

# STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

# Parking Ticket Activity – 2013

Date:	April 28, 2014
To:	Government Management Committee
From:	Treasurer
Wards:	All
Reference Number:	P:\2014\Internal Services\rev\gm14012rev (AFS18863)

# **SUMMARY**

This report provides information on the total number and type of parking infraction notices (i.e., parking tickets) issued in 2013, as well as information on cancellation activity, trial requests, court conviction activity, and collection rates. This year's Parking Ticket Activity Report is being submitted to the Government Management Committee together with a report from Toronto Police Service: "Annual Report – 2013 Parking Enforcement Unit Estimated Tag Issuance Report," which identifies enforcement related activity for 2013. The Government Management Committee had previously requested that these reports be submitted concurrently.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

# The Treasurer recommends that:

1. The Government Management Committee receive this report for information.

#### Financial Impact

There are no financial implications arising from this report.

The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

#### **DECISION HISTORY**

Staff report annually on parking ticket issuance, collection and cancellation activity.

The 2012 Parking Ticket Activity report (Item GM21.6) was considered and received for information by the Government Management Committee at its meeting of April 8, 2013. Link to 2012 report:

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2013.GM21.6

The City continues to use the Council approved "Parking Ticket Cancellation Guidelines" when considering cancellation of parking tickets. These Guidelines were approved by City Council at its meeting of June 8 and 9, 2010. The City's Parking Ticket Cancellation Guidelines were revised in 2013 following a request from Council to incorporate criteria to allow for cancellations for meter and pay and display offences where 10 minutes or less had expired from the expiry of the paid parking period. The Cancellation Guidelines are available at:

 $\frac{http://www1.toronto.ca/City\%20Of\%20Toronto/Revenue\%20Services/Tickets/Files/pdf/}{C/cancellation\_guidelines.pdf}$ 

Further and most recently, at its meeting of April 1, 2 and 3, 2014, Council, in adopting Item GM28.6: *Grace Periods for Parking Offences*, approved amendments to the City's parking ticket by-laws to provide for a ten-minute grace period for on street pay-and-display parking, i.e., such that tickets are not issued within 10 minutes of the expiry of the purchased time indicated on the pay-and-display receipt. Link to Council item: <a href="http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2014.GM28.6">http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2014.GM28.6</a>

## **ISSUE BACKGROUND**

The purpose of the City's various parking by-laws is to regulate the movement of traffic on City streets and to help ensure smooth traffic flow and safe City streets. Fines that have been established for parking related offences serve as a deterrent to illegal parking.

The Toronto Police Service (TPS), through its Parking Enforcement Unit, is responsible for parking enforcement and enforcement practices. The TPS issues the majority of the City's parking tickets each year. However, approximately 7% to 9% of all tickets are issued by trained Municipal Law Enforcement Officers (MLEOs). MLEOs are independent private agencies whose staff are trained and certified by the TPS to issue parking tickets on private or municipal property throughout the City of Toronto. MLEO agencies are required to obtain a license from the City's Municipal Licensing and Standards Division in order to operate in the City. Some of the City's agencies, such as the TTC and Toronto Parking Authority, employ MLEOs to enforce off-street parking in their respective areas. Currently, there are approximately 2,500 MLEOs working for 115 different agencies.

Revenue Services Division is responsible for processing and collecting fines for all parking tickets issued in the City of Toronto.

#### COMMENTS

In 2013, the City of Toronto issued 2,630,402 parking tickets. Approximately 2.4 million tickets were issued by the TPS and the balance of the tickets was issued by MLEOs.

Table 1 below provides a breakdown of the number of tickets issued in 2013 (with a comparison to 2012) by issuing officer/unit.

Increase / 2012 2013 (Decrease) Toronto Police Services: Parking Enforcement 2.507.251 2.430.294 (76,957)Officers Toronto Police Services: Police Officers/Cadets 10,051 8,333 (1,718)Subtotal: Toronto Police Services 2,517,302 2,438,627 (78,675)Municipal Law Enforcement Officers (MLEO's) 244,500 191,775 (52,725)**TOTAL** 2,761,802 2,630,402 (131,400)

Table 1: Number of Parking Tickets Issued by Unit

The overall number of parking tickets issued in 2013 is fewer than the number issued in 2012 by approximately 4.8 per cent (there were 131,400 fewer parking tickets issued in 2013). This decrease in issuance is believed to be attributable to a number of factors including greater compliance, the grace period offered during the recent ice-storm in December 2013, an increase to "calls for service", whereby Parking Enforcement Officers attended private property or other areas for service calls and an increase in the number of "relocates," whereby Parking Enforcement Officers are tasked with re-locating vehicles due to weather, community events, construction or other investigations.

# **Parking Ticket Issuance by Offence Type**

Attachment 1 to this report provides a detailed breakdown of parking tickets issued in 2013 by offence type, sorted in order of ticket issuance (i.e., highest number of tickets issued to lowest), with a comparison to 2012.

In 2013, the largest category of tickets were issued under "Expired Meter" offences (i.e., offences related to failing to deposit the fee in parking meters or Pay and Display machines) and "No Parking" (i.e., offences related to prohibited parking areas such as major arterial roadways and transit routes). These two categories represented approximately 42.5 per cent of all parking tickets issued in 2013.

The next highest category of offences was "No Valid Permit" (i.e., offences where vehicles are ticketed for failing to display a valid residential parking permit) which represented approximately 15.7 per cent of all tickets issued in 2013.

# Collection Activity for Tickets Issued in 2012 & Prior Years

Attachment 2 to this report provides information on tickets issued each year since 1989, and the number of tickets that have been paid as at December 31, 2013. Staff continue to report on collection activity attributable to tickets issued as far back as 1989 since the City continued to receive parking ticket fine payments in 2013 for tickets issued in 1989.

Based on analysis of prior years' collections experience, staff project a long-term average collection rate of approximately 81 per cent for all years from 1989 - 2012.

Attachment 2 outlines the collection rate(s) for tickets issued in 2013 and paid as of December 31, 2013. The details show that approximately 50 per cent of parking tickets issued in 2013 were paid in 2013. However, given that offenders will continue to pay 2013 parking tickets in 2014 and later years (when renewing their license plates at the Ministry of Transportation), or following trials and disputes, the final collection rate is expected to approach approximately 81 per cent, in line with the long term historical averages.

As noted above, the City continues to collect on parking tickets issued in prior years. In 2013, payments were received for tickets issued in 2012, as well as tickets issued between 1989 and 2011. For example, 150 payments were received in 2013 that related to parking tickets issued in 1989. Although staff are unable to determine exactly why these payments continue to be received for tickets that were issued as far back as 25 years ago, it is believed that some of these payments are generated when drivers re-activate a dormant license plate.

# **Trial Requests and Court Conviction Activity**

In 2013, 332,680 parking ticket recipients requested a trial. This total represents approximately 12.7 per cent of all tickets issued in 2013.

In 2013, a total of 306,084 trials were held for parking tickets issued from 2011 to 2013. Of the tickets that went to trial in 2013, a total of 193,462 (or 63.2 per cent) received a conviction by the Justice of the Peace at trial. A total of 112,622 (or 36.2 per cent) had received acquittals by the Justices of the Peace.

Attachment 3 to this report provides a breakdown of the number of:

- a) trials requested for parking tickets issued in 2013; and,
- b) trials held for parking tickets issued from 2011 to 2013, including the outcome of the trial (i.e. the number of convictions versus the number of acquittals).

### **Cancellations and Withdrawals**

In 2013, of the 2,630,402 tickets issued, 578,250 or 22.0 per cent of the total tickets issued were cancelled for a variety of reasons. The reasons for cancellations include:

- tickets cancelled by staff at the City's First Appearance Facilities (parking ticket counters) under the Council-approved Parking Ticket Cancellation guidelines;
- tickets issued to out-of-province vehicles for which ownership information cannot be obtained;
- tickets cancelled because the offender drove away prior to the ticket being served; and,
- tickets cancelled in court by the Judiciary.

Table 2, below, outlines and categorizes all tickets cancelled in 2013.

Table 2: Breakdown of Parking Tickets Cancelled – 2013

Parking Tickets Cancelled in 2012		Parking Tickets Cancelled in 2013		Reason for Cancellation		
#	%	#	%			
199,215	7.2%	150,229	5.7%	Cancelled/Conviction by Justice of the Peace at Trial.		
143,812	5.2%	129,281	4.9%	Cancelled by Parking Ticket staff for various reasons, contained within the Cancellation Guidelines.		
131,562	4.8%	143,050	5.4%	Out-of-Province – issued to out-of-province vehicles - license plate/owner information not available.		
97,356	3.5%	91,885	3.5%	Drove Away – offender drives away before officer can serve the ticket.		
50,113	1.8%	55,932	2.1%	Plate errors – plate does not exist, plate is unattached		
11,050	1.7%	7,873	0.3%	Error on parking ticket <sup>*1</sup> .		
633,108	22.9%	578,250	22.0%			

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>\*1</sup> Note: "Error on Parking Ticket" includes incomplete, information missing and illegible. Overall error rate was reduced in 2013 from 0.40% to 0.29%.

The total number of parking tickets cancelled in 2013 (578,250 tickets) was 54,858 tickets lower than the number of tickets cancelled in 2012 (633,108). In addition, the percentage of tickets cancelled in 2013 (22%) is also slightly lower than 2012 (22.9%). The largest decreases are in two areas:

- a) tickets cancelled in court by the Judiciary or Courts (Crown/Justice of the Peace);
- b) tickets cancelled by Parking Ticket staff for various reasons contained within the Council approved Parking Ticket Cancellation Guidelines. Staff believe that enhanced publication / promotion of the guidelines on the City's website and at each of the City's First Appearance Facilities (i.e. parking ticket counters) has led to a better understanding of the Cancellation Guidelines by the public, resulting in fewer cancellation requests. Additionally, there were also 24,671 fewer trial requests in 2013 (332,680), compared to 2012 (357,351).

# **CONTACT**

Casey Brendon Director, Revenue Services 416-392-8065 cbrendo@toronto.ca Anthony Fabrizi
Manager, Utility Billing & Parking Tickets,
Revenue Services
416-392-5880, afabriz@toronto.ca

## **SIGNATURE**

\_\_\_\_\_

Giuliana Carbone Treasurer

#### **ATTACHMENTS**

Attachment 1: Breakdown of Parking Offences – 2012 and 2013

Attachment 2: Collection Activity for Parking Tickets Issued in 2013 & Prior Years

(1989-2013)

Attachment 3: Summary of Trial Requests and Court Conviction Activity – 2013

# Attachment 1 Breakdown of Parking Offences – 2012 and 2013

Bylaw / Offence	Set Fine Amount	Tickets Issued 2012		Tickets Issued 2013	
		#	%	#	%
<b>Expired Meter Offences –</b> "Park at Expired Meter, Fail to deposit fee/display receipt"	\$30.00	594,355	21.52%	571,844	21.74%
<b>No Parking –</b> "Park Signed Highway during Prohibited Times/Days	\$40.00	569,783	20.63%	546,012	20.76%
No Valid Permit - "Park (Prohibited area/location) without a Permit"	\$30.00	428,462	15.51%	413,664	15.73%
Private Property - "Park Vehicle on Private Property without Consent"	\$30.00	333,040	12.06%	300,519	11.42%
<b>No Stopping -</b> "Stop Vehicle signed Highway Prohibited Time/Day"	\$60.00	184,223	6.67%	180,131	6.85%
Parking – 3 Hour Limit - "Park Longer than 3 Hours"	\$30.00	114,813	4.16%	119,026	4.53%
<b>No Standing</b> – "Stand Vehicle signed Highway Prohibited Time/Day"	\$60.00	110,473	4.00%	107,436	4.08%
Parking Excess Time – "Park Signed Highway in excess of Permitted Time"	\$30.00	102,710	3.72%	95,354	3.63%
Fire Hydrant – "Park – 3M of Fire Hydrant"	\$100.00	39,710	1.44%	38,098	1.45%
No Parking 2:00am – 6:00am in North York from Dec 1 to Mar 31	\$30.00	34,721	1.26%	29,661	1.13%
Other Offences – Parking in Parks, Park facing wrong direction, etc.	\$15- \$150*	47,571	1.72%	39,643	1.51%
Stop Sidewalk/Footpath - "Stop - on/over sidewalk/footpath"	\$60.00	25,447	0.92%	26,212	1.00%
Parking – Public Lane - "Park in Public Lane"	\$30.00	24,246	0.87%	21,978	0.84%
Fire Route – "Park Vehicle in Designated Fire Routes"	\$250.00	21,428	0.78%	21,664	0.82%
Parking – Transit Zone - "Stand Vehicle - Signed Highway – Transit Zone"	\$60.00	18,418	0.67%	18,267	0.69%
Unauthorized Parking on Boulevard	\$50.00	16,371	0.59%	15,080	0.57%
Park Passenger/Freight Loading Zones contrary to Permitted times	\$40.00	16,358	0.59%	14,008	0.53%
Parking – 9M Intersection - "Park - 9M of Intersecting Highway"	\$60.00	16,032	0.58%	16,263	0.62%
<b>Disabled Parking -</b> "Park Vehicle in Designated Disable Parking Space"	\$60.00- \$450	12,257	0.44%	12,014	0.46%
Municipal Offences - "Park Vehicle on Municipal Property without Consent"	\$30.00	10,621	0.38%	7,676	0.29%
Stand Signed Taxi Cab Stand	\$30.00	6,073	0.22%	4,807	0.18%
Park in Park Not in Designated Area	\$105.00	5,999	0.22%	4,177	0.16%
Parking – Parallel to Curb – "Fail to Park/Stop Parallel to curb"	\$20.00	5,738	0.21%	6,320	0.24%
Park not within period permitted	\$30.00	4,940	0.18%	3,838	0.15%
Parking - "Park/Obstruct Driveway/Laneway"	\$40.00	4,479	0.16%	4,498	0.17%
Fail to Park/Stop Parallel to Right Hand Side of Highway	\$15.00	4,376	0.16%	3,534	0.13%
Park Contrary to Posted Condition	\$105.00	3,222	0.12%	3,115	0.12%
Stop Roadway Side of any Stopped or Parked Vehicle	\$60.00	2,607	0.09%	2,346	0.09%
Stop Within 9.0M of Crosswalk	\$60.00	1,964	0.07%	1,501	0.06%
Park Heavy Truck Highway, Prohibited Times/Days	\$90.00	1,365	0.05%	1,716	0.07%
Totals		2,761,802	100%	2,630,402	100%

<sup>\*</sup> The "Other Offences" category is a summation of all other parking offences where the number of tickets issued is under 1,000. The fines in this category range from \$15 - \$150.

# Attachment 2 Collection Activity for Parking Tickets Issued in 2013 & Prior Years (1989-2013)

Year	Number of Tickets Issued	Number of Tickets Paid as of Dec 31, 2012 (a)	Number of Tickets Paid in 2013 (b)	Total Number of Tickets Paid as of Dec 31, 2013 (a + b)	Collection Rate as of Dec 31, 2013
	#	#	#	#	%
1989	803,723	650,390	150	650,540	80.9%
1990	3,144,174	2,425,308	1,069	2,426,377	77.2%
1991	2,929,574	2,293,755	821	2,294,576	78.3%
1992	2,639,282	1,938,292	486	1,938,778	73.5%
1993	2,598,057	2,004,468	545	2,005,013	77.2%
1994	2,481,123	1,980,196	557	1,980,753	79.8%
1995	2,284,687	1,790,723	1,113	1,791,836	78.4%
1996	2,575,178	1,976,320	1,189	1,977,509	76.8%
1997	2,570,146	1,965,366	1,149	1,966,515	76.5%
1998	2,633,616	2,044,425	1,272	2,045,697	77.7%
1999	2,546,102	2,045,219	1,620	2,046,839	80.4%
2000	2,760,301	2,252,622	1,887	2,254,509	81.7%
2001	2,796,949	2,253,269	2,542	2,255,811	80.6%
2002	2,934,214	2,231,939	2,295	2,234,234	76.1%
2003	3,108,663	2,404,749	2,795	2,407,544	77.5%
2004	3,076,149	2,422,016	2,961	2,424,977	78.8%
2005	2,858,353	1,914,696	3,113	1,917,809	67.1%
2006	2,852,100	2,007,396	3,523	2,010,919	70.5%
2007	2,888,234	2,125,614	5,624	2,131,238	73.8%
2008	2,902,929	2,049,409	8,888	2,058,297	70.9%
2009	2,794,460	1,542,738	22,420	1,565,158	56.0%
2010	2,787,071	1,773,346	46,889	1,820,235	65.3%
2011	2,833,787	1,405,400	131,620	1,537,020	54.2%
2012	2,761,802	1,405,155	441,517	1,846,672	66.9%
2013	2,630,402		1,348,865	1,348,865	51.3%

# Attachment 3 Summary of Trial Requests and Court Conviction Activity - 2013

Tickets & Trial Requests for 2013 Tickets					
2013	Number of Tickets Issued	Number of Trial Requests	Percentage of Trial Requests		
	#	#	%		
January	206,867	32,359	15.6%		
February	183,598	26,810	14.6%		
March	224,139	20,741	9.3%		
April	228,696	28,868	12.6%		
May	237,572	31,897	13.4%		
June	229,879	25,659	11.2%		
July	229,849	23959	10.4%		
August	230,897	35691	15.5%		
September	221,194	29538	13.4%		
October	236,185	30525	12.9%		
November	229,781	25457	11.1%		
December	171,745	21176	12.3%		
Total	2,630,402	332,680	12.7%		

Court Activity for Tickets issued in 2011, 2012 & 2013					
	Convictions Acquitta			ittals	
Total # of Trials Held	Total Convicted	Percentage Convicted	Acquittals	Percentage of Acquittals	
#	#	%	#	%	
38,686	24,926	64.4%	13,760	35.6%	
36,069	20,981	58.2%	15,088	41.8%	
26,957	19,339	71.7%	7,618	28.3%	
19,222	13,121	68.3%	6,101	31.7%	
27,560	21,288	77.2%	6,272	22.8%	
39,580	21,407	54.1%	18,173	45.9%	
6,133	4,516	73.6%	1,617	26.4%	
12,703	3,291	25.9%	9,412	74.1%	
21,313	16,236	76.2%	5,077	23.8%	
32,450	17,806	54.9%	14,644	45.1%	
19,515	13,995	71.7%	5,520	28.3%	
25,896	16,556	63.9%	9,340	36.1%	
306,084	193,462	63.2%	112,622	36.8%	

Note: 2013 Court Activity figures shown above include parking tickets with trial requests from late 2012 and Re-openings/Appeals from earlier years.