

# EX30.2.6

**From: S.I.T. (Save Improved T.C.H.C.)**

**pg. 1 of 3**

**Re: EX30.2: 'Implementing Tenants First - Toronto Community Housing Corporation (TCHC) Scattered Portfolio Plan and Interim Selection Process for Tenant Directors on the Toronto Community Housing Corporation Board'**

**FULL DEPUTATION:**

**SELECTING TENANTS TO THE T.C.H.C. BOARD OF DIRECTORS:**

**The City of Toronto EX30.2 Report for Action Proposes:**

'd. A selection panel composed of two City staff and one Toronto Community Housing Corporation tenant appointed by the Deputy City Manager, Cluster A, will shortlist, interview and recommend candidates to the Corporations Nominating Panel for appointment by City Council including addressing any vacancies as they arise.' (pg. 3 of 14, Full Report, 'Report for Action, Implementing Tenants First')

**S.I.T.'s RESPONSE:**

**1. The interim 'Selection Panel', in deciding on tenant positions on TCHC's Board of Directors, goes against a fully democratic process, & the City of Toronto's Mayor's Task Force's mandated Tenant Charter\* (approved by TCHC's Bd. of Directors 2017)**

**1.a. The Tenant Charter states under 'Community Collaboration', 'All tenants will: Have the opportunity to vote for position(s) in Toronto Community Housing's Tenant Engagement System.'** Please note, no where is it stated the Tenant Charter position(s) are restricted to any one segment of the 'Engagement System'.

**SOLUTION:**

**Please support TCHC tenants in amending the 'Implementing Tenants First' Report by replacing the interim selection panel with the permanent process of all tenants being able to vote for the tenant positions on TCHC's Board of Directors at the same time as Tenant Representative positions every three years instead of two.** This is in keeping with the 'Shareholder Direction', 'Tenant Nomination Process ...Tenants will be nominated for appointment to the Board by The City Corporation Nominating Panel...having regard to the recommendations of the Tenants, formulated through a process approved by Council...' (pg. 12, Shareholder Direction...2013)

**NEW AMENDED MODEL Proposed:**

**1. Changes to 'Tenant Board Directors Selection Information Session', April 2015:**

**1. a. Stage Two: Screening Process (pg. 15):**

**In addition to the selection of Tenant Representatives from Tenant Councils, an equal number of Tenant Leaders who received A.O.D.A. (Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act) training (April, 2017) would attend the selection meeting where applications will be screened, delegates will vote and a short-list will be created.**

**1. b. Stage Three: Voting Process (pg. 17):**

**Three all candidates meetings will take place in the East, Central, & West districts which any tenant can attend, & ask questions in a limited time frame.**

**1. c. Stage Three: Voting Process (continue) (pg. 18):**

**Voting will take place at the same time as the Tenant Representative Elections to save money.**

**1. d. Key Points (pg. 21):**

**Tenant Representative & Tenant Leaders who applied to run for the Board cannot take part in the selection process.**

**All current Tenants over 18 can take part in the voting process, including Tenant Representatives & Tenant Leaders who applied to run for the Board.**

**SELECTING TENANTS TO THE T.C.H.C. BOARD OF DIRECTORS Cont'd:**

**CONCLUSION:**

**As the largest stakeholders in T.C.H.C., ALL tenants should be able to vote,** at the same time as the Tenant Representative Elections to save money, for the tenant positions on TCHC's Board of Directors, **not just a select tenant group. This is consistent with the Tenant Charter's directive.**

We don't want to see any built in biases occurring in favour of any minority **for the most important elected tenant positions in the TCHC engagement process.**

This is the most transparent and accountable process possible.

**Note:** If for any reason the City cannot get the ballot boxes / machines right away because of the upcoming municipal election it would be only fair to once again extend the tenure of the current T.C.H.C. tenant board members until such time (a firm time line of 6 mths. for example) we can elect the Tenant Board members by all tenants in the aforementioned amended model.

Fair, because, for two and half years there was **no City of Toronto directed T.C.H.C. aforementioned reviews through public consultation meetings with the tenants since 'On June 10, 2015, City Council requested the City Manager, in consultation with TCHC and tenants, to review the process for the selection and appointment of tenants to the TCHC Board...'**

**Citation: \*(pg. 78, Jan. 26, 2016, 'Transformative Change for TCHC, A Report from the Mayor's Task Force on T.C.H.')**

**Re: 'Transfer Plan: TCHC Agency Houses and Rooming Houses, ' Appendix 2:**

**When transferred, all applicable tenants, as the largest stakeholders, must have specified transparency, & accountability mechanisms in place** within their new non profit providers. i.e. Tenant Positions on Non Profit Board of Directors, Participatory Budgeting, etc. like T.C.H.C.'s models.

This is not mentioned anywhere in the 'Report for Action' or its Appendices.

**Re: 'Additional Information Requested by Council,' Appendix 6:  
'Portable Housing Benefit (PHB)':**

**No Portable Rent Subsidies.**

"Portable housing benefits are unlikely to be an effective tool to relocate T.C.H. tenants to private market housing or diversify incomes at T.C.H. Their application in the U.S. shows a track record too uneven and fraught with pitfalls to justify replication here."\*\*\*\*\* (coming out of a discussion with tenants including one member of Tenants 4 Social Housing, Fred Victor, & Dr. Emily Paradis who specializes in this subject.). **First and foremost tenants would be moving to privately run buildings that could be run by landlords only concerned by the bottom line profit margin, & not maintaining infrastructure issues. Secondly, the City has already been involved in the New York style 'Poor Doors', separate entrances based on income.** The largest is the Aquilina at Bayside development, south of Queens Quay, between Lower Sherbourne and Parliament (projected to be completed by 2018)\*\*. On hearing of this Ann Rohmer, host of CP24's Hot Property, said (paraphrasing), 'This is not the Canada I know that would do this.' '...planning to ban poor doors...Alicia Glen, a deputy mayor in New York, told the New York Times that poor doors were not in keeping with administration's principles of equality. "Walking into a building should not be any different based on income status," she said'\*\*\*

The '**side effect of vouchers: their potential to bid up market rents.** The reasoning here is simple. Subsidies shift the demand curve up...subsidized renters compete with a large group of income-eligible non-recipients... (causing) a large increase in the price of housing for the (working) poor (and students). ...**The...estimate presented here suggests that the voucher program has raised the rent paid by unsubsidized poor households in the average metropolitan area by 16 percent.**...have caused a \$8.2 billion increase in the total rent paid by low-income non-recipients, while only providing a subsidy of \$5.8 billion to recipients, resulting in a net loss of \$2.4 billion to low-income households.' \*\*\*

**References:**

1. \*\*Separate entrances: Are New York-style 'poor doors' here in Toronto already? by Jessica Smith Cross, Metro, Toronto, Sept. 3, 2014.
2. \*\*\*<http://piketty.pse.ens.fr/fichiers/enseig/econeg/articl/Susin2002.pdf>  
From: Dec. 21, 2000, Journal of Public Economics 83 (2002) 109-152 (Full Report)  
Abbreviated version:  
RENT VOUCHERS AND THE PRICE (1999)  
OF LOW-INCOME HOUSING  
By Scott J. Susin (Currently Economist with the U.S. Dept. of Housing & Urban Development, & formerly at New York University, Center for Real Estate and Urban Policy, N.Y.C., N.Y.).
3. \*\*\*\*\* pg. 10, Social Planning Toronto Report on Housing Forum Implications for Tenants First.

**By Marcel Pereira, founder of S.I.T. (SAVE IMPROVED T.C.H.C.),  
Jan. 24, 2018      email: liliommc@yahoo.com**