

Appendix 2 – Supplemental Jurisdictional Scan

The development of the Toronto Public Art Strategy was informed by the comprehensive jurisdictional review completed by researchers from OCAD University and the University of Toronto as part of their 2017 report *Redefining Public Art in Toronto*¹. Chapters four and seven of their study include an in-depth consideration of Canadian and international municipal public art policies.

Building on this foundational research, City staff undertook a supplemental jurisdictional scan to explore how a number of other Canadian and international cities – including Vancouver, Ottawa, Montreal, Sydney (Australia), Seattle (United States) and New York City (United States) – approach particular features of their public art programs, including:

1. Municipal capital funding for public art;
2. Strategies for incorporating equity and inclusion in public art initiatives; and
3. Innovative and creative best practices in public art programs.

Cities were chosen for further investigation based on their comparable size to Toronto, and their recognition as leaders within the field of public art. The cities noted in this supplemental jurisdictional scan have achieved success in the implementation of their public art policies, however given the differences in size, governance structure and programmatic perspectives, this intent of this review is primarily to identify selected highlights of how other cities approach particular features of their public art programs. As such, this scan is not meant to be comprehensive.

1 Summary of Findings

Municipal Capital Funding for Public Art

All cities reviewed with the exception of Vancouver have policies which allocate at least one percent of municipal capital project budgets to public art. Vancouver allocates an annual budget to public art as well as requiring private sector re-zonings greater than 100,000 square feet to contribute \$1.98 per buildable square foot to a public art process approved by the City. Ottawa includes its Boards and Commissions in their one percent funding mechanism, as well as one percent of eligible P3 projects. A charitable, independent non-profit philanthropic organization operating in New York City also provides funding for public art in that city.

While all cities surveyed have adopted policies governing municipal capital funding for public art, the level of detail in those policies vary. Ottawa, for example, publishes specific criteria and thresholds for when a public art contribution is triggered – namely, for projects exceeding \$2 million in value, and specific types of P3 projects. The City of Toronto's Official Plan includes

¹ *Redefining Public Art in Toronto: A Collaborative Project* by Researchers from OCAD University and the University of Toronto, 2017, <https://www2.ocadu.ca/sites/www2.ocadu.ca/files/project/Pt1%20-%20Redefining%20Public%20Art%20Toronto%202017.pdf>.

direction to allocate one percent of the budget of "major municipal buildings and structures" to public art (Section 3.1.4). The Toronto Public Art Strategy includes a recommendation to develop consistent, City-wide guidelines to interpret and apply this policy, building on best practices from other municipalities and taking into account divisional priorities and objectives.

Moreover, while this supplemental scan considered the types of funding policies that exist in other cities, additional research would be required to fully assess how successful other cities have been in implementing said funding policies. This should be considered in further detail as Toronto begins implementation of the Public Art Strategy to identify additional best practices and lessons learned.

Strategic or Master Plans for Public Art

Some of the cities reviewed have specific strategic or master plans for public art (Ottawa, Montreal, Sydney, and Seattle), while others include public art in their overall culture strategies and plans (Vancouver, Montreal, New York City). All of cities have some sort of guiding documents for the funding, commissioning and maintaining of public art.

Building on the work of the cities surveyed, the Public Art Strategy works toward establishing a distinct, shared vision for public art in Toronto. The City's public art programs are informed by the directional policies of the Official Plan, and other Council-approved plans such as the Graffiti Management Plan (2011) and the Culture Plan for the Creative City (2003). Developing an overarching strategy and vision for public art will help set a path to guide the future development of Toronto's various public art programs. Through this process, it is anticipated that Toronto's existing programs will be strengthened and efforts to provide meaningful engagement opportunities for the public will be pursued.

Equity and Inclusion in Public Art

With the exception of Ottawa, all other cities reviewed have strong inclusion and equity statements in their public art strategies or master plans. Vancouver, Ottawa and Montreal all have strong commitments to encouraging and supporting Indigenous art and artists, as has Sydney, Australia. Seattle and New York City have also strongly embedded equity into their approaches to public art, with Seattle explicitly aligning its public art plan with the City's Race and Social Justice Initiative; and New York City focusing on underrepresented communities, support for cultural access for people with disabilities and for disability arts, and increasing diversity and inclusion in the cultural workforce.

Equity and inclusion have long been held as priorities for the City of Toronto's public art programs. Based on best practices from other cities, Toronto can be a global leader in this area by prioritizing equity and inclusion within its new strategy, with a particular focus on advancing Indigenous place-making through public art. Sydney has seen particular success in this area by following through on a commitment to delivering specific projects co-designed with the Indigenous community as part of their City Public Art Strategy, most notably the Eora Journey, celebrating the culture of the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander communities living in Sydney.

Creative Practices in Public Art

Given that public art is a creative practice in its own right, it is not surprising that all cities examined in this review demonstrate creativity and innovation in their various approaches to public art. Below is a summary of leading practices that these cities have used to help advance creativity and experimentation in their public art programs – several of which are already being implemented in Toronto, while others may be considered to further strengthen the impact of public art in Toronto.

A. Embedding the Artist at the Centre of Public Art

- Expanding "artist-led initiatives" like artists in residence, artist-initiated public art commissions, arts-based engagement, solutions labs artists, and exploring artists role in shaping city building processes and practices (Vancouver).
- Reviewing awards, third party administration, granting partnerships, recommender models, and the current interpretation of the Vancouver charter to improve access to artists and creators (Vancouver).
- Aligning the private development public art process with City priorities, including artist centred practice (Vancouver).
- Embedding artists into public art plans across City departments (Seattle).

B. Approaching Funding Differently

- Diversifying and integrating public art funding to ensure sustainable public art funding and protect against overdependence on large-scale re-zonings (Vancouver).
- Establishing an independent, non-profit philanthropic organization to commission works of public art and offer innovative programs and services (New York City).

C. Using Technology Creatively

- Offering the opportunity for artists and others to sign up for an eSubscription newsletter to receive calls and announcements regarding public art commissions and exhibitions (Ottawa).
- Featuring a web page with the public art collection viewable by art piece, artist and location (Montreal).

D. Embracing Public Art as a Tourism Attractor

- Working in collaboration with local tourism agencies, increase awareness of the City as an international public art destination (Montreal).
- Partnering with other orders of government and local tourism agencies, create free public art maps for self-guided tours. (Montreal).
- Commissioning iconic pieces in major entry points to the City (Montreal).

E. Using Public Art to Advance Indigenous Reconciliation

- Emphasizing Aboriginal art and heritage in public art installations and programming, including significant artworks and interpretation; holding major events to celebrate Aboriginal culture; creating an Aboriginal cultural centre; and creating jobs and business support programs to help Aboriginal empowerment (Sydney).

Canadian Cities Public Art Summary Chart

City	Funding Mechanism	Public Art Plan or Strategies	Equity/Inclusion	Creative Practices
Vancouver	Yearly budgeting Private sector rezonings greater than 100,000 square feet are required to contribute \$1.98 per buildable square foot to a public art process approved by the City	<u>Culture Shift: Blanketing the City in Arts and Culture, Vancouver Culture Plan 2020-2029</u> (2019)	Strong equity commitment, including to Indigenous Peoples	<u>Open call program</u> for artist-initiated projects
Ottawa	One percent of municipal capital construction budgets of \$2 million or more of the City of Ottawa and its Boards and Commissions, as well as one percent of eligible P3 projects	<u>Public Art Policy</u> (2015)	Strong equity commitment, including to Indigenous Peoples	<u>Public Art Program eSubscription newsletter</u> for calls and announcements regarding the City of Ottawa Art Collection
Montreal	Pledge to pass a by-law on the integration of the arts into architecture for every new municipal construction project (1%)	<u>The Framework for Action in Public Art</u> (2010) <u>2017-2022 Cultural Development Policy</u>	Strong equity commitment, including to Indigenous Peoples	The Public Art page on the City of Montreal's website featuring Montreal's <u>public art collection</u> viewable by art piece, artist and location

International Cities Public Art Summary Chart

City	Funding Mechanism	Public Art Plan or Strategies	Equity/Inclusion	Creative Practices
Sydney, Australia	In 2018, allocated one per cent of the AUD \$200 million-public works budget to public art – about \$2 million a year	Public Art Policy (2016) City Art Public Art Strategy	Strong commitment to Aboriginal Art and Heritage	Aboriginal art and heritage an integral part of the Public Art policies and initiatives, for example, the Eora Journey project
Seattle, Washington	The public art program collects 1% USD for Art dollars as revenue into its Municipal Art Fund	Municipal Art Plan (2016)	Strong commitment to equity, including alignment with Seattle's Race and Social Justice Initiative	Artist-authored public art plans across City departments
New York City	Percent for Art law requires that one percent of the budget for eligible City-funded construction projects be spent on public artwork Philanthropic, independent non-profit Public Art Fund also supports public art in New York City	CreateNYC Cultural Plan (2017) CreateNYC 2019 Action Plan	Strong commitment to equity, including underrepresented communities; support for cultural access for people with disabilities and for disability arts; and diversity and inclusion in the cultural workforce	Philanthropic independent non-profit Public Art Fund , including a podcast on public art and consulting services

2 Public Art Programs in Selected Canadian Cities

The following section provides a description of particular aspects of public art programs and policies in Vancouver, Ottawa and Montreal.

City of Vancouver

The City of Vancouver "has been commissioning public art for more than twenty-five years and has produced over 300 pieces of public art throughout the City."² Vancouver has three programs to "place public art in Vancouver": 1) Civic Public Art Program; 2) Private Development Program; and 3) Public Art Community Grants.³

Civic Public Art Program: A budget for projects that reflect civic priorities is allocated each year. Potential projects are selected from our planning initiatives, such as:

- Infrastructure and parks development projects.
- City buildings and other City undertakings.
- Needs and interests of particular communities.
- Current public art plans.

Private Development Program: Private sector rezonings greater than 100,000 square feet are required to contribute \$1.98 per buildable square foot to a public art process approved by the City.

Public Art Community Grants: The City of Vancouver provides grants up to \$20,000 to support small-scale public art projects produced by Vancouver-based organizations working with practicing artists and communities.

Projects involving emerging artists and diverse cultures are encouraged to apply. Public art projects should contribute to the discourse, practice or art form. All projects must be a one-time, single creative project or time-limited series.

A. Municipal Funding for Public Art

In 2016 Vancouver City Council approved a \$1,500,000 allocation of funds over two years to create opportunities for artists and other partners to "support Vancouver's vibrant and world-class emerging art scene."⁴

The Council-approved 2008 *Public Art Guidelines for Rezoned Development* stipulates that the Public Art Program "applies to rezonings greater in aggregate than 100,000 square feet and to projects where a substantive public benefit is sought, excluding any areas devoted to non-market housing but inclusive of all other uses."⁵

² Public Art Boost – 2018 Recommendations, City of Vancouver Administrative Report, January 2, 2018, p. 3, <https://council.vancouver.ca/20180131/documents/cfsc3.pdf>, p. 2.

³ See <https://vancouver.ca/parks-recreation-culture/create-and-place-public-art.aspx>.

⁴ Public Art Boost – 2018 Recommendations, January 2, 2018, p. 3.

⁵ Public Art Guidelines for Rezoned Development, approved by Vancouver City Council, June 26 2008, p. 2, <https://vancouver.ca/files/cov/public-art-guidelines-for-rezoned-development-retired.pdf>.

B. Strategic or Master Plans for Public Art

In 2019, Vancouver City Council approved *Culture|Shift: Blanketing the City in Arts and Culture, Vancouver Culture Plan 2020-2029*.⁶ On the issue of public art, the administrative report accompanying the *Plan* states: "Vancouver's public art program spans a range of approaches to art and to the public. The program supports excellence in public art by emerging and established artists, in new and traditional media, through award-winning commissions and partnerships. Public artworks bring new meaning to the public realm by reflecting the complexities of place and publics, engaging cultural practices, and provoking critical dialogue. Two distinct commissioning programs bring public art into the city: the Civic Program and the Private Development Program. The Civic Program commissions works for infrastructure, buildings, plazas and parks. These civic commissions are initiated through calls for artist-initiated projects, and through public art plans for specific developments and areas. The Private Development Program oversees public art generated through private sector rezonings. The Public Art Committee, appointed by Council, guides public art policy and approves art plans."⁷

C. Equity and Inclusion Elements

The new *Vancouver Culture Plan 2020-2029* includes very clear and deliberate equity and inclusion statements. The *Plan* affirms reconciliation and decolonization as guiding principles, stating: "Musqueam, Squamish and Tsleil-Waututh First Nations have thousands of years of living culture and deep connection with their lands and waters. However, Vancouver's cultural landscapes do not fully reflect this fact."⁸ In addition, cultural equity and cultural redress are also affirmed as guiding principles: "As a principle, cultural equity promotes fair support for cultural work, so marginalized people can see their stories presented by artists who share their experience. As a practice, cultural equity identifies and addresses the systemic discrimination built into cultural norms and practices within art and culture institutions and systems."⁹ Lastly, the *Plan* affirms accessibility as a final guiding principle, noting that "The City has a role to play in supporting disabled creators, disability arts as a practice, and accommodations for disabled audiences. Disability arts and 'mad' arts include canons and communities of practice that draw inspiration from the creative possibilities that open up outside of the limitations of ableist cultural norms."¹⁰

D. Creative Practices

Vancouver's *Culture Plan* offers a number of fresh practices to inject creativity and innovation into the City's cultural programs and activities:

- Expanding "artist-led initiatives" like artists in residence, artist-initiated public art commissions, arts-based engagement, solutions labs artists, and exploring artists' roles in shaping city building processes and practices.

⁶ Culture|Shift: Blanketing the City in Arts and Culture Vancouver Culture Plan 2020-2029, City of Vancouver 2019, <https://council.vancouver.ca/20190910/documents/ACCS-RTS13175-AppendixC-CultureShift.PDF>.

⁷ Culture|Shift: Blanketing the City in Arts and Culture, Vancouver Culture Plan 2020-2029, City of Vancouver Administrative Report, August 13, 2019, <https://council.vancouver.ca/20190910/documents/rr1.pdf>.

⁸ Culture|Shift: Blanketing the City in Arts and Culture, Vancouver Culture Plan 2020-2029, p. 31.

⁹ Culture|Shift: Blanketing the City in Arts and Culture, Vancouver Culture Plan 2020-2029, p. 32.

¹⁰ Culture|Shift: Blanketing the City in Arts and Culture, Vancouver Culture Plan 2020-2029, p. 33.

- Reviewing awards, third party administration, granting partnerships, recommender models, and the current interpretation of the Vancouver charter to improve access to artists and creators.
- Aligning the private development public art process with City priorities, including artist centred practice.
- Diversifying and integrating public art funding to ensure sustainable public art funding and protect against overdependence on large-scale rezonings.

Vancouver describes its open call program for artist-initiated projects in this way: "Our Public Art Program invites artists to submit their ideas for public art projects in any scale, scope, and medium. We are looking for artists to propose meaningful pieces for public spaces in the city that reflect the complexities of place and publics, engage cultural practices, and provoke critical dialogue. The artist-initiated call is open to all artists, working individually or in collaboration. Artists and cultural practitioners of the Musqueam, Squamish, and Tsleil-Waututh Nations are especially encouraged to apply."¹¹

City of Ottawa

Ottawa's Public Art Program collects, commissions, presents and interprets artworks by professional visual artists in two main areas of focus and function: A) The City of Ottawa Art Collection, and B) Exhibitions, Professional Development and Public Education.¹²

A. Municipal Funding for Public Art

According to the City of Ottawa's *Public Art Policy*, "one percent of eligible municipal capital construction budgets of \$2 million or more from the Growth, Strategic Initiatives and Renewal capital budget categories of the City of Ottawa and its Boards and Commissions, as well as one percent of eligible P3 projects, are designated for Public Art Commissions. The one percent applies to the individual project level of municipal construction budgets, and to the municipal contribution to construction projects funded by other agencies."¹³

B. Strategic or Master Plans for Public Art

The City of Ottawa's Public Art Program is defined by a *Public Art Policy* that was approved by Ottawa City Council on October 28, 2015. The purpose of the policy is to bring the Public Art Program under one cohesive municipal policy. It adheres to the following core values: Responsible Stewardship; Openness and Transparency; Engagement and Collaboration; Encourage Excellence; and Planned Strategic Management Framework. The *Public Art Policy* is divided into two main areas: A) City of Ottawa Art Collection which outlines scope related to public art commissions; the purchase and donation of artwork; and the Firestone Collection of Canadian Art; and B) Exhibitions, Professional Development and Public Education, which

¹¹ Open call for artist-initiated projects, City of Vancouver, <https://vancouver.ca/parks-recreation-culture/open-call-for-artist-initiated-projects.aspx>.

¹² Public Art Policy, City of Ottawa, <https://ottawa.ca/en/city-hall/your-city-government/policies-and-administrative-structure/administrative-policies#public-art-policy>.

¹³ Public Art Policy, City of Ottawa.

outlines scope related to exhibitions, mentoring and internship, artist-in-residence, and outreach and public education.

C. Equity and Inclusion Elements

The Ottawa *Public Art Policy* states that the program, among other goals, "provides opportunities for emerging, mid-career and established professional artists across Ottawa's full diversity and encourages participation by First Nations, Inuit, Métis, Francophone and new Canadian artists" as well as provides direction to "increase collaboration and partnership with the private sector, internal and external stakeholders, and underserved communities." With specific reference to public art commissions, the *Policy* states that the Public Art Fund will be allocated according to a number of goals, including one to "address Ottawa's full geographic scope (urban, suburban and rural) and underserved areas in particular."

However, as this is a policy document and not meant to be a strategic action plan, it does not go into any great detail on specific actions to advance these goals.

D. Creative Practices

The City of Ottawa is innovative in its public art program by:

- Offering the opportunity for artists and others to sign up for the Public Art Program eSubscription newsletter to receive calls and announcements regarding the City of Ottawa Art Collection, public art commissions, and exhibitions at Karsh-Masson Gallery, City Hall Art Gallery and Corridor 45|75 all in one place.¹⁴

City of Montreal

For over 25 years, Montreal's Public Art Office acquires, preserves and promotes the City's public art collection. Montreal is home to over 350 public artworks throughout the City in both public spaces and municipal buildings, pieces acquired from the 1800s through to the present day.¹⁵ In addition, "an inventory conducted in 2013 identified more than 1,000 works belonging to public, institutional and private bodies, such as the important collection of murals and stained-glass windows in the Montréal metro."¹⁶

A. Municipal Funding for Public Art

Montreal's *Combining Creativity and the Citizen Cultural Experience in the Age of Digital Technology and Diversity: The 2017-2022 Cultural Development Policy* notes that the commissioning of public art in Montreal was greatly enhanced when, in the 1960s, the Government of Quebec required that 1% of the budget for construction of a public building or

¹⁴ City of Ottawa eSubscriptions Sign Up Form, <https://app06.ottawa.ca/esubscriptions/signup-form-en.html>.

¹⁵ City of Montreal's Public Art Office, <https://artpublic.ville.montreal.qc.ca/>.

¹⁶ Combining Creativity and the Citizen Cultural Experience in the Age of Digital Technology and Diversity: The 2017-2022 Cultural Development Policy, City of Montreal, p. 70, http://ville.montreal.qc.ca/culture/sites/ville.montreal.qc.ca/culture/files/2017-2022_cultural_development_policy_0.pdf.

development of a public site be allocated to the inclusion of art.¹⁷ *The Framework for Action in Public Art* (2010) contains a pledge to "pass a by-law on the integration of the arts into architecture for every new municipal construction project (1%)."¹⁸

B. Strategic or Master Plans for Public Art

The Framework for Action in Public Art was adopted by the City of Montreal's Executive Committee in 2010.¹⁹ The Action Plan contains three guidelines: 1. Build on experience and achievements; 2. Integrate public art with Ville de Montréal's strategies and projects; and 3. Encourage the participation of the private sector. It also lists three main strategies: 1. Maintain and preserve; 2. Acquire and develop; and 3. Disseminate and promote. The *Framework* outlines eleven pledges to advance these strategies:

- Pledge 1: Complete and update the inventory of the city's collection of public art, by documenting the state of preservation of the works, their artistic and historical context, as well as the history of the sites.
- Pledge 2: Devise a Preservation Plan for the city's collection of public art, which includes an enhanced artwork maintenance program.
- Pledge 3: Introduce a by-law on the protection of public artworks located on private land, and entrust its application to the boroughs.
- Pledge 4: Pass a by-law on the integration of the arts into architecture for every new municipal construction project (1%).
- Pledge 5: Integrate public art into all large-scale urban development projects under the city's responsibility, and encourage the boroughs to establish their own individual public art development plan.
- Pledge 6: Launch and carry out every two years, and with the assistance of the private sector, an emblematic project of public art.
- Pledge 7: Encourage real-estate developers and property owners to integrate public art into their development projects.
- Pledge 8: Implement a strategy aimed at promoting projects of temporary installations on the public realm. This strategy will include logistical support and a financial contribution.
- Pledge 9: Adopt a procedure of acquisition through endowment.
- Pledge 10: Elaborate, for the benefit of the public and of internal and external partners, tools of dissemination that enhance the promotion of Montréal's public art; in this spirit, priority must be given to the use of Web technologies.
- Pledge 11: Set up an advisory committee for public art, whose members will be designated by the city council.

The *2017-2022 Cultural Development Policy* complements the 2010 Framework and highlights the following priorities related to public art: Develop, intensify and enhance what is offered by cultural quarters, festivals, museums, public art, design, gastronomy and religious heritage; Showcase and structure Indigenous cultural products, beginning in 2017;²⁰ Complete

¹⁷ The 2017-2022 Cultural Development Policy, City of Montreal.

¹⁸ Framework for Action in Public Art, City of Montreal, p. 23, <http://ville.montreal.qc.ca/culture/en/framework-action-public-art>.

¹⁹ Framework for Action in Public Art, City of Montreal.

²⁰ The 2017-2022 Cultural Development Policy, City of Montreal, p. 52

implementation of the Framework for Action in Public Art by 2022; Stimulate the initiatives of private companies and art sponsorship; and Continue the development of mural art and deploy specific programs to promote the production of temporary and ephemeral works.²¹

C. Equity and Inclusion Elements

Montreal's *2017-2022 Cultural Development Policy* specifically references supporting Indigenous culture: "From a perspective of diversity of cultural expressions and intangible cultural heritage as a common asset of humanity, Montréal has the responsibility to contribute to the enhancement of the Indigenous presence and history... In a context of identity and cultural reconstruction, a cultural renaissance, a contemporary aboriginality, is being launched. Several works included in municipal collections and Montréal public art have been created by Indigenous artists."²²

D. Creative Practices

Montreal has implemented a number of innovative and creative practices with respect to public art:

- Art Public Montréal is an initiative of the Ville de Montréal to bring together the owners of public artworks installed on the territory of Montréal with the metropolis's influential stakeholders. Working in collaboration with Tourisme Montréal, Art Public Montréal's objective is to increase awareness of Montréal as an international public art destination. <https://artpublicmontreal.ca/en/public-art-montreal/>.
- As part of the *2014-2017 Cultural Tourism Plan* (developed through a partnership between Tourisme Montréal, the Ministère de la Culture et des Communications and Ville de Montréal, in close collaboration with the cultural community and tourism industry), a public art map *More than 100 Works of Public Art in Montréal – 5 Tours to Discover* was produced and distributed free of charge.²³
- The Public Art page on the City of Montreal's website features Montreal's public art collection viewable by art piece, artist and location – see <https://artpublic.ville.montreal.qc.ca/en/artistes/> and <https://artpublic.ville.montreal.qc.ca/en/collection/>.
- The commission of iconic pieces in major entry points to the City: "In the years ahead, Montréal will devote part of its efforts to the integration of public art into the city's entrance points as an assertion of its mission as a cultural metropolis. The first contemporary art installation *Vélocité des lieux* has been placed at the very busy intersection of Boulevard Pie-IX and Boulevard Henri-Bourassa. Others are planned in the Quartier des spectacles, Parc Frédéric-Back and the new Bonaventure city gateway. The redesign of this key urban axis provides for public art investments of \$2.8 million, in addition to major philanthropic donations."²⁴

²¹ The 2017-2022 Cultural Development Policy, City of Montreal, p. 71

²² The 2017-2022 Cultural Development Policy, City of Montreal, p. 20.

²³ The 2017-2022 Cultural Development Policy, City of Montreal, p. 51; and Public Art Discovery Tours, City of Montreal, <http://ville.montreal.qc.ca/culture/en/public-art-discovery-tours>.

²⁴ The 2017-2022 Cultural Development Policy, City of Montreal, p. 71.

3 Public Art Programs in Selected International Cities

The following section provides a description of particular aspects of public art programs and policies in Sydney (Australia), Seattle (United States) and New York City (United States).

Sydney, Australia

City Art is the City of Sydney's public art program²⁵ and was developed following the amalgamation of South Sydney Council in 2004, "guided by the diversity of the city and aiming to celebrate its creativity and culture."²⁶ City Art manages and cares for a collection of over 250 permanent works and a conservation program. City Art "also looks after plaques and memorials, issues associated with murals and graffiti, and the assessment of public art proposals in private developments during the development application process."²⁷

A. Municipal Funding for Public Art

According to Commercial Real Estate's online news, "During the last financial year [2018] the City of Sydney allocated one per cent of its \$200 million-public works budget to public art – about \$2 million a year, which Cr Forster said was a standard rate compared with other global cities. But in the two previous financial years, the council had spent about double that."²⁸ However, Sydney's public art program has not been without controversy; the same article notes: "A recently proposed public art project, the Cloud Arch on George Street, would have cost \$22 million, or 10 per cent of the public works budget, which led City of Sydney Council to scrap the project. But the council has not ruled it out if it could gain corporate sponsorship and be completed with a lower budget."

B. Strategic or Master Plans for Public Art

The City of Sydney's *Public Art Policy* (2016) identifies the following eight guiding principles for public art:

1. Align significant City Art projects with major Sustainable Sydney 2030 urban design projects;
2. Recognise and celebrate Aboriginal stories and heritage in public spaces;
3. Support local artists and activate city places through temporary art projects;
4. Support vibrant places in Village Centres with community art and City Art projects;
5. Promote high quality public art in private development;
6. Support stakeholder and government partners to facilitate public art opportunities;
7. Manage and maintain the City's collection of permanent art works, monuments and memorials; and

²⁵ City Art, <https://www.cityartsydney.com.au/>.

²⁶ City Art Public Art Strategy, City of Sydney, p. 12

https://www.cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au/_data/assets/pdf_file/0004/139810/Final-Version-City-Art-Public-Art-Strategy.pdf.

²⁷ City of Sydney Public Art, <https://www.cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au/explore/arts-and-culture/public-art>.

²⁸ "Public art brings 'enormous financial and social value' and developers need to be contributing more, experts say," June 14, 2019, <https://www.commercialrealestate.com.au/news/public-art-brings-enormous-financial-and-social-value-and-developers-need-to-be-contributing-more-experts-848787/>.

8. Initiate and implement programs to communicate, educate and engage the public about City Art.²⁹

Sydney's *City Art Public Art Strategy* is the implementation plan for Sydney's *Public Art Policy*. The *City Art Public Art Strategy* is divided into three parts:

- Part 1: City Art and Sustainable Sydney 2030. What will be delivered?
- Part 2: City Art Implementation Plan and how it will be delivered
- Part 3: City Art: Making it Happen³⁰

C. Equity and Inclusion Elements

Sydney's *City Art Public Art Strategy* places high importance on Aboriginal Art by including support for Aboriginal art as the second of its eight guiding principles: Guiding Principle 2: Recognize and Celebrate Aboriginal Stories and Heritage in Public Spaces. The Implementation Plan lists Eora Journey – Cultural Mapping; Eora Journey – Recognition in Public Spaces; and the Redfern Banner Program as projects to support Aboriginal art.

D. Creative Practices

It is notable that Sydney's *City Art Public Art Strategy* emphasizes Aboriginal art and heritage. Key elements of the Eora Journey project include:

- *Recognition in the Public Domain*
The Eora Journey aims to deliver significant artworks and interpretation in the City's public spaces to recognise Aboriginal culture past and present.
- *A Major Event to Celebrate Aboriginal Culture*
In consultations for the Sustainable Sydney 2030 Vision, the Aboriginal and the broader community called for a major event to celebrate Aboriginal culture.
- *Aboriginal Cultural and Knowledge Centre*
Opportunities to include contemporary Aboriginal art and design will be a feature of Council's commitment to an Aboriginal cultural centre.
- *Employment and Enterprise*
The creation of jobs and business support programs as part of the Eora Journey Project will help Aboriginal empowerment.³¹

Seattle, Washington

Seattle's public art collection "includes more than 400 permanently sited and integrated works and nearly 3,000 portable works. Artworks are commissioned through a public process. Panels comprised of professional visual artists along with community and city representatives evaluate the artist applicants. The city stewards and maintains its artworks through an ongoing program

²⁹ Public Art Policy 2016, City of Sydney, page 2-3, https://www.cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au/_data/assets/pdf_file/0006/139812/Public-Art-Policy-January-2016.pdf.

³⁰ City Art Public Art Strategy, City of Sydney.

³¹ City Art Public Art Strategy, City of Sydney, p. 27.

of coordinated conservation activities, which include inspections, major restorative work and routine maintenance."³²

A. Municipal Funding for Public Art

The City of Seattle's website states that "Artwork projects are determined, in part, by One Percent for Art funding sources. Some funds are restricted to a new construction site or influenced by specific departmental goals and objectives. However, money placed in the Municipal Art Fund may be combined into projects that include funding from several sources. This enables us to create special projects and citywide programs that will have a greater impact than small-scale artworks peppered around the city."³³

Seattle's *Municipal Art Plan* states: "In 2016, we anticipate collecting close to \$4 million in 1% for Art revenue (again buoyed by Seawall and Drainage and Wastewater 1% for Art). Of this amount, we will allocate approximately \$3.3 million to the implementation of artwork (selection, artist fees, artwork costs and project management) and we will use 15%, or close to \$600,000, for general support of the office. These figures are subject to change, and these changes will be noted next year. This Municipal Art Plan also reflects changes made to 2015 funds, due to changes in capital departments' spending."³⁴

The *Municipal Art Plan* notes: "Seattle Public Utilities [SPU], primarily due to its work on Combined Sewer Outflows, provides much of 2016's 1% for Art funds. Its three lines of business, Water, Drainage and Wastewater, and Solid Waste, offer a range of opportunities for artists. One of the goals shared by SPU and Arts is a commitment to the city's Race and Social Justice Initiative, as well as providing opportunities for emerging and diverse artists. We hope to explore a new range of project types that expand the notion of public art while bringing awareness to the services, facilities and projects the utilities provide its ratepayers. Seattle Public Utilities 1% for Arts funds come from three sources: Water, Drainage and Wastewater, and Solid Waste. The artwork projects to which the 1% for Art funds are allocated must have a 'sufficiently close nexus' to Seattle Public Utilities' primary mission and purpose. SPU continues to fund purchases of portable artworks, typically funded jointly by DWU and Water funds."³⁵

Funding is through a Public Art Ordinance: "The City of Seattle has been including artworks and the thinking of artists in the design of the city's public realm for over 40 years through funds generated by the Public Art Ordinance. Each year, the public art program collects 1% for Art dollars as revenue into its Municipal Art Fund and, with the assistance of city departments, the community and the Public Art Advisory Committee (PAAC), determines how to allocate those funds to public art projects."³⁶

³² City of Seattle website, <https://www.seattle.gov/arts/programs/public-art>.

³³ City of Seattle website, <https://www.seattle.gov/arts/programs/public-art#municipalartplan>.

³⁴ 2016 Municipal Art Plan, City of Seattle, Corrections October 2016, p. 4
<https://www.seattle.gov/Documents/Departments/Arts/Downloads/Arts-Plans/2016MAPFINALCorrected.pdf>.

³⁵ 2016 Municipal Art Plan, City of Seattle, Corrections October 2016, p. 12.

³⁶ 2016 Municipal Art Plan, City of Seattle, Corrections October 2016, p. 3.

B. Strategic or Master Plans for Public Art

Seattle, Washington published a *Municipal Art Plan* in 2016 with a stated mission for Seattle's Public Art Program to "engage artists in the civic dialogue, integrating artworks and the ideas of artists into a variety of public settings."³⁷ The *Municipal Art Plan* (MAP) "describes the status of continuing public art projects and establishes budgets for new public art projects for the Public Art Program of the Office of Arts & Culture. The Seattle Municipal Code requires that one percent of eligible city capital improvement program funds from select city departments be placed in the Municipal Art Fund for the purchase and commissioning of artworks. The Office of Arts & Culture manages the fund and the program and prepares, adopts and amends the annual MAP."³⁸

C. Equity and Inclusion Elements

The Public Art page on the City of Seattle's website puts equity upfront: "In alignment with the City's Race and Social Justice Initiative, we work to eliminate institutional racism in our programs, public art, policies and practices."³⁹

The Seattle's 2016 *Municipal Art Plan* makes a strong commitment to equity: "In conjunction with the Seattle Arts Commission, the Office of Arts & Culture, and its programs, the Public Art Program will focus on the lens of equity, especially racial equity, to guide our activities and the projects we develop and launch. We will use tools to ensure that we are applying an equity lens in the evaluation and review of projects. The PAAC has a particular interest in focusing projects in communities, such as Delridge, Southeast Seattle, Lake City and Northgate, we will work with our collaborating departments to identify communities and project opportunities that engage a diverse range of people both as the creators of the art and as the audience. The goal is to ensure that the best and most appropriate artist is selected for each commission....We continue to look for ways to increase access to participation for both artists and new and underserved audiences.... The city's commitment to inclusion and social justice will help inform the scoping of our upcoming work.... We will work with partner departments to find opportunities to reach out to immigrant and traditionally underserved populations."⁴⁰

As noted above, the *Municipal Art Plan* states that the Seattle Public Utilities (SUP) is committed "to the city's Race and Social Justice Initiative, as well as providing opportunities for emerging and diverse artists."⁴¹

D. Creative Practices

The City of Seattle embeds artists into their public art plans. According to the City's Public Art web page, "Artist-authored public art plans provide a vehicle to involve artists early in the design phase to develop a visionary framework that identifies and defines public art opportunities.

³⁷ City of Seattle website, <https://www.seattle.gov/arts/programs/public-art#municipalartplan>.

³⁸ 2016 Municipal Art Plan, City of Seattle, Corrections October 2016, p. 6.

³⁹ City of Seattle website, <https://www.seattle.gov/arts/programs/public-art>.

⁴⁰ 2016 Municipal Art Plan, City of Seattle, Corrections October 2016, p. 3.

⁴¹ 2016 Municipal Art Plan, City of Seattle, Corrections October 2016, p. 12.

Artists also develop plans for integrating art into a City department's routine work and infrastructure, using 1% for Art funds."⁴² Some of these art plans include:

- The AMP: The AIDS Memorial Pathway Master Art Plan
- The Vision for Public Art in Drainage and Wastewater
- agriCULTURE
- Elliott Bay Seawall Project Art Programming Plan
- Central Seattle Waterfront Art Plan
- South Lake Union Streetcar Art Plan
- Department of Planning and Development
- Seattle Department of Transportation
- Fire Station 10 Art Plan
- ProParks and Community Centers

New York City

New York City's Public Art program "began in 1983 with the development of a procedure for determining eligible projects and an equitable artist selection process. Nearly 300 projects have been completed since the program's inception with accumulated art work commissions of over \$41 million. Since 2002 almost 100 projects have been completed—a third of the total collection—and more than 70 artist commissions are currently in progress."⁴³

In addition, an independent non-profit organization, Public Art Fund, was founded in 1977 to support public art in New York City. "Since its inception, Public Art Fund has presented more than five hundred artists' exhibitions and projects at sites throughout New York City's five boroughs, making it possible for artists to engage diverse audiences and, along the way, redefine public art in relation to the changing nature of contemporary art."⁴⁴

A. *Municipal Funding for Public Art*

In New York, "Since 1982, New York City's Percent for Art law has required that one percent of the budget for eligible City-funded construction projects be spent on public artwork."⁴⁵ The 2017 *CreateNYC Cultural Plan* notes, "In 2017, Mayor de Blasio signed a package of cultural legislation bills passed by the New York City Council that strengthened the public's involvement in the Percent for Art process and will more than double the size of the program over the next two years."⁴⁶

In addition to the municipal Public Art Program, Public Art Fund, operating as an independent non-profit organization, relies on contributions from individuals, corporations, and foundations for funding. Contributions to Public Art Fund are 100% tax-deductible.⁴⁷

⁴² City of Seattle Public Art Plans, <https://www.seattle.gov/arts/programs/public-art#artplans>.

⁴³ About Percent for Art, New York City, <https://www1.nyc.gov/site/dclapercentforart/about/about.page>.

⁴⁴ Public Art Fund, <https://www.publicartfund.org/about/mission/>.

⁴⁵ New York City, The Department of Cultural Affairs Percent for Art, <https://www1.nyc.gov/site/dclapercentforart/index.page>.

⁴⁶ CreateNYC: A Cultural Plan for All New Yorkers, p. 127, https://createnyc.cityofnewyork.us/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/CreateNYC_Cultural_Plan.pdf.

⁴⁷ Public Art Fund, <https://www.publicartfund.org/>.

B. Strategic or Master Plans for Public Art

The 2017 *CreateNYC Cultural Plan* affirms "a series of strategies to increase arts and cultural programming in public space including providing grant and technical support and increasing transparency.... CreateNYC also seeks to expand our definition of public art and increases its inclusion in both underutilized public and private sites.... Perhaps most importantly, CreateNYC affirms our public spaces as our public commons: vital places to come together, express our diverse cultures, and engage in free speech. In doing so, CreateNYC maps a vision for the future of New York City that celebrates the voices, experiences, and values of all New Yorkers."⁴⁸

The *CreateNYC Cultural Plan* outlines strategies to support public art, including: "increase opportunities for artists to work in public agencies and public space; and actively encourage, support, and strengthen public spaces as vital places for creative expression and community building."⁴⁹

The 2017 *CreateNYC Cultural Plan* was followed by a *CreateNYC 2019 Action Plan*, which outlines the following strategies specifically related to public art:

- **Strategy:** Increase funding for individual artists, especially those from underrepresented communities.
Public Art-related Action: Provided technical assistance to help underrepresented artists apply for Percent for Art public art commissions in low-income neighborhoods.
- **Strategy:** Support more opportunities for temporary and permanent art in public spaces.
Public Art-related Action: Initiated four new Public Artists in Residence (PAIRs) within the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, the Department for the Aging, the Department for Records and Information Services, and the Mayor's Office of Sustainability, to develop creative solutions to pressing civic challenges.
Public Art-related Action: Initiated four new Public Artists in Residence (PAIRs) projects with the Mayor's Office to End Gender Based Violence, NYC Commission on Human Rights, the Department of Probation, and Department of Correction, to develop creative solutions to pressing civic challenges.⁵⁰

C. Equity and Inclusion Elements

Equity and diversity are strong elements in the both *CreateNYC Cultural Plan* and the *CreateNYC 2019 Action Plan*. Both documents contain strong equity statements. Out of eight goals for the strategy and action plan, three are focused on equity: Increase support for the cultural life of low-income communities and underrepresented groups; Expand cultural access for people with disabilities and for disability arts; and Expand diversity and inclusion in the cultural workforce.⁵¹

In particular, the *CreateNYC 2019 Action Plan* notes "Promoting a more diverse workforce has been a priority since Day One of this Administration, and CreateNYC provided new energy and

⁴⁸ CreateNYC, p. 129.

⁴⁹ CreateNYC, p. 131.

⁵⁰ CreateNYC 2019 Action Plan, pages 5,8, https://createnyc.cityofnewyork.us/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/CreateNYC_ActionPlan_FIN_20190801.pdf.

⁵¹ CreateNYC 2019 Action Plan, pages 1-2.

clarity on how to make a real difference. An explicit emphasis on diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) has been integrated into the agency's entire budget— from new DEI questions on the agency's Cultural Development Fund grant applications, to the full DEI plans required of the 33 members of the CIG. New and expanded programs—from CUNY Cultural Corps to the CreateNYC Leadership Accelerator—have created pipelines for New Yorkers from all backgrounds into the cultural workforce, and pathways for advancement within it."⁵²

D. Creative Practices

New York City appears to be unique in that not only does it have a well-supported municipal public art program, but it is home to an independent, philanthropic non-profit that also supports public art. In addition to commissioning works of public art, Public Art Fund offers a number of innovative programs and services, including:

- *Public Art Works: A Podcast by Public Art Fund*
"In Public Art Fund's new podcast series, *Public Art Works*, artists and cultural leaders explore topical subjects like activism, representation, feminism, and even street food through the lens of public art in New York City."⁵³
- *Consulting Services: Creative Partnerships*
"Extending our core mission of presenting dynamic exhibitions by the world's most compelling artists and making culture accessible to all, Public Art Fund: Creative Partnerships bring strategic planning, curatorial, and project management expertise to leading cultural institutions, corporations, and civic organizations across the globe. Through these collaborations, Public Art Fund commissions permanent installations and temporary exhibitions in line with the unique vision of our partners and the specific parameters of each site, resulting in new artworks that activate public spaces, create engaged constituencies, and amplify the impact of our partners' own initiatives through the power of public art."⁵⁴

⁵² CreateNYC 2019 Action Plan, p. 2.

⁵³ Public Art Works: A Podcast by Public Art Fund, https://www.publicartfund.org/videos_etc/podcast/.

⁵⁴ About Creative Partnerships, <https://www.publicartfund.org/creative-partnerships/>.

4 Bibliography

Note that all websites cited in this review were verified to be current as of November 2019.

- City of Montreal, "Combining Creativity and the Citizen Cultural Experience in the Age of Digital Technology and Diversity: The 2017-2022 Cultural Development Policy."
http://ville.montreal.qc.ca/culture/sites/ville.montreal.qc.ca/culture/files/2017-2022_cultural_development_policy_0.pdf
- City of Montreal, "Framework for Action in Public Art," 2010.
<http://ville.montreal.qc.ca/culture/en/framework-action-public-art>
- City of Montreal, "Public Art Discovery Tours."
<http://ville.montreal.qc.ca/culture/en/public-art-discovery-tours>
- City of Montreal, "Public Art Office."
<https://artpublic.ville.montreal.qc.ca/>
- New York City, "About Percent for Art."
<https://www1.nyc.gov/site/dclapercentforart/about/about.page>
- New York City, "CreateNYC 2019 Action Plan," 2019.
https://createnyc.cityofnewyork.us/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/CreateNYC_ActionPlan_FIN_20190801.pdf
- New York City, "CreateNYC: A Cultural Plan for All New Yorkers," 2017.
https://createnyc.cityofnewyork.us/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/CreateNYC_Cultural_Plan.pdf
- New York City, "The Department of Cultural Affairs Percent for Art."
<https://www1.nyc.gov/site/dclapercentforart/index.page>
- City of Ottawa, "eSubscriptions Sign Up Form."
<https://app06.ottawa.ca/esubscriptions/signup-form-en.html>
- City of Ottawa, "Public Art Policy," 2015.
<https://ottawa.ca/en/city-hall/your-city-government/policies-and-administrative-structure/administrative-policies#public-art-policy>
- City of Seattle, "2016 Municipal Art Plan," Corrections October 2016.
<https://www.seattle.gov/Documents/Departments/Arts/Downloads/Arts-Plans/2016MAPFINALCorrected.pdf>
- City of Seattle, Municipal Art Plan.
<https://www.seattle.gov/arts/programs/public-art#municipalartplan>
- City of Seattle, "Public Art."
<https://www.seattle.gov/arts/programs/public-art>
- City of Seattle, "Public Art Plans."
<https://www.seattle.gov/arts/programs/public-art#artplans>
- City of Sydney, "City Art."
<https://www.cityartsydney.com.au/>
- City of Sydney, "City Art Public Art Strategy."
https://www.cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au/_data/assets/pdf_file/0004/139810/Final-Version-City-Art-Public-Art-Strategy.pdf
- City of Sydney, "Public Art."
<https://www.cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au/explore/arts-and-culture/public-art>
- City of Sydney, Public Art Policy 2016," 2016.
https://www.cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au/_data/assets/pdf_file/0006/139812/Public-Art-Policy-January-2016.pdf

- City of Vancouver, "Culture|Shift: Blanketing the City in Arts and Culture, Vancouver Culture Plan 2020-2029," 2019.
<https://council.vancouver.ca/20190910/documents/ACCS-RTS13175-AppendixC-CultureShift.PDF>
- City of Vancouver, "Open call for artist-initiated projects."
<https://vancouver.ca/parks-recreation-culture/open-call-for-artist-initiated-projects.aspx>
- City of Vancouver, "Placing public art in public spaces."
<https://vancouver.ca/parks-recreation-culture/create-and-place-public-art.aspx>
- City of Vancouver, "Public Art Boost – 2018 Recommendations," City of Vancouver Administrative Report, January 2, 2018.
<https://council.vancouver.ca/20180131/documents/cfsc3.pdf>
- City of Vancouver, "Public Art Guidelines for Rezoned Development," approved by Vancouver City Council, June 26 2008.
<https://vancouver.ca/files/cov/public-art-guidelines-for-rezoned-development-retired.pdf>
- Commercial Real Estate, "Public art brings 'enormous financial and social value' and developers need to be contributing more, experts say," June 14, 2019.
<https://www.commercialrealestate.com.au/news/public-art-brings-enormous-financial-and-social-value-and-developers-need-to-be-contributing-more-experts-848787/>
- OCAD University and University of Toronto, "Redefining Public Art in Toronto: A Collaborative Project by Researchers from OCAD University and the University of Toronto," 2017.
<https://www2.ocadu.ca/sites/www2.ocadu.ca/files/project/Pt1%20-%20Redefining%20Public%20Art%20Toronto%202017.pdf>
- Public Art Fund.
<https://www.publicartfund.org/>