# Redacted confidential attachment to EX29.10 made public on December 5, 2017

## **CONFIDENTIAL ATTACHMENT # 1**

#### CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION OR ADVICE

### **Recommended Enhanced Security Measures for Toronto City Hall**

#### **City Hall Threat Assessment**

As Toronto City Hall is the seat of municipal government, corporate head office for Canada's largest city, and one of the most distinctive, symbolic, and iconic buildings in the City of Toronto, these attributes also make Toronto City Hall and Nathan Phillips Square a target for serious threats and some key measures required to mitigate these threats are not currently present.

Some of these serious threats are posed by lone wolf terrorists, organized terror groups, and other individuals with grievances. Some of the threats include active attackers, improvised explosive devices, vehicle borne improvised explosive devices, etc.

A foreseeable threat to the building that remains difficult to mitigate with the current security posture is the active attacker (individual(s) with a weapon(s) who is engaged in killing or attempting to kill people in a confined and populated area).



An attack on City Hall is not only an attack on a government building, it is an attack on a symbol of Toronto and Canada, as well as, an attack on a place that many people have or will visit.



One of the main enhancements for City Hall has been visitor control. The enhancement consists of all perimeter doors being locked except for the main entrance doors. The main entrance doors are not locked but are staffed with in-house (Corporate) Security Guards who visually screen members of the public and assist with customer service directions.



#### **Toronto Police Service Vulnerability Assessment of Toronto City Hall**

The Vulnerability Assessment for Toronto City Hall provides a vulnerability threat assessment on various types of threats, outlines the current security effectiveness measures for each of these threats, and makes recommendations to reduce or mitigate each threat through security enhancements, policies and training. The most severe threats and recommendations are listed below:



• The most severe threats to *City Hall* are an IED and/or an active attacker. The main recommendation is the implementation of security screening for all visitors requiring the use of x-ray machines / hand wands (patron screening), building access restricted to one door, and turning all exterior doors into exit-only doors.

#### Public Safety Canada Critical Infrastructure Vulnerability Assessment

At the request of the City, Public Safety Canada conducted a vulnerability assessment at Toronto City Hall. Two of the main recommendations/considerations include the use of metal detectors at the facility entrance and

#### **Patron Screening**

The Staff Report proposes the implementation of a Patron Screening Program which involves the use of walk through metal detectors (WTMD's), hand-held metal detectors (HHMD's), and physical baggage checks done by persons, x-ray, or a combination of both. Due to the number of visitors at Toronto City Hall and the desired patron flow rate, it is recommended that baggage checks be completed by persons (Security Guards) as opposed to x-ray. This level of patron screening is used at venues such as the Air Canada Centre and Rogers Centre for various events such as sports and music.

Following this level of patron screening, an individual would be greeted by a Security Guard who would explain the process and advise the patron to remove all metal objects and place them in a tray on a table. The Security Guard would also advise the patron to place any baggage on a table for separate physical examination. The patron would pass through a walk through metal detector with multi-zone detection. This multi-zone detection has multiple transmit and receive indicators, quickly allowing the Security Guard to assess where the alarm is generating from (e.g. left side at hip level) and to ask if the patron if they have anything metallic in that general location. If no alarm is activated by the WTMD the patron retrieves their items that did not pass through the WTMD (metal objects and baggage) and the screening process is complete. If an alarm is received by the WTMD and the Security Guard is not able to resolve the source of the alarm, the patron would undergo secondary screening in the form of a hand-held metal detector. Once secondary screening has resolved the source of alarm, the patron has cleared screening.

If approved by City Council, patron security screening would occur for all members of the public and City staff without access cards. Security screening would be provided strictly according to these parameters, Security Guards would not have the authority to exclude an individual from screening.



Some exterior doors will be retrofitted to permit secure employee access from the exterior and additional exits for visitors. A common example of this set-up would be the installation of a "smart" revolving door which permits an employee to use their card from the exterior and the revolving door would turn 180 degrees. A visitor would not be able to enter this door but could leave the facility using this door. The "smart" door will not permitted access or egress if there is an individual already in the door (tailgating).

One of the determining factors for the applicable configuration of the patron security screening is determined by the number of walk through metal detectors (WTMDs) required. The number of WTMDs is determined by the desired patron screening rate (throughput).

Staff and visitor access counts were taken by Security staff to determine an average daily total. The daily average was approximately 3100 visitors and 2500 staff accesses per day. City Hall is open to the public from 7:30 AM - 9:30 PM Monday to Friday, and from 8:00 AM to 6:00 PM Saturdays and Sundays. The busiest times for visitor access is from 8:30 AM to 5:30 PM.

A best practice throughput is 9 seconds to use a walk through metal detector and 16 seconds to use a hand held metal detector on one person.

Based upon the best practice patron screening rate, and the number of patrons that need to be screened, it is recommended that two security screening set-ups are required from 08:00 AM - 6:00 PM, Monday to Friday. For off-business hours and on weekends, only one screening set-up is required. The maximum amount of persons required to operate a screening set-up is three. During off peak hours, this set-up can operate with as little as one individual.

During business days, for the majority of hours the building is open to the public, two separate screening set-ups would be required in order to efficiently screen visitors.

Based upon the described set-ups, 405.5 hours must be filled weekly by Security Guards. A Security Guard works 40 hours per week, therefore a total of ten, new, full-time Corporate Security Guards will be required to operate the security screening. The new operating impact of ten full-time in-house Security Guards is \$773,510.

#### Nathan Phillips Square Vehicle Mitigation Measures

A preliminary assessment was conducted on the adequacy of the current vehicle control mitigation measures.

#### Physical Delineation of Space in Committee Rooms #1 and #2

Currently there is no visual or physical delineation between areas reserved for members of the public and those reserved for elected officials and City staff.

A review of applicable measures will be completed, in conjunction with the planned AODA review and enhancements, to install a measure that will provide a physical delineation. An example of a proposed measure may include a waist-height glass wall with swing doorways to provide a physical separation of the spaces

The cost of this delineation is estimated at \$70,000 and forms part of the existing 2018 FREEE Capital Budget request.

This work would occur during the Council break in the summer of 2018 with design occurring in early 2018.

#### **Council Chamber Enhancements**

Due to the Council seating configuration, Councillors have their backs to the visitors in the Chamber. Surrounding the outer row of Councillors is a glass wall that delineates the Councillors seating area from the public areas.

A review of applicable measures will be completed, in conjunction with the planned AODA review and enhancements, to install a measure that will provide a further separation. These measures could include raising the height of this glass up to 30 centimeters, installing an angled top-guard on the glass, etc.

The cost of this delineation is estimated at \$100,000 and forms part of the existing 2018 FREEE Capital Budget request.

This work would occur during the Council break in the summer of 2018 with design occurring in early 2018.