



Barbara Gray
General Manager
Transportation Services

John Livey
Deputy City Manager
Cluster B

Transportation Services
24th Floor, East Tower, City Hal
100 Queen St. West
Toronto, ON M5H 2N2

Tel: (416) 392-8431
Fax: (416) 696-3743
Barbara.Gray@toronto.ca
www.toronto.ca

2017 OPERATING BUDGET BRIEFING NOTE

Road and Sidewalk Maintenance – Levels of Service

Issue/Background:

- Budget Committee, at its meeting on December 19, 2016, in considering the 2017 Capital and Operating Budgets for Citizen Centred Services "B", requested the General Manager, Transportation Services to prepare a budget briefing note on "a revised schedule of service levels for road and sidewalk maintenance to reflect actual achieved service levels in past years."

Key Points:

- The 2017 Preliminary Operating Budget Notes for Transportation Services includes a table that articulates the proposed 2017 Service Levels for the Road and Sidewalk Management Service (pages 19-22). The table also includes the approved service levels for 2014-2016.
- The service levels have been approved by City Council either as part of the annual budget process (since 2012) or through separate staff reports on specific services provided by the Division (e.g. winter maintenance levels of service). Over 80% of the service levels are tracked regularly and are generally being achieved. The remaining service levels are difficult to track. A "Work Management System" is currently being developed in conjunction with other Divisions to capture any activities undertaken by the Division that are not currently tracked.
- The Road and Sidewalk Management Service Level table on pages 19-22 of the 2017 Budget Notes is detailed for each of the following major activities:
 - Winter Operations
 - Road and Sidewalk Repairs and Cleaning
 - Patrols and Investigations
 - Infrastructure Planning, Programming and Budgeting
 - Pedestrian and Cycling Infrastructure and Programs
- Specifically, the Budget Committee asked whether the Division is meeting the current levels of service with respect to winter operations, road and sidewalk repairs and cleaning and, if so, whether the funding proposed in the 2017 Preliminary Operating Budget is sufficient to maintain these levels of service. This Briefing Note focuses on these two activities and addresses the specific questions raised during the Transportation Services discussion.

Questions & Answers:

Q1: Are the 2017 service levels in the table included in the Budget Notes up-to-date?

A1: The service levels contained in the Road and Sidewalk Management Service Level table have been approved by City Council either as part of the annual budget process or through separate staff reports. They reflect any service levels that have been recently revised and/or established by City Council (e.g. winter maintenance). However, some specific activities (e.g. snow clearing on sidewalks and cycling infrastructure) have not been identified specifically in the table.

Q2: What are the specific levels of service approved by City Council that are not reflected in the table?

A2: They are generally related to the winter maintenance service levels approved by City Council in 2013 (PW27.15). The staff report approved by City Council included numerous pages of tables by road classification (expressways, arterials, collectors, locals, and laneways), roadway characteristics (with/without bus routes, roads with steep hills, with/without on-street parking, cul-de-sacs, etc.), storm type (based on snow accumulation), maintenance activity (de-icing, ploughing, snow removal, etc.) as well as several other factors and classifications. These service levels are too detailed to be included in the Budget Notes and, consequently, only a summary of the service levels has been provided in the tables.

The staff report and detailed winter maintenance service levels can be found at:
<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2013.PW27.15>

It should also be noted that some of the "service levels" included in the tables in the Budget Notes should more appropriately be identified as "311 response times" which were established with the introduction of this service.

Q3: The table in the Budget Notes indicates a level of service for snow removal from bike trails (within 6 hours). Didn't City Council adopt specific service levels for the winter maintenance of all types of bikeways?

A3: Yes, City Council at its meeting of June 10, 2014 adopted the recommendations of a staff report that dealt specifically with the winter maintenance service levels for bikeways, among other things (PW31.1). The appendix to the staff report, attached to this Briefing Note for reference, identifies the time to completion for salting, ploughing and snow removal from the various types of cycling infrastructure (Martin Goodman Trail, cycle tracks, bike lanes, contra-flow lanes and sharrows). It identifies the snow accumulation required to initiate ploughing and the desired pavement condition after salting and ploughing operations.

Q4: Is the Division achieving the service levels for Road and Sidewalk Maintenance contained in the Budget Notes with the current budget and level of funding?

A4: Over 80% of the activities listed in the table are tracked regularly. For these activities the levels of service are generally being achieved although some constraints and circumstances (e.g. major snowfalls) might result in some non-compliance with these service levels.

The remaining 20% of the activities is difficult to track, for example "the provision of advice or input to other agencies/proponents regarding their transportation infrastructure planning projects..." A Work Management System is currently being developed in partnership with Toronto Water, Solid Waste Management and Parks, Forestry & Recreation which will be designed to capture any activities undertaken by the Division that are not currently tracked.

Q5: What is Transportation Services performance specifically with respect to the 311 response times?

A5: Transportation Services received 120,470 service requests in 2016. Of this total, 114,555 service requests (95.1%) were closed on-time (i.e. were addressed within the prescribed response times for the respective activity, as generally shown in the service level table). This performance was highlighted in the DCM's presentation to the Budget Committee on the slide of Transportation Services 2016 Key Service Accomplishments which indicated a 96% on-time completion rate (to-date) for 311 service requests. These results are shown in further detail in the attached figure with comparative figures since 2008.

Q6: Is the funding included in the proposed 2017 Operating Budget sufficient to achieve the 2017 levels of service?

A6: The 2017 levels of service are the same as the 2016 levels and, therefore, the funds are available in the proposed 2017 budget to continue to meet these service levels to the same extent. The exceptions are the recommended service adjustments that have been recommended to achieve budget reductions as outlined in Table 3 on page 11 of the Budget Notes which include harmonized leaf collection, reduction in grass cutting and reduction in local road street sweeping. The service implications of these recommended adjustments, are discussed more fully on page 13 of the Budget Notes as well as in the associated business cases.

Q7: Aren't some of the service standards included in the table in the Budget Notes excessive, such as the 60-day standard for clearing snow that is piled too high on boulevards?

A7: Yes and, as a result, this service level standard as well as several others have been recently reduced. For example:

- The 60-day standard for clearing snow piled high on boulevards in 2014 was reduced to 21 days.
- The service level for the maintenance of boulevards (asphalt repairs, boulevards sinking, sod replacement, etc.) was reduced from 18 months in 2014 to 6 months.
- The permanent repair of expressways (damaged guiderails, potholes, etc.) was reduced from 18 months in 2014 to 6 months. Temporary repairs are completed within 5 days and emergency repairs to address safety issues are addressed immediately.

Q8: Specifically with respect to local road street sweeping, are we currently providing the levels of service identified in the table?

A8: The table identifies a service level of 1-2 times per month for mechanical street sweeping. This is an overall average because the level of street sweeping depends on the classification of road and the location. Expressways and arterial roads are swept more

often than collector and local roads. Areas with mature tree canopies, high pedestrian traffic, significant commercial activity and tourist destinations are swept more frequently. For example, areas such as Chinatown, Kensington, Spadina Avenue, and the Entertainment District are swept on a daily basis.

Q9: How does the proposed reduced level of local road sweeping compare to other municipalities?

A9: The proposed reduction in the level of service for street sweeping on local roads to 3 times per year will remain the highest amongst municipalities in southern Ontario. Some municipalities sweep local roads only once a year (e.g. Brampton and Barrie) and some sweep only on an as-required basis (e.g. London and Mississauga). There is no Minimum Maintenance Standard established by the Province for the sweeping of municipal streets. It should be emphasized that a reduction in the frequency of street sweeping of arterial roads is not recommended although it has been included as budget reduction option for consideration.

Prepared by: John Mende, P.Eng. Director, Scarborough District, (416) 396-7842,
john.mende@toronto.ca

Further Information: John Mende, P.Eng. Director, Scarborough District, (416) 396-7842,
john.mende@toronto.ca

Date: January 4, 2017

Attachment 1 Winter Maintenance Levels of Service for Cycling Facilities

BIKE LANE CATEGORY	DESIRED PAVEMENT CONDITION AFTER SALTING / PLOWING (1)	ACCUMULATION (cm) TO INITIATE PLOWING	TIME TO COMPLETION FOR SALTING / PLOWING & SNOW REMOVAL (AFTER THE END OF SNOWFALL) (2)			
			STORM TYPE 1 30-40 per year (up to 5cm)	STORM TYPE 2 3-6 per year (5-15 cm)	STORM TYPE 3 Once/2-3 years (15-25 cm)	STORM TYPE 4 Once 10/years (over 25cm)
Martin Goodman Trail	Bare pavement	5.0 and still snowing	Plowing & salting within 6-8hrs	Plowing & salting within 6-8hrs	Plowing & salting within 6-8hrs	Plowing & salting within 6-8hrs
Cycle Tracks (incl bus pads) - Sherbourne St - Roncesvalles Ave	Bare pavement	5.0 and still snowing	Salted to a higher level of service as the road they are on/adjacent to	Plowing & salting within 6-8hrs	Plowing & salting within 6-8hrs	Plowing & salting within 6-8hrs
Priority Bike Lanes - East – west - North - south	Bare Pavement	5.0 and still snowing	Salted to a higher level of service as the road they are on/adjacent to	Plowing & salting as per road classification. Full removal within 48 – 72hrs when required to achieve bare pavement.		
Red – Arterial Roads - Bike lanes - Contra-flow - Sharrows	Bare Pavement	5.0 and still snowing	Salted to a higher level of service as the road they are on/adjacent to	Plowing & salting within 6-8hrs	Plowing & salting within 8-10hrs	Plowing & salting only within 12-14hrs
Blue – Collector Roads - Bike lanes - Contra-flow - Sharrows	Bare Pavement	5.0-8.0	Salted to a higher level of service as the road they are on/adjacent to	Plowing & salting within 8-10hrs	Plowing & salting within 10-12hrs	Plowing & salting only within 14-16hrs

1. Multiple applications of salt may be required to achieve a bare pavement condition. This may take up to 72hrs and will be subject to temperature constraints.
2. Bike lane snow removal to prioritized within hierarchy of Managed Snow Removal operations

Attachment 2 Service Requests (2008 – 2016)

Status	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
Active, Late	0	0	0	22	97	55	129	1059	1278
Active, Warning						1		53	408
Active, On-Time	0	0	0	0	1	183	1406	5213	12758
Closed, Late	25742	8730	3299	4164	3459	8500	12820	6859	4231
Closed, On-Time	55804	72081	72120	90436	78263	103864	134230	118492	101799
Total	81546	80811	75419	94622	81820	112603	148585	131676	120470
Percentage Late	32%	11%	4%	4%	4%	8%	9%	6%	5%

