0.09%
Stop Within 9.0M of Crosswalk	\$60.00	1,892	0.07%	1,964	0.07%
Park Heavy Truck Highway, Prohibited Times/Days	\$90.00	1,766	0.06%	1,365	0.05%
Totals		2,833,787	100%	2,761,802	100%

* The “Other Offences” category is a summation of all other parking offences where the number of tickets issued is under 1,000. The fines in this category range from \$15 - \$150.

Attachment 2
Collection Activity for Parking Tickets Issued in 2012 & Prior Years
(1989-2012)

Year	Number of Tickets Issued	Number of Tickets Paid as of Dec 31, 2011 (a)	Number of Tickets Paid in 2012 (b)	Number of Tickets Paid as of Dec 31, 2012 (a + b)	Collection Rate as of Dec 31, 2011
	#	#	#	#	%
1989	803,723	650,390	269	650,659	80.96%
1990	3,144,174	2,425,308	2,302	2,427,610	77.21%
1991	2,929,574	2,293,755	1,841	2,295,596	78.36%
1992	2,639,282	1,938,292	853	1,939,145	73.47%
1993	2,598,057	2,004,468	1,061	2,005,529	77.19%
1994	2,481,123	1,980,196	1,132	1,981,328	79.86%
1995	2,284,687	1,790,723	1,240	1,791,963	78.43%
1996	2,575,178	1,976,320	1,356	1,977,676	76.80%
1997	2,570,146	1,965,366	1,138	1,966,504	76.51%
1998	2,633,616	2,044,425	1,312	2,045,737	77.68%
1999	2,546,102	2,045,219	1,512	2,046,731	80.39%
2000	2,760,301	2,252,622	2,189	2,254,811	81.69%
2001	2,796,949	2,253,269	2,625	2,255,894	80.66%
2002	2,934,214	2,231,939	1,976	2,233,915	76.13%
2003	3,108,663	2,404,749	2,979	2,407,728	77.45%
2004	3,076,149	2,422,016	3,966	2,425,982	78.86%
2005	2,858,353	1,914,696	3,795	1,918,491	67.12%
2006	2,852,100	2,007,396	3,927	2,011,323	70.52%
2007	2,888,234	2,125,614	6,842	2,132,456	73.83%
2008	2,902,929	2,049,409	12,326	2,061,735	71.02%
2009	2,794,460	1,542,738	62,506	1,605,244	57.44%
2010	2,787,071	1,773,346	182,916	1,956,262	70.19%
2011	2,833,787	1,405,400	483,817	1,889,217	66.67%
2012	2,761,802	N/A	1,408,882	1,408,882	51.01%

Attachment 3
Collection Activity, by Month, for Parking Tickets Issued in 2012

Month	Number of Tickets Issued	Number of Tickets Paid as at Dec. 31, 2012	% of tickets paid at Dec. 31 2012	Original Face Value of Tickets Issued	Dollar value of Tickets Paid as at Dec 31,2012	% of dollar value paid as at Dec. 31 2012
	#	#	%	\$	\$	%
Jan	231,362	51,111	22.1	7,838,060	1,850,829	23.6
Feb	227,490	92,892	40.8	7,739,426	3,354,856	43.4
Mar	260,061	119,029	45.8	8,722,448	4,288,829	49.2
Apr	230,060	115,717	50.3	7,797,741	4,205,375	53.9
May	237,660	129,533	54.5	8,195,518	4,744,866	57.9
Jun	227,743	117,063	51.4	7,799,351	4,324,674	55.5
Jul	223,273	121,470	54.4	7,733,822	4,486,475	58.0
Aug	226,614	126,153	55.7	7,666,901	4,696,557	61.3
Sep	227,382	121,710	53.5	7,647,073	4,461,947	58.4
Oct	235,366	136,821	58.1	7,999,122	4,996,243	62.5
Nov	235,963	147,370	62.5	8,062,017	5,444,567	67.5
Dec	198,828	130,013	65.4	6,922,221	4,766,989	68.9
Total	2,761,802	1,408,882	51.0	94,123,700	51,622,207	54.9

Note: Based on an analysis of prior years' collections experience, and given that offenders will continue to pay 2012 parking tickets in 2013 and later years (when renewing their license plates at the Ministry of Transportation), staff project a long-term average collection rate of approximately 80 per cent for tickets issued in 2012.

Attachment 4
Summary of Trial Requests and Court Conviction Activity - 2012

2012	Number of Tickets Issued #	Number of Trial Requests #	Percentage of Trial Requests %	Total on Docket ¹ #	Total Convicted ² #	Percentage Convicted %
January	231,229	31,107	13.45%	17,142	14,188	82.77%
February	227,143	30,051	13.23%	42,354	13,161	31.07%
March	259,978	33,336	12.82%	20,880	14,710	70.45%
April	230,114	28,785	12.51%	14,196	11,373	80.11%
May	237,846	31,601	13.29%	23,798	18,279	76.81%
June	228,079	28,183	12.36%	29,182	19,270	66.03%
July	223,661	29,955	13.39%	14,630	11,710	80.04%
August	226,643	29,441	12.99%	30,638	15,066	49.17%
September	227,161	28,623	12.60%	20,554	14,564	70.86%
October	235,338	30,723	13.05%	20,907	17,371	83.09%
November	235,997	31,147	13.20%	21,829	18,007	82.49%
December	198,613	24,399	12.28%	27,453	14,365	52.33%
Total 2012	2,761,802	357,351	12.94%	283,563	182,064	64.21%