GM5.12.3

From:	Roxanne St. Germain
То:	Government Management Committee
Cc:	
Subject:	Request to Investigate the BMR Application from GM5.12 of June 15, 2015
Date:	Monday, June 15, 2015 3:13:02 PM
Attachments:	Speaking at City Hall regarding the Recovery Centre.doc
	F.E.R.A.L. Centre Estimated Operating Budget January 2014 for BMR.doc
	Recovery Centre Closure March 3 2015.doc
	Recovery Centre Closing TAS and THS Minutes February 18th.doc

Dear City of Toronto Council,

I am writing to you to discuss the Item from the Government Management Committee meeting of June 15th, 2015. Item number GM5.12 with attachments GM5.12.1 and GM5.12.2. I will also be attaching several other documents to this email including my original concerns that I did not get the opportunity to voice at the GM5 meeting this morning.

First I will address concerns regarding the actual BMR application being endorsed by Toronto Animal Services. The BMR is presently under the Charitable Group Urban Cat Relief. This is no longer accurate. The Charity Urban Cat Relief publically announced that they would be stepping down from managing the Recovery Center in February 2015. At this time Toronto Animal Services approached Toronto Humane Society to take over Management and the running of the facility. THS declined to do this. By March 2015 Toronto Cat Rescue, who is already a partner with TAS, agreed to assume the Managing and day to day operating responsibilities of the location called the Toronto Feral Cat Recovery Centre. The BMR should now be invalid as the submitting group has stepped away from the physical operation of the site. This may create possible insurance and liability issues with this property, and possible financial responsibility issues as well. The Charity Urban Cat Relief does not have the manpower or financial resources to operate the facility. The \$30,000.00 capital investment discussed on page 4 paragraph 2 has actually already been performed by a private investor, who has since left supporting the project due to funds donated for a specific project being misappropriated and used elsewhere by UCR. UCR only invested a nominal amount of their own money into lease hold improvements. UCR has supported the Recovery Centre through funds provided by significant financial contributions of Toronto Animal Services, with minimal financial support from the Toronto Feral Cat Coalition Members. Urban Cat Relief has not been successful in running or managing the Feral Cat Recovery Centre. During the last 5 months of 2014 and the first 2 months of 2015 Urban Cat Relief continually requested the public to help them with volunteers, supplies, and financial contributions. During these requests for help they reiterated they could not keep the Recovery Centre open. Second I would like to address the inaccurate information provided on the numbers of the cats having accessed the facility for recovery. In the GM5.12 document on page 4 paragraph 1 it states that there have been 6,000 cats that have accessed the facility since UCR took over approximately November 2013 and stepped away from the management of the Feral Cat Recovery Centre in February 2015. It is understood that records of intake at the Feral Cat

Recovery Centre show that during this period approximately 890 cats. This reinforces the statement made by Dr. Ester Attard to me and several other people in late November or early December 2013 at a meeting held at the Feral Cat Recovery Centre attended by Glenn De Baermaeker, several members of TAS and City staff and I believe members of the TDSB. This is a far cry from the 6,000 cats being claimed in this document and repeated in the document GM5.12.2 on back of document in paragraph 4. Both of these documents also allude to the fact that TAS and the Toronto Feral Cat Coalition are responsible for the spaying and neutering of the majority of the cats in the City of Toronto that have been TNR'd. This is in fact is another miscommunication. The reality is the majority of this work is done by individual people helping the cats in the neighbourhood who receive very little support outside being able to access the free spay and neuter clinics if they qualify.

The City of Toronto has been supporting this project through money from Toronto Animal Services. The City has provided additional funds through applications made by Glen De Baermaeker which were then distributed through TAS. Now the support of the BMR application gives this project further financial support. Presently all management and all paperwork and all reference to the Feral Cat Recovery Centre show and state that Toronto Cat Rescue is in complete control of this project and provide all management and staffing needs to care for the cats. It is public knowledge that Heather Brown, Executive Director of Toronto Cat Rescue, has guit her job to take on the paid position of Managing the Feral Cat Recovery Centre. The ``Contract Wages`` are apparently coming from Toronto Cat Rescue finances. I ask you Why would a group not in charge of a facility spend the money to pay a salary that must be large enough to support quitting your previous job if they are not actually in charge of the facility? This does not make sense. It is believed that because of ongoing Union issues regarding the staffing of the Feral Cat Recovery Centre that the TAS is providing the majority of the funds to TCR for the purpose of paying the salary of Heather Brown in order to offset the Union concerns that TAS is actually running the facility and not employing Union people for this job. This concern has been discussed several times with various people by both Dr. Ester Attard and Elizabeth Glibbery, who stated to me "if you give me 10 minutes I can spin anything". We would like the possibility that TAS is actually paying the majority of this salary through TCR and in addition that the ``Contract`` was not put out for public tender as required by the City of Toronto be investigated.

I trust that these serious concerns will be investigated and this issue will be reopened for further debate or the BMR refused as the project is not a cost effective or physically responsible investment for the City of Toronto to support. Please refer to the attachments providing further insight to this issue. I especially bring your attention to the Document Tilted Speaking at City Hall Regarding the Recovery Centre document as it discusses the high cost to the city to support a project that gives access to a handful of people and is proven not to be cost effective. I am awaiting confirmation of some information and when I have it I will forward to you. Regards,

Roxanne St. Germain

Roxanne St. Germain

President, Cats Gone Wild roxanne@catsgonewild.ca

"Be bold and mighty forces will come to your aid" Johann Wolfgang Goethe BMR Recovery Centre.

In this time of cutbacks and demand for increased accountability by taxpayers I am here to speak regarding the BMR on the Feral Cat Recovery Center the City of Toronto is presently subsidizing at 705 Progress Avenue, Unit 15, Scarborough.

This project was originally began to be used for the recovery of cats trapped at colonies to be cared for while they recovered from spay and neuter surgery done at clinics or vets. It was for many colony caretakers who had no access to space for this purpose. Many of these caretakers and trappers have no extra money to spare to pay for this service and many do not have vehicles.

This facility is not without cost and was mostly running on donations of time, money, and supplies. In order to be cost effective this facility must be run on volume of cats and caretakers being helped. The City of Toronto Animal Services is overseeing the lease agreement in its present state and is contributing financially to the site. This Project is on its 3rd charitable group taking charge and responsibility of this facility since December 2013. The group the present BMR application is under has stepped away from managing this project several months ago making this application invalid.

The City has contributed money to this project and I understand that a person is being paid a salary to run the facility. If we take all of these contributions from the city into account and divide it by the number of cats actually being recovered at the Recovery Centre we will see that the ratio of cats per money spent caring for them is out of balance and makes this project not feasible. I would state that this service and the amount of money being spent could be better used by paying a private facility to recover the cats for a great deal less than the funds being used now. The surplus funds could be used for other needs of trappers, caretakers and the colony cat's, be it medical, reimbursing out of pocket expenses such as fuel to trappers and caretakers, or providing food for these City of Toronto cats being cared for out of the kindness of their hearts and significant personal money by your voting tax payers.

This facility is not accessible by a large majority of the Citizens due to the hours it is open, the location of the facility makes it difficult to get there via

transit, there are very few people using the facility. It is more exclusive as opposed to inclusive.

Between August 2014 and February 2015 there were approximately 150 cats that used the centre, extrapolating these figures will serve to back up the statement from Toronto Animal Services that there will be no more than 450 cats per year that will be recovered in the centre. If TAS are contributing to paying for staff to run the facility and the city is subsidizing the rent and then adding the known associated costs I would say there must be a more cost effective means to perform the same services for recovering cats that could be sourced. The present amount of volunteer hours and the remaining money could then be used for other needed services or associated costs that would help the Community Cats and Caretakers of the city in their efforts to address this animal crisis.

Estimated Present Cost to the City of Toronto

Rent Subsidy approximately \$12,000.00

Wage Subsidy approximately \$40,000.00

Operations approximately \$15,000.00

Total \$67,000.00 divided by 450 cats equals \$148.00 per cat

At the cost of \$148.00 per cat this is not a cost effective project to use tax payer's money for. I would suggest that if the City of Toronto would like to continue this project that space be made available at the 4 TAS sites and this would also allow equal access to caretakers in all areas of the City.

F.E.R.A.L. Centre Estimated Operational Budget – 2014 to 2018

Expense	Monthly Base	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018
Insurance	\$125.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,550.00	\$1,600.00	\$1,650.00	\$1,700.00
Rent	\$169.00	\$2,028.00	\$2,129.00	\$2,235.00	\$2,346.00	\$2,463.00
Dumpster	\$151.00	\$1,819.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,100.00	\$2,205.00	\$2,315.00
Food	\$150.00	\$1,800.00	\$1,980.00	\$2,178.00	\$2,395.00	\$2,634.00
Litter includes shipping	\$90.00	\$1,080.00	\$1,134.00	\$1,190.00	\$1,249.00	\$1,311.00
Cleaning Supplies	\$150.00	\$1,800.00	\$1.980.00	\$2,178.00	\$2,395.00	\$2,634.00
Disinfectant	\$20.00	\$240.00	\$252.00	\$264.00	\$277.00	\$290.00
Internet & Phone	\$50.00	\$600.00	\$630.00	\$661.00	\$694.00	\$728.00
Office Supplies & Copying	\$30.00	\$360.00	\$378.00	\$396.00	\$415.00	\$435.00
ECO Bacterial System	\$166.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,100.00	\$2,205.00	\$2,315.00	\$2,430.00
Maintenance Budget	\$50.00	\$600.00	\$630.00	\$661.00	\$694.00	\$728.00
Total	\$1,151.00	\$13,827.00	\$14,763.00	\$15,668.00	\$16,635.00	\$17,668.00